# PLUTARCH'S MORALIA

IN SIXTEEN VOLUMES

IX

697 C—771 E

WITH AN ENGLISH TRANSLATION BY

EDWIN L. MINAR, JR.
DEPAUW UNIVERSITY, GREENCASTLE, INDIANA

F. H. SANDBACH
TRINITY COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE

W. C. HELMBOLD
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

LONDON
WILLIAM HEINEMANN LTD
CAMBRIDGE, MASSACHUSETTS
HARVARD UNIVERSITY PRESS
MCMLXIX

THE LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

FOUNDED BY JAMES LOEB, LL.D.

EDITED BY

E. H. WARMINGTON, M.A., F.R.HIST.SOC.

PREVIOUS EDITORS

† T. E. PAGE, C.H., LITT.D. † E. CAPPS, PH.D., LL.D

† W. H. D. ROUSE, LITT.D. L. A. POST, L.H.D.

# PLUTARCH'S MORALIA

## IX

425

© The President and Fellows of Harvard College 1961

*First printed* 1961
*Reprinted* 1969

*Printed in Great Britain*

# CONTENTS OF VOLUME IX

PAGE

PREFATORY NOTE . . . . . vii

THE TRADITIONAL ORDER OF THE BOOKS OF THE *MORALIA* . . . . . ix

TABLE-TALK : BOOK VII—

Introduction . . . . . 2
Text and Translation . . . . . 4

TABLE-TALK : BOOK VIII—

Introduction . . . . . 107
Text and Translation . . . . . 108

TABLE-TALK : BOOK IX—

Introduction . . . . . 215
Text and Translation . . . . . 218

THE DIALOGUE ON LOVE—

Introduction . . . . . 303
Text and Translation . . . . . 306

INDEX . . . . . 443

# PREFATORY NOTE

Books VII and VIII of the *Table-Talk* are translated by Edwin L. Minar, Jr. Book IX is by F. H. Sandbach. The *Dialogue on Love* is by W. C. Helmbold. There is no joint responsibility.

THE TRADITIONAL ORDER OF THE BOOKS of the *Moralia* as they appear since the edition of Stephanus (1572), and their division into volumes in this edition.


| | | PAGE |
|---|---|---|
| I. | De liberis educandis (Περὶ παίδων ἀγωγῆς) . | 1A |
| | Quomodo adolescens poetas audire debeat (Πῶς δεῖ τὸν νέον ποιημάτων ἀκούειν) . . | 17D |
| | De recta ratione audiendi (Περὶ τοῦ ἀκούειν) . | 37B |
| | Quomodo adulator ab amico internoscatur (Πῶς ἄν τις διακρίνειε τὸν κόλακα τοῦ φίλου) . | 48E |
| | Quomodo quis suos in virtute sentiat profectus (Πῶς ἄν τις αἴσθοιτο ἑαυτοῦ προκόπτοντος ἐπ' ἀρετῇ) . . . . . | 75A |
| II. | De capienda ex inimicis utilitate (Πῶς ἄν τις ὑπ' ἐχθρῶν ὠφελοῖτο) . . . . | 86B |
| | De amicorum multitudine (Περὶ πολυφιλίας) . | 93A |
| | De fortuna (Περὶ τύχης) . . . . | 97C |
| | De virtute et vitio (Περὶ ἀρετῆς καὶ κακίας) . | 100B |
| | Consolatio ad Apollonium (Παραμυθητικὸς πρὸς Ἀπολλώνιον) . . . . . | 101F |
| | De tuenda sanitate praecepta (Ὑγιεινὰ παραγγέλματα) . . . . . | 122B |
| | Coniugalia praecepta (Γαμικὰ παραγγέλματα) . | 138A |
| | Septem sapientium convivium (Τῶν ἑπτὰ σοφῶν συμπόσιον) . . . . . | 146B |
| | De superstitione (Περὶ δεισιδαιμονίας) . . | 164E |
| III. | Regum et imperatorum apophthegmata (Ἀποφθέγματα βασιλέων καὶ στρατηγῶν) . . | 172A |
| | Apophthegmata Laconica (Ἀποφθέγματα Λακωνικά) . . . . . | 208A |
| | Instituta Laconica (Τὰ παλαιὰ τῶν Λακεδαιμονίων ἐπιτηδεύματα) . . . . . | 236F |

| | | PAGE |
|---|---|---|
| | Lacaenarum apophthegmata (Λακαινῶν ἀποφθέγματα) | 240C |
| | Mulierum virtutes (Γυναικῶν ἀρεταί) | 242E |
| IV. | Quaestiones Romanae (Αἴτια Ῥωμαϊκά) | 263D |
| | Quaestiones Graecae (Αἴτια Ἑλληνικά) | 291D |
| | Parallela Graeca et Romana (Συναγωγὴ ἱστοριῶν παραλλήλων Ἑλληνικῶν καὶ Ῥωμαϊκῶν) | 305A |
| | De fortuna Romanorum (Περὶ τῆς Ῥωμαίων τύχης) | 316B |
| | De Alexandri magni fortuna aut virtute, libri ii (Περὶ τῆς Ἀλεξάνδρου τύχης ἢ ἀρετῆς, λόγοι β′) | 326D |
| | Bellone an pace clariores fuerint Athenienses (Πότερον Ἀθηναῖοι κατὰ πόλεμον ἢ κατὰ σοφίαν ἐνδοξότεροι) | 345C |
| V. | De Iside et Osiride (Περὶ Ἴσιδος καὶ Ὀσίριδος) | 351C |
| | De E apud Delphos (Περὶ τοῦ ΕΙ τοῦ ἐν Δελφοῖς) | 384C |
| | De Pythiae oraculis (Περὶ τοῦ μὴ χρᾶν ἔμμετρα νῦν τὴν Πυθίαν) | 394D |
| | De defectu oraculorum (Περὶ τῶν ἐκλελοιπότων χρηστηρίων) | 409E |
| VI. | An virtus doceri possit (Εἰ διδακτὸν ἡ ἀρετή) | 439A |
| | De virtute morali (Περὶ τῆς ἠθικῆς ἀρετῆς) | 440D |
| | De cohibenda ira (Περὶ ἀοργησίας) | 452E |
| | De tranquillitate animi (Περὶ εὐθυμίας) | 464E |
| | De fraterno amore (Περὶ φιλαδελφίας) | 478A |
| | De amore prolis (Περὶ τῆς εἰς τὰ ἔκγονα φιλοστοργίας) | 493A |
| | An vitiositas ad infelicitatem sufficiat (Εἰ αὐτάρκης ἡ κακία πρὸς κακοδαιμονίαν) | 498A |
| | Animine an corporis affectiones sint peiores (Πότερον τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς ἢ τὰ τοῦ σώματος πάθη χείρονα) | 500B |
| | De garrulitate (Περὶ ἀδολεσχίας) | 502B |
| | De curiositate (Περὶ πολυπραγμοσύνης) | 515B |
| VII. | De cupiditate divitiarum (Περὶ φιλοπλουτίας) | 523C |
| | De vitioso pudore (Περὶ δυσωπίας) | 528C |
| | De invidia et odio (Περὶ φθόνου καὶ μίσους) | 536E |
| | De se ipsum citra invidiam laudando (Περὶ τοῦ ἑαυτὸν ἐπαινεῖν ἀνεπιφθόνως) | 539A |
| | De sera numinis vindicta (Περὶ τῶν ὑπὸ τοῦ θείου βραδέως τιμωρουμένων) | 548A |

| | | PAGE |
|---|---|---|
| | De fato (Περὶ εἱμαρμένης) | 568B |
| | De genio Socratis (Περὶ τοῦ Σωκράτους δαιμονίου) | 575A |
| | De exilio (Περὶ φυγῆς) | 599A |
| | Consolatio ad uxorem (Παραμυθητικὸς πρὸς τὴν γυναῖκα) | 608A |
| VIII. | Quaestionum convivalium libri vi (Συμποσιακῶν προβλημάτων βιβλία ϛ′) | 612C |
| | I, 612C; II, 629B; III, 644E; IV, 659E; V, 672D; VI, 686A | |
| IX. | Quaestionum convivalium libri iii (Συμποσιακῶν προβλημάτων βιβλία γ′) | 697C |
| | VII, 697C; VIII, 716D; IX, 736C | |
| | Amatorius (Ἐρωτικός) | 748E |
| X. | Amatoriae narrationes (Ἐρωτικαὶ διηγήσεις) | 771E |
| | Maxime cum principibus philosopho esse disserendum (Περὶ τοῦ ὅτι μάλιστα τοῖς ἡγεμόσι δεῖ τὸν φιλόσοφον διαλέγεσθαι) | 776A |
| | Ad principem ineruditum (Πρὸς ἡγεμόνα ἀπαίδευτον) | 779C |
| | An seni respublica gerenda sit (Εἰ πρεσβυτέρῳ πολιτευτέον) | 783A |
| | Praecepta gerendae reipublicae (Πολιτικὰ παραγγέλματα) | 798A |
| | De unius in republica dominatione, populari statu, et paucorum imperio (Περὶ μοναρχίας καὶ δημοκρατίας καὶ ὀλιγαρχίας) | 826A |
| | De vitando aere alieno (Περὶ τοῦ μὴ δεῖν δανείζεσθαι) | 827D |
| | Vitae decem oratorum (Περὶ τῶν δέκα ῥητόρων) | 832B |
| | Comparationis Aristophanis et Menandri compendium (Συγκρίσεως Ἀριστοφάνους καὶ Μενάνδρου ἐπιτομή) | 853A |
| XI. | De Herodoti malignitate (Περὶ τῆς Ἡροδότου κακοηθείας) | 854E |
| | * De placitis philosophorum, libri v (Περὶ τῶν ἀρεσκόντων τοῖς φιλοσόφοις, βιβλία ε′) | 874D |
| | Quaestiones naturales (Αἰτίαι φυσικαί) | 911C |
| XII. | De facie quae in orbe lunae apparet (Περὶ τοῦ ἐμφαινομένου προσώπου τῷ κύκλῳ τῆς σελήνης) | 920A |


* To be added to this edition later.

| | | PAGE |
|---|---|---|
| | De primo frigido (Περὶ τοῦ πρώτως ψυχροῦ) . | 945E |
| | Aquane an ignis sit utilior (Περὶ τοῦ πότερον ὕδωρ ἢ πῦρ χρησιμώτερον) . . . . . | 955D |
| | Terrestriane an aquatilia animalia sint callidiora (Πότερα τῶν ζῴων φρονιμώτερα τὰ χερσαῖα ἢ τὰ ἔνυδρα) . . . . . | 959A |
| | Bruta animalia ratione uti, sive Gryllus (Περὶ τοῦ τὰ ἄλογα λόγῳ χρῆσθαι) . . . | 985D |
| | De esu carnium orationes ii (Περὶ σαρκοφαγίας λόγοι β′) . . . . . | 993A |
| XIII. | Platonicae quaestiones (Πλατωνικὰ ζητήματα). | 999C |
| | De animae procreatione in Timaeo (Περὶ τῆς ἐν Τιμαίῳ ψυχογονίας) . . . . . | 1012A |
| | Compendium libri de animae procreatione in Timaeo (Ἐπιτομὴ τοῦ περὶ τῆς ἐν τῷ Τιμαίῳ ψυχογονίας) . . . . . | 1030D |
| | De Stoicorum repugnantiis (Περὶ Στωικῶν ἐναντιωμάτων) . . . . . | 1033A |
| | Compendium argumenti Stoicos absurdiora poetis dicere (Σύνοψις τοῦ ὅτι παραδοξότερα οἱ Στωικοὶ τῶν ποιητῶν λέγουσι) . . . | 1057C |
| | De communibus notitiis adversus Stoicos (Περὶ τῶν κοινῶν ἐννοιῶν πρὸς τοὺς Στωικούς) . | 1058E |
| XIV. | Non posse suaviter vivi secundum Epicurum (Ὅτι οὐδὲ ζῆν ἐστιν ἡδέως κατ' Ἐπίκουρον) . | 1086C |
| | Adversus Colotem (Πρὸς Κωλώτην ὑπὲρ τῶν ἄλλων φιλοσόφων) . . . . . | 1107D |
| | An recte dictum sit latenter esse vivendum (Εἰ καλῶς εἴρηται τὸ λάθε βιώσας) . . . | 1128A |
| | De musica (Περὶ μουσικῆς) . . . . | 1131A |
| XV. | Fragments | |
| XVI. | General Index | |

# TABLE-TALK

## (QUAESTIONES CONVIVALES)

## BOOK VII

# INTRODUCTION

THE *Table-Talk* is a collection of dialogues purporting to reproduce the after-dinner conversation of Plutarch and his friends and relatives on various occasions. They differ widely in dramatic liveliness, and in the degree to which they seem to be based on recollection, or on memoranda, of actual conversations. Their subject matter ranges from scientific or philosophical questions, more or less serious, to antiquarian, historical, and ethical topics; some deal with the symposium or dinner party itself.

In Book VII, the scene of two or three of the dialogues (7, 8, and probably 3) is laid in Plutarch's home in Chaeronea, that of 2 and 5 at Delphi, and that of 9 and 10 at Athens; the others give no clue as to location. The seventh and eighth dialogues are connected dramatically, as are the ninth and tenth. A peculiar phrase at the beginning of 10 suggests that some revision or rearrangement has taken place. The lack of dramatic detail causes Questions 3 and 6 to seem less like reports of actual conversation than the rest; and the rather formal organization of Question 6 heightens this impression.

No fewer than six of the ten dialogues in this book have subjects related to the organization and conduct of the symposium itself; the others are scientific and antiquarian. Plutarch's customary interest in the

ethical implications of customs and ideas is strongly evident, especially in the long Questions 5, 6, and 8, and not least in his spirited defence of the use of wine in 10.

The text and critical notes of this edition are based on K. Hubert's Teubner edition (*Moralia*, vol. iv, Leipzig, 1938). The notes are intended to record important variations from manuscript readings. Book VII includes the passage (704 F—709 A) whose loss from MS. T (Vindobonensis 148) enabled scholars to show that in its original form this was the source of all other manuscripts of the *Quaestiones Convivales*.

EDWIN L. MINAR, JR.

(697) C

# ΣΥΜΠΟΣΙΑΚΩΝ

## ΒΙΒΛΙΟΝ ΕΒΔΟΜΟΝ

Χαρίεντος ἀνδρός, ὦ Σόσσιε Σενεκίων, καὶ φιλανθρώπου λόγον ἔχουσι Ῥωμαῖοι διὰ στόματος, ὅστις ἦν ὁ εἰπών, ἐπεὶ μόνος ἐδείπνησεν, " βεβρωκέναι, μὴ δεδειπνηκέναι σήμερον," ὡς τοῦ δείπνου κοινωνίαν καὶ φιλοφροσύνην ἐφηδύνουσαν ἀεὶ πο-
D θοῦντος. Εὔηνος μὲν γὰρ ἔλεγεν τὸ πῦρ ἥδιστον ἡδυσμάτων εἶναι, καὶ τὸν ἅλα " θεῖον " Ὅμηρος, οἱ δὲ πολλοὶ " χάριτας " καλοῦσιν, ὅτι ἐπὶ τὰ πλεῖστα μιγνύμενος εὐάρμοστα τῇ γεύσει καὶ προσφιλῆ ποιεῖ καὶ κεχαρισμένα· δείπνου δὲ καὶ τραπέζης θειότατον ὡς ἀληθῶς ἥδυσμα φίλος ἐστὶ παρὼν καὶ συνήθης καὶ γνώριμος οὐ τῷ συνεσθίειν καὶ συμπίνειν, ἀλλ' ὅτι λόγου μεταλαμβάνει καὶ μεταδίδωσιν, ἄν γε δὴ χρήσιμον ἐνῇ τι καὶ πιθανὸν καὶ οἰκεῖον τοῖς λεγομένοις· ἐπεὶ τούς γε πολλοὺς αἱ παρ' οἶνον ἀδολεσχίαι ληροῦντας ἐμβάλλουσι

[a] The Roman friend of Plutarch to whom is dedicated each book of the *Table-Talk*, as well as a number of other Plutarchean works. He was a friend of the emperor Trajan, and consul in 99, 102, and 107 A.D.

Notes on all the characters in these dialogues are to be found in section 8, " Plutarchs Freundeskreis," of K. Ziegler's long article, *s.v.* " Plutarchos (2)," Pauly-Wissowa, *Real-*



# TABLE-TALK

## BOOK SEVEN

THE Romans, Sossius Senecio,[a] are fond of quoting a witty and sociable person who said, after a solitary meal, " I have eaten, but not dined to-day," implying that a " dinner " always requires friendly sociability for seasoning. Now Evenus said that a fire is the finest of seasonings[b]; Homer calls salt " divine,"[c] and a colloquial term for salt is " graces," because when mixed with foods it will render most of them harmonious and agreeable and so " gracious " to our taste.[d] But the most truly godlike seasoning at the dining-table is the presence of a friend or companion or intimate acquaintance—not because of his eating and drinking with us, but because he participates in the give-and-take of conversation, at least if there is something profitable and probable and relevant in what is said. For chitchat over wine means for most people a wild plunge into the life of feeling and tends

*encyclopädie* (henceforth abbreviated *RE*) (1951; also published separately, 1949), cols. 665-696 (cols. 688 f. for Sossius, on whom *cf.* also *ibid. s.v.* " Sossius," cols. 1180-1193).

[b] Frag. 10 Bergk; also cited at *Mor.* 50 A and 1010 C. At 126 D the line is attributed to Prodicus (*cf.* Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 84 B 10, and note).

[c] *Iliad*, ix. 214; *cf.* above, Book V, 684 F.

[d] *Cf.* Book V, 685 A, where the reason is " that it makes the necessary pleasant."

(697) πρὸς τὰ πάθη καὶ προσδιαστρέφουσιν. ὅθεν ἄξιόν
E ἐστι μηδὲν ἧττον λόγους ἢ φίλους δεδοκιμασμένους παραλαμβάνειν ἐπὶ τὰ δεῖπνα, τοὐναντίον ἢ Λακεδαιμόνιοι φρονοῦντας καὶ λέγοντας· ἐκεῖνοι μὲν γάρ, ὅταν νέον ἢ ξένον εἰς τὸ φιδίτιον παραλάβωσι, τὰς θύρας[1] δείξαντες, " ταύτῃ," φασίν, " οὐκ ἐξέρχεται λόγος "· ἡμεῖς δ' ἑαυτοὺς χρῆσθαι λόγοις συνεθίζωμεν, ὧν πᾶσίν ἐστιν καὶ πρὸς πάντας ἐξαγωγή, διὰ τὰς ὑποθέσεις μηδὲν ἀκόλαστον μηδὲ βλάσφημον μηδὲ κακόηθες ἐχούσας μηδ' ἀνελεύθερον. ἔξεστι δὲ κρίνειν τοῖς παραδείγμασιν, ὧν τὴν ἑβδόμην δεκάδα τουτὶ περιέχει τὸ βιβλίον.

F

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Α

Πρὸς τοὺς ἐγκαλοῦντας Πλάτωνι τὸ ποτὸν εἰπόντι διὰ τοῦ πλεύμονος ἐξιέναι

Collocuntur Nicias, Protogenes, Florus, Plutarchus, conviva

1. Εἰσῆλθέ τινι τῶν συμποτῶν ὥρᾳ θέρους τουτὶ τὸ πρόχειρον ἅπασιν ἀναφθέγξασθαι,

698 τέγγε πλεύμονας οἴνῳ· τὸ γὰρ ἄστρον περιτέλλεται·

καὶ Νικίας ὁ Νικοπολίτης ἰατρὸς οὐδὲν ἔφη θαυμαστόν, εἰ ποιητικὸς ἀνὴρ Ἀλκαῖος ἠγνόησεν ὃ καὶ Πλάτων ὁ φιλόσοφος. καίτοι τὸν μὲν Ἀλκαῖον

[1] θύρας Kronenberg : θυρίδας.

[a] Also cited *Instituta Laconica*, 236 F ; *Life of Lycurgus*, 46 D.

[b] This Question is cited and discussed by Gellius, *Noctes Atticae*, xvii. 11, and imitated by Macrobius, *Saturnalia*, vii. 15, who apparently also had Gellius before him. *Cf.* also





to warp the character. Therefore subjects of discourse, like friends, should be admitted to dinners only if they are of proved quality. In spirit and in speech we should be just the opposite of the Lacedaemonians.[a] When they invite a young man or a foreign visitor to their common meal, they point to the door and say, " No talk goes out that way." Let us rather make a practice of speaking only such words as may be divulged by anyone to anyone, as they may if the topics involve no licence, no profanity, no malice, and no vulgarity. Permission is given to use as criteria the examples whose seventh set of ten this book comprises.

## QUESTION 1

Against those who find fault with Plato for saying that drink passes through the lungs.[b]

Speakers : Nicias, Protogenes, Florus, Plutarch, an unnamed guest

1. A CERTAIN dinner-guest, on a summer evening, was inspired to quote the familiar tag,

Drench your lungs with wine, for the Dog-star returns [c];

and Nicias of Nicopolis, the physician,[d] commented that it was no wonder if Alcaeus, a poet, was ignorant of a point which even the philosopher Plato missed. And yet (he said) Alcaeus could be defended, after a

Hippocrates, *On the Heart*, 2, Aristotle, *De Part. Animal.* iii. 3 (664 b 4-19) (where those who hold this view, presumably including Plato, are criticized), Cohen and Drabkin, *Source-Book of Greek Science* (New York, 1948), p. 479.

[c] Alcaeus, frag. 39 Bergk, 94 Diehl, Z 23 Lobel-Page (*Poetarum Lesbiorum Fragmenta*), line 1.

[d] A follower of the school of Erasistratus, as appears below.

(698) ἀμωσγέπως[1] εὐπορήσειν βοηθείας, ἀπολαύειν γὰρ[2] ἰκμάδος τὸν πλεύμονα, γειτνιῶντα τῷ στομάχῳ, καὶ διὰ τοῦτο τέγγεσθαι πιθανόν ἐστιν· " ὁ δὲ φιλόσοφος οὕτωσὶ σαφῶς," ἔφη, " γράψας διεξιέναι τὰ ποτὰ[3] διὰ τοῦ πλεύμονος οὐδὲ τοῖς προθυμοτάτοις ἀμύνειν[4] ἐπιχείρησιν ὑπὲρ αὐτοῦ πιθανὴν ἀπολέλοι-
B πεν. τὸ γὰρ ἀγνόημα μέγα· πρῶτον μὲν ὅτι, τῆς ὑγρᾶς τροφῆς πρὸς τὴν ξηρὰν ἀναγκαίαν ἐχούσης τὴν ἀνάμιξιν, εἰκός ἐστιν ταὐτὸν ἀμφοτέραις ἀγγεῖον ὑποκεῖσθαι τὸν στόμαχον εἰς τὴν κάτω κοιλίαν ἐκδιδόντα μαλακὸν καὶ διάβροχον τὸ σιτίον· ἔπειτα τοῦ πλεύμονος μὴ[5] λείου καὶ πυκνοῦ παντάπασι γεγονότος, πῶς τὸ σὺν κυκεῶνι πινόμενον ἄλφιτον διέξεισι καὶ οὐκ ἐνίσχεται; τοῦτο γὰρ Ἐρασίστρα-
τος ὀρθῶς πρὸς αὐτὸν ἠπόρησεν.

" Καὶ μὴν ἐπί γε τῶν πλείστων τοῦ σώματος μορίων τὸ οὗ[6] ἕνεκα τῷ λόγῳ μετιὼν καὶ πρὸς ἣν ἕκαστον ἡ φύσις[7] χρείαν πεποίηκεν βουλόμενος, ὥσπερ καὶ προσήκει τῷ φιλοσόφῳ, φρονεῖν, οὐκ
C εὐπάριτον ἔχει[8] τὸ τῆς ἐπιγλωττίδος ἔργον, ἐπὶ τούτῳ τεταγμένης, ὅπως ἐν τῇ καταπόσει τῆς τρο-

[1] ἀμωσγέπως Xylander (in his translation): ἄλλως γέ πως.
[2] γὰρ added by Turnebus. [3] ποτὰ Turnebus: πολλὰ.
[4] ἀμύνειν Basel edition: ἀμβλύνειν.
[5] μὴ added by Hubert. [6] τὸ οὗ Stephanus: τούτου.
[7] φύσις Basel edition: κρίσις.
[8] εὐπάριτον ἔχει Post: εὖ πάριτον T: εὖ παρίησι Wyttenbach, Hubert.

[a] Plutarch uses the word στόμαχος for both oesophagus and stomach. The translation varies according to the context.

[b] *Timaeus*, 70 C, 91 A. Galen supposed Plato to mean that only part of the liquid drunk passes through the lungs (*Hipp. et Plat.* 722 ff.; *cf.* Cornford, *Plato's Cosmology*, p. 284, n. 1), and this would be consistent with some Platonic passages (*Timaeus*, 70 C, 72 E, 78 A, B). In 91 A, however, he seems to speak unequivocally of " *the* conduit of our drink . . . through the lungs " (Cornford).





fashion, since it is a plausible view that the lungs, being neighbours to the stomach,[a] do benefit by the moisture of the body, and that in this way they are " drenched." " The philosopher, however," he continued, " wrote so plainly that what is drunk passes through the lungs that he left no plausible line of argument in his behalf, even for those most zealous to defend him.[b] His error is a blatant one, in the first place because, since our liquid nourishment must necessarily be mixed with the dry, it stands to reason that the stomach serves as a receptacle, the same for both, and passes the food on, soft and moist, into the lower belly. In the second place, since the lung is not altogether smooth and close-textured, how does the barley drunk in a *kykeon*[c] pass through without getting stuck? This is the objection which Erasistratus[d] justifiably raised against Plato.

" Moreover, since for most of the parts of the body Plato takes account of their purpose in the course of his discussion, wishing, as a philosopher should, to understand the function for which nature has made each one, it is wrong for him to ignore the service performed by the epiglottis, which is put there for this very purpose, of stopping the windpipe while

[c] A drink containing barley-groats and grated cheese, in wine.

[d] A native of Ceos, physician and scholar at Alexandria in the first half of the third century B.C. He established an influential school which was still active in Plutarch's time. *Cf.* Wellmann, *RE*, *s.v.* (on this passage, col. 338), H. Fuchs, " De Erasistrato Capita Selecta," *Hermes*, xxix (1894), pp. 171-203.

(698) φῆς τὴν ἀρτηρίαν πιέζουσα κωλύῃ παρεμπεσεῖν ὁτιοῦν εἰς τὸν πλεύμονα· δεινὰς γὰρ ὑπὸ βηχὸς ἴσχει τραχύτητας καὶ χαράξεις, ὅταν παρολίσθῃ φερομένου τοῦ πνεύματος· ἡ δὲ μέταυλος αὕτη κλίσιν ἐπ' ἀμφότερα λαμβάνουσα φθεγγομένων μὲν ἐπιπίπτει τῷ στομάχῳ, σιτουμένων δὲ καὶ πινόντων τῇ ἀρτηρίᾳ, καθαρὸν τῷ πνεύματι τὸν δρόμον φυλάττουσα καὶ τὴν ἀναπνοήν.

"Ετι τοίνυν," ἔφη, "καὶ τοὺς ἀτρέμα πίνοντας ἴσμεν τὰς κοιλίας ὑγροτέρας ἴσχοντας τῶν ἄθρουν
D ἐφελκομένων τὸ ὑγρόν· ὠθεῖται[1] γὰρ εὐθὺς εἰς κύστιν ὑπὸ ῥύμης διεξιόν· ἐκεῖνο δὲ μᾶλλον ἐνδιατρίβει τοῖς σιτίοις καὶ μαλάσσει, ὥστ' ἀναμίγνυσθαι καὶ παραμένειν. οὐκ ἂν δὲ ταῦτα συνέβαινε διακρινομένων εὐθὺς ἐν τῇ καταπόσει τῶν ὑγρῶν, ἀλλὰ συμπλεκομένων ἅμα[2] καὶ συμπαραπεμπόντων τὸ σιτίον, οἷον ὀχήματι τῷ ὑγρῷ χρώμενον, ὡς ἔλεγεν Ἐρασίστρατος."

2. Τοιαῦτα τοῦ Νικίου διεξιόντος ὁ γραμματικὸς Πρωτογένης ἔφη[3] συνεωρακέναι πρῶτον Ὅμηρον, ὅτι τῆς μὲν τροφῆς ὁ στόμαχος ἀγγεῖόν ἐστιν, τοῦ δὲ πνεύματος ὁ βρόγχος, ὃν ἀσφάραγον ἐκάλουν οἱ
E παλαιοί· διὸ καὶ τοὺς μεγαλοφώνους "ἐρισφαράγους" ἐπονομάζειν εἰώθασιν· εἰπὼν οὖν ὅτι τοῦ Ἕκτορος ὁ Ἀχιλλεὺς ἤλασε

λευκανίην, ἵνα τε ψυχῆς ὠκιστος ὄλεθρος·
οὐδ' ἄρ' ἀπ' ἀσφάραγον μελίη τάμε χαλκοβάρεια,
ὄφρα τί μιν προτιείποι ἀμειβόμενος ἐπέεσσιν,

[1] ὠθεῖται Wyttenbach : ὠθεῖ.
[2] ἅμα Madvig : ἡμῶν ἅμα. [3] ἔφη added by Turnebus.

[a] Erasistratus' expression is also cited above, vi. 690 A.
[b] Probably the same as the Protogenes of the *Amatorius* (below), a guest-friend of Plutarch from Tarsus. *Cf.* also viii. 4, ix. 2, 12, 13.
[c] This word is only found, however, in the *Homeric Hymn to Hermes* (187, of Poseidon), and once in Pindar.
[d] *Iliad*, xxii. 325, 328-329.





food is being swallowed, thus preventing any of it from accidentally falling into the lungs; for the latter are badly rasped and scratched by coughing when anything slips past during respiration. The epiglottis, like the inner door of a courtyard, can be set either way. When we speak it falls over the oesophagus, and when we eat or drink it falls over the windpipe, thus keeping the route clear for the breath when we inhale again.

"Further," he continued, "we know that people who drink slowly have more moisture in their abdomen than those who gulp their drink. In the latter case, it is thrust by the momentum straight to the bladder, while in the former, it lingers with the food, and softens it up, thus combining and staying with it. This would not be the case if any liquids were separated out at the very moment of swallowing. They must be in one package with the food, helping to speed it on its way and serving it as a vehicle, in Erasistratus' words." [a]

2. After this exposition by Nicias, the schoolmaster Protogenes [b] remarked that Homer was the first to have observed that the receptacle for our nourishment is the oesophagus, and for breath the windpipe, which the ancients called *aspharagus* (so that the epithet for loud-voiced persons was *erispharagoi*).[c] When Homer says that Achilles struck Hector's "throat (*leukaniē*), where life is quickest to perish, but the bronze-heavy ashen spear cut not his windpipe (*aspharagos*), that he might speak and exchange words with him," [d] he

(698) ὡς τὸν ἀσφάραγον ὄντα φωνῆς ἴδιον ὀχετὸν καὶ πνεύματος, τὴν δὲ λευκανίην τροφῆς ἀγγεῖον λέγει ἐν τούτοις·

νῦν δὴ καὶ σίτου πασάμην καὶ αἴθοπα οἶνον
λευκανιὴν ἐσέθηκα.[1]

3. Γενομένης οὖν ἐπὶ τῷ λόγῳ σιωπῆς ὁ Φλῶρος εἶπεν· "οὕτως ὑφησόμεθα τοῦ Πλάτωνος ἐρήμην ὀφλισκάνοντος;"

"Οὐχ ἡμεῖς γ'," ἔφην ἐγώ· "προησόμεθα γὰρ ἅμα τῷ Πλάτωνι καὶ τὸν Ὅμηρον, ὃς τοσοῦτον ἀποδεῖ τοῦ τὸ ὑγρὸν ἀπελαύνειν καὶ ἀποστρέφειν τῆς ἀρτηρίας, ὥστε καὶ τὸ σιτίον ὁμοῦ συνεκβαλεῖν ἐνταῦθα· 'φάρυγγος,'[2] γάρ φησιν, 'ἐξέσσυτο οἶνος
F ψωμοί τ' ἀνδρόμεοι'· χωρὶς εἰ μὴ τὸν Κύκλωπα φήσει τις ὥσπερ ὀφθαλμὸν ἔχειν ἕνα καὶ πόρον τροφῆς καὶ φωνῆς τὸν αὐτόν· ἢ τὸν φάρυγγα φήσει στόμαχον εἰρῆσθαι καὶ μὴ βρόγχον, ὥσπερ ὑπὸ πάντων καὶ πάλαι καὶ νῦν ὠνόμασται. ταῦτα δ' οὐκ ἀπορίᾳ μαρτύρων, ἀλλ' ὑπὸ τῆς ἀληθείας ἐπηγαγόμην· ἐπεὶ μάρτυρές γε τῷ Πλάτωνι πολλοί τε
699 κἀγαθοὶ πάρεισιν. Εὔπολιν μὲν γάρ, εἰ βούλει, πάρες ἐν Κόλαξιν εἰπόντα,

πίνειν γὰρ ὁ Πρωταγόρας ἐκέλευσ', ἵνα
πρὸ τοῦ κυνὸς τὸν πλεύμον' ἔκκλυστον φορῇ·

[1] τροφῆς . . . λευκανίην added by Wyttenbach, who saw that Plutarch must have quoted *Iliad*, xxiv. 641 f. (Homer's MSS. have λευκανίης καθέηκα.)

[2] φάρυγος Xylander, to accord with Homer's spelling, and the metre.





is speaking of the windpipe (*aspharagos*) as the special channel of voice and breath, but he speaks of the throat (*leukanië*) as the receptacle of nourishment in the following :

Now I have tasted food and poured bright wine down my throat.[a]

3. After a pause, Florus [b] said, "Are we thus to let Plato's case go by default ? "

" Surely not," I replied, " for we should be betraying Homer as well as Plato. He is so far from driving or turning liquid from the windpipe that he even has solid food coming out with it by that route. ' From his throat (*pharynx*),' he says, ' came pouring wine and pieces of human flesh.' [c] Unless someone is going to allege that, as the Cyclops had one eye, he also had a single passageway for both food and voice —or that by *pharynx* Homer meant the oesophagus and not the windpipe, which is what everyone has meant by it in both ancient and modern times. I have introduced this quotation not for any lack of authorities, but out of regard for truth ; for the witnesses on Plato's side are both numerous and excellent. Disregard Eupolis, if you will, who says in the *Flatterers*,

Protagoras bade him drink, to have his lungs well sluiced, before the dog days.[d]

[a] See critical note.

[b] L. Mestrius Florus, an influential Roman friend, through whom, presumably, Plutarch obtained Roman citizenship, and whose gentile name he assumed. Florus is characterized in the *Table-Talk*, where he appears 13 times, as a man of wide learning, with a fondness for philosophy (734 D) and for ancient customs (702 D).

[c] *Odyssey*, ix. 373.

[d] Frag. 147 Kock.

(699) πάρες δὲ καὶ τὸν κομψὸν Ἐρατοσθένην λέγοντα,

καὶ βαθὺν ἀκρήτῳ πλεύμονα τεγγόμενος·

Εὐριπίδης δὲ σαφῶς δήπου λέγων,

οἶνος περάσας πλευμόνων διαρροάς,

δῆλός ἐστιν Ἐρασιστράτου βλέπων τι ὀξύτερον· εἶδεν γὰρ ὅτι σήραγγας ὁ πλεύμων ἔχει καὶ πόροις κατατέτρηται, δι' ὧν τὸ ὑγρὸν διίησιν. οὐ γὰρ τὸ πνεῦμα πόρων ἐδεῖτο πρὸς τὴν ἐξαγωγήν, ἀλλ' ἕνεκα τῶν ὑγρῶν καὶ τῶν τοῖς ὑγροῖς συμπαρολισθαινόντων γέγονεν ἠθμοειδὴς καὶ πολύπορος. καὶ οὐδὲν ἧττον, ὦ μακάριε, τῷ πλεύμονι προσῆκόν ἐστιν ἢ τῷ στομάχῳ συνεκδιδόναι τὸ ἄλφιτον καὶ τὸ κρίμνον· οὐδὲ γὰρ ὁ στόμαχος ἡμῶν λεῖος, ὥς τινες, οὐδ' ὀλισθηρός, ἀλλ' ἔχει τραχύτητας, αἷς εἰκός ἐστι τὰ λεπτὰ καὶ μικρὰ περιπίπτοντα καὶ προσισχόμενα διαφεύγειν τὴν κατάποσιν.

B

"Ἀλλ' οὔτε τοῦτο λέγειν οὔτ' ἐκεῖνο καλῶς ἔχον ἐστίν· ἡ γὰρ φύσις οὐκ ἐφικτὸν ἔχει τῷ λόγῳ τὸ περὶ τὰς ἐνεργείας εὐμήχανον, οὐδ' ἔστι τῶν ὀργάνων αὐτῆς τὴν ἀκρίβειαν οἷς χρῆται (λέγω δὲ τὸ πνεῦμα καὶ τὸ θερμόν) ἀξίως διελθεῖν.

C

"Ἔτι δὴ τῶν μαρτύρων τῷ Πλάτωνι προσκαλοῦμαι Φιλιστίωνά τε τὸν Λοκρόν, εὖ μάλα παλαιὸν ἄνδρα καὶ λαμπρὸν ἀπὸ τῆς τέχνης ὑμῶν γενόμενον, καὶ Ἱπποκράτη καὶ Διώξιππον τὸν Ἱπποκράτειον· οὗτοι γὰρ οὐχ ἑτέραν ὁδόν, ἀλλ' ἣν Πλάτων, ὑφηγοῦνται τοῦ πόματος.[1] ἥ γε μὴν πολυ-

[1] πόματος Reiske : στόματος.

[a] E. Hiller, *Eratosthenis Carminum Reliquiae* (1872), pp. 3, 100 ; fr. 25 Powell (*Collectanea Alexandrina*, p. 65).





Disregard the elegant Eratosthenes, too, and his expression,

Drenching his lungs deep down with unmixed wine.[a]

But when Euripides speaks in plain terms of

Wine, traversing the channels of the lungs,[b]

he shows that he has keener eyes than Erasistratus. For he has perceived that the lung has cavities and is pierced with channels through which it transmits liquid. The breath has no need of special passages through which to escape ; it is for the sake of the liquids and the solids that slip in with them, that the lung is created in the pattern of a sieve, and is well provided with channels. What is more, my good friend, it is no less the part of the lung than of the stomach to pass along the barley groats or meal you speak of. Our stomach is not smooth or slippery, as some suppose, but it has irregularities, into which it is likely that light and small particles fall and lodge and so escape getting swallowed further.

" But neither this account nor the other is quite satisfactory ; the ingenious organization of Nature's activities is beyond the range of words, and it is impossible to explain adequately the exact working of the agencies it employs—that is breath and warmth.

" Now, the further witnesses for Plato whom I shall call are Philistion of Locri,[c] a very ancient authority and one eminent in your profession, and Hippocrates with his follower Dioxippus.[d] These men teach us that what we drink follows no other route but Plato's. Your precious epiglottis did not

[b] Frag. 983 Nauck.

[c] Frag. 7 Wellmann.

[d] The correct form of the name is probably Dexippus (*cf.* Wellmann in *RE*, *s.v.* " Dexippos (7) ").

(699) τίμητος ἐπιγλωττὶς οὐκ ἔλαθε τὸν Διώξιππον, ἀλλὰ περὶ ταύτην φησὶ τὸ ὑγρὸν ἐν τῇ καταπόσει διακρινόμενον εἰς τὴν ἀρτηρίαν ἐπιρρεῖν, τὸ δὲ σιτίον εἰς τὸν στόμαχον ἐπικυλινδεῖσθαι· καὶ τῇ μὲν ἀρτηρίᾳ τῶν ἐδωδίμων μηδὲν παρεμπίπτειν, τὸν δὲ στόμαχον ἅμα τῇ ξηρᾷ τροφῇ καὶ τῆς ὑγρᾶς ἀνα-
D μιγνύμενόν τι μέρος ὑποδέχεσθαι· πιθανὸν γάρ ἐστι· τὴν μὲν γὰρ ἐπιγλωττίδα τῆς ἀρτηρίας προκεῖσθαι διάφραγμα καὶ ταμιεῖον, ὅπως ἀτρέμα καὶ κατ' ὀλίγον διηθῆται τὸ ποτόν, ἀλλὰ μὴ ταχὺ μηδ' ἄθρουν ἐπιρρακτὸν ἀποβιάζηται τὸ πνεῦμα καὶ διαταράττῃ· διὸ τοῖς ὄρνισιν οὐ γέγονεν ἐπιγλωττὶς οὐδ' ἔστιν· οὐδὲ γὰρ σπῶντες οὐδὲ λάπτοντες, ἀλλὰ κάπτοντες καὶ κατ' ὀλίγον διιέντες τὸ ποτὸν ἡσυχῇ τὴν ἀρτηρίαν διαίνουσι καὶ τέγγουσι.

"Μαρτύρων μὲν οὖν ἅλις. ὁ δὲ λόγος τῷ Πλάτωνι πρῶτον ἐκ τῆς αἰσθήσεως ἔχει τὴν πίστιν· τῆς γὰρ ἀρτηρίας τρωθείσης οὐ καταπίνεται τὸ
E ὑγρόν, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ὀχετοῦ διακοπέντος ἐκπῖπτον ἔξω καὶ ἀποκρουνίζον ὁρᾶται, καίπερ ὑγιοῦς καὶ ἀκεραίου τοῦ στομάχου μένοντος. ἔπειτα πάντες ἴσμεν, ὅτι τοῖς περιπλευμονικοῖς πάθεσι δίψος[1] ἕπεται περιφλεγέστατον ὑπὸ ξηρότητος ἢ θερμότητος ἤ τινος ἄλλης αἰτίας ἅμα τῇ φλεγμονῇ τὴν ὄρεξιν ἐμποιούσης· ὃ δὲ τούτου μεῖζόν ἐστι τεκμήριον, ὅσοις πλεύμων οὐκ ἐμπέφυκε τῶν ζῴων ἢ σφόδρα μικρὸς ἐμπέφυκε, ταῦτ' οὐ δεῖται ποτοῦ τὸ παράπαν οὐδ' ὀρέγεται, διὰ τὸ τῶν μορίων ἑκάστῳ σύμφυτον ὑπάρχειν τὴν πρὸς τοὔργον[2] ἐπιθυμίαν,

[1] δίψος Stephanus: δίψα.
[2] τοὔργον Reiske, Doehner (*ministerium* Macrobius, 18): τὸ ὑγρόν.





escape Dioxippus' notice; he says that in the act of swallowing, the liquid part is separated out in this organ's neighbourhood and flows into the windpipe, while the solid food goes tumbling into the oesophagus. No solid food slips into the windpipe; but the oesophagus, along with the dry part of the nourishment, also receives a portion of the moist combined with it. This seems a likely interpretation; the epiglottis, you see, is stationed before the windpipe like a barrier or regulator, so that what we drink may filter through gradually, a little at a time, and not, by being forced down suddenly or all at once, do violence to the breath and interfere with its regularity. This is why birds have not been provided with an epiglottis. They do not drink by sucking or lapping, but by gulps; by taking in a little at a time they gradually moisten or wet their windpipe.

"Enough of authorities. Plato's account has its primary corroboration from ordinary observation: when the windpipe is wounded, liquids are not swallowed. They are observed escaping and gushing out as from a broken water pipe, though the oesophagus remains whole and uninjured. In the second place, we all know that in diseases involving an inflammation of the lungs there develops an excessive, burning thirst, because of the dryness or the heat, or some other cause that induces the craving for liquid along with the fever. But a proof even stronger than this is that the creatures to whom nature has not given a lung, or has given only a very small one, do not need to drink at all, and feel no desire for it, because a natural concomitant of each organ is the desire directed toward fulfilment of its function, and

(699) οἷς δ' οὐκ ἔστι μόρια, μηδὲ χρείαν παρεῖναι μηδὲ προθυμίαν τῆς δι' αὐτῶν ἐνεργείας.

F "Ὅλως δὲ δόξει μάτην ἡ κύστις γεγονέναι τοῖς ἔχουσιν· εἰ γὰρ ὁ στόμαχος ἅμα τῷ σιτίῳ τὸ ποτὸν ἀναλαμβάνει καὶ τῇ κοιλίᾳ παραδίδωσιν, οὐθὲν ἰδίου πόρου δεῖται τὸ περίττωμα τῆς ὑγρᾶς τροφῆς, ἀλλ' εἷς ἀρκεῖ καὶ κοινὸς ὥσπερ εὐδιαῖος ἀμφοτέροις εἰς ταὐτὸ διὰ ταὐτοῦ συνεισκομιζομένοις[1]· νῦν δὲ χωρὶς μὲν ἡ κύστις γέγονεν, χωρὶς δὲ τὸ ἔντερον, ὅτι τὸ μὲν ἐκ τοῦ πλεύμονος βαδίζει, τὸ δ' ἐκ τοῦ
700 στομάχου, διακρινόμενον εὐθὺς περὶ τὴν κατάποσιν. ὅθεν οὐδ' ἐπιφαίνεται τῷ ὑγρῷ τοῦ ξηροῦ περιττώματος οὐδέν, οὔτε χρόᾳ προσεοικὸς οὔτ' ὀσμῇ τὸ παράπαν· καίτοι φύσιν εἶχεν ἀναμιγνύμενον ἐν τῇ κοιλίᾳ κἀνδυόμενον[2] ἀναπίμπλασθαι τῶν ἐκείνου ποιοτήτων καὶ μὴ καθαρὸν οὕτως ἀπηθεῖσθαι καὶ ἄχραντον. ἀλλ' οὐδὲ λίθος ἐν κοιλίᾳ πώποτε συνέστη· καίτοι λόγον εἶχεν μηδὲν ἧττον ἢ ἐν κύστει συνίστασθαι καὶ πήγνυσθαι τὸ ὑγρόν, εἴπερ εἰς κοιλίαν ἐχώρει διὰ στομάχου πᾶν τὸ πινόμενον. ἀλλ' ἔοικεν ὁ μὲν στόμαχος ἐκ τῆς ἀρτηρίας εὐθὺς
B ἕλκων τοῦ παροδεύοντος ὑγροῦ τὸ ἱκανὸν καὶ τὸ μέτριον ἀποχρῆσθαι πρὸς μάλαξιν καὶ χύλωσιν τῆς τροφῆς, διὸ μηδὲν ὑγροῦ περίττωμα ποιεῖν· ὁ δὲ πλεύμων ὥσπερεὶ τὸ πνεῦμα καὶ τὸ ὑγρὸν ἐξ αὑτοῦ διανέμων τοῖς δεομένοις τὸ λοιπὸν ἐκκρίνειν εἰς τὴν κύστιν.

" Εἰκότα γὰρ μακρῷ ταῦτα μᾶλλον ἐκείνων. τὸ

[1] συνεισκομιζομένοις Doehner : εἰσκομιζομένοις.
[2] κἀνδυόμενον Hubert : καὶ ἀναδευόμενον.





creatures that do not have certain parts have neither a need for them nor any eagerness for the activity that employs them.

" The bladder, too, will by your account seem to have been given to the creatures that have it quite in vain ; for if the stomach takes in drink along with food, and passes it along to the lower abdomen, the residue of liquid nourishment has no need for a passage of its own ; a single one would suffice, shared, like a bilge-hole, by both, since they would be borne to the same place over the same route. In fact, however, the bladder and the bowel have been made separate and distinct because one type of waste comes from the lung, and the other from the stomach, separation taking place at the very start when we swallow. This is why, in the liquid excretion, no remnant of dry food is seen, nor any approximation either in colour or in odour ; and yet the natural thing would be, if the liquid were mixed in the belly with the solid, so as to permeate it, that it should be infected with its properties instead of being filtered out so clear and uncontaminated. Nor in fact has a stone ever been formed in the abdomen, though it would make as good sense for liquid to be concentrated and solidified here as in the bladder, if everything drunk went through the stomach into the abdomen. What seems likely is that the stomach draws directly from the windpipe a sufficient and moderate quantity of moisture as it passes by, and uses it to soften and liquefy the food, and for that reason produces no liquid residue. And the lung, distributing air and liquid from itself, so to speak, to the parts that need them, excretes the remainder to the bladder.

" This is far more probable than the other accounts.

(700) δ' ἀληθὲς ἴσως ἄληπτον ἔν γε τούτοις, καὶ οὐκ ἔδει πρὸς φιλόσοφον δόξῃ τε καὶ δυνάμει πρῶτον οὕτως ἀπαυθαδίσασθαι περὶ πράγματος ἀδήλου καὶ τοσαύτην ἀντιλογίαν[1] ἔχοντος."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Β

Τίς ὁ παρὰ τῷ Πλάτωνι κερασβόλος, καὶ διὰ τί τῶν σπερμάτων
C ἀτεράμονα γίγνεται τὰ προσπίπτοντα τοῖς κέρασι τῶν βοῶν;

Collocuntur Euthydemus, Patrocleas, Florus, Plutarchus, alii

1. Ἐν ταῖς Πλατωνικαῖς συναναγνώσεσιν[2] ὁ λεγόμενος "κερασβόλος" καὶ "ἀτεράμων" ζήτησιν ἀεὶ παρεῖχεν· οὐχ ὅστις εἴη, δῆλον γὰρ ἦν ὅτι τῶν σπερμάτων τὰ προσπίπτοντα τοῖς τῶν βοῶν κέρασιν ἀτεράμονα τὸν καρπὸν ἐκφύειν νομίζοντες οὕτως τὸν αὐθάδη καὶ σκληρὸν ἄνθρωπον ἐκ μεταφορᾶς κερασβόλον καὶ ἀτεράμονα προσηγόρευον· ἀλλὰ περὶ αὐτῆς διηπορεῖτο τῆς αἰτίας καθ' ἣν
D τοῦτο πάσχει τὰ προσπίπτοντα τοῖς κέρασι τῶν βοῶν σπέρματα. καὶ πολλάκις ἀπειπάμεθα τοῖς φίλοις, οὐχ ἥκιστα Θεοφράστου δεδιττομένου[3] τὸν λόγον, ἐν οἷς πολλὰ συναγήοχεν καὶ ἱστόρηκεν τῶν τὴν αἰτίαν ἀνεύρετον ἡμῖν ἐχόντων· οἷός ἐστιν ὁ τῶν ἀλεκτορίδων ὅταν τέκωσι περικαρφισμός, ἥ τε

[1] ἀντιλογίαν Bernardakis: αἰτιολογίαν.
[2] First four words transferred from end of Question 1 by Wyttenbach.
[3] δεδιττομένου Kronenberg: αἰνιττομένου.

[a] *Laws*, ix. 853 D.





Certainty, however, is doubtless unattainable in questions of this sort; and it was wrong to make such a rash attack, in a matter which is obscure and admits of so many contrary arguments, against a philosopher pre-eminent in reputation and in influence."

## QUESTION 2

Who the "horncast" man is, of whom Plato speaks, and why seeds that happen to touch the horns of cattle are "obdurate."

Speakers: Euthydemus, Patrocleas, Florus, Plutarch, and others

1. When we have had readings from Plato in company, the sort of person he calls "horncast" (*kerasbolos*) or "obdurate" (*ateramon*)[a] has always set us to puzzling—not who he is, for it is clear that people used to believe that seeds which touch the horns of oxen produce grain that is "obdurate" and so, by transfer, referred to a self-willed and unbending person as "horncast" and "obdurate." Our difficulty was rather to know the reason itself why seeds which touch the horns of cattle are so affected. I had frequently asked my friends to excuse me, not least because Theophrastus fights shy of the question, in a book that collects and discusses many phenomena whose causes we cannot discover,[b] such as the hen's covering herself with chaff when she has laid an egg,[c]

[b] Frag. 175 Wimmer; but Theophrastus does not mention the *kerasbolon* here, and in *De Causis Plant.* iv. 12. 13, he expresses doubt about this phenomenon.
[c] *Cf.* Aristotle, *Historia Animal.* vii. 2 (560 b 8). Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* x. 116 interprets this as an act of religious purification.

(700) καταπίνουσα φώκη τὴν πυτίαν ἁλισκομένη,[1] καὶ τὸ κατορυσσόμενον ὑπὸ τῶν ἐλάφων κέρας, καὶ τὸ ἠρύγγιον, ὃ μιᾶς αἰγὸς εἰς τὸ στόμα λαβούσης ἅπαν ἐφίσταται τὸ αἰπόλιον· ἐν τούτοις γὰρ καὶ τὰ κερασβόλα τῶν σπερμάτων προτίθεται, πρᾶγμα πίστιν ἔχον ὅτι γίγνεται, τὴν δ' αἰτίαν ἔχον ἄπορον
E ἢ παγχάλεπον. ἀλλ' ἔν γε Δελφοῖς παρὰ δεῖπνον ἐπέθεντό τινες ἡμῖν τῶν ἑταίρων, ὡς οὐ μόνον

γαστρὸς ἀπὸ πλείης βουλὴν καὶ μῆτιν ἀμείνω

γινομένην ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰς ζητήσεις πολὺ προθυμοτέρας καὶ θρασυτέρας τὰς ἀποφάνσεις τοῦ οἴνου ποιοῦντος, ἀξιοῦντες εἰπεῖν τι περὶ τοῦ προβλήματος.

2. Εἶχον μὲν οὖν ἀρνούμενος οὐ φαύλους συνηγόρους, Εὐθύδημον τὸν συνιερέα καὶ Πατροκλέα τὸν γαμβρόν, οὐκ ὀλίγα τοιαῦτα τῶν ἀπὸ γεωργίας καὶ κυνηγίας προφέροντας· οἷον ἐδόκει τὸ περὶ τὴν χάλαζαν εἶναι τὴν ὑπὸ τῶν χαλαζοφυλάκων αἵματι
F σπάλακος ἢ ῥακίοις γυναικείοις ἀποτρεπομένην· καὶ τὸ τῶν ἀγρίων ἐρινεῶν, ἃ ταῖς ἡμέροις περιαπτόμενα συκαῖς ἀπορρεῖν οὐκ ἐᾷ τὸν καρπὸν ἀλλὰ

[1] πυτίαν ἁλισκομένη Meziriacus, after Xylander : πίτυν ἀναλισκομένη.

[a] Aelian, *De Natura Animal.* iii. 19 ; Aristotle, frag. 370 Rose ; Ps.-Aristotle, *De Mir. Ausc.* 835 b 31 ; Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* xxviii. 77.





the seal's swallowing its rennet when captured,[a] the stag's burying its cast horns,[b] and the sea-holly (if one goat takes a bit of this in its mouth, the whole herd comes to a stop).[c] It is in this context that he mentions the matter of the horncast seeds, a phenomenon whose occurrence is attested, but whose cause is impossible or very difficult to discover. At a dinner in Delphi, however, some of my companions set upon me, pressing for a discussion of this problem, on the ground not only that

Counsel and wisdom are better when belly is full,[d]

but that wine makes a man much more zealous in inquiry and self-confident in stating his views.

2. I refused the request, and got no mean support from Euthydemus, my colleague in priesthood,[e] and Patrocleas my son-in-law,[f] who cited a good number of similar phenomena out of their experience in farming and hunting ; for example, the story of hail being averted by " hail-wizards " through the use of the blood of a mole or a woman's rags[g] ; or that about wild figs, which when attached to domesticated fig-trees prevent them from dropping their fruit, and

[b] Aristotle, *Historia Animal.* 611 a 29 ; frag. 370 Rose ; Aelian, *De Natura Animal.* iii. 17 ; Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* viii. 115.

[c] *Cf. De Sera Numinis Vindicta,* 558 E, *Maxime cum Princ.* 776 F ; Aristotle, *Historia Animal.* 610 b 29.

[d] Fragment of an unknown poet.

[e] This Euthydemus is probably not the same as " Euthydemus of Sunium " who appears in iii. 10.

[f] This man appears several times in Plutarch's dialogues. Since the writer's only daughter died in childhood, it is conjectured that by γαμβρός Plutarch means the husband of a niece (*RE, s.v.* " Plutarchos (2)," col. 651).

[g] *Cf.* Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* xxviii. 77.

(700) συνέχει καὶ συνεκπεπαίνει· καὶ τὸ τὰς ἐλάφους ἁλμυρὸν ἀφιέναι, τοὺς δὲ σῦς γλυκὺ τὸ δάκρυον ἁλισκομένους.

"Ἀλλ' ἐὰν ταῦτ'," ἔφη, "ζητῇς," ὁ Εὐθύδημος, "αὐτίκα δεήσει σε καὶ περὶ τοῦ σελίνου καὶ περὶ τοῦ κυμίνου διδόναι λόγον, ὧν τὸ μὲν ἐν τῷ βλαστάνειν καταπατοῦντες καὶ συντρίβοντες οἴονται
701 βέλτιον αὐξάνεσθαι, τὸ δ' ἂν καταρώμενοι σπείρωσι καὶ λοιδοροῦντες."

3. Ἐπεὶ δὲ τοῦτο μὲν ὁ Φλῶρος ᾤετο παιδιὰν εἶναι καὶ φλύαρον, ἐκείνων δ' οὐκ ἄν τινα τῆς αἰτίας ὡς ἀλήπτου προέσθαι τὴν ζήτησιν, "ἐξεύρηκ'," ἔφην, "φάρμακον, ᾧ πρὸς τὸν λόγον ἐφ' ἡμᾶς προσάξεις[1] τοῦτον, ἵνα καὶ σὺ διαλύσῃς ἕνια τῶν ἐκκειμένων. δοκεῖ δή μοι ἡ ψυχρότης τὸ ἀτέραμον ἐμποιεῖν τοῖς τε πυροῖς[2] καὶ τοῖς χέδροψι, πιέζουσα καὶ πηγνύουσα τὴν ἕξιν ἄχρι σκληρότητος, ἡ δὲ θερμότης τὸ εὐδιάλυτον καὶ μαλακόν. ὅθεν οὐκ ὀρθῶς οἱ λέγοντες, 'ἔτος φέρει οὔτις ἄρουρα,' τὰ καθ' Ὁμήρου λέγουσιν· τὰ γὰρ ἔνθερμα φύσει
B χωρία, κρᾶσιν εὐμενῆ τοῦ ἀέρος ἐνδιδόντος, ἐκφέρει μαλακωτέρους τοὺς καρπούς. ὅσα τοίνυν ἐκ τῆς χειρὸς εὐθὺς εἰς τὴν γῆν ἀφιέμεν' ἐμπίπτει τῶν σπερμάτων, ἐνδυόμενα καὶ λοχευόμενα τῇ κρύψει μᾶλλον ἀπολαύει τῆς ἐν τῇ γῇ θερμότητος καὶ ὑγρότητος· τὰ δὲ προσκρούοντα τοῖς κέρασι τῶν βοῶν οὐ τυγχάνει τῆς 'ἀρίστης' καθ' Ἡσίοδον

[1] προσάξεις Post : προσάξεις.
[2] πυροῖς Basel edition : ῥυπoῖς.

[a] *Cf. Amatorius*, 753 A ; Aristotle, *Historia Animal.* 557 b 29 ; Theophrastus, *De Causis Plant.* ii. 9. 5 ; Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* xv. 81.





promote its ripening [a] ; or the fact that deer when captured shed salty tears, while boars shed sweet.

"But if you go into these matters," said Euthydemus, "you will straightway have to explain about celery and cumin, too ; the first of these, people think, grows better if they trample and crush it as it grows, the other if they sow the seed with curses and maledictions." [b]

3. Since Florus thought all this last was childish nonsense, but that none of the former questions should be given up as insoluble, I said,[c] "I have found a potion that will make you leap into the argument against us, so that you too may lend a hand in solving some of the problems proposed. It seems to me to be cold that produces obduracy in both wheat and legumes ; it squeezes and freezes them into such a state that they are unyielding, whereas warmth produces a texture that is soft and easily loosened. Thus it is wrong to cite the proverb, 'the season, not the field, bears the crop,' against Homer.[d] For localities that are naturally warm, where the climate affords a bland temperature, produce grain that is softer. However, while seeds that sink into the soil straight from the hand that sows them, nestle down and become embedded, so that, covered up as they are, they get more good of the warmth and moisture of the soil, those which strike the horns of oxen do not receive the 'best placement,' as Hesiod calls it,[e] but

[b] *Cf.* Theophrastus, *Hist. Plant.* ii. 4. 3 ; Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* xix. 120, 158.

[c] Much of the following passage, and in particular the idea of the influence of cold, is borrowed from Theophrastus, *De Causis Plant.* iv. 12. 1-9.

[d] *Cf.* Theophrastus, *De Causis Plant.* iii. 23. 4 ; *Hist. Plant.* viii. 7. 6.

[e] *Works and Days*, 471.

(701) ' εὐθημοσύνης,' ἀλλὰ σφαλλόμενα καὶ παρολισθαίνοντα ῥιπτομένοις μᾶλλον ἢ σπειρομένοις προσέοικεν· ὅθεν ἢ φθείρουσιν αὐτὰ παντάπασιν αἱ ψυχρότητες ἢ δύστηκτα καὶ ἄχυμα καὶ ξυλώδη τοῖς χιτῶσι γυμνοῖς ἐπισκήπτουσαι ποιοῦσιν.

" Ὁρᾷς γὰρ ὅτι καὶ τῶν λίθων τὰ ἔγγαια καὶ
C ζώφυτα μέρη μαλακώτερα τῶν ἐπιπολῆς ἡ ἀλέα φυλάττει· διὸ καὶ κατορύττουσιν οἱ τεχνῖται τοὺς ἐργασίμους λίθους, ὥσπερ ἐκπεπαινομένους ὑπὸ τῆς θερμότητος· οἱ δ' ὕπαιθροι καὶ γυμνοὶ διὰ ψῦχος ἀντίτυποι καὶ δυσμετάβλητοι καὶ ἀτεράμονες[1] ἀπαντῶσι τοῖς ἔργοις. τοὺς δὲ καρπούς, κἂν ἐπὶ τῆς ἅλω διαμείνωσι πλείω χρόνον ὑπαίθριοι καὶ γυμνοί, μᾶλλον ἀτεράμονας γίνεσθαι λέγουσιν τῶν εὐθὺς αἰρομένων. ἐνιαχοῦ δὲ καὶ πνεῦμα λικμωμένοις ἐπιγινόμενον ἀτεράμονας ποιεῖ διὰ τὸ
D ψῦχος, ὥσπερ ἐν Φιλίπποις τῆς Μακεδονίας ἱστοροῦσι· τοῖς δ' ἀποκειμένοις βοηθεῖ τὸ ἄχυρον. οὐ δεῖ δὲ θαυμάζειν ἀκούοντας τῶν γεωργῶν, ὅτι καὶ δυεῖν αὐλάκων παραλλήλων ἡ μὲν ἀτεράμονας, ἡ δὲ τεράμονας[2] ἐκφέρει τοὺς καρπούς, καὶ ὃ μέγιστόν ἐστι, τοὺς κυάμους τῶν λοβῶν οἱ μὲν τοίους οἱ δὲ τοίους, δηλονότι τοῖς μὲν ἧττον τοῖς δὲ μᾶλλον ἢ πνεύματος ψυχροῦ προσπεσόντος ἢ ὕδατος."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Γ

*Διὰ τί τοῦ μὲν οἴνου τὸ μέσον, τοῦ δ' ἐλαίου τὸ ἐπάνω, τοῦ δὲ μέλιτος τὸ κάτω γίνεται βέλτιον;*

Collocuntur Alexio, Plutarchus, alii

1. Ἀλεξίων ὁ πενθερὸς κατεγέλα τοῦ Ἡσιόδου

[1] ἀτεράμονες Bernardakis : ἀτεράμνοις.





as they are baffled and glance off, are more like seed thrown away than sown. So the cold, impinging upon their naked coats, either destroys them altogether or makes them unyielding and juiceless and woody.

" You observe, too, that those parts of stones which are underground and quickset are kept softer by the warmth than the parts on the surface. This is why artisans in fact bury stones that are to be worked, as though they were to be ripened by the heat, whereas those that lie naked in the open air are by reason of cold impenetrable and rigid, and prove to be difficult to work. They say that even such grain as lies naked to the sky on the threshing-floor for a good while becomes more obdurate than any that is removed at once. In some places a wind that comes up during winnowing will make them obdurate by cooling (this is reported from Philippi in Macedonia), whereas what has been put away is protected by the chaff. We need not be surprised when we hear farmers say that even of two furrows side by side one will produce unyielding, and one yielding grain, or even, what is more, that some pods have one kind of beans and others another, clearly because some are more exposed, some less, to the cold onset of wind and rain."

## QUESTION 3

Why it is that in wine the middle part is best, in olive oil the top, and in honey the bottom.[a]

Speakers : Alexio, Plutarch, others

1. Alexio, my father-in-law,[b] ridiculed Hesiod for

[a] Macrobius imitates this discussion, *Saturnalia*, vii. 12. 8-16. [b] The only mention of Plutarch's father-in-law.

[2] ἡ δὲ τεράμονας added by Bernardakis.

(701) παραινοῦντος, " ἀρχομένου πίθου καὶ λήγοντος ἐμφορεῖσθαι, μεσσόθι δὲ φείδεσθαι," ὅπου τὸ χρη-
E στότατον οἰνάριον ἔστιν. " τίς γάρ," ἔφη, " οὐκ οἶδεν, ὅτι τοῦ μὲν οἴνου τὸ μέσον γίνεται βέλτιστον, τοῦ δ' ἐλαίου τὸ ἀνωτάτω, τὸ δὲ κατωτάτω τοῦ μέλιτος; ὁ δ' ἐᾶν ἐκέλευεν τὸν ἐν μέσῳ[1] καὶ περιμένειν, ἄχρι ἂν μεταβάλῃ πρὸς τὸ χεῖρον, ἀποδεοῦς τοῦ πίθου γενομένου." ῥηθέντων δὲ τούτων, χαίρειν ἐάσαντες τὸν Ἡσίοδον ἐπὶ τὸ ζητεῖν τὴν αἰτίαν τῆς διαφορᾶς ὡρμήσαμεν.[2]

2. Ὁ μὲν οὖν τοῦ μέλιτος λόγος οὐ πάνυ πολλὰ πράγματα παρέσχεν ἡμῖν, πάντων ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν ἐπισταμένων ὅτι τὸ κουφότατον ὑπὸ μανότητος κουφότατόν ἐστιν, τὸ δὲ πυκνὸν καὶ συνεχὲς διὰ
F βάρος ὑφίσταται τῷ λοιπῷ· κἂν περιστρέψῃς τὸ ἀγγεῖον, αὖθις ὀλίγῳ χρόνῳ τὴν προσήκουσαν ἑκάτερον ἀπολαμβάνει χώραν, τοῦ μὲν κάτω φερομένου τοῦ δ' ἐπιπολάζοντος.

Οὐ μὴν οὐδ' ὁ οἶνος ἀπελείφθη πιθανῶν ἐπιχειρημάτων· πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ ἡ δύναμις αὐτοῦ, θερμότης οὖσα, πρὸς τὸ μέσον εὐλόγως δοκεῖ συνῆχθαι μάλιστα καὶ τοῦτο διατηρεῖν βέλτιστον· ἔπειτα τὸ μὲν κάτω διὰ τὴν τρύγα φαῦλον εἶναι, τὸ δ' ἐξ
702 ἐπιπολῆς τοῦ ἀέρος φθείρεσθαι πλησιάζοντος· ὅσων[3] γὰρ ἐξίστησιν ὁ ἀὴρ τῆς ποιότητος τὸν οἶνον ἐπισφαλέστατον[4] ἴσμεν ὄντα· διὸ καὶ κατορύττουσι τοὺς πίθους καὶ σκεπάζουσιν, ὅπως ὅτι σμικρότατος ἀὴρ αὐτῶν ἐπιψαύῃ. τὸ δὲ μέγιστον, οὐ φθείρει πλῆρες ἀγγεῖον οὕτως ῥᾳδίως οἶνον ὡς ἀποδεὲς

[1] μέσῳ Doehner : μέσῳ οἶνον.
[2] ὡρμήσαμεν Kronenberg : ὥρμησαν.





giving the advice, " when the storage jar is first opened or giving out, drink your fill, but be sparing of the middle part "[a]—where the best part of the wine is found. " Who does not know," he said, " that in wine the middle part is best, in olive oil the top, and in honey the bottom? Yet Hesiod tells us to let the wine in the middle stand, and wait till it changes for the worse, after the jar is partly emptied." With this comment, we took leave of Hesiod, and attacked the problem why there is this difference.

2. The explanation was not at all troublesome in the case of honey, since practically everyone knows that what is lightest is so because of the looseness of its elements, whereas the dense and compact, because of its weight, sinks below the rest; and if you turn the container over, each part presently resumes its proper position again, one sinking and the other rising.

Nor was wine, moreover, left destitute of plausible arguments. In the first place, it seems reasonable that its specific power, which is heat, is especially concentrated in the middle, so that it keeps this part of it in best condition. Secondly, the lower part is of poor quality because of the lees, while that on the surface tends to deteriorate because of its contact with the air. For of all the things whose quality air alters we know that wine is the most susceptible. So in fact they bury wine jars in the ground and cover them, so that as little air as possible may come in contact with them. What is more, a full container does not let wine go bad as easily as one partly

[a] *Works and Days*, 368.

[3] ὅσων Herwerden : ὅτι.
[4] ἐπισφαλέστατον Stephanus : ἐπισφαλέστερον.

(702) γενόμενον· πολὺς γὰρ εἰς τὸ κενούμενον ἐπεισρέων ὁ ἀὴρ ἐξίστησι μᾶλλον· ἐν δὲ τοῖς μεστοῖς ὁ οἶνος αὐτὸς ὑφ' αὑτοῦ συνέχεται, πολὺ τοῦ φθείροντος ἔξωθεν μὴ παραδεχόμενος.

3. Τὸ δ' ἔλαιον οὐ φαύλην διατριβὴν παρέσχεν. ὁ μὲν γάρ τις ἔφη τὸ κάτω τοῦ ἐλαίου γίνεσθαι χεῖρον ἀπὸ τῆς ἀμόργης ἀναθολούμενον, οὐ τὸ ἄνω
B βέλτιον, ἀλλὰ δοκεῖν, ὅτι πορρωτάτω τοῦ βλάπτοντός ἐστιν. ἄλλος ἠτιᾶτο τὴν πυκνότητα, δι' ἣν ἀμικτότατόν ἐστι καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ὑγρῶν οὐδὲν εἰς αὐτὸ δέχεται, πλὴν βίᾳ καὶ ὑπὸ πληγῆς ἀνακοπτόμενον· ὅθεν οὐδὲ τῷ ἀέρι δίδωσιν ἀνάμιξιν, ἀλλ' ἀποστατεῖ διὰ λεπτότητα τῶν μορίων καὶ συνέχειαν, ὥσθ' ἧττον ὑπ' αὐτοῦ τρέπεσθαι μὴ κρατοῦντος. ἐδόκει δὲ πρὸς τοῦτον ὑπεναντιοῦσθαι τὸν λόγον Ἀριστοτέλης, τετηρηκώς, ὡς φησιν, εὐωδέστερόν τε γινόμενον καὶ βέλτιον ὅλως τὸ ἐν τοῖς ἀποκενουμένοις[1] ἀγγείοις ἔλαιον· εἶτα τῷ ἀέρι τὴν αἰτίαν τῆς βελτιώσεως ἀνατίθησιν, πλείων γάρ
C ἐστι καὶ κρατεῖ μᾶλλον εἰς ἀποδεὲς κατερχόμενος τὸ ἀγγεῖον.

4. "Μήποτ' οὖν," ἔφην ἐγώ, "καὶ τὸ ἔλαιον ὁ ἀὴρ ὠφελεῖ καὶ βλάπτει τὸν οἶνον ἀπὸ τῆς αὐτῆς δυνάμεως; οἴνῳ μὲν γὰρ ὠφέλιμον, ἐλαίῳ δ' ἀσύμφορον παλαίωσις, ἣν ἑκατέρου προσπίπτων ὁ ἀὴρ ἀφαιρεῖ· τὸ γὰρ ψυχόμενον νεαρὸν διαμένει,[2] τὸ δ' οὐκ ἔχον διαπνοὴν ὑπὸ συνεχείας ταχὺ παλαιοῦται καὶ ἀπογηράσκει.[3] διὸ τοῦ μὲν οἴνου τὸ

[1] ἀποκενουμένοις Wyttenbach: ἀποκειμένοις.

[2] διαμένει Stephanus: διαφέρει.

[3] The following words, λελέχθαι πιθανῶς, ὅτι τοῖς ἐπιπολῆς πλησιάζων ὁ ἀὴρ νεαροποιεῖ, are deleted by Hubert as a marginal note.





empty. For if the air comes streaming into an emptied vessel, it is more likely to produce an alteration of quality, whereas in full containers the wine is self-enclosed, and does not permit much of the destructive element to penetrate from outside.

3. Olive-oil provided us an interesting topic. Someone expressed the opinion that the lower part of the oil is less good because it is adulterated by the watery exudate from the olives, and that the upper part is not actually better, but seems so, because it is farthest from this source of contamination. Someone else found a cause in the density of olive oil, which accounts for its being very averse to mixture, not admitting any other liquid into it except by force, and when it is vigorously beaten. Thus it does not submit to mixture with air either, but holds aloof because of the fineness and coherence of its particles, with the result that it is less likely to be altered by an element which has no power over it. We thought, however, that this argument was countered by the observation reported by Aristotle,[a] that oil in partly emptied vessels has a better odour and is better on all counts; he goes on to attribute the improvement to the action of air, which is present in greater quantity and strength when it enters a partly empty vessel.

4. "I wonder if it may not be," said I, "that the same property of air both improves oil and harms wine. For ageing is beneficial to wine but harmful to oil, and air by its contact deprives them both of this. One of them is cooled and retains its freshness, but the other, which, because of its compactness, has no passageways for air, quickly ages and gets stale. This is why the top of the wine is least good and the top

[a] Frag. 224 Rose.

(702) ἄνω φαυλότατον τοῦ δ' ἐλαίου βέλτιστον· ἡ γὰρ παλαίωσις τῷ μὲν τὴν ἀρίστην τῷ δὲ τὴν κακίστην ἐμποιεῖ διάθεσιν."

D

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Δ

*Διὰ τί τοῖς πάλαι Ῥωμαίοις ἔθος ἦν μήτε τράπεζαν αἰρομένην περιορᾶν κενὴν μήτε λύχνον σβεννύμενον;*

Collocuntur Florus, Eustrophus, Caesernius, Lucius, Plutarchus

1. Φιλάρχαιος ὢν[1] ὁ Φλῶρος οὐκ εἴα κενὴν ἀπαίρειν τὴν τράπεζαν, ἀλλ' ἀεὶ τῶν ἐδωδίμων ἐπ' αὐτῆς ὑπέλειπεν· "καὶ οὐ τοῦτο μόνον," ἔφη, "οἶδα τὸν πατέρα καὶ τὸν πάππον εὖ μάλα παραφυλάττοντας, ἀλλὰ μηδὲ λύχνον ἐῶντας ἀποσβεννύναι· καὶ γὰρ τοῦτο τοὺς παλαιοὺς Ῥωμαίους ἐξευλαβεῖσθαι· τοὺς δὲ νῦν εὐθὺς ἀποσβεννύναι μετὰ τὸ δεῖπνον, ὅπως μὴ μάτην τοὔλαιον ἀναλίσκωσι."

Παρὼν οὖν Εὔστροφος ὁ Ἀθηναῖος, "εἶτ'," ἔφη, "τί πλέον αὐτοῖς, ἂν μὴ τὸ Πολυχάρμου τοῦ ἡμε-
E τέρου σοφὸν ἐκμάθωσιν; ὃς πολὺν ἔφη σκεπτόμενος χρόνον, ὅπως οὐ κλέψουσι τοὔλαιον οἱ παῖδες, ἐξευρεῖν μόλις· εὐθὺς γὰρ ἀποπληροῦν τοὺς λύχνους ἀποσβεσθέντας, εἶτ' ἐπισκοπεῖν τῇ ὑστεραίᾳ πάλιν, εἰ πλήρεις διαμένουσιν."

Γελάσας δ' ὁ Φλῶρος, "οὐκοῦν," εἶπεν, "ἐπεὶ τοῦτο τὸ πρόβλημα λέλυται, σκεψώμεθα τὸν λόγον,

[1] *φιλάρχαιος ὢν* Amyot, Meziriacus: *φίλαρχος.*

[a] *Cf. Quaest. Rom.* 64, 279 D, 75, 281 F, where some of the same explanations are advanced. Rose (in his commentary, p. 197) thinks it likely that this custom was "a





of the oil is best; the ageing process induces the most favourable condition in the one and the least favourable in the other."

## QUESTION 4

The reason for the custom of the ancient Romans, not to allow a table to be removed empty, nor to let a lamp be extinguished.[a]

Speakers: Florus, Eustrophus, Caesernius, Lucius, Plutarch

1. Florus, being a lover of old customs, would never let the servants take his table away empty, but would always leave some food on it. "I know," he said, "that my father and grandfather not only observed this custom very carefully, but also would refuse to let them put out the lamp. This was another thing the ancient Romans were scrupulous about, but people nowadays put it out directly after eating, so as not to waste oil."

Eustrophus the Athenian,[b] who was among the guests, said, "What gain would that be to them, unless they knew the trick of my fellow citizen Polycharmus? After long consideration of the problem of preventing the slaves from stealing oil, he finally came up with this method: to fill the lamps immediately after they are extinguished, and then inspect them the next day, to see whether they are still full."

"Well," said Florus with a laugh, "since this problem has been solved, let us consider what reason

piece of sympathetic magic, designed to prevent the family from being short of food."

[b] Also a character in the dialogue *De E apud Delphos.*

(702) ᾧ τοὺς παλαιοὺς εἰκός ἐστι καὶ περὶ τοὺς λύχνους καὶ περὶ τὰς τραπέζας οὕτως εὐλαβεῖς γεγονέναι."

2. Πρότερον οὖν ἐζητεῖτο περὶ τῶν λύχνων· καὶ ὁ μὲν γαμβρὸς αὐτοῦ Καισέρνιος ᾤετο τῇ πρὸς τὸ ἄσβεστον καὶ ἱερὸν πῦρ συγγενείᾳ παντὸς φθορὰν πυρὸς ἀφοσιώσασθαι τοὺς πρεσβυτέρους· δύο γὰρ
F εἶναι φθοράς, ὥσπερ ἀνθρώπου, τὴν μὲν βίαιον σβεννυμένου, τὴν δ' ὥσπερ κατὰ φύσιν ἀπομαραινομένου· τῷ μὲν οὖν ἱερῷ πρὸς ἀμφοτέρας ἀρήγειν, ἀεὶ τρέφοντας καὶ φυλάττοντας· τὸ δ' ἄλλο δι' αὑτοῦ περιορᾶν μαραινόμενον, αὐτοὺς δὲ μὴ βιάζεσθαι μηδὲ φθονεῖν ὥσπερ θρέμματος ἀφαιρουμένους τὸ ζῆν ἵνα μὴ μάτην τρέφοιτο.

3. Λεύκιος δ' ὁ τοῦ Φλώρου υἱὸς τἄλλα μὲν ἔφη καλῶς λέγεσθαι, τὸ δ' ἱερὸν πῦρ οὐκ ἄμεινον ἡγουμένους[1] ἑτέρου πυρὸς οὐδὲ σεμνότερον οὕτω σέ-
703 βεσθαι καὶ περιέπειν· ἀλλ' ὥσπερ Αἰγυπτίων ἐνίους μὲν τὸ κυνῶν γένος ἅπαν σέβεσθαι καὶ τιμᾶν, ἐνίους δὲ τὸ λύκων ἢ κροκοδείλων, ἕνα μέντοι τρέφειν τοὺς μὲν κύνα τοὺς δὲ κροκόδειλον τοὺς δὲ λύκον (οὐ γὰρ οἷόν τ' ἦν ἅπαντας), οὕτως ἐνταῦθα τὴν περὶ ἐκεῖνο θεραπείαν καὶ φυλακὴν τὸ πῦρ τῆς πρὸς ἅπαν εὐλαβείας εἶναι σύμβολον. " οὐδὲν γὰρ ἄλλο μᾶλλον ἐμψύχῳ προσέοικεν ἢ πῦρ, κινούμενόν τε καὶ τρεφόμενον δι' αὑτοῦ καὶ τῇ λαμπρότητι δηλοῦν, ὥσπερ ἡ ψυχή, καὶ σαφηνίζον ἅπαντα· μάλιστα δὲ ταῖς σβέσεσιν αὐτοῦ καὶ φθοραῖς ἐμφαί-

[1] ἡγουμένους Wyttenbach : αἱρουμένους.





the ancients probably had for being so scrupulous, both in the matter of lamps and that of tables."

2. First we looked into the question about lamps. Florus' son-in-law Caesernius opined that his ancestors had avoided putting out any fire out of pious motives, because of its kinship to the unquenchable, sacred fire.[a] Fire, like man, can die two kinds of death—one violent, when it is put out, and the other when it dies out in a natural way. The sacred fire they protected against both kinds, continually feeding and watching over it; an ordinary fire they would allow to die out of itself, but they would not themselves use violence toward it, nor seem to begrudge it sustenance, so to speak, by taking its life to avoid feeding a useless mouth, as we do with livestock.

3. Florus' son Lucius[b] expressed general satisfaction with these remarks, but said that the Romans did not revere and minister to the sacred fire in this way because they thought it better or more holy than other fire, but that just as some of the Egyptians worship and honour the whole race of dogs, others that of wolves or crocodiles, but feed only a single one (some a dog, some a crocodile, and some a wolf), because it is not possible to feed them all—so in Rome the care and preservation of that particular fire is symbolic of a reverent attitude to all fire. " For there is nothing else," he said, " that is more like a living being than fire. It is self-moved and finds its own food, and by its radiance, like the mind, reveals and clarifies everything. Especially in its extinction or destruction a force is vaguely seen that

[a] The fire in the temple of Vesta, in the Forum, tended perpetually by the Vestal Virgins.

[b] Only mentioned here.

(703) B νεται δύναμις οὐκ ἀμοιροῦσα ζωτικῆς ἀρχῆς· βοᾷ γὰρ καὶ φθέγγεται καὶ ἀμύνεται, καθάπερ ἔμψυχον ἀποθνῆσκον βίᾳ καὶ φονευόμενον· εἰ μή τι σὺ λέγεις," ἔφη πρὸς ἐμὲ βλέψας, " βέλτιον."

4. " Οὐδέν," εἶπον ἐγώ, " τῶν εἰρημένων αἰτιῶμαι· προσθείην δ' ἄν, ὅτι καὶ φιλανθρωπίας διδασκαλία τὸ ἔθος ἐστίν· οὔτε γὰρ τροφὴν ἀφανίζειν ὅσιον αὐτοὺς ἄδην ἔχοντας, οὔτε νάματος ἐμφορηθέντας πηγὴν ἀποτυφλοῦν καὶ ἀποκρύπτειν, οὔτε πλοῦ σημεῖα καὶ ὁδοῦ διαφθείρειν χρησαμένους, ἀλλ' ἐᾶν καὶ ἀπολείπειν τὰ χρήσιμα τοῖς δεησομένοις μεθ' ἡμᾶς. ὅθεν οὐδὲ φῶς λύχνου μὴ δεο- C μένους ἀπολλύναι διὰ μικρολογίαν καλόν, ἀλλὰ τηρεῖν καὶ ἀπολείπειν, εἴ τις ἔλθοι δεόμενος παρόντος ἔτι καὶ λάμποντος· καὶ γὰρ ὄψιν, εἰ δυνατὸν ἦν, καὶ ἀκοὴν χρῆσαι καλῶς εἶχεν ἑτέρῳ καὶ νὴ Δία τὴν φρόνησιν καὶ τὴν ἀνδρείαν, μέλλοντας αὐτοὺς καθεύδειν καὶ ἡσυχάζειν.

" Ὅρα δ', εἰ καὶ μελέτης ἕνεκα τοῦ εὐχαρίστου τὰς τοιαύτας ἐφιέντες ὑπερβολὰς οὐκ ἀτόπως οἱ παλαιοὶ καὶ δρῦς ἐσέβοντο καρποφόρους καὶ συκῆν τινα προσηγόρευσαν ἱερὰν Ἀθηναῖοι καὶ μορίαν ἐκκόπτειν ἀπαγορεύουσιν[1]· ταῦτα γὰρ οὐ ποιεῖ πρὸς δεισιδαιμονίαν ἐπιφόρους, ὡς ἔνιοί φασιν, ἀλλὰ D προσεθίζει τὸ εὐχάριστον ἡμῶν καὶ κοινωνικὸν ἐν τοῖς ἀναισθήτοις καὶ ἀψύχοις πρὸς ἀλλήλους. ὅθεν

[1] ἀπαγορεύουσιν Basel edition: προσαγορεύουσιν.





is not utterly devoid of elemental life. It protests and speaks up and resists like a living creature that is slain by a violent and murderous death.—Or perhaps you have some better explanation," he concluded, turning to me.

4. " No," I replied, " I have no objection to what you have said, but I might add that the custom teaches a lesson in social responsibility. For it is impious to destroy food when we have ourselves eaten enough, or to blind and conceal a spring as soon as we have had our fill of its flow, or to destroy the markers of a voyage or journey after using them. No, we should leave and abandon whatever is serviceable for the benefit of any who follow us and need them. Consequently it is also not gentlemanly to be so minutely thrifty as to quench a lamp that is not needed. We should keep it going and leave it burning in case someone should come who requires a light still shining there. It would in fact also be generous to lend the sense of sight or hearing to another, if it were possible, as well as, by Zeus, the virtues of prudence and courage, if we expect to be asleep and inactive ourselves.

" I wonder in fact whether it was not merely absurd —whether it was to inculcate the virtue of gratitude by enjoining such extreme observances that the ancients showed reverence to the fruitful oak, while the Athenians pronounced a certain fig-tree sacred and prohibit the grubbing out of a holy olive? The effect of these observances is not to make us prone to superstition, as some say, but to make gratitude habitual, as well as the impulse to share with each other, where respect is shown for things without sensation and even without life. Thus Hesiod is

(703) ὀρθῶς μὲν Ἡσίοδος οὐδ' ' ἀπὸ χυτροπόδων ἀνεπιρρέκτων ' ἐᾷ παρατίθεσθαι σῖτον ἢ ὄψον, ἀλλ' ἀπαρχὰς τῷ πυρὶ καὶ γέρα τῆς διακονίας ἀποδιδόντας· εὖ δὲ Ῥωμαῖοι χρησάμενοι τοῖς λύχνοις ἣν ἔδοσαν οὐκ ἀφῃροῦντο τροφήν, ἀλλὰ χρῆσθαι ζῶντας εἴων[1] καὶ λάμποντας."

5. Ἐμοῦ δὲ ταῦτ' εἰπόντος ὁ Εὔστροφος, " ἆρ' οὖν," ἔφη, " τοῦτο καὶ τῷ περὶ τῆς τραπέζης λόγῳ πάροδον οἰκείαν δίδωσιν, οἰομένων δεῖν ἀεί τι καταλιπεῖν οἰκέταις ἀπὸ δείπνου καὶ παισὶν οἰκετῶν; χαίρουσι γὰρ οὐχ οὕτως λαμβάνοντες ὡς μεταλαμ-
E βάνοντες. διὸ καὶ τοὺς Περσῶν βασιλεῖς φασιν οὐ μόνον φίλοις καὶ ἡγεμόσι καὶ σωματοφύλαξιν ἀποπέμπειν ἀεὶ μερίδας, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ τῶν δούλων καὶ τὸ τῶν κυνῶν δεῖπνον[2] ἐπὶ τῆς ἐκείνων προτίθεσθαι τραπέζης, ὡς ἀνυστὸν[3] ἦν, πάντας οἷς ἐχρῶντο ποιουμένων ὁμοτραπέζους καὶ ὁμεστίους. ἡμεροῦται γὰρ τῇ τῆς τροφῆς μεταδόσει καὶ τὰ σκυθρωπότατα τῶν θηρίων."

6. Ἐγὼ δὲ γελάσας, " ἐκεῖνον δ'," εἶπον, " ὦ ἑταῖρε, τὸν ἐκ τῆς παροιμίας ' ἀποκείμενον ἰχθῦν ' διὰ τί[4] οὐχ ἕλκομεν[5] εἰς μέσον μετὰ τῆς Πυθαγορικῆς χοίνικος, ἐφ' ἧς ἀπηγόρευεν καθῆσθαι, διδάσκων
F ἡμᾶς ἀεί τι τοῦ παρόντος εἰς τὸ μέλλον ὑπολείπειν καὶ τῆς αὔριον ἐν τῇ σήμερον μνημονεύειν; ἡμῖν μὲν οὖν τοῖς Βοιωτοῖς τὸ ' λεῖπέ τι καὶ Μήδοις ' διὰ στόματός ἐστιν, ἐξ οὗ Μῆδοι τήν τε Φωκίδα καὶ τὰ

[1] ζῶντας εἴων Xylander, Reiske: ζῶν.
[2] So Sandbach: ἀεὶ δεῖπνον.
[3] ἀνυστὸν Stephanus: ἂν οἰστὸν.
[4] διὰ τί added by Stephanus.
[5] ἕλκομεν Basel edition: ἑλκόμενον.

[a] *Works and Days*, 748. Hesiod apparently meant " from





right in not permitting us to serve bread and meat ' from undedicated dishes.' [a] We should render the fire its due libation as a tribute to its service; and the Romans did well, after making use of a lamp, not to scant it of the food that they had themselves given it, but to allow the lamp to live and shine by using the rest."

5. After my remarks, Eustrophus asked, " Does this also provide a useful approach to the question of the table? Did people think that they ought always to leave something from dinner for the slaves and the slaves' children? They enjoy not so much the taking as the partaking with us. So too the kings of Persia (they say) not only always send portions to their friends and officers and bodyguards, but even see that the slaves' dinner, and the dogs' dinner, are served on their table, in so far as this is feasible, considering all who serve them sharers in table and hearth. For by passing out food even the most sullen of wild beasts can be tamed."

6. I replied with a smile, " My friend, we may as well drag in the proverbial ' fish in reserve,' [b] too, and Pythagoras' peck-measure,[c] upon which he forbade us to sit, in order to teach us always to leave for the future some part of what is at hand, and each day to think of the morrow. We Boeotians have had on our tongues the saying, ' Leave some for the Medes, too,' since the time when the Medes came ravaging

an uncharmed pot " (Evelyn-White), *i.e.*, " Do not use vessels until you have offered sacrifice over them " (Sinclair); but Plutarch is thinking of an offering *from* the pot.

[b] Leutsch-Schneidewin, *Paroemiographi Graeci*, ii. 462.

[c] Plutarch was fond of this Pythagorean precept, which he " dragged in " at least five times in his surviving works. On the *symbola* see below, viii. 7-8, and notes.

(703) ἔσχατα τῆς Βοιωτίας ἄγοντες καὶ φέροντες ἐπέτρεχον· ἀεὶ δὲ καὶ πανταχοῦ δεῖ πρόχειρον εἶναι τὸ 'λεῖπέ τι καὶ ξένοις ἐπελθοῦσιν.' ὡς ἔγωγε καὶ τοῦ Ἀχιλλέως κενὴν ἀεὶ καὶ λιμώδη καταλαμβανο-
704 μένην αἰτιῶμαι τὴν τράπεζαν· τῶν τε γὰρ περὶ τὸν Αἴαντα καὶ τὸν Ὀδυσσέα πρέσβεων ἀφικομένων, οὐδὲν ἔχων ἕτοιμον ἀναγκάζεται μαγειρεύειν ἐξ ὑπαρχῆς καὶ ὀψοποιεῖν, τόν τε Πρίαμον φιλοφρονεῖσθαι βουλόμενος πάλιν 'ἀναΐξας ὄιν ἄργυφον' σφάττει καὶ διαιρεῖ καὶ ὀπτᾷ, πολὺ μέρος περὶ ταῦτ' ἀναλίσκων τῆς νυκτός. ὁ δ' Εὔμαιος, ἅτε δὴ θρέμμα γεγονὼς σοφοῦ σοφόν, οὐ πράγματ' εἶχεν τοῦ Τελεμάχου ἐπιφανέντος, ἀλλ' εὐθὺς ἑστιᾷ καθίσαντα, πίνακας κρεῶν παρατιθεὶς

ὀπταλέων, ἃ ῥα τῇ προτέρῃ κατέλειπον ἔδοντες.

εἰ δὲ τοῦτο δόξει μικρόν, ἐκεῖνό γ' οὐ μικρόν, τὸ
B συστέλλειν καὶ ἀνέχειν τὴν ὄρεξιν ἔτι παρούσης τῆς ἀπολαύσεως· ἧττον γὰρ ἐπιθυμοῦσι τῶν ἀπόντων[1] οἱ ἐθισθέντες ἀπέχεσθαι τῶν παρόντων."

7. Ὑπολαβὼν δ' ὁ Λεύκιος ἔφη τῆς μάμμης ἀκηκοὼς μνημονεύειν, ὡς ἱερὸν μὲν ἡ τράπεζα, δεῖ δὲ τῶν ἱερῶν μηδὲν εἶναι κενόν. "ἐμοὶ δ'," εἶπεν, "ἐδόκει καὶ μίμημα τῆς γῆς ἡ τράπεζ' εἶναι· πρὸς γὰρ τῷ τρέφειν ἡμᾶς καὶ στρογγύλη καὶ μόνιμός ἐστι καὶ καλῶς ὑπ' ἐνίων 'ἑστία' καλεῖται. καθάπερ γὰρ τὴν γῆν ἀεί τι χρήσιμον ἔχειν καὶ φέρειν

[1] ἀπόντων Basel edition: ἁπάντων.

[a] *Cf.* Athenaeus, i. 13 a. [b] *Iliad*, ix. 206.
[c] *Iliad*, xxiv. 621. [d] *Odyssey*, xvi. 50.
[e] The Greek word can mean "home" as well as "hearth" (and to be sure Hofmann, *Etym. Wörterbuch d. Gr.* p. 96,





and pillaging to Phocis and the borders of Boeotia. But the maxim for every time and place is 'leave something for unexpected guests.'[a] I, for one, include in my disapproval the table of Achilles, which is always found empty and hungry. When the embassy of Ajax and Odysseus came,[b] he had nothing ready, and had to start from the very beginning, butchering and roasting meat; and again, when he wanted to show Priam hospitality, he 'jumped up' and slaughtered a 'white sheep,' cut it up and roasted it, consuming in this a good part of the night.[c] Eumaeus, on the other hand, the wise thrall of a wise man, suffered no embarrassment when Telemachus appeared, but at once gave him a seat and provided hospitable fare, putting before him platters of meat,

Roasted, which were left over from yesterday's meal.[d]

If this seems a small point, the next is not: to take in sail and hold back the appetite while there is still pleasure in food; for those are less greedy for what they do not have who have been trained to abstain from what they do have."

7. Lucius, in reply, said he recalled hearing from his grandmother that the table is sacred and that nothing sacred should be empty. "I have entertained the idea," he went on, "that the table is in fact copied from the earth. For besides nourishing us, it is both round and stable, and by some it is properly given the name of 'hearth.'[e] Just as we expect the earth always to have and produce something useful for us,

would derive it from a root meaning "dwell"). Popular etymology doubtless connected it with ἑστάναι, "stand," as does Cornutus, *De Nat. Deor.* 28. An old tradition identified the goddess Hestia with Gaia or Earth (Sophocles, frag. 558 Nauck; Euripides, frag. 944 Nauck).

(704) ἡμῖν ἀξιοῦμεν, οὕτως οὐδὲ τὴν τράπεζαν οἰόμεθα δεῖν κενὴν ὁρᾶν καὶ ἀνερμάτιστον ἀπολειπομένην."

C

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ε

*Ὅτι δεῖ μάλιστα τὰς διὰ τῆς κακομουσίας ἡδονὰς φυλάττεσθαι, καὶ πῶς φυλακτέον*

Collocuntur Callistratus, Lamprias, Plutarchus

1. Ἐν Πυθίοις Καλλίστρατος, τῶν Ἀμφικτυόνων ἐπιμελητής, αὐλῳδόν τινα πολίτην καὶ φίλον ὑστερήσαντα τῆς ἀπογραφῆς τοῦ μὲν ἀγῶνος εἶρξε κατὰ τὸν νόμον, ἑστιῶν δ' ἡμᾶς παρήγαγεν εἰς τὸ συμπόσιον ἐσθῆτι καὶ στεφάνοις, ὥσπερ ἐν ἀγῶνι, μετὰ τοῦ χοροῦ κεκοσμημένον ἐκπρεπῶς. καὶ νὴ
D Δία κομψὸν ἦν ἀκρόαμα τὸ πρῶτον· ἔπειτα διασείσας καὶ διακωδωνίσας τὸ συμπόσιον, ὡς ἠσθάνετο τοὺς πολλοὺς ἐγκεκλικότας καὶ παρέχοντας ὑφ' ἡδονῆς ὅ τι βούλοιτο χρῆσθαι καὶ καταυλεῖν καὶ ἀκολασταίνειν, ἀποκαλυψάμενος παντάπασιν ἐπεδείξατο τὴν μουσικὴν παντὸς οἴνου μᾶλλον μεθύσκουσαν τοὺς ὅπως ἔτυχεν καὶ ἀνέδην αὐτῆς ἐμφορουμένους· οὐδὲ γὰρ κατακειμένοις ἔτι βοᾶν ἐξήρκει καὶ κροτεῖν, ἀλλὰ τελευτῶντες ἀνεπήδων οἱ πολλοὶ καὶ συνεκινοῦντο κινήσεις ἀνελευθέρους, πρεπούσας

[a] *ἀνερμάτιστος* means properly "without ballast" (as at *Mor.* 501 D), but L. A. Post calls attention to a pun here with *ἑρμαῖον*, "lucky find": the leftovers are a lucky find for the slaves.





so we do not think a table should be seen, when it is abandoned, bare and carrying no load of luck." [a]

## QUESTION 5

That one should guard especially against the pleasures derived from degenerate music, and how to do so.[b]

Speakers: Callistratus, Lamprias, Plutarch

1. At the time of the Pythian Games, Callistratus,[c] who was a director of the Amphictyons, had, in accordance with the rule, disqualified for late registration a certain flute-player who was a fellow citizen and friend of his. But when he gave a dinner for us, he brought the man before the party, with his dancing-group, splendidly arrayed as for a contest, in costume and garlands. And for a fact it was a fine performance to hear—at first. But then, shaking the hall and filling it with resounding noise, when he perceived that most of the auditors were so overwhelmed as to allow him, under the spell of pleasure, to do with them what he pleased and hypnotize them with his piping or even with licentious movements, he cast off all disguise and showed that music can inebriate, more effectively than any wine, those who drink it in as it comes, with no restraint. For the guests were no longer content to shout and clap from their places, but finally most of them leapt up and joined in the dancing, with movements disgraceful for a gentleman, though quite in keeping with

[b] On this theme compare the essay, *Quomodo Adolescens Poetas Audire Debeat*, *Mor.* 14 E ff.

[c] Son of Leon (below, 705 B), member of a prominent family of Delphi, very rich, whose lavish entertainment at Aedepsus, in Euboea, is described in iv. 4, above.

(704) δὲ τοῖς κρούμασιν ἐκείνοις καὶ τοῖς μέλεσιν. ἐπεὶ
E δ' ἐπαύσαντο καὶ κατάστασιν αὖθις ὥσπερ ἐκ μανίας ὁ πότος ἐλάμβανεν, ἐβούλετο μὲν ὁ Λαμπρίας εἰπεῖν τι καὶ παρρησιάσασθαι πρὸς τοὺς νέους· ὀρρωδοῦντι δ' ὅμως αὐτῷ μὴ λίαν ἀηδὴς γένηται καὶ λυπηρός, αὐτὸς ὁ Καλλίστρατος ὥσπερ ἐνδόσιμον παρέσχε τοιαῦτά τινα διαλεχθείς·

2. "'Ακρασίας μέν," ἔφη, "καὶ αὐτὸς ἀπολύω τὸ φιλήκοον καὶ φιλοθέαμον· οὐ μὴν 'Αριστοξένῳ γε συμφέρομαι παντάπασι, ταύταις μόναις φάσκοντι ταῖς ἡδοναῖς τὸ 'καλῶς'[1] ἐπιλέγεσθαι· καὶ γὰρ ὄψα καλὰ καὶ μύρα καλοῦσι καὶ καλῶς γεγονέναι λέγουσιν δειπνήσαντες ἡδέως καὶ πολυτελῶς.
F δοκεῖ δέ μοι μηδ' 'Αριστοτέλης αἰτίᾳ δικαίᾳ τὰς περὶ θέαν καὶ ἀκρόασιν εὐπαθείας ἀπολύειν ἀκρασίας, ὡς μόνας ἀνθρωπικὰς οὔσας, ταῖς δ' ἄλλαις καὶ τὰ θηρία φύσιν[2] ἔχοντα χρῆσθαι καὶ κοινωνεῖν. ὁρῶμεν γὰρ ὅτι καὶ μουσικῇ πολλὰ κηλεῖται τῶν ἀλόγων,[3] ὥσπερ ἔλαφοι σύριγξιν, ἵπποις δὲ μιγνυμέναις ἐπαυλεῖται νόμος, ὃν ἱππόθορον ὀνομάζουσιν·

[1] καλῶς Basel edition: κακῶς.
[2] φύσιν Meziriacus: φασὶν.
[3] The section from this point to 709 A is missing from the principal MS., *i.e.* T.

[a] One of Plutarch's two brothers, who appears many times in his works (see *RE*, *s.v.* "Plutarchos (2)," col. 645). Sometimes he shows a less serious side, as viii. 6, 726 E, and vii. 10, 715 A (if the same brother is meant there).





that kind of rhythm and melody. When they stopped and the company was settling down again, as though recovering from a fit of madness, Lamprias [a] wanted to address some frank words of expostulation to the younger men, but when he hesitated, not wishing to be too disagreeable or censorious, Callistratus himself sounded a keynote for him, so to speak, with some such words as these:

2. "I myself would exempt from the charge of dissolute character a person who is fond of concerts and spectacles. On the other hand, I do not agree completely with Aristoxenus' statement that the word 'beautiful' is applied to the pleasures of these senses alone [b]; for people call both foods and perfumes 'beautiful' and say that it was a 'beautiful' occasion when they have enjoyed a pleasant and sumptuous meal. Aristotle seems to me mistaken, too, in the reason he gives for exempting the delights of sight and sound from charges of incontinence, namely that these alone are exclusively human, whereas animals too are capable by nature of feeling the others and sharing in them.[c] We observe that many nonrational creatures are bewitched by music, for example stags by flutes [d]; and a tune, which is called '*Hippothoros*' ('The Stallion's Leap'), is played to mares while they are being covered.[e] Pindar speaks

[b] Frag. 74 Wehrli; *Frag. Hist. Graec.* ii. 288.
[c] *Nicomachean Ethics*, iii. 10 (1118 a 23 ff.); *Problemata*, xxviii. 7 (949 b 37 ff.).
[d] Aristotle, *Historia Animal.* 611 b 26, etc.
[e] Plutarch also mentions this custom in his *Coniugalia Praecepta*, 138 B. *Cf.* also Aelian, *De Natura Animal.* xii. 44; xv. 25, where the custom is attributed to the Mysians, and we learn in addition that under the music's influence the mares conceive more readily and have more handsome offspring.

(704) ὁ δὲ Πίνδαρός φησι κεκινῆσθαι πρὸς ᾠδὴν

ἁλίου δελφῖνος ὑπόκρισιν·
τὸν μὲν ἀκύμονος ἐν πόντου πελάγει
αὐλῶν ἐκίνησ'[1] ἐρατὸν μέλος·

ὀρχούμενοι δὲ τοὺς ὤτους[2] αἱροῦσι, χαίροντας τῇ ὄψει καὶ μιμητικῶς ἅμα δεῦρο κἀκεῖσε τοὺς ὤμους συνδιαφέροντας. οὐδὲν οὖν ὁρῶ τὰς τοιαύτας ἡδονὰς ἴδιον ἐχούσας, ἢ ὅτι μόναι τῆς ψυχῆς εἰσιν, αἱ δ' ἄλλαι τοῦ σώματος καὶ περὶ τὸ σῶμα καταλήγουσιν· μέλος δὲ καὶ ῥυθμὸς καὶ ὄρχησις καὶ ᾠδὴ παραμειψάμεναι τὴν αἴσθησιν ἐν τῷ χαίροντι τῆς ψυχῆς ἀπερείδονται τὸ ἐπιτερπὲς καὶ γαργαλίζον. ὅθεν οὐδεμία τῶν τοιούτων ἡδονῶν ἀπόκρυφός ἐστιν οὐδὲ σκότους δεομένη καὶ τῶν τοίχων 'περιθεόν-
B των,' ὡς οἱ Κυρηναϊκοὶ[3] λέγουσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ στάδια ταύταις καὶ θέατρα ποιεῖται, καὶ τὸ μετὰ πολλῶν θεάσασθαί τι καὶ ἀκοῦσαι ἐπιτερπέστερόν ἐστι καὶ σεμνότερον, οὐκ ἀκρασίας δήπου καὶ ἡδυπαθείας ἀλλ' ἐλευθερίου διατριβῆς καὶ ἀστείας μάρτυρας ἡμῶν ὅτι πλείστους λαμβανόντων."

3. Ταῦτα τοῦ Καλλιστράτου εἰπόντος ὁ Λαμπρίας ὁρῶν ἔτι μᾶλλον ἐκείνους τοὺς τῶν ἀκροαμάτων χορηγοὺς θρασυνομένους, "οὐ τοῦτ'," ἔφη, "τὸ αἴτιον, ὦ παῖ Λέοντος, ἀλλά μοι δοκοῦσιν οὐκ ὀρθῶς οἱ παλαιοὶ παῖδα Λήθης τὸν Διόνυσον (ἔδει γὰρ πατέρα) προσαγορεύειν· ὑφ' οὗ καὶ σὺ νῦν

[1] ἐκίνησ' Stephanus : ἐκείνης, ἐκείνοις MSS.
[2] ὤτους Hubert : ὦπας (σκῶπας Reiske, *cf.* Athen. ix. 391 a).
[3] οἱ Κυρηναϊκοὶ Doehner : αἱ γυναῖκες (*cf.* 1089 A).





of himself as stirred by a song,

Like a dolphin of the sea, whom on the main of the waveless
Deep the lovely strain of pipes has set adancing.[a]

And by dancing they capture horned owls,[b] which take pleasure in the spectacle and in an imitative way move their shoulders rhythmically this way and that. I do not see that pleasures of this sort have anything special about them, except that they alone have to do with the mind, whereas the rest are pleasures of the body and reach an end in the body. Melody, however, and rhythm and dance and song go on past sense-perception and find a basis for their pleasing and enticing quality in the mind's faculty of enjoyment. Thus none of the pleasures of this kind is secret or requires darkness or walls 'running round' (as the Cyrenaics say), but stadia are even built for them, and theatres ; and to witness a spectacle of sight or sound in a large company is considered more enjoyable and more impressive because we are associating as many persons as possible with ourselves, surely not in incontinence and sensuality, but in a liberal and civilized pastime."

3. Lamprias perceived that after this speech of Callistratus those partisans of musical entertainments were still more inclined to assert themselves. "You have missed the point," he said, "O son of Leon. I fear the ancients were wrong in calling Dionysus the son of Lethe (Forgetfulness) ; they should have made him her father. For he seems to have made you forget

[a] Frag. 235 Schroeder, 125 Bowra. On the dolphin *cf.* *Septem Sapientium Convivium*, *Mor.* 162 F, and note.
[b] *Cf.* Aristotle, frag. 354-355 Rose ; Athenaeus, ix. 390 e—391 a ; *De Sollertia Animalium*, *Mor.* 961 E, and note.

(705) C ἀμνημονεῖν ἔοικας, ὅτι τῶν περὶ τὰς ἡδονὰς ἁμαρτανομένων τὰ μὲν ἀκρασία τὰ δ' ἄγνοια ποιεῖ καὶ παρόρασις. ὅπου μὲν γὰρ ἡ βλάβη πρόδηλός ἐστι, ταῦτ' ἀκρασίᾳ καταβιαζόμενοι τὸν λογισμὸν ἐξαμαρτάνουσιν· ὅσα δ' οὐκ εὐθὺς οὐδὲ παραχρῆμα τῆς ἀκολασίας τὸν μισθὸν ἐπιτίθησι, ταῦθ' ὑπ' ἀγνοίας τοῦ βλάπτοντος αἱροῦνται καὶ πράττουσι. διὸ τοὺς μὲν περὶ ἐδωδὰς καὶ ἀφροδίσια καὶ πότους ἀστοχοῦντας, οἷς νόσοι τε πολλαὶ καὶ χρημάτων ὄλεθροι συνακολουθοῦσι καὶ τὸ κακῶς ἀκούειν, ἀκρατεῖς προσαγορεύομεν· ὡς Θεοδέκτην ἐκεῖνον εἰπόντα ' χαῖρε φίλον φῶς ' ὀφθαλμιῶντα, τῆς ἐρωμένης ἐπιφανείσης· ἢ τὸν Ἀβδηρίτην Ἀνάξαρχον,

D ὅς ῥα καὶ εἰδώς,
ὡς φάσαν, ἄθλιος ἔσκε· φύσις δέ μιν ἔμπαλιν ἦγεν[1]
ἡδονοπλήξ, τῇ πλεῖστοι ὑποτρείουσι σοφιστῶν.

ὅσαι δὲ τῶν ἡδονῶν τοὺς περὶ γαστέρα καὶ αἰδοῖα καὶ γεῦσιν καὶ ὄσφρησιν ἀντιτεταγμένους αὐταῖς καὶ ὅπως οὐχ ἁλώσονται προσέχοντας ἐκπεριοδεύουσαι περὶ τὰ ὄμματα καὶ τὰ ὦτα λανθάνουσιν ἐνῳκισμέναι καὶ λοχῶσαι, τούτους ἐκείνων οὐδὲν ἧττον ἐμπαθεῖς ὄντας καὶ ἀκολάστους ἀκρατεῖς ὁμοίως οὐ καλοῦμεν· οὐ γὰρ εἰδότες ἀλλὰ δι' ἀπειρίαν ὑποφέρονται, καὶ νομίζουσι τῶν ἡδονῶν εἶναι κρείττονες, ἂν ἐν θεάτροις ἄσιτοι καὶ ἄποτοι δι-

[1] ἄθλιος . . . ἦγεν Xylander (*cf.* 446 c) : λέλιος . . . ἦκεν.

[a] In the essay *De Virtute Morali*, *Mor.* 445 B ff., using Aristotelian terminology, as here, Plutarch discusses this distinction more fully (though not more clearly), and comes to a somewhat different result. Aristotle's principal discussion of incontinence is in the *Nicomachean Ethics*, Book VII.

[b] This proverb is very differently interpreted by the paroe-





just now that of faults in dealing with pleasure, some are due to incontinence and others to misapprehension and oversights.[a] Wherever the harm is obvious, the fault is indulged because people fail to control themselves and forcibly suppress their reason. But acts that do not impose the penalty for incontinence directly and immediately, they choose and perform in ignorance of any harm to come. Thus those whose shortcomings are in eating and drinking and sexual indulgence, which are attended by a numerous train of diseases and financial losses as well as ill fame. we call incontinent, like the notorious Theodectes, with his ophthalmia, saying ' Hail, dear light ! ' when his lady-love appeared [b]; or Anaxarchus of Abdera,

Who, though he knew, they said, would still be wretched; his nature,
Pleasure-struck, would lead him back to haunts most wise men shun.[c]

But when pleasures succeed in hoodwinking men who are on guard against them, alert not to be taken by surprise in the regions of belly, sex-organs, palate and nose—for they outflank our defences and lodge ambushed in eyes and ears,—these men, though they are no less subject to passion and no less licentious than the others, we still do not call incontinent. For they have not seen the consequences ; it is through inexperience that they are swept away downstream ; they think that they are superior to pleasure if they spend a whole day in the theatres without

miographers (Leutsch-Schneidewin, *Paroemiographi Graeci*, i. 173, 319).

[c] Timon, frag. 58 Diels (*Poet. Phil. Frag.*) ; *cf. Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 72 A 10. Quoted more fully in *De Virtute Morali*, *Mor.* 446 B.

(705) E ημερεύσωσιν· ὥσπερ εἰ τῶν κεραμίων μέγα φρονοίη τὸ μὴ ἀπὸ[1] τῆς γαστρὸς αἰρόμενον ἢ τοῦ πυθμένος, ἐκ δὲ τῶν ὤτων ῥᾳδίως μεταφερόμενον· ὅθεν Ἀρκεσίλαος οὐδὲν ἔφη διαφέρειν τοῖς ὄπισθεν εἶναι κίναιδον ἢ τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν. δεῖ δὴ καὶ τὴν ἐν ὄμμασι καὶ τὴν ἐν ὠσὶν γαργαλίζουσαν μαλακίαν καὶ ἡδυπάθειαν φοβεῖσθαι, καὶ μήτε πόλιν ἀνάλωτον νομίζειν τὴν τὰς ἄλλας πύλας βαλανάγραις καὶ μοχλοῖς καὶ καταρράκταις ὀχυρὰς ἔχουσαν, εἰ διὰ μιᾶς οἱ πολέμιοι παρελθόντες ἔνδον εἰσίν, μήθ' ἑαυτὸν ἀήττητον ὑφ' ἡδονῆς, εἰ μὴ κατὰ τὸ Ἀφροδίσιον ἀλλὰ κατὰ τὸ Μουσεῖον ἑάλωκεν ἢ τὸ θέατρον· ὁμοίως γὰρ ἐγκέκλικε καὶ παραδέδωκε[2] ταῖς F ἡδοναῖς ἄγειν καὶ φέρειν τὴν ψυχήν. αἱ δὲ παντὸς ὀψοποιοῦ καὶ μυρεψοῦ δριμύτερα καὶ ποικιλώτερα φάρμακα τὰ τῶν μελῶν καὶ τῶν ῥυθμῶν καταχεόμεναι τούτοις ἄγουσιν ἡμᾶς καὶ διαφθείρουσιν, αὐτῶν τρόπον τινὰ καταμαρτυροῦντας. τῶνδε γὰρ ' οὔτε τι μεμπτὸν οὔτ' ὢν μεταλλακτόν,' ὡς Πίν- 706 δαρος ἔφη, τῶν ἐπὶ ταῖς τραπέζαις, ' ὅσσ' ἀγλαὰ χθὼν πόντου τε ῥιπαὶ φέρουσιν,' ἄρτι παρακειμένων· ἀλλ' οὔτ' ὄψον οὐδὲν οὔτε σιτίον οὔθ' ὁ βέλτιστος οὑτοσὶ πινόμενος οἶνος ἐξήγαγεν ὑφ' ἡδονῆς φωνήν, οἷον ἄρτι τὰ αὐλήματα καὶ τὰ κρούματα τὴν οἰκίαν, εἰ μὴ καὶ τὴν πόλιν ἅπασαν, ἐμπέπληκε θορύβων καὶ κρότων καὶ ἀλαλαγμῶν.

" Διὸ δεῖ μάλιστα ταύτας εὐλαβεῖσθαι τὰς ἡδονάς· ἰσχυρόταται γάρ εἰσιν, ἅτε δὴ μή, καθάπερ αἱ περὶ γεῦσιν καὶ ἁφὴν καὶ ὄσφρησιν, εἰς τὸ ἄλογον B καὶ φυσικὸν ἀποτελευτῶσαι τῆς ψυχῆς, ἀλλὰ τοῦ

[1] μὴ ἀπὸ added by Bernardakis.
[2] παραδέδωκε Kronenberg : παρέδωκε.





food or drink, as though, forsooth, a pot should be proud that cannot be picked up by the belly or the base, when it can easily be carried about by the ears. So Arcesilaüs said it makes no difference if a man is licentious in front or in the rear.[a] Surely one must also be wary of the degeneracy and luxury that titillates the eyes and ears. We should not reckon a city impregnable because most of the gates are fastened with bars and bolts and portcullises, if the enemy have entered by a single one, and are within the walls ; nor can a man rate himself immune to pleasure if he is not overcome in Aphrodite's precinct but is in that of the Muses or that of the theatre ; in any case, he has given way and surrendered his mind to the pleasures to despoil. So they take us captive and corrupt us by means of concoctions more pungent and varied than the products of any cook or perfumer, overwhelming our senses—I mean melody and rhythm. They testify against themselves, in a way : of what lies ready for us on the tables here, there is, as Pindar says, ' nothing to cavil at and nothing to change, of all that the bright earth and the surges of the sea provide '[b] ; but no food, meat or sauce, nor this excellent wine that we are drinking, ever produced, through the pleasure it gives, such an outcry as the music did just now, filling the whole house, if not the whole city, with roars and clapping and cheers.

" Hence we must be especially wary of these pleasures ; they are extremely powerful, because they do not, like those of taste and touch and smell, have their only effect in the irrational and ' natural '

[a] Quoted also in *De Tuenda Sanitate*, *Mor.* 126 A ; *cf.* Gellius, *Noctes Atticae*, iii. 5.
[b] Frag. 220 Schroeder, 207 Bowra.

(706) κρίνοντος ἁπτόμεναι καὶ τοῦ φρονοῦντος· ἔπειτα ταῖς μὲν ἄλλαις ἡδυπαθείαις κἂν ὁ λογισμὸς ἐλλίπῃ διαμαχόμενος, ἀλλὰ τῶν παθῶν ἔνια πολλάκις ἐμποδών ἐστι· καὶ γὰρ ἐν ἰχθύων ἀγορᾷ μικρολογία καθαιρεῖ δάκτυλον ὀψοφάγου, καὶ πολυτελοῦς ἑταίρας ἀπέστρεψε φιλαργυρία φιλογυνίαν· ὥσπερ ἀμέλει παρὰ τῷ Μενάνδρῳ τῶν συμποτῶν ἕκαστος ἐπιβουλευόμενος ὑπὸ τοῦ πορνοβοσκοῦ σοβαράν τινα παιδίσκην ἐπάγοντος αὐτοῖς

κύψας καθ' ἑαυτὸν τῶν τραγημάτων ἔφλα·

χαλεπὸν γὰρ ὁ δανεισμὸς τῆς ἀκρασίας κόλασμα
C καὶ τὸ λῦσαι βαλάντιον οὐ πάνυ ῥᾴδιον· ταύταις δὲ ταῖς ἐλευθερίαις λεγομέναις περὶ[1] ὦτα καὶ ὄμματα φιλομούσοις καὶ φιλαύλοις μουσομανίαις προῖκα καὶ ἀμισθὶ τῶν ἡδονῶν πάρεστι[2] πολλαχόθεν ἀρύτεσθαι καὶ ἀπολαύειν, ἐν ἀγῶσιν, ἐν θεάτροις, ἐν συμποσίοις, ἑτέρων χορηγούντων· ὅθεν ἕτοιμον τὸ διαφθαρῆναι τοῖς μὴ βοηθοῦντα καὶ παιδαγωγοῦντα τὸν λογισμὸν ἔχουσι."

4. Γενομένης οὖν σιωπῆς, " τί οὖν," ἔφην, " ποιοῦντα τὸν λογισμὸν ἢ τί λέγοντα βοηθεῖν ἀξιοῦμεν; οὐ γὰρ ἀμφωτίδας γε περιθήσει τὰς Ξενοκράτους ἡμῖν οὐδ' ἀναστήσει μεταξὺ δειπνοῦντας, ἐὰν αἰσθώ-
D μεθα λύρας ἁρμοζομένης ἢ κινουμένων αὐλῶν."

" Οὐ γὰρ οὖν," εἶπεν ὁ Λαμπρίας, " ἀλλ' ὁσάκις ἂν εἰς τὰς Σειρῆνας[3] ἐμπέσωμεν, ἐπικαλεῖ-

[1] περὶ added by Meziriacus.
[2] πάρεστι Meziriacus : γάρ ἐστι.
[3] Σειρῆνας Wyttenbach : εἰρημένας.

[a] Frag. 607 Kock, 741 Koerte. Also quoted in *De Tuenda Sanitate*, *Mor.* 133 B.





part of our mind, but lay hold of our faculty of judgement and prudence. Again, with the other forms of luxury, though our reason may give up its struggle against them, there remain other emotions that frequently stand in their way. In the fish-market, stinginess restrains the finger of the epicure; and Miserliness turns Lechery from the expensive harlot. Such is the case in Menander's scene in which the banqueters are all exposed one by one to the wiles of a designing procurer, who brings a certain very grand courtesan before them.

Each kept his head down, nibbling at dessert.[a]

Yes, the loans at interest are a severe chastiser of incontinence, and to make a man loosen his purse-strings is not a very easy matter. But with these so-called refined crazes for music and flute-playing, whose attack is on the eyes and ears, it is frequently possible to procure and enjoy such delights free, without any expenditure at all—at the festivals, in the theatres, or at dinners, where others foot the bills. In this way it is easy for the hearers to be corrupted, since they do not have the calculation of the costs to rescue and discipline them."

4. A silence fell. " Well, now," I said, " what is it we expect the calculation to do or say in order to rescue us? Surely it won't muffle us in the ear-protectors Xenocrates[b] speaks of, nor get us up in the midst of a dinner if we hear a lyre being tuned or see a flute raised."

" Of course not," replied Lamprias, " but whenever we fall among the Sirens, we must call upon the

[b] Frag. 96 Heinze; *cf. De Recta Ratione Audiendi*, *Mor.* 38 B.

(706) σθαι δεῖ τὰς Μούσας καὶ καταφεύγειν εἰς τὸν Ἑλικῶνα τὸν τῶν παλαιῶν. ἐρῶντι μὲν γὰρ πολυτελοῦς οὐκ ἔστι τὴν Πηνελόπην προσαγαγεῖν οὐδὲ συνοικίσαι τὴν Πάνθειαν· ἡδόμενον δὲ μίμοις καὶ μέλεσι καὶ ᾠδαῖς κακοτέχνοις καὶ κακοζήλοις ἔξεστι μετάγειν ἐπὶ τὸν Εὐριπίδην καὶ τὸν Πίνδαρον καὶ τὸν Μένανδρον, ' ποτίμῳ λόγῳ ἁλμυρὰν ἀκοήν,' ὥς φησιν ὁ Πλάτων, ' ἀποκλυζόμενον.' E ὥσπερ γὰρ οἱ μάγοι τοὺς δαιμονιζομένους κελεύουσι τὰ Ἐφέσια γράμματα πρὸς αὐτοὺς καταλέγειν καὶ ὀνομάζειν, οὕτως ἡμεῖς ἐν τοῖς τοιούτοις τερετίσμασι καὶ σκιρτήμασι

μανίαις τ' ἀλαλαῖς τ' ὀρινόμενοι ῥιψαύχενι σὺν κλόνῳ

τῶν ἱερῶν καὶ σεμνῶν ἐκείνων γραμμάτων ἀναμιμνησκόμενοι καὶ παραβάλλοντες ᾠδὰς καὶ ποιήματα καὶ λόγους γενναίους[1] οὐκ ἐκπλαγησόμεθα παντάπασιν ὑπὸ τούτων οὐδὲ πλαγίους παραδώσομεν ἑαυτοὺς ὥσπερ ὑπὸ ῥεύματος λείου φέρεσθαι."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ϛ'

*Περὶ τῶν λεγομένων σκιῶν, καὶ εἰ δεῖ βαδίζειν καλούμενον πρὸς ἑτέρους ὑφ' ἑτέρων ἐπὶ δεῖπνον, καὶ πότε, καὶ παρὰ τίνας*

Collocuntur Plutarchus, Florus, Caesernius

F 1. Τὸν[2] Μενέλαον Ὅμηρος πεποίηκεν αὐτό-

[1] γενναίους Minar : κενοὺς.

[2] 706 F (τὸν . . . ἔχωσιν), appended to Question 5 in the MSS., placed here by Xylander and Amyot.

[a] The wife of a Persian grandee in Xenophon's historical novel, *Cyropaedeia*.





Muses and take refuge in the Helicon of olden times. If a man has a passion for a costly harlot, we cannot bring Penelope on stage, nor marry Pantheia [a] to him ; but it is possible to take a man who is enjoying mimes and tunes and lyrics that are bad art and bad taste, and lead him back to Euripides and Pindar and Menander, ' washing the brine from the ears with the clear fresh water of reason,' in Plato's words.[b] For just as sorcerers advise those possessed by demons to recite and name over to themselves the Ephesian letters,[c] so we, in the midst of such warblings and caperings,

Stirred by frenzies and whoops to the tumult of tossing heads,[d]

if we bethink ourselves of those hallowed and venerable writings and set up for comparison songs and poems and tales of true nobility, shall not be altogether dazed by these performances, nor shall we surrender ourselves, as it were, to float reclining on the gentle stream of the music."

## QUESTION 6

On " shadows," so-called, and whether one should go to one man's dinner at another man's invitation, and on what occasions, and to what kind of host.

Speakers : Plutarch, Florus, Caesernius

1. Homer represents Menelaüs as coming uninvited

[b] *Phaedrus*, 243 D ; *cf.* below, 711 D.

[c] A magical formula : *ἄσκιον, κατάσκιον, λίξ, τετράξ, δαμναμενεύς, αἶσια.* See *RE*, *s.v.* " Ephesia grammata," W. Schultz, *Philologus*, lxviii (1909), pp. 210-228.

[d] Pindar, frag. 208 Schroeder, 61 Bowra, line 10. *Cf.* above, i. 623 B, *De Defectu Oraculorum*, 417 C. Plutarch has a slightly different wording in each passage.

(706) ματον ἑστιῶντι τοὺς ἀριστεῖς τῷ Ἀγαμέμνονι παραγινόμενον·

ἤδεε γὰρ κατὰ θυμὸν ἀδελφεὸν ὡς ἐπονεῖτο·

καὶ τὴν ἄγνοιαν οὐ περιεῖδεν αὐτοῦ καταφανῆ γενομένην οὐδ' ἤλεγξε τῷ μὴ ἐλθεῖν, ὥσπερ οἱ φιλομεμφεῖς καὶ δύσκολοι ταῖς τοιαύταις τῶν φίλων παροράσεσι καὶ ἀγνοίαις ἐπιτίθενται, τῷ ἀμελεῖσθαι μᾶλλον ἢ τῷ τιμᾶσθαι χαίροντες, ὅπως ἐγκαλεῖν ἔχωσιν.

707 Τὸ δὲ τῶν ἐπικλήτων ἔθος, οὓς νῦν σκιὰς καλοῦσιν, οὐ κεκλημένους αὐτοὺς ἀλλ' ὑπὸ τῶν κεκλημένων ἐπὶ τὸ δεῖπνον ἀγομένους, ἐζητεῖτο πόθεν ἔσχε τὴν ἀρχήν· ἐδόκει δ' ἀπὸ Σωκράτους, Ἀριστόδημον ἀναπείσαντος οὐ κεκλημένον εἰς Ἀγάθωνος ἰέναι σὺν αὐτῷ καὶ παθόντα τι γελοῖον· ἔλαθε γὰρ
B κατὰ τὴν ὁδὸν ὑπολειφθεὶς ὁ Σωκράτης, ὁ δὲ προεισῆλθεν, ἀτεχνῶς σκιὰ προβαδίζουσα σώματος ἐξόπισθεν τὸ φῶς ἔχοντος. ὕστερον μέντοι περὶ τὰς τῶν ξένων ὑποδοχάς, μάλιστα τῶν ἡγεμονικῶν, ἀναγκαῖον ἐγίνετο τοῖς ἀγνοοῦσι τοὺς ἑπομένους καὶ τιμωμένους ἐπὶ τῷ ξένῳ ποιεῖσθαι τὴν κλῆσιν, ἀριθμὸν δ' ὁρίζειν, ὅπως μὴ πάθωσιν ὃ παθεῖν συνέπεσε τῷ δεχομένῳ τὸν βασιλέα Φίλιππον ἐπὶ τῆς χώρας· ἦκε γὰρ ἄγων πολλούς, τὸ δὲ δεῖπνον οὐ πολλοῖς ἦν παρεσκευασμένον· ἰδὼν οὖν θορυβούμενον τὸν ξένον περιέπεμπε πρὸς τοὺς φίλους ἀτρέμα, χώραν πλακοῦντι καταλιπεῖν κελεύων· οἱ

[a] *Iliad*, ii. 409.
[b] The Latin is *umbra*; *cf.* Horace, *Sat.* ii. 8. 22, *Ep.* i. 5. 28.





when Agamemnon entertained the chiefs :

For he knew in his heart what cares his brother had.[a]

He did not fail to notice his brother's oversight, which was obvious, nor did he reproach him by staying away, as censorious and touchy persons will fasten upon such oversights and slips of their friends. They are happier if neglected than if honoured, because that gives them a grievance.

A question arose, however, as to the origin of the custom of the secondary guest, those whom they call nowadays " shadows,"[b] persons who are not personally invited but are brought by the invited guests. We decided that it began with Socrates, who persuaded Aristodemus, though not invited, to go along to Agathon's dinner with him.[c] Aristodemus had an amusing experience, for without noticing that Socrates had been left behind on the way, he went in ahead of him—the shadow literally going ahead of a person who had the light behind him. But in later times in the entertainment of guests from abroad, especially important personages, it became necessary for those who were ignorant who their followers and favourites were to leave the inviting of them to the principal guest. The host had to specify a number, however, so as not to get into the position of the man who entertained Philip in the country.[d] He came with a large number, but dinner had not been prepared for so many ; so, seeing that his host was embarrassed, he passed the word quietly to his friends to " save room for cake." Looking forward to this, they ate

[c] Plato, *Symposium*, 174 A ff.
[d] *Cf. De Tuenda Sanitate*, *Mor.* 123 F, *Regum Apophthegmata*, *Mor.* 178 D.

(707) δὲ προσδοκῶντες ὑπεφείδοντο τῶν παρακειμένων καὶ πᾶσιν οὕτως ἐξήρκεσε τὸ δεῖπνον.

C 2. Ἐμοῦ δὲ ταῦτα πρὸς τοὺς παρόντας ἀδολεσχοῦντος, ἔδοξε Φλώρῳ καὶ σπουδάσαι τι περὶ τῶν σκιῶν λεγομένων, διαπορήσαντας εἰ προσήκει τοῖς καλουμένοις οὕτω βαδίζειν καὶ συνακολουθεῖν. ὁ μὲν οὖν γαμβρὸς αὐτοῦ Καισέρνιος ὅλως ἀπεδοκίμαζε τὸ πρᾶγμα. μάλιστα μὲν γὰρ τῷ Ἡσιόδῳ πειθομένους ἔφη χρῆναι "τὸν φιλέοντ' ἐπὶ δαῖτα καλεῖν"· εἰ δὲ μή, γνωρίμους αὑτῶν καὶ ἐπιτηδείους παρακαλεῖν ἐπὶ κοινωνίαν σπονδῆς καὶ τραπέζης καὶ λόγων ἐν οἴνῳ γινομένων καὶ φιλοφροσύνης. "νῦν δ' ὥσπερ," εἶπεν, "οἱ τὰ πλοῖα ναυλοῦντες, ὅ τι ἂν φέρῃ τις, ἐμβάλλεσθαι παρέχουσιν, οὕτως
D ἡμεῖς τὰ συμπόσια παραδόντες ἑτέροις πληροῦν ἀφίεμεν ἐκ τῶν προστυχόντων, ἄν τε χαρίεντες ὦσιν ἄν τε φαῦλοι.

"Θαυμάσαιμι δ' ἄν, εἰ χαρίεις ἀνὴρ ἐπίκλητος ἀφίκοιτο, μᾶλλον δ' ἄκλητος, ὃν γε πολλάκις οὐδὲ γινώσκει τὸ παράπαν ὁ δειπνίζων· εἰ δὲ γινώσκων καὶ χρώμενος μὴ κέκληκεν, ἔτι γε μᾶλλον αἰσχύνη βαδίζειν πρὸς τοῦτον ὥσπερ ἐξελέγχοντα καὶ[1] μετέχειν τῶν ἐκείνου τρόπον τινὰ βίᾳ καὶ ἄκοντος.

"Ἔτι καὶ προτερεῖν ἢ ἀπολείπεσθαι τοῦ κεκληκότος πρὸς ἕτερον ἔχει τινὰ δυσωπίαν, καὶ οὐκ ἀστεῖόν ἐστι μαρτύρων δεόμενον πρὸς τοὺς ὑποδεχομένους βαδίζειν, ὡς οὐκ ἄκλητος[2] ἀλλὰ σκιὰ
E τοῦ δεῖνος ἐπὶ τὸ δεῖπνον ἥκει· καὶ πάλιν τὸ παρέπεσθαι καὶ παραφυλάττειν ἄλειμμα καὶ λουτρὸν

[1] καὶ added by Pohlenz.
[2] οὐκ ἄκλητος Kaltwasser : οὐ κλητός.





sparingly of what lay before them, and in this way there was enough for everyone.

2. I had been discoursing of all this to the company in a casual way, but Florus thought we ought to take some more serious notice of these so-called "shadows," and consider whether it is proper for a person who is invited in this way to go and be a hanger-on. His brother-in-law Caesernius thought such an action completely inadmissible. Best of all, he said, is to follow Hesiod's advice, "invite your friend to dinner,"[a] or, at least, to invite acquaintances and associates of one's own, to share in the libations and the food and the talk over the wine and the conviviality. "But nowadays," he went on, "like those who let ships on charter and permit any cargo to be loaded, we make over our dinner parties to others to fill with whomever they please, whether they are polite company or not.

"I should be surprised to see a man of breeding come on a secondary invitation—or rather uninvited, since the host frequently does not even know him at all. Or if the host knows him and is on friendly terms with him and yet has not invited him, surely it is still more disgraceful to go to his house, as though to set him right, and to force oneself upon his hospitality, as it were, against his will.

"Further, there is also a certain embarrassment in being earlier or later than one who has invited you to another's house; and it is surely not a nice situation, to stand before the host in need of a witness to certify that you have not come to dinner uninvited, but as so-and-so's 'shadow.' Or, on the other hand, to dance attendance on another man and play the

[a] *Works and Days*, 342.

(707) ἑτέρου καὶ ὥραν βραδύνοντος ἢ ταχύνοντος ἀνελεύθερον εὖ μάλα καὶ Γναθώνειον, εἰ δὴ Γνάθων γέγονε δεινότατος ἀνθρώπων τἀλλότρια δειπνεῖν.

" Ἔτι γε μὴν οὐκ ἔστιν ὅτε μᾶλλον ἀνθρώποις ἐφιᾶσιν εἰπεῖν

ὦ[1] γλῶσσα, μέτριον εἴ τι κομπάσαι θέλεις,
ἔξειπε,

καὶ παρρησία πλείστη μετὰ παιδιᾶς ἀναμέμικται τοῖς λεγομένοις ἐν οἴνῳ καὶ πραττομένοις; ἐνταῦθα δὴ πῶς ἄν τις ἑαυτὸν μεταχειρίσαιτο μὴ γνήσιος ὢν μηδ' αὐτόκλητος, ἀλλὰ τρόπον τινὰ νόθος καὶ
F παρεγγεγραμμένος εἰς τὸ συμπόσιον; καὶ γὰρ τὸ χρῆσθαι καὶ τὸ μὴ χρῆσθαι παρρησίᾳ πρὸς τοὺς παρόντας εὐσυκοφάντητον.

" Οὐ μικρὸν δὲ κακὸν οὐδ' ἡ τῶν ὀνομάτων εὐχέρεια καὶ βωμολοχία τοῖς μὴ δυσχεραίνουσιν ἀλλ' ὑπομένουσι σκιὰς καλεῖσθαι καὶ ὑπακούειν· προεθίζει[2] γὰρ εἰς τὰ ἔργα τῷ αἰσχρῷ τὸ ῥᾳδίως ὑπὸ τῶν ῥημάτων προάγεσθαι.[3]

708 " Διὸ καλῶν μὲν ἑταίρους ἔδωκα τόπον σκιαῖς,[4] ἰσχυρὰ γὰρ ἡ τῆς πόλεως συνήθεια καὶ δυσπαραίτητος· αὐτὸς δὲ κληθεὶς ὑφ' ἑτέρου πρὸς ἕτερον ἄχρι γε νῦν ἀντέχω μὴ ὑπακοῦσαι."

3. Γενομένης δὲ μετὰ τοὺς λόγους τούτους ἡσυχίας ὁ Φλῶρος, " τοῦτ'," ἔφη, " τὸ δεύτερον ἔχει

[1] ὦ added by Wyttenbach.
[2] προεθίζει Post (*cf.* 531 A) : προσεθίζει.
[3] προάγεσθαι Post : ἄγεσθαι.
[4] τόπον σκιαῖς Reiske : ποτε σκιάς.





bodyguard while he anoints and bathes himself, and perhaps puts off or hastens the hour of arrival—this is downright servility and Gnathonism, if it is Gnatho who holds the record as an artist in scrounging dinners.[a]

" Here is yet another point : is there not sometimes more impulsion for a man to say,

O tongue, if you will boast in moderation, speak up ![b]

Is there not a very great allowance of frankness and jesting in the conversation and the activity of a drinking party ? Now at such a time how is one to handle himself, pray, if he is not a legitimate guest, personally invited, but, as it were, a bastard illegally enrolled in the register of guests ? Whether he speaks freely or not to the other guests, he is an easy mark for carping critics.

" There is much to deplore, too, in the lack of refinement and dignity of those who are not squeamish, but tolerant of names, and allow themselves to be invited, and accept, as ' shadows.' It is preliminary training in deeds when you allow yourself to be readily led by words in the path of indignity.

" This is why, although in inviting my friends I have allowed a place for shadows, on occasion, since the custom of the city is firmly established and excuse is not easy, yet if I am myself invited by one man to another man's house, I have up to now been firm in declining."

3. In the silence that followed this speech, Florus said, " It is more the latter point that raises a ques-

[a] Gnatho the parasite is a stock character of the New Comedy, most familiar from Terence's *Eunuch*.
[b] A fragment of an unknown comedy or tragedy : *Com. Adesp. Frag.* 1228 Kock, *Trag. Adesp. Frag.* 398 Nauck.

(708) μᾶλλον ἀπορίαν· τὸ δὲ καλεῖν οὕτως ἀναγκαῖόν ἐστιν ἐν ταῖς τῶν ξένων ὑποδοχαῖς, ὥσπερ εἴρηται πρότερον· οὔτε γὰρ ἄνευ φίλων ἐστὶ δὴ ἐπιεικὲς οὔτε γινώσκειν οὓς ἔχων ἥκει ῥᾴδιον."

Κἀγὼ πρὸς αὐτόν, "ὅρα τοίνυν," ἔφην, "μὴ οἱ καλεῖν οὕτω δεδωκότες τοῖς ἑστιῶσι καὶ τὸ πείθε-
B σθαι τοῖς καλουμένοις καὶ βαδίζειν δεδώκασιν· οὔτε γὰρ διδόναι καλὸν ὃ αἰτεῖν[1] οὔτ' αἰτεῖν ὃ διδόναι μὴ καθῆκεν, οὔθ' ὅλως παρακαλεῖν ἃ μὴ δεῖ παρακαλεῖσθαι μηδ' ὁμολογεῖν μηδὲ πράττειν. τὰ μὲν οὖν πρὸς ἡγεμόνας ἢ ξένους οὐκ ἔχει κλῆσιν οὐδ' αἵρεσιν, ἀλλὰ δεῖ δέχεσθαι τοὺς μετ' αὐτῶν παραγινομένους. ἄλλως δὲ φίλον ἑστιῶντα φιλικώτερον μέν ἐστι τὸ καλεῖν αὐτόν, ὡς οὐκ ἀγνοοῦντα τοὺς γνωρίμους αὐτοῦ καὶ συνήθεις ἢ οἰκείους· μείζων γὰρ ἡ τιμὴ καὶ ἡ χάρις, ὡς μὴ λανθάνοντος ὅτι τούτους ἀσπάζεται μάλιστα καὶ τούτοις ἥδιστα σύνεστι καὶ χαίρει τιμωμένοις ὁμοίως καὶ παρακαλουμένοις.

C "Οὐ μὴν ἀλλ' ἔστιν ὅτε ποιητέον ἐπ' αὐτῷ,[2] καθάπερ οἱ θεῷ θύοντες ἅμα συμβώμοις καὶ συννάοις κοινῶς συνεπεύχονται καὶ καθ' ἕκαστον ἐκείνων μὴ ὀνομάζοντες· οὔτε γὰρ ὄψον οὔτ' οἶνος οὔτε μύρον οὕτως ἡδέως[3] διατίθησιν ὡς σύνδειπνος εὔνους καὶ προσηνής. ἀλλὰ τὸ μὲν ὄψοις καὶ πέμμασιν οἷοις ὁ μέλλων ἑστιᾶσθαι μάλιστα χαίρει καὶ περὶ οἴνων διαφορᾶς καὶ μύρων ἐρωτᾶν καὶ διαπυνθάνεσθαι φορτικὸν κομιδῇ καὶ νεόπλουτον· ᾧ δὲ

[1] ὃ αἰτεῖν added by Meziriacus.
[2] αὐτῷ Amyot: αὐτῷ καὶ. [3] ἡδέως Reiske: ἥδεσθαι.





tion. To issue invitations in this way is inevitable when one entertains a visitor from abroad, as was said; for it is neither polite to invite him without his friends, nor easy to discover who is with him."

"Consider, however," I replied to him, "whether those who have granted the host the privilege of inviting in this manner have not also granted those invited the privilege of accepting. For it is neither fitting to grant what one ought not to ask, nor to ask what one ought not to grant; nor in general is it right to encourage an action that one ought not to be encouraged or agree to do, or in fact to do. In our relations with dignitaries or foreigners[a] there is really no inviting or choice; we have to receive whoever is with them. But it is different in entertaining a friend; it is more friendly to issue the invitations oneself, since one knows who his acquaintances and intimates are and the members of his family. We show him greater honour and kindness when it does not escape us that these are the men whom he likes most and whose company he enjoys, whom he rejoices to see honoured equally and invited along with him.

"However, there are times when we have to leave the decision to him, just as those who sacrifice to a god pray also to all the deities who share in his altar or temple, even though they may not call on each of them by name; for neither food nor wine nor perfume is so conducive to comfort at dinner as a well-disposed and amiable companion. To put questions and make inquiries what kinds of food and pastries the prospective guest enjoys most, and his preferences in wine and perfume, is vulgarity itself and typical of the newly rich. But to invite a man who has many

[a] Plutarch here refers to the Roman officials.

(708) πολλοὶ φίλοι καὶ οἰκεῖοι καὶ συνήθεις εἰσίν, αὐτὸν παρακαλεῖν ἐκείνων, οἷς ἂν ἥδιστα συγγίνοιτο καὶ
D μεθ' ὧν εὐφραίνεται παρόντων μάλιστα, τούτους ἄγειν οὐκ ἀηδὲς οὐδ' ἄτοπον. οὔτε γὰρ τὸ συμπλεῖν οὔτε τὸ συνοικεῖν οὔτε τὸ συνδικάζειν μεθ' ὧν οὐ βούλεταί τις οὕτως ἀηδὲς ὡς τὸ συνδειπνεῖν, καὶ τοὐναντίον ἡδύ· κοινωνία γάρ ἐστι καὶ σπουδῆς καὶ παιδιᾶς καὶ λόγων καὶ πράξεων τὸ συμπόσιον. ὅθεν οὐ τοὺς τυχόντας ἀλλὰ προσφιλεῖς εἶναι δεῖ καὶ συνήθεις ἀλλήλοις, ὡς ἡδέως συνεσομένους· ὄψα μὲν γὰρ οἱ μάγειροι σκευάζουσιν ἐκ χυμῶν διαφόρων, αὐστηρὰ καὶ λιπαρὰ καὶ γλυκέα καὶ δριμέα συγκεραννύντες, σύνδειπνον δὲ χρηστὸν οὐκ ἂν γένοιτο καὶ κεχαρισμένον ἀνθρώπων μὴ ὁμοφύλων
E μηδ' ὁμοιοπαθῶν εἰς τὸ αὐτὸ συμφθαρέντων.

" Ἐπεὶ δ', ὥσπερ οἱ Περιπατητικοὶ λέγουσι τὸ μὲν πρῶτον φύσει κινοῦν μὴ κινούμενον δ' εἶναι τὸ δ' ἔσχατον κινούμενον μηδὲ ἓν δὲ κινοῦν μεταξὺ δ' ἀμφοῖν τὸ καὶ κινοῦν ἕτερα καὶ κινούμενον ὑφ' ἑτέρων, οὕτως," ἔφην, " περὶ ὧν ὁ λόγος τριῶν ὄντων, ὁ μὲν καλῶν μόνον ὁ δὲ καλούμενος ὁ δὲ καὶ καλῶν καὶ καλούμενός ἐστιν, εἴρηται μὲν περὶ τοῦ καλοῦντος, οὐ χεῖρον δ' ἐστὶ καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων," ἔφην, " ἃ γ' ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, διελθεῖν. ὁ μὲν οὖν καλούμενος ὑφ' ἑτέρου καὶ καλῶν ἑτέρους πρῶ-
F τον, οἶμαι, τοῦ πλήθους φείδεσθαι δίκαιός ἐστι, μὴ καθάπερ ἐκ πολεμίας ὁμοῦ πᾶσι τοῖς περὶ αὐτὸν ἐπισιτιζόμενος μηδ', ὥσπερ οἱ χώρας καταλαμβάνοντες ἐν τῷ πεττεύειν, ἀεὶ τοῖς ἰδίοις φίλοις τοὺς





friends and members of the family and intimates to bring those of them whose company he would most enjoy, and whose presence makes him the most jovial —this is neither offensive nor peculiar. To have the company of others forced upon one on a voyage, in the family, or in legal business, is not so unpleasant as at dinner, and there, too, congenial company is most pleasant. A dinner party is a sharing of earnest and jest, of words and deeds ; so the diners must not be left to chance, but must be such as are friends and intimates of one another who will enjoy being together. Cooks make up their dishes of a variety of flavours, blending the sour, the oily, the sweet, and the pungent, but you could not get good and agreeable company at dinner by throwing together men who are different in their associations and sympathies.

" Just as, according to the Peripatetic philosophy," I continued, " there is in nature a first mover which is not moved, and a last moved which does not move anything, and between these two the kind of mover which moves some things and is moved by others,[a] so our discussion has three subjects, the man who invites only, the man who is invited only, and the man who both invites and is invited. Since we have spoken of the inviter, I should think it no less appropriate to give my opinion of the others as well. Now, I suppose the first obligation of one who is invited and himself asks others is to be careful not to ask too many. He must not seek provisions for everyone about him, as though they were an army living off enemy country, nor, like a player seizing squares in a game of *pettoi*, always be squeezing out his host's men with his own

[a] *Cf.* Aristotle, *Metaphysics* Λ 7, 1072 a 20 ff.

(708) τοῦ καλέσαντος ἐκκρούων καὶ ἀποκρούων ἅπαντας, ὥστε πάσχειν τοὺς δειπνίζοντας, ἃ πάσχουσιν οἱ τῇ Ἑκάτῃ καὶ τοῖς ἀποτροπαίοις ἐκφέροντες τὰ
709 δεῖπνα, μὴ γευομένους αὐτοὺς μηδὲ τοὺς οἴκοι, πλὴν καπνοῦ καὶ θορύβου μετέχοντας. ἄλλως γὰρ ἡμῖν προσπαίζουσιν οἱ λέγοντες

Δελφοῖσι θύσας αὐτὸς ὀψωνεῖ κρέας·

ἀληθῶς δὲ τοῦτο συμβαίνει τοῖς ξένους ἀγνώμονας ἢ φίλους δεχομένοις μετὰ σκιῶν πολλῶν ὥσπερ Ἁρπυιῶν διαφοροῦντας τὰ δεῖπνα καὶ προνομεύοντας.

" Ἔπειτα δεῖ μὴ μεθ' ὧν ἔτυχε βαδίζειν πρὸς ἑτέρους ἐπὶ δεῖπνον, ἀλλὰ μάλιστα μὲν καλεῖν τοὺς τοῦ δειπνίζοντος οἰκείους καὶ συνήθεις, πρὸς αὐτὸν ἐκεῖνον ἁμιλλώμενον καὶ προκαταλαμβάνοντα ταῖς κλήσεσιν· εἰ δὲ μή, τῶν ἰδίων φίλων οὓς ἂν καὶ ἤθελεν αὐτὸς ἑλέσθαι ὁ δειπνίζων, ἐπιεικὴς ὢν
B ἐπιεικεῖς καὶ φιλόλογος φιλολόγους ὄντας ἢ δυνατοὺς δυνάμενος, πάλαι καὶ ζητῶν ἁμωσγέπως αὐτοῖς ἐν προσηγορίᾳ καὶ κοινωνίᾳ γενέσθαι. τὸ γὰρ οὕτως ἔχοντι παραδοῦναι καὶ παρασχεῖν ὁμιλίας ἀρχὴν καὶ φιλοφροσύνης εὔστοχον ἐπιεικῶς καὶ ἀστεῖον· ὁ δ' ἀσυμφύλους καὶ ἀσυναρμόστους ἐπάγων, οἷον νηπτικῷ πολυπότας καὶ λιτῷ περὶ δίαιταν ἀκολάστους καὶ πολυτελεῖς ἢ νέῳ πάλιν

[a] *Pesseia* or *pessoi* (Attic *pett-*) was a general name for certain board games rather like chess or checkers, in some of which, it appears, a piece hemmed in by two opposing pieces might be removed from the board. See Lamer in *RE*, *s.v.* " Lusoria tabula," 13 (1927), cols. 1900-2029, at cols. 1967 ff.; Smith, *Dict. Ant.*, *s.v.* " Latrunculi."





friends, or driving them all from the board.[a] This would put the host in the position of people setting out suppers for Hecatê and the hostile spirits : they never get a taste themselves, and their household has for its share nothing but smoke and tumult. Of course it is merely to make fun of us [b] that people say,

Who offers sacrifice at Delphi must buy meat for himself [c];

but this is what really happens to those whose guests, whether strangers or friends, come with a lot of ' shadows,' like Harpies, to carry off and make spoil of the feast.

" In the second place, he ought to come to dinner not just with whoever happens to be at hand, but should, if it is possible, invite persons who are friends and intimates of the host, so as to rival and anticipate him in his own invitations ; failing that, he should choose those of his own friends whom the host himself would want to invite, if the host is a good fellow, choosing good fellows, if a scholar, scholars, if a man of influence, other men of influence, and men with whom he has long been seeking to converse and be friends. To offer and provide the opportunity, under such circumstances, of beginning an acquaintance and a friendship is a very appropriate and polite act. But he who introduces people of different and incompatible types, for example, heavy drinkers to an abstemious host, or intemperate and extravagant people to a man of simple life ; or, on the other hand,

[b] Plutarch was a priest at Delphi.

[c] The proverb may allude to the large number among whom the sacrificial meat must be divided, or to the greediness of the Delphic priests. (Leutsch-Schneidewin, *Paroemiographi Graeci*, i. 393 ; *Com. Adesp. Frag.* 460 Kock.)

(709) ποτικῷ καὶ φιλοπαίγμονι πρεσβύτας σκυθρωποὺς
ἢ βαρὺ φθεγγομένους ἐκ πώγωνος σοφιστάς,
ἄκαιρός ἐστιν ἀηδίᾳ φιλοφροσύνην ἀμειβόμενος.
δεῖ γὰρ οὐχ ἧττον ἡδὺν εἶναι τῷ δειπνίζοντι τὸν
C κεκλημένον ἢ τῷ κεκλημένῳ τὸν ὑποδεχόμενον·
ἔσται δ' ἡδύς, ἐὰν μὴ μόνον ἑαυτὸν ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὺς
σὺν αὐτῷ καὶ δι' αὐτὸν ἥκοντας ἐπιδεξίους παρέχῃ
καὶ προσηνεῖς.

"Ὁ γε μὴν λοιπὸς ἔτι τῶν τριῶν οὗτος ὁ καλού-
μενος ὑφ' ἑτέρου πρὸς ἕτερον τὸ μὲν τῆς σκιᾶς
ἀναινόμενος ὄνομα καὶ δυσχεραίνων ἀληθῶς σκιὰν
δόξει φοβεῖσθαι, δεῖται δὲ πλείστης εὐλαβείας· οὔτε
γὰρ τοῖς τυχοῦσιν ἀκολουθεῖν ἑτοίμως καλὸν οὔθ'
ὅπως ἔτυχεν· δεῖ δὲ σκοπεῖν πρῶτον τίς ὁ καλῶν
ἐστιν. εἰ μὲν γὰρ οὐ[1] σφόδρα συνήθης, ἀλλὰ[2] τῶν
πλουσίων τις ἢ σατραπικῶν, ὡς ἐπὶ σκηνῆς δορυ-
φορήματος λαμπροῦ δεόμενος ἢ πάνυ χαρίζεσθαι
τῇ κλήσει πεπεισμένος καὶ τιμᾶν, ἐπάγεται, παρ-
D αιτητέος εὐθύς· εἰ δὲ φίλος καὶ συνήθης, οὐκ εὐθὺς
ὑπακουστέον, ἀλλ' ἐὰν δοκῇ δεῖσθαί τινος ἀναγ-
καίας ὁμιλίας καὶ κοινωνίας καιρὸν ἄλλον οὐκ
ἐχούσης, ἢ διὰ χρόνου ποθὲν ἀφιγμένος ἢ μέλλων
ἀπαίρειν φανερὸς ᾖ δι' εὔνοιαν ἐπιθυμῶν καὶ ποθῶν
συμπεριενεχθῆναι, καὶ μήτε πολλοὺς μήτ' ἀλλοτρί-
ους ἀλλ' αὐτὸν ἢ μετ' ὀλίγων ἑταίρων ἐπαγόμενος,
ἢ μετὰ ταῦτα πάντα πραγματευόμενος ἀρχήν τινα
συνηθείας καὶ φιλίας δι' αὐτοῦ γενέσθαι τῷ καλου-

[1] οὐ Basel edition: ὁ.
[2] ἀλλὰ Basel edition: ἀλλὰ μὴ.





one who introduces to a young man, fond of wine and gaiety, gloomy old men or sophists talking solemnly through their beards—such a man is tactless, and replaces friendly entertainment with annoyance. The guest received ought to be no less pleasing to the host than the host to the man he has invited, and this will be so if the inviter makes sure that not only he himself, but those who come with him or by his action are suitable and congenial.

"Now for the last of our three, this man who is invited by one man to another man's house, if he rejects or resents the name of 'shadow,' he is in truth afraid of a shadow; but, on the other hand, he does need to be very circumspect. It is not good breeding to accept at once an invitation to go along with just anybody or in just any way. The first consideration must be, who invites him. If it is not someone quite intimate who would take him, but some man of wealth or nabob who, like an actor on the stage, wants a splendid retinue, or one who thinks that he is doing a great favour and honour by his invitation, we must at once ask to be excused. But even if it is a friend or close acquaintance, we must not at once accept, but only if he is found to desire our company and society for pressing reasons, and there will be no other chance. or if he has just returned from abroad, after a long absence, or is about to set out, and clearly has a friendly desire and longing for our company at parties; and if, in addition, those he is taking along are not numerous nor outsiders, but we are either the only one or one of a few close friends; or if, as a final consideration, his object is to promote a friendly association between us whom he is inviting and the principal host, and the

(709) μένῳ πρὸς τὸν καλοῦντα χρηστὸν ὄντα καὶ φιλίας ἄξιον. ἐπεὶ τούς γε μοχθηρούς, ὅσῳ μᾶλλον ἐπιλαμβάνονται καὶ συμπλέκονται, καθάπερ βάτους
E καὶ ἀπαρίνας[1] ὑπερβατέον ἐστίν· κἂν ἐπιεικεῖς οἱ ἄγοντες ὦσιν πρὸς ἐπιεικῆ δὲ μὴ ἄγωσιν, οὐ δεῖ συνακολουθεῖν οὐδ' ὑπομένειν, ὥσπερ διὰ μέλιτος φάρμακον λαμβάνοντας, μοχθηρὸν διὰ χρηστοῦ φίλον. ἄτοπον δὲ καὶ τὸ πρὸς ἀγνῶτα κομιδῇ καὶ ἀσυνήθη βαδίζειν, ἂν μή τις ᾖ διαφέρων ἀρετῇ, καθάπερ εἴρηται, καὶ τοῦτο φιλίας ποιησόμενος ἀρχὴν καὶ ἀγαπήσων τὸ ῥᾳδίως καὶ ἀφελῶς ἀφικέσθαι σὺν ἑτέρῳ πρὸς αὐτόν.

" Καὶ μὴν τῶν συνήθων πρὸς τούτους μάλιστα βαδιστέον ὑφ' ἑτέρου καλούμενον, οἷς ἐφίεται μεθ ἑτέρων καὶ αὐτοῖς βαδίζειν πρὸς ἡμᾶς. Φιλίππῳ
F μὲν γὰρ ἐδόκει τῷ γελωτοποιῷ τὸ αὐτόκλητον ἐπὶ δεῖπνον ἐλθεῖν γελοιότερον εἶναι τοῦ κεκλημένου· ἀγαθοῖς δὲ καὶ φίλοις ἀνδράσι παρὰ φίλους καὶ ἀγαθοὺς σεμνότερόν ἐστιν καὶ ἥδιον, ἂν μὴ καλέσασι μηδὲ προσδοκῶσιν ἐν καιρῷ παραγίνωνται μετὰ φίλων ἑτέρων, εὐφραίνοντες ἅμα τοὺς δεχο-
710 μένους καὶ τιμῶντες τοὺς ἀγαγόντας. ἥκιστα δὲ πρὸς ἡγεμόνας ἢ πλουσίους ἢ δυνάστας μὴ καλουμένους ὑπ' αὐτῶν ἀλλ' ὑφ' ἑτέρων πρέπει βαδίζειν, ἀναιδείας καὶ ἀπειροκαλίας καὶ φιλοτιμίας ἀκαίρου δόξαν οὐκ ἄλογον φυλαττομένους."

[1] ἀπαρίνας Hercher : ἀναιρεῖν καὶ.





latter is an excellent person, worthy of our friendship. For we have to avoid the wicked like brambles or catchweed, so much the more when they try to seize and embrace us. If those who would take us are persons of character but not the one to whom they would introduce us, we ought not to accept, nor tamely let a good friend be the means of getting us a worthless one, as if we were taking bitter medicine in honey. It is bad form, too, to visit a person wholly unknown and unfamiliar, unless he is someone of outstanding qualities, as I have said, and someone who will look on acceptance as an opportunity for friendship and will take it in good part if you turn up at his residence simply and informally in company with another guest.

" Of our own intimates, we ought surely to prefer to visit on another's invitation those who have the same privilege of visiting us by invitation of a third person. To Philip the jester it seemed more amusing to go to dinner self-invited than properly invited [a]; but if those concerned are gentlemen and good friends, on both sides, it is a more impressive as well as a more pleasant experience if they arrive along with other friends, at just the right time, uninvited and unexpected. In such cases, they both provide pleasure for the host and do honour to their conductors. It is quite improper, however, to go to the entertainments of rulers or of rich men or dignitaries, with an invitation not from themselves but from third persons—that is, if we are to avoid a not unjustified reputation for insolence and bad taste and unseasonable ambition."

[a] Xenophon, *Symposium*, i. 13.

(710)

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ζ

Εἰ δεῖ παρὰ πότον αὐλητρίσι χρῆσθαι

Collocuntur sophista Stoicus, Philippus

B Περὶ ἀκροαμάτων ἐν Χαιρωνείᾳ λόγοι παρὰ πότον ἐγένοντο Διογενιανοῦ τοῦ Περγαμηνοῦ παρόντος, καὶ πράγματ' εἴχομεν ἀμυνόμενοι βαθυπώγωνα σοφιστὴν ἀπὸ τῆς Στοᾶς, ὃς ἐπήγαγεν τὸν Πλάτωνα κατηγοροῦντα τῶν αὐλητρίσι χρωμένων παρ' οἶνον, ἀλλήλοις δὲ συγγίνεσθαι διὰ λόγου μὴ δυναμένων. καίτοι παρὼν ἀπὸ τῆς αὐτῆς παλαίστρας Φίλιππος ὁ Προυσιεὺς ἐᾶν ἐκέλευσεν τοὺς παρ' Ἀγάθωνι δαιτυμόνας ἐκείνους παντὸς αὐλοῦ καὶ πηκτίδων ἐπιτερπέστερα φθεγγομένους· οὐ γὰρ
C αὐλητρίδα παρόντων ἐκείνων ἐκπεσεῖν θαυμαστὸν ἦν, ἀλλ' εἰ μὴ καὶ πότου καὶ σίτου λήθη κατελάμβανεν ὑφ' ἡδονῆς καὶ κηλήσεως τὸ συμπόσιον. "καίτοι Ξενοφῶν οὐκ ἠσχύνθη, Σωκράτους καὶ Ἀντισθένους καὶ ἄλλων παρόντων τοιούτων, τὸν γελωτοποιὸν φέρων Φίλιππον, ὥσπερ Ὅμηρος τὸ 'κρόμυον ποτῷ ὄψον,' ὑποδεῖξαι τοῖς ἀνδράσι. Πλάτων δὲ τόν τ' Ἀριστοφάνους λόγον περὶ τοῦ ἔρωτος ὡς κωμῳδίαν ἐμβέβληκεν εἰς τὸ Συμπόσιον, καὶ τελευτῶν ἔξωθεν ἀναπετάσας τὴν αὔλειον ἐπάγει δρᾶμα τῶν ποικιλωτάτων, μεθύοντα καὶ κώμῳ χρώμενον ἐστεφανωμένον Ἀλκιβιάδην. εἶθ' οἱ πρὸς Σωκράτην διαπληκτισμοὶ περὶ Ἀγάθωνος
D καὶ τὸ Σωκράτους ἐγκώμιον—ὦ φίλαι Χάριτες, ἆρά γ' εἰπεῖν ὅσιόν ἐστιν ὅτι, τοῦ Ἀπόλλωνος

[a] *Protagoras*, 347 c, *Symposium*, 176 e.





## QUESTION 7

Whether the music of flute-girls is proper after-dinner entertainment.

Speakers: A Stoic sophist, Philip

When I gave a dinner party, in Chaeronea, for Diogenianus of Pergamum, there was some discussion of types of entertainment, and we had considerable difficulty in beating off the attack of a long-bearded sophist of the Stoic persuasion, who brought up Plato's indictment of people who listen to flute-girls over their wine because they are unable to entertain themselves by conversation.[a] Philip of Prusa,[b] though a member of the same school, bade us dismiss from consideration Agathon's famous guests, whose talk was more delightful than any music of flute or lyre. The surprising thing was not, he said, that the flutist should be expelled from such a company, but that the party was not so entertained and charmed as to forget both food and drink. "Nevertheless, Xenophon was not ashamed, in the presence of Socrates and Antisthenes and others of their type, to introduce the jester Philip,[c] like Homer's 'onion, the spice of the drink.'[d] Plato has inserted Aristophanes' speech on love as a comic interlude in the *Symposium*,[e] and finally opens the street door and introduces from outside an extremely gaudy spectacle: Alcibiades drunk and revelling, his head garlanded. Then comes his skirmish with Socrates over Agathon, and his encomium of Socrates—ye beloved Graces, is it really not blasphemous to say that if Apollo

[b] Philip also appears elsewhere as a Stoic (notably in the *De Defectu Oraculorum*).
[c] *Symposium*, i. 11, *et passim*.
[d] *Iliad*, xi. 630.
[e] 189 c ff.

(710) ἥκοντος εἰς τὸ συμπόσιον ἡρμοσμένην τὴν λύραν ἔχοντος, ἱκέτευσαν ἂν οἱ παρόντες ἐπισχεῖν τὸν θεόν, ἕως ὁ λόγος συμπερανθῇ καὶ λάβῃ τέλος; εἶτ' ἐκεῖνοι μὲν οἱ ἄνδρες," ἔφη, " τοσαύτην ἐν τῷ διαλέγεσθαι χάριν ἔχοντες ὅμως ἐχρῶντο τοῖς ἐπεισοδίοις καὶ διεποίκιλλον τὰ συμπόσια παιδιαῖς τοιαύταις, ἡμεῖς δὲ μεμιγμένοι πολιτικοῖς καὶ ἀγοραίοις ἀνδράσι, πολλοῖς δ', ὅταν οὕτω τύχωμεν, ἰδιώταις καὶ ὑπαγροικοτέροις ἐκβάλωμεν τὴν τοιαύτην χάριν καὶ διατριβὴν ἐκ τῶν συμποσίων ἢ ἀπίωμεν, ὥσπερ Σειρῆνας ἐπιούσας φεύγοντες; ἀλλὰ Κλειτόμαχος μὲν ὁ ἀθλητὴς ἐξανιστάμενος
E καὶ ἀπιών, εἴ τις ἐμβάλοι λόγον ἐρωτικόν, ἐθαυμάζετο, φιλόσοφος δ' ἀνὴρ αὐλὸν ἐκ συμποσίου φεύγων καὶ ψαλτρίας ἁρμοζομένης ὑποδεῖσθαι[1] βοῶν ταχὺ καὶ τὸν λυχνοῦχον ἅπτειν οὐ καταγέλαστός ἐστι, τὰς ἀβλαβεστάτας ἡδονάς, ὥσπερ οἱ κάνθαροι τὰ μύρα, βδελυττόμενος; εἰ γὰρ ἄλλοτε, μάλιστα δήπου παρὰ πότον προσπαιστέον ἐστὶ τούτοις καὶ δοτέον εἰς ταῦτα τῷ θεῷ τὴν ψυχήν. ὡς τά γ' ἄλλα φίλος ὢν Εὐριπίδης ἐμὲ γοῦν οὐ πέπεικε, περὶ μουσικῆς νομοθετῶν, ὡς ἐπὶ τὰ πένθη καὶ τὰς
F βαρυφροσύνας μετακομιστέας οὔσης· ἐκεῖ μὲν γὰρ ὥσπερ ἰατρὸν ἐφιστάναι δεῖ νοσοῦσιν ἐσπουδακότα καὶ νήφοντα τὸν λόγον, τὰς δὲ τοιαύτας ἡδονὰς τῷ Διονύσῳ καταμίξαντας ἐν παιδιᾶς μέρει τίθεσθαι.

[1] ὑποδεῖσθαι Meziriacus : ὑποδεῖται.

[a] On the self-discipline of this pancratiast *cf.* Aelian, *De Natura Animal.* vi. 1 ; *Varia Hist.* iii. 30.

[b] Theophrastus, *De Causis Plant.* vi. 5. 1 (vultures are





himself had entered the party with his lyre tuned, the company would have asked the god to hold his music till the conversation ran its course and reached its natural conclusion ? Now," he went on, " considering that those great men, whose dialogues are so charming, still used episodic interruptions and gave variety to their *Symposiums* with such comic interludes, shall we, who have among us both statesmen and men of business, and a number, when it so happens, who are no one in particular and the least bit rustic—are we to expel such pleasant entertainments from our dinners, or retreat from them as though from the approach of Sirens ? Cleitomachus the athlete was indeed admired for getting up and leaving a party if anyone mentioned sex [a] ; but is not a philosopher ridiculous if he runs from a party to escape a flute, or calls for his shoes and shouts to his boy to light the lantern when he hears a harp-girl tuning up ? Is he to loathe the most innocent pleasures, as a dung-beetle loathes perfume ? [b] Surely it is especially appropriate over the after-dinner wine, if ever, to sport with such pleasures, and to surrender the mind to the god for their sake. In other respects I am a great admirer of Euripides, but I at any rate have never accepted his legislation about music, that it is something to be relegated to scenes of sorrow and depression.[c] In those circumstances the physician required at the bedside is a serious and sober discourse ; pleasures like music we should spice with the wine of Dionysus, and classify them as play, not

repelled by the odour of perfume, dung-beetles by that of roses) ; *cf. Non Posse Suaviter Vivi Secundum Epicurum, Mor.* 1096 A.

[c] *Medea,* 190 ff. At *Coniugalia Praecepta, Mor.* 143 D, Plutarch expresses agreement with this sentiment.

(710) χάριεν γάρ τοι τὸ τοῦ Λάκωνος, ὃς Ἀθήνησι καινῶν ἀγωνιζομένων τραγῳδῶν θεώμενος τὰς παρασκευὰς τῶν χορηγῶν καὶ τὰς σπουδὰς τῶν διδασκάλων καὶ τὴν ἅμιλλαν οὐκ ἔφη σωφρονεῖν τὴν πόλιν μετὰ τοσαύτης σπουδῆς παίζουσαν. τῷ γὰρ ὄντι παί-
711 ζοντα δεῖ παίζειν καὶ μήτε δαπάνης πολλῆς μήτε τῶν πρὸς ἄλλα χρησίμων καιρῶν ὠνεῖσθαι τὸ ῥᾳθυμεῖν, ἀλλ' ἐν πότῳ καὶ ἀνέσει τῶν τοιούτων ἀπογεύεσθαι καὶ σκοπεῖν ἅμα τερπόμενον εἴ τι χρήσιμον ἐξ αὐτῶν λαβεῖν ἔστιν."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Η

Τίσι μάλιστα χρηστέον ἀκροάμασι παρὰ δεῖπνον;

Collocuntur Plutarchus, sophista, Philippus, Diogenianus

1. Ἐπεὶ δὲ ταῦτ' ἐρρήθη, βουλόμενον αὖθις ἀντιλέγειν τὸν σοφιστὴν ἐγὼ διακρουόμενος, "ἐκεῖνο
B μᾶλλον," ἔφην, "σκέψαιτ' ἄν τις, ὦ Διογενιανέ, πολλῶν ἀκροαμάτων ὄντων ποῖον ἂν μάλιστα γένος εἰς πότον ἐναρμόσειεν, καὶ παρακαλῶμεν ἐπικρῖναι τουτονὶ τὸν σοφόν· ἀπαθὴς γὰρ ὢν πρὸς ἅπαντα καὶ ἀκήλητος οὐκ ἂν σφαλείη πρὸ τοῦ βελτίονος ἑλέσθαι τὸ ἥδιον."

Ὡς οὖν ὅ τε Διογενιανὸς παρεκάλει καὶ ἡμεῖς, οὐδὲν[1] μελλήσας ἐκεῖνος ἔφη τἄλλα μὲν ἐπὶ τὴν θυμέλην καὶ τὴν ὀρχήστραν ἐξελαύνειν, εἰσάγειν δὲ

[1] οὐδὲν Reiske : οὐδὲ.

[a] The story is given a rather different point in *De Gloria Atheniensium*, *Mor.* 348 F.

[b] Obviously a close friend of Plutarch ; that his tastes and views were similar appears from the words attributed to him in several *Table-Talk* appearances (vii. 8, viii. 1, 2, 9).





work. What true wit the Spartan uttered at Athens ! When new tragic actors were to compete, he observed the equipment provided by the producers, the labours of the directors and the determination to win, then remarked that the city was mad to play in such dead earnest.[a] It is true that we ought to play while playing, and not purchase our hours of ease at great cost, either in money or in time that is usable for something else ; but when the after-dinner wine provides relaxation we may well try the flavour of such entertainments, and also, as we enjoy them, consider whether some profit may not be gained from them."

## QUESTION 8

What kinds of entertainment are most appropriate at dinner.

Speakers : Plutarch, a sophist, Philip, Diogenianus

1. At the conclusion of this speech, I forestalled the sophist, who was intent on rebuttal, by saying, " Don't you think, Diogenianus,[b] that it would be a better question, which of the many kinds of entertainment would be most in keeping with a dinner party ? Let us call upon this wise man here to give judgement on the point ; being free of emotion of all kinds,[c] and proof against enchantment, he would not be so misled as to choose the more pleasant in preference to the better."

As Diogenianus joined me in this suggestion, the sophist replied without hesitation that he would banish all other forms of entertainment to stage and orchestra, and introduce a form of entertainment that

[c] An allusion to the Stoic " apathy."

(711) τὸ νεωστὶ μὲν ἐν Ῥώμῃ παρεισηγμένον εἰς τὰ συμπόσια μήπω δ' ἀναλάμπον ἐν τοῖς πολλοῖς. "ἴστε γάρ," εἶπεν, "ὅτι τῶν Πλάτωνος διαλόγων C διηγηματικοί τινές εἰσιν οἱ δὲ δραματικοί· τούτων οὖν τῶν δραματικῶν τοὺς ἐλαφροτάτους ἐκδιδάσκονται παῖδες ὥστ' ἀπὸ στόματος λέγειν· πρόσεστι δ' ὑπόκρισις πρέπουσα τῷ ἤθει τῶν ὑποκειμένων προσώπων καὶ φωνῆς πλάσμα καὶ σχῆμα καὶ διαθέσεις ἑπόμεναι τοῖς λεγομένοις. ταῦθ' οἱ μὲν αὐστηροὶ καὶ χαρίεντες ἠγάπησαν ὑπερφυῶς, οἱ δ' ἄνανδροι καὶ διατεθρυμμένοι τὰ ὦτα δι' ἀμουσίαν καὶ ἀπειροκαλίαν, οὓς φησιν Ἀριστόξενος χολὴν ἐμεῖν ὅταν ἐναρμονίου ἀκούσωσιν, ἐξέβαλλον· καὶ οὐ θαυμάσαιμ' ἄν, εἰ τὸ πάμπαν ἐκβαλοῦσιν· ἐπικρατεῖ γὰρ ἡ θηλύτης."

2. Καὶ ὁ Φίλιππος ὁρῶν ὑποδυσχεραίνοντας D ἐνίους, "φείδου," εἶπεν, "ὦ τᾶν, καὶ παραβάλλου λοιδορῶν ἡμᾶς· ἡμεῖς γάρ ἐσμεν οἱ πρῶτοι τοῦ πράγματος εἰσαγομένου δυσχεράναντες ἐν Ῥώμῃ καὶ καθαψάμενοι τῶν ἀξιούντων Πλάτωνα διαγωγὴν ἐν οἴνῳ ποιεῖσθαι καὶ τῶν Πλάτωνος διαλόγων ἐπὶ τραγήμασι καὶ μύροις ἀκούειν διαπίνοντας[1]· ὅτε καὶ Σαπφοῦς ἂν ᾀδομένης[2] καὶ τῶν Ἀνακρέοντος ἐγώ μοι δοκῶ καταθέσθαι τὸ ποτήριον αἰδούμενος· πολλὰ δ' εἰπεῖν ἐπιόντα μοι δέδια μὴ μετὰ σπουδῆς τινος οὐ παιδιᾶς λέγεσθαι πρός σε δόξῃ· ὅθεν, ὡς

[1] διαπίνοντας Wyttenbach : διατείνοντας.





had recently been brought in at parties in Rome but had not yet become a popular vogue. "You are aware," he said, "that of the dialogues of Plato, some are narrative and others dramatic. Slaves are taught the most lively of these dramatic dialogues, so as to say them by rote. They use a type of presentation appropriate to the personalities of the characters in the text, with modulation of voice and gestures and delivery suited to the meaning. Men of solid character and culture gave it enthusiastic approval, but such as had no manly quality and were so unmusical and uncultured that their ear had lost its purity—those who (as Aristoxenus says)[a] vomit bile when they hear something in tune—would have banned it. It will not in fact surprise me if they get it altogether banned in the end, since effeminate taste is in the ascendant."

2. Philip saw that some of the company were a bit offended at this. "Spare us, good sir," he said; "an end to your abuse! We[b] were the first to be disgusted when this movement was launched in Rome, and the first to attack those who thought fit to regard Plato as a bibulous pastime and to hear his dialogues rendered over their wine and dessert and perfume. Even when Sappho's poems are sung, or Anacreon's, I am moved to put down my cup respectfully. I have a good deal more I might say, but fear it might seem aimed at you in a serious rather than a jesting

[a] Frag. 85 Wehrli; *Frag. Hist. Graec.* ii. 288. Plutarch's expression is actually somewhat more technical than this: "when they hear music with enharmonic intervals." The point is the contrast between old-fashioned and modern.

[b] *i.e.*, "we Stoics."

[2] ἂν ᾀδομένης Emperius, Hubert : ἀναδεχομένης.

(711) ὁρᾷς, ' ποτίμῳ λόγῳ ἁλμυρὰν ἀκοὴν ' κατακλύσαι τῷ φίλῳ Διογενιανῷ μετὰ τῆς κύλικος δίδωμι."

E 3. Δεξάμενος οὖν ὁ Διογενιανός, " ἀλλὰ καὶ τούτους," ἔφη, " νήφοντας ἀκούω λόγους· ὥσθ' ὁ οἶνος ἡμᾶς ἀδικεῖν οὐκ ἔοικεν οὐδὲ κρατεῖν. δέδια δὴ μὴ καὶ αὐτὸς εὐθύνας ὑπόσχω· καίτοι τὰ πολλὰ περικοπτέα τῶν ἀκροαμάτων ἐστίν· πρώτην τὴν τραγῳδίαν, ὡς οὐ πάνυ τι συμποτικὸν ἀλλὰ σεμνότερον βοῶσαν καὶ σκευωρουμένην πραγμάτων ὑποκρίσεις πάθος ἐχόντων καὶ οἶκτον. ἀποπέμπω δὲ τῆς ὀρχήσεως τὴν Πυλάδειον, ὀγκώδη καὶ παθητικὴν καὶ πολυπρόσωπον οὖσαν· αἰδοῖ δὲ τῶν ἐγκωμίων ἐκείνων, ἃ Σωκράτης περὶ ὀρχήσεως διῆλθε, δέχομαι τὴν Βαθύλλειον αὐτόθεν πέζαν τοῦ κόρ-

F δακος ἁπτομένην, Ἠχοῦς ἤ τινος Πανὸς ἢ Σατύρου σὺν Ἔρωτι κωμάζοντος ὑπόρχημά τι διατιθεμένην.[1]

" Τῶν δὲ κωμῳδιῶν ἡ μὲν ἀρχαία διὰ τὴν ἀνωμαλίαν ἀνάρμοστος ἀνθρώποις πίνουσιν· ἥ τε γὰρ ἐν ταῖς λεγομέναις παραβάσεσιν αὐτῶν σπουδὴ καὶ

712 παρρησία λίαν ἄκρατός ἐστι καὶ σύντονος, ἥ τε πρὸς τὰ σκώμματα καὶ βωμολοχίας εὐχέρεια δεινῶς κατάκορος καὶ ἀναπεπταμένη καὶ γέμουσα ῥημάτων ἀκόσμων καὶ ἀκολάστων ὀνομάτων· ἔτι δ' ὥσπερ ἐν τοῖς ἡγεμονικοῖς δείπνοις ἑκάστῳ παρέστηκε τῶν κατακειμένων οἰνοχόος, οὕτω δεήσει

[1] ὑπόρχημά τι διατιθεμένην Wyttenbach, Casaubon (*cf.* Athen. i. 20 d) : ὑπορχήματοσατιθεμένην.

[a] Plato, *Phaedrus*, 243 D.

[b] *Cf.* Athenaeus, i. 20 b-e (citing Aristonicus), where, however, Bathyllus and Pylades are spoken of as partners in the development of the " tragic dance." Pylades was from





spirit. Therefore, as you see, I pass to our dear friend Diogenianus, along with this cup, the duty of ' sluicing the bitter brine from our ears with fresh springs of speech.' " [a]

3. Taking the cup, Diogenianus said, " These, too, sound like sober words to me ; the wine seems not to be harming us or getting the best of us. So I fear that I myself may be subject to correction. All the same, most kinds of entertainment must be trimmed from the list. First of all, tragedy : it is not at all appropriate to a party, with its majestic elocution and its elaborate representation of events that are moving and sorrowful. As for dances, I should disqualify the Pyladic,[b] as pretentious and emotional and requiring a large cast ; but out of respect for Socrates' well-known praise of the dance, I will accept the Bathyllic.[c] It is a straightforward unaccompanied dance, verging on the *kordax*, and presents a danced interpretation of Echo or some Pan or Satyr revelling with Eros.

" As to comedy, the Old Comedy is, because of its unevenness of mood, unsuitable for men who are drinking. For instance the so-called parabases are so serious and outspoken that they are too fiery and intense. Then too it has so little squeamishness in admitting jests and buffoonery that it is shockingly overloaded, nakedly indecent, and larded with words and phrases that are improper and obscene. What is more, just as a special waiter stands by each guest, at the banquets of the great, so everyone would

Cilicia, and the author of a book on dancing, Bathyllus from Alexandria, and a freedman of Maecenas. See further *OCD*, *s.v.* " Dancing," *RE*, *s.v.* " Tanzkunst," " Mimos," " Pantomimus," " Bathyllus."

[c] Xenophon, *Symposium*, ii. 15 ff.

(712) γραμματικὸν ἑκάστῳ τὸ καθ' ἕκαστον ἐξηγεῖσθαι, τίς ὁ Λαισποδίας παρ' Εὐπόλιδι καὶ ὁ Κινησίας παρὰ Πλάτωνι καὶ ὁ Λάμπων παρὰ Κρατίνῳ, καὶ τῶν κωμῳδουμένων ἕκαστος, ὥστε γραμματοδιδασκαλεῖον ἡμῖν γενέσθαι τὸ συμπόσιον ἢ κωφὰ καὶ ἄσημα τὰ σκώμματα διαφέρεσθαι.

B "Περὶ δὲ τῆς νέας κωμῳδίας τί ἂν ἀντιλέγοι τις; οὕτω γὰρ ἐγκέκραται τοῖς συμποσίοις, ὡς μᾶλλον ἂν οἴνου χωρὶς ἢ Μενάνδρου διακυβερνῆσαι τὸν πότον. ἥ τε γὰρ λέξις ἡδεῖα καὶ πεζὴ κατέσπαρται τῶν πραγμάτων, ὡς μήθ' ὑπὸ νηφόντων καταφρονεῖσθαι μήτ' οἰνωμένους ἀνιᾶν· γνωμολογίαι τε χρησταὶ καὶ ἀφελεῖς ὑπορρέουσαι καὶ τὰ σκληρότατα τῶν ἠθῶν ὥσπερ ἐν πυρὶ τῷ οἴνῳ μαλάττουσι καὶ κάμπτουσι πρὸς τὸ ἐπιεικέστερον· ἥ τε τῆς σπουδῆς πρὸς τὴν παιδιὰν ἀνάκρασις ἐπ' οὐδὲν ἂν
C πεποιῆσθαι δόξειεν ἀλλ' ἢ πεπωκότων καὶ διακεχυμένων ἡδονὴν ὁμοῦ καὶ ὠφέλειαν. ἔχει δὲ καὶ τὰ ἐρωτικὰ παρ' αὐτῷ καιρὸν πεπωκόσιν ἀνθρώποις καὶ ἀναπαυσομένοις μετὰ μικρὸν ἀπιοῦσι παρὰ τὰς ἑαυτῶν γυναῖκας· οὔτε γὰρ παιδὸς ἔρως ἄρρενός ἐστιν ἐν τοσούτοις δράμασιν, αἵ τε φθοραὶ τῶν παρθένων εἰς γάμον ἐπιεικῶς καταστρέφουσιν· τὰ δὲ πρὸς τὰς ἑταίρας, ἂν μὲν ὦσιν ἰταμαὶ καὶ θρασεῖαι, διακόπτεται σωφρονισμοῖς τισιν ἢ μετανοίαις τῶν νέων, ταῖς δὲ χρησταῖς καὶ ἀντερώσαις ἢ πατήρ τις ἀνευρίσκεται γνήσιος ἢ χρόνος τις ἐπιμετρεῖται τῷ ἔρωτι συμπεριφορὰν αἰδοῦς ἔχων φιλάνθρωπον. ταῦτα δ' ἀνθρώποις ἄλλο μέν τι πράττουσιν ἴσως

[a] Frag. 102 Kock.
[b] The comic writer, frag. 184 Kock.





need his own scholar to explain the allusions: who is Laespodias in Eupolis,[a] and Cinesias in Plato,[b] and Lampon in Cratinus,[c] and so on with all the persons satirized in the plays. Our dinner party would turn into a schoolroom, or else the jokes would be without meaning or point.

"What objection, however, could anyone make to the New Comedy? It has become so completely a part of the *symposium* that we could chart our course more easily without wine than without Menander. The style, pleasant and unadorned, is spread upon the action in such a way as to be neither too low for the sober nor too difficult for the tipsy. Excellent unaffected sentiments are an undercurrent that can melt the hardest heart and with wine to supply heat, like the smith's fire, reshape and improve the character. The blend of serious and humorous would seem to have no other poetic end in view than to combine pleasure with profit for men relaxing over their wine. Even the erotic element in Menander is appropriate for men who after their wine will soon be leaving to repose with their wives; for in all these plays there is no one enamoured of a boy. Moreover, when virgins are seduced, the play usually ends with a marriage; while affairs with casual women, if these are aggressive and shameless, are cut short by some chastening experience or repentance on the young man's part, and good girls who give love for love either find again a father with legitimate status or get a further dispensation of time for their romance—an accommodation of conscience that is but charitable. For men who are occupied with some other business, all this is perhaps

[c] Frag. 117. 57 Kock.

(712)
D οὐδεμιᾶς σπουδῆς ἄξι' ἐστίν· ἐν δὲ τῷ πίνειν οὐ θαυμάσαιμ' ἂν εἰ τὸ τερπνὸν αὐτῶν καὶ γλαφυρὸν ἅμα καὶ πλάσιν τινὰ καὶ κατακόσμησιν ἐπιφέρει συνεξομοιοῦσαν τὰ ἤθη τοῖς ἐπιεικέσι καὶ φιλανθρώποις."

4. Ὁ μὲν οὖν Διογενιανὸς ἢ παυσάμενος ἢ διαλείπων ἐσιώπησεν· ἐπιφυομένου δ' αὐτῷ τοῦ σοφιστοῦ πάλιν καὶ ῥήσεις τινὰς οἰομένου δεῖν τῶν Ἀριστοφανείων περαίνειν, ὁ Φίλιππος ἐμὲ προσαγορεύσας, "οὗτος μέν," ἔφη, "τὴν ἐπιθυμίαν ἐμπέπληκε, τὸν ἥδιστον αὐτῷ Μένανδρον ἐπαινέσας,[1] καὶ τῶν ἄλλων οὐδὲν ἔτι φροντίζειν ἔοικεν· λείπεται δὲ πολλὰ τῶν ἀκροαμάτων ἡμῖν ἀνεξέταστα, περὶ ὧν ἂν ἡδέως ἀκούσαιμί σου· τὸν δὲ τῶν
E ζῳδιογλύφων ἀγῶνα βραβεύσομεν αὔριον, ἂν δοκῇ τῷ ξένῳ καὶ Διογενιανῷ, νήφοντες."

"Οὐκοῦν," ἔφην ἐγώ, "μῖμοί τινές εἰσιν, ὧν[2] τοὺς μὲν ὑποθέσεις τοὺς δὲ παίγνια καλοῦσιν· ἁρμόζειν δ' οὐδέτερον οἶμαι συμποσίῳ γένος, τὰς μὲν ὑποθέσεις διὰ τὰ μήκη τῶν δραμάτων καὶ τὸ δυσχορήγητον, τὰ δὲ παίγνια πολλῆς γέμοντα βωμολοχίας καὶ σπερμολογίας οὐδὲ τοῖς τὰ ὑποδήματα κομίζουσι παιδαρίοις, ἄν γε[3] δὴ δεσποτῶν ᾖ σωφρονούντων, θεάσασθαι προσήκει· οἱ δὲ πολλοὶ καὶ γυναικῶν συγκατακειμένων καὶ παίδων ἀνήβων
F ἐπιδείκνυνται μιμήματα πραγμάτων καὶ λόγων, ἃ πάσης μέθης ταραχωδέστερον τὰς ψυχὰς διατίθησιν.

"Ἀλλ' ἥ γε κιθάρα πάλαι που καὶ καθ' Ὅμηρον

[1] ἐπαινέσας Stephanus : παραινέσας.
[2] ὧν Basel edition : ὡς. [3] ἄν γε Bernardakis : ἄτε.





not worth serious attention ; but over the wine-cups, I cannot regard it as surprising that Menander's polished charm exercises a reshaping and reforming influence that helps to raise morals to a higher standard of fairness and kindness."

4. Diogenianus fell silent at this point, whether he was merely pausing or had finished ; and the sophist launched another attack upon him, finding it necessary to recite some passages from Aristophanes. Then Philip turned to me and said, " Diogenianus has got everything that he wanted, since he has sung the praises of his darling Menander, and nothing else seems to interest him. But there are still many kinds of entertainment that we have not reviewed, which I should like to hear you discuss. To-morrow, when we are sober, we shall judge the sculptor's contest, if this is satisfactory to Diogenianus and to the stranger."

" Well," I replied, " there are certain mimes that they call *hypotheseis* (narrative representations), and some that they call *paignia* (farces),[a] but I do not suppose that either kind is suitable to a dinner party. The *hypotheseis* have a too prolonged action and demand too much equipment ; and the *paignia*, which are packed with scurrilous and trivial low comedy, ought not even to be seen by the slaves that fetch our shoes, if their masters are prudent. The vulgar, even when women and young children are in the company, see exhibited stories and language that are more disruptive of an orderly mind than any tippling.

" The lyre has been since ancient times, both in

[a] E. Wüst discusses this passage, *RE*, *s.v.* " Mimos," cols. 1739 f.

(712) καὶ νῦν[1] ἔτι τοῖς χρόνοις γνωρίμη τῆς δαιτός ἐστιν, καὶ μακρὰν οὕτως φιλίαν καὶ συνήθειαν οὐ πρέπει διαλύειν, ἀλλὰ δεῖσθαι τῶν κιθαρῳδῶν μόνον, ὅπως τὸν πολὺν θρῆνον καὶ γόον ἐξαιρῶσιν τῶν ᾠδῶν, εὔφημα καὶ πρέποντα θαλιάζουσιν ἀνθρώποις ᾄδοντες. τὸν δ' αὐλὸν οὐδὲ βουλομένοις ἀπώσα-
713 σθαι τῆς τραπέζης ἔστιν· αἱ γὰρ σπονδαὶ ποθοῦσιν αὐτὸν ἅμα τῷ στεφάνῳ καὶ συνεπιφθέγγεται τῷ παιᾶνι τὸ θεῖον, εἶτ' ἀπελίγανε καὶ διεξῆλθε τῶν ὤτων καταχεόμενος φωνὴν ἡδεῖαν ἄχρι τῆς ψυχῆς ποιοῦσαν γαλήνην· ὥστ', εἴ τι τῶν ἀσηρῶν καὶ πεφροντισμένων ὁ ἄκρατος οὐκ ἐξέσεισεν οὐδὲ διέλυσεν, τοῦτο τῇ χάριτι καὶ πραότητι τοῦ μέλους ὑποκατακλινόμενον ἡσυχάζειν, ἄν γε δὴ καὶ αὐτὸς τὸ μέτριον διαφυλάττῃ μὴ παθαινόμενος μηδ' ἀνασοβῶν καὶ παρεξιστὰς βόμβυξι καὶ πολυχορδίαις τὴν διάνοιαν ὑγρὰν ὑπὸ τῆς μέθης καὶ ἀκροσφαλῆ
B γεγενημένην· ὡς γὰρ τὰ θρέμματα λόγου μὲν οὐ συνίησιν διάνοιαν ἔχοντος, σιγμοῖς δὲ καὶ ποππυσμοῖς ἐμμελέσιν[2] ἢ σύριγξιν καὶ στρόμβοις ἐγείρουσι καὶ κατευνάζουσι πάλιν οἱ νέμοντες, οὕτως, ὅσον ἔνεστι τῇ ψυχῇ φορβαδικὸν καὶ ἀγελαῖον καὶ ἀξύνετον λόγου καὶ ἀνήκοον, μέλεσι καὶ ῥυθμοῖς ἐπιψάλλοντες καὶ καταυλοῦντες εὖ τίθενται καὶ καταπραΰνουσιν.

" Οὐ μὴν ἀλλ' εἰ δεῖ τό γ' ἐμοὶ φαινόμενον εἰπεῖν, οὔτ' ἂν αὐλοῦ ποτε καθ' αὑτὸν οὔτε λύρας μέλει χωρὶς λόγου καὶ ᾠδῆς ἐπιτρέψαιμι τὸ συμπόσιον ὥσπερ ῥεύματι φέρειν ὑπολαμβάνοντι· δεῖ γὰρ

[1] καὶ νῦν added by Post (πάλαι που καθ' Ὅμηρον τοῖς χρόνοις καὶ ἔτι νῦν Wyttenbach).
[2] ἐμμελέσιν Xylander : ἀμελέσιν.





Homer's era and on down to our own, a familiar member of the banquet, and we ought not to dissolve an intimate association of such long standing, but simply request the singers to eliminate the frequent dirges and laments from their repertory and to sing cheerful songs that are suitable to men in festive mood. The flute we could not drive away from the table if we wanted to ; it is as essential to our libations as the garland, and it helps impart a religious tone to the singing of the paean. As its piping note touches our ear, it suffuses us with a voice of sweetness that strikes calm to the mind itself, so that if we harbour any troublesome care, that the wine has not dissolved or dispelled, this brings peace to the man who yields his spirit to its graceful and gentle melody —at least if the flute itself keeps due measure, and avoids emotional display, so as not to rouse into ecstasy, with low-register notes and a multiplicity of tones, a mind already moist with drink and easily stirred. Just as cattle do not comprehend speech that has meaning, but the herdsmen rouse them and quiet them again with musical whistlings and calls, or with pipes and conch shells, so, in so far as there is in our mental life something of the grass-fed herd that has no notion of reason and no response to it, a musician may with melody and rhythm, plucking the lyre or blowing on the flute, compose our minds and soothe our moods.

" If I may express my own opinion, I should never commit a party to the music of flute or lyre by itself without words to be sung, as if it were committed to the whim of a stream on which it floats. There must

(713) C οὕτως ἐθίζειν καὶ σπουδάζοντας καὶ παίζοντας,[1] ὥστε καὶ τὰς ἡδονὰς ἐκ λόγου λαμβάνειν καὶ τὰς διατριβὰς ἐν λόγῳ ποιεῖσθαι, τὸ δὲ μέλος καὶ τὸν ῥυθμὸν ὥσπερ ὄψον ἐπὶ τῷ λόγῳ καὶ μὴ καθ' αὑτὰ προσφέρεσθαι μηδὲ λιχνεύειν. ὡς γὰρ ἡδονὴν ἐν οἴνῳ καὶ ὄψῳ τῇ χρείᾳ τῆς τροφῆς συνεισιοῦσαν οὐδεὶς ἀπωθεῖται, τὴν δ' ἐπὶ τοῖς μύροις οὐκ ἀναγκαίαν καὶ περίεργον οὖσαν ὁ Σωκράτης ἐπὶ κόρρης ῥαπίζων ἐξέβαλλεν, οὕτω ψαλτηρίου φωνῆς καὶ αὐλοῦ καθ' ἑαυτὴν τὰ ὦτα κοπτούσης μὴ ὑπακούωμεν, ἂν δ' ἕπηται μετὰ λόγου καὶ ᾠδῆς ἑστιῶσα D καὶ τέρπουσα τὸν ἐν ἡμῖν λόγον, εἰσάγωμεν, οἰόμενοι καὶ τὸν Μαρσύαν ἐκεῖνον ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ κολασθῆναι, ὅτι φορβειᾷ καὶ αὐλοῖς ἐπιστομίσας ἑαυτὸν ἐτόλμησεν ψιλῷ μέλει διαγωνίζεσθαι πρὸς ᾠδὴν καὶ κιθάραν.

"Μόνον," ἔφην, "σκοπῶμεν ὅπως συμπόταις διὰ λόγου καὶ φιλοσοφίας ἀλλήλους εὐφραίνειν δυναμένοις μηδὲν ἐπάξομεν τοιοῦτον θύραθεν ὃ κώλυμα διαγωγῆς μᾶλλον ἢ διαγωγή τις ἔσται. οὐ γὰρ μόνον ὅσοι τὴν σωτηρίαν οἴκοι καὶ παρ' αὑτῶν ἔχοντες

ἄλλην θέλουσιν εἰσαγώγιμον λαβεῖν,

ὡς Εὐριπίδης εἶπεν, ἀβέλτεροί εἰσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ ὅσοι, πολλῆς ἐν αὐτοῖς εὐφροσύνης καὶ θυμηδίας παρού- E σης, ἔξωθεν ἐπάγειν τὰ τέρποντα φιλοτιμοῦνται. καὶ γὰρ ἡ τοῦ μεγάλου βασιλέως μεγαλοφροσύνη

[1] καὶ παίζοντας added by Reiske, Bernardakis.

[a] The word λόγος in this passage, as often, reflects the two senses of (*a*) word, verbal expression, speech, and (*b*) reason, rationality.





also be words—that is, song. We must form the habit, whether working or playing, of enjoying the words and including words [a] in our pastimes. We should regard melody and rhythm as a sauce, so to speak, added to the words, rather than use or prize them for their own sake. For just as no one refuses the pleasure in the wine and in the relish that we eat with our principal food, but Socrates did reject contemptuously the enjoyment of scents as unessential and artificial,[b] so let us not answer the voice of the lyre or flute when it knocks at our ear unchaperoned; but if it comes in company with words and song, providing a feast to delight our rational part, then let us usher it in. We must suppose that Marsyas' punishment by the god in the old story was for the crime of bridling himself with mouthpiece and flutes and making bold to compete with instrumental music alone against the combination of song and lyre.[c]

"One thing we must watch out for," I continued, "is, when our fellow guests are capable of entertaining each other with philosophic discourse, not to introduce from outside something that will put a stop to entertainment instead of being entertainment. They are a silly lot who have the means of safety at home but (as Euripides says)

Consent to take some other from abroad [d];

but so are people who have a fund of joy and gladness in themselves, yet take pride in introducing amusements from other sources. So too the Persian king's lavish thought was horribly tasteless and boorish,

[b] Xenophon, *Symposium*, ii. 3 ff.

[c] Marsyas contended in music against Apollo, was defeated, and flayed alive.

[d] Frag. 984 Nauck.

(713) πρὸς Ἀνταλκίδαν τὸν Λάκωνα δεινῶς ἀπειρόκαλος ἐφάνη καὶ ἀγροῖκος, ὁπηνίκα ῥόδων καὶ κρόκου μεμιγμένων στέφανον εἰς μύρον βάψας ἔπεμψεν αὐτῷ, τὸ σύμφυτον καὶ ἴδιον καλὸν ἀποσβέσας καὶ καθυβρίσας τοῖς ἄνθεσιν· ὅμοιον οὖν ἐστι τό, συμποσίου χάριν ἔχοντος ἐν ἑαυτῷ καὶ μοῦσαν ἰδίαν, καταυλεῖν καὶ καταψάλλειν ἔξωθεν, ἀφαιρούμενον τῷ ἀλλοτρίῳ τὸ οἰκεῖον.

"Μάλιστ' ἂν οὖν ἀκροαμάτων εἴη καιρὸς ἐν
F συμποσίῳ κυμαίνοντι καὶ κορυσσομένῳ πρὸς ἔριν ἢ φιλονεικίαν, ὥστε λοιδορίαν τινὰ κατασβέσαι καὶ ζητήσεως εἰς ἄμιλλαν ἀτερπῆ καὶ ἀγῶνα σοφιστικὸν ἐκφερομένης ἐπιλαμβάνεσθαι καὶ προϊούσης[1] πρὸς ἀγῶνας ἐκκλησιαστικοὺς καὶ ἀγοραίους ἐπίσχειν, ἄχρι ἂν αὖθις ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἀθόρυβον καὶ ἀνήνεμον γένηται τὸ συμπόσιον."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Θ

714 Ὅτι βουλεύεσθαι παρὰ πότον οὐχ ἧττον ἦν Ἑλληνικὸν ἢ Περσικόν

Collocuntur Glaucias, alii

Περὶ ὧν ἔμελλον ἐκκλησιάζειν Ἀθηναῖοι λόγος ἦν παρὰ τὸ δεῖπνον, ἑστιῶντος ἡμᾶς Νικοστράτου· καί τινος εἰπόντος ὡς "Περσικὸν πρᾶγμα ποιοῦμεν, ὦ ἄνδρες, βουλευόμενοι παρ' οἶνον," "τί

[1] προϊούσης added by Post.

[a] In the *Lives* of Pelopidas (30) and Artaxerxes (22), the honour conferred by this act is emphasized, not its tastelessness.





when, before he sent Antalcidas the Spartan a wreath made of roses and crocuses, he dipped it in scent, so as to drown the native and special beauty of the flowers, and do them violence.[a] It is a similar action, when a party has in its own circle a special Grace and Muse of its own, to suppress it with pipe and zither from without, and to make use of the foreign to abolish the domestic.

"The best occasion for musical entertainment is a party where the waves of strife or rivalry are rising toward a crest. There it can drown out name-calling; it can check a discussion that is deviating into an unpleasant squabble or a contest in sophistry; or if the discussion is moving in the direction of political and legal controversy, it can keep it in hand until the company settles down to a fresh start quiet and free from gales of eloquence."

## QUESTION 9

That deliberating on public affairs over wine was no less a Greek than a Persian custom.

Speakers: Glaucias, others

At a dinner given for me by Nicostratus,[b] there was some conversation about matters to be taken up in the Athenian assembly; and when someone remarked, "This is a Persian custom we are following, gentlemen, in deliberating over our wine,"[c] Glaucias[d]

[b] The host does not speak in this dialogue, but does in 10, below. He is only known from these passages.

[c] Herodotus, i. 133.

[d] Apparently an Athenian and an intimate of Plutarch. See also 10, ii. 2, ix. 12, 13.

(714) μᾶλλον," ἔφη ὁ Γλαυκίας ὑπολαβών, " ἢ Ἑλληνικόν; Ἕλλην μὲν γὰρ ἦν ὁ εἰπών,

γαστρὸς ἀπὸ πλείης βουλὴ καὶ μῆτις ἀμείνων·

Ἕλληνες δὲ σὺν Ἀγαμέμνονι Τροίαν ἐπολιόρκουν,
B οἷς φαγοῦσι καὶ πιοῦσιν ' ὁ γέρων πάμπρωτον ὑφαίνειν ἤρχετο μῆτιν,' ἐπ' αὐτὸ τοῦτο τῆς κλήσεως τῶν ἀρίστων εἰσηγητὴς τῷ βασιλεῖ γενόμενος· ' δαίνυ δαῖτα γέρουσι,' ' πολλῶν ' γάρ τοι, φησίν, ' ἀγρομένων τῷ πείσεαι, ὅς κεν ἀρίστην βουλὴν βουλεύσῃ.' διὸ καὶ τὰ πλείστῃ χρησάμενα τῆς Ἑλλάδος εὐνομίᾳ γένη καὶ μάλιστα φιλοχωρήσαντα περὶ τοὺς ἀρχαίους ἐθισμοὺς ἐν οἴνῳ τὰς ἀρχὰς συνεῖχε. τὰ γὰρ παρὰ Κρησὶν Ἀνδρεῖα καλούμενα, παρὰ δὲ Σπαρτιάταις Φιδίτια, βουλευτηρίων ἀπορρήτων καὶ συνεδρίων ἀριστοκρατικῶν τάξιν εἶχεν, ὥσπερ οἶμαι καὶ τὸ ἐνθάδε Πρυτανεῖον καὶ Θεσμο-
C θετεῖον· οὐ πόρρω δὲ τούτων ὁ νυκτερινὸς σύλλογος παρὰ Πλάτωνι τῶν ἀρίστων καὶ πολιτικωτάτων ἀνδρῶν ἐστιν, ἐφ' ὃν ἀναπέμπεται τὰ μέγιστα καὶ πλείστης ἄξια φροντίδος. οἱ δὲ τῷ Ἑρμῇ ' πυμάτῳ σπένδοντες, ὅτε μνησαίατο κοίτου,' ἆρ' οὐκ εἰς τὸ αὐτὸ συνάγουσιν τῷ οἴνῳ τὸν λόγον; ὡς γοῦν παρόντι καὶ συνεπισκοποῦντι τῷ φρονιμωτάτῳ θεῷ πρῶτον ἀπαλλαττόμενοι προσεύχονται. οἱ δὲ

[a] Fragment from an unknown poet, also quoted at 700 E.
[b] Homer, *Iliad*, ix. 93. [c] *Ibid.* 74.
[d] *Cf.* Dosiadas, frag. 2 Jacoby (*Frag. Gr. Hist.* iii B, p. 458): 1 Müller (*Frag. Hist. Graec.* iv. 399) (Athenaeus, iv. 143 a-d). *Cf.* Willetts, *Aristocratic Society in Ancient Crete* (London, 1955), pp. 21 ff.





retorted, " How is it any more Persian than Greek? It was a Greek who said,

From a full belly come better counsel and wisdom.[a]

They were Greeks, too, who were besieging Troy with Agamemnon, before whom, when they had eaten and drunk, ' first the old man began the weaving of counsel '[b]; and it was for this very purpose that Nestor had proposed to the king to summon the nobles. ' Provide a feast for the elders,' he said, and ' when many are gathered together, you will be guided by him who gives the best counsel.'[c] This also explains why the peoples with the best governments, among the Greeks and those that have shown the most love of country in the maintenance of ancient custom, kept their rulers together over wine. For the so-called *andreia* (men's halls)[d] among the Cretans, and the *phiditia* (common messes)[e] among the Spartans had a place as secret councils and aristocratic caucuses—as did also, I suppose, the Prytaneum and Thesmotheteum here. And not much differently from these, the Nocturnal Council of Plato[f] is a group of the best and most statesmanlike men to which are referred the most important matters, and those which require the most careful consideration. When Homer's heroes ' poured libation to Hermes last, when their thought was of bed,'[g] were they not bringing reason and wine into one gathering? Just before departing, at least, they pray to the cleverest of the gods, believing him to be there with them and a partner in their deliberations. And in very ancient

[e] See *Life of Lycurgus*, 12; *OCD*, *s.v.* " Syssitia."
[f] *Laws*, xii. 968 A.
[g] Homer, *Odyssey*, vii. 136-138.

(714) πάμπαν ἀρχαῖοι ὡς οὐδὲ τοῦ Ἑρμοῦ δεόμενον τὸν Διόνυσον αὐτὸν Εὐβουλέα καὶ τὴν νύκτα δι' ἐκεῖνον 'εὐφρόνην' προσεῖπον."

D

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ι

Εἰ καλῶς ἐποίουν βουλευόμενοι παρὰ πότον

Collocuntur Nicostratus, frater Plutarchi (Lamprias?)

1. Ταῦτα τοῦ Γλαυκίου διεξελθόντος, ἔδοξαν ἡμῖν ἐπιεικῶς οἱ θορυβώδεις ἐκεῖνοι κατακεκοιμῆσθαι λόγοι, καὶ ὅπως ἔτι μᾶλλον αὐτῶν ἀμνηστία γένοιτο, ζήτησιν ἑτέραν ἐπάγων Νικόστρατος ἔφη πρότερον οὐ πάνυ μέλειν αὐτῷ Περσικοῦ τοῦ πράγματος εἶναι δοκοῦντος· ἐπεὶ δὲ νῦν Ἑλληνικὸν ὂν[1] πεφώραται, δεῖσθαι λόγου βοηθοῦντος αὐτῷ πρὸς τὴν αὐτόθεν φαινομένην ἀτοπίαν. "ὅ τε γὰρ λογισμὸς ὥσπερ ὀφθαλμὸς ἐν ὑγρῷ σάλον ἔχοντι δυσκίνητον ἡμῖν καὶ δύσεργόν ἐστι, τά τε πάθη[2]
E πανταχόθεν ὥσπερ ἑρπετὰ πρὸς ἥλιον σαλευόμενα πρὸς τὸν οἶνον καὶ ἀναδυόμενα τὴν γνώμην ἐπισφαλῆ ποιεῖ καὶ ἀκατάστατον. ὅθεν ὥσπερ ἡ κλίνη τοῖς πίνουσι τῆς καθέδρας ἀμείνων, ὅτι τὸ σῶμα κατέχει καὶ ἀπολύει[3] κινήσεως ἁπάσης, οὕτως ἔχειν ἀτρέμα τὴν ψυχὴν ἄριστον· εἰ δὲ μή,

[1] ὂν Reiske: εἶναι.
[2] τε πάθη Reiske, Bernardakis: δ' ἐπάχθη.
[3] ἀπολύει Stephanus: ἀπολαύει.

[a] This name for night is euphemistic: "the kindly one"; but the word might also mean, as Plutarch seems to intend, "the wise one."

[b] Plutarch cannot be referring here to the previous Question, which has no "tumultuous arguments," unless he means





times, men regarded Dionysus as not even needing the help of Hermes; they spoke of him as *Eubuleus* (Good Counsellor), and on his account they termed night *euphrone* (good thinking)." [a]

## QUESTION 10

Whether it was a good custom to deliberate over wine.

Speakers: Nicostratus, a brother of Plutarch (perhaps Lamprias)

1. With this speech of Glaucias, we concluded that those earlier, tumultuous arguments had been pretty well put to rest [b]; and that we might forget them even more completely, Nicostratus introduced a new question. In the past, he said, he had not been greatly concerned about the matter, because this was held to be a Persian custom, but that now, since it had been investigated and found to be Greek, there was need of a discussion in defence of it, in view of its apparent absurdity. "For reasoning, like the eye, if it is surrounded by a surging humour, is no easy thing for us to move as we would, or keep at work; moreover, the emotions which are stirred by the wine, like reptiles emerging when stirred by the sun, make our judgement precarious and unstable. Thus for men who are drinking, just as a couch is better than a chair, because it retains the whole body, and relieves it of all activity, so it is best to hold the mind steady. Failing that, we must not

the potentially disturbing topics mentioned at the beginning of Question 8. Hubert suggests that by oversight he refers to Question 8 (in which, however, Glaucias does not appear). The confusion may be due to an editorial rearrangement of the Questions, perhaps by the author himself.

(714) δοτέον, ὥσπερ παισὶν ἀτρεμεῖν μὴ δυναμένοις, οὐ δόρυ καὶ ξίφος, ἀλλὰ πλαταγὴν καὶ σφαῖραν, ὥσπερ ὁ θεὸς τὸν νάρθηκα τοῖς μεθύουσιν ἐνεχείρισε κωφότατον βέλος καὶ μαλακώτατον ἀμυντήριον, ὅπως, ἐπεὶ τάχιστα παίουσιν, ἥκιστα βλάπτωσιν· δεῖ γὰρ γελοῖα τὰ σφάλματα τοῖς μεθύουσι ποιεῖν, οὐκ
F οἰκτρὰ καὶ τραγικὰ καὶ μεγάλας ἀποτεύξεις ἔχοντα.

" Καὶ μήν, ὅπερ ἐστὶ μέγιστον ἐν ταῖς περὶ τῶν μεγίστων σκέψεσι, τὸν ἐνδεᾶ νοῦ καὶ πραγμάτων ἄπειρον ἕπεσθαι τοῖς φρονοῦσι καὶ τῶν ἐμπείρων ἀκούειν, ἀφαιρεῖται τοὺς μεθύοντας ὁ οἶνος· ὥστε
715 καὶ τοὔνομα γενέσθαι φησὶν ὁ Πλάτων ' ὅτι οἴεσθαι νοῦν ἔχειν ποιεῖ ' τοὺς πίνοντας· οὔτε γὰρ ἐλλόγιμος οὔτε καλὸς οὔτε πλούσιος[1] οὕτως οἴεται, καίπερ οἰόμενος, εἶναι τῶν πινόντων ἕκαστος ὡς φρόνιμος· διὸ καὶ πολύφωνος ὁ οἶνός ἐστι καὶ λαλιᾶς ἀκαίρου καὶ φρονήματος ἡγεμονικοῦ καταπίμπλησιν, ὡς οὐκ ἀκούειν ἀλλ' ἀκούεσθαι μᾶλλον ἡμῖν καὶ ἄγειν οὐχ ἕπεσθαι προσῆκον. ἀλλὰ γάρ," ἔφη, " τὰ μὲν εἰς τοῦτο ῥᾳδίως ἄν τις συναγάγοι, δῆλα γάρ ἐστιν· τῶν δ' ἐναντίων ἀκουστέον εἴ τις ἢ νέος προσέστηκεν ἢ πρεσβύτερος."

2. Ἐπιβούλως δὴ πάνυ καὶ σοφιστικῶς ὁ
B ἀδελφὸς ἡμῶν, " οἴει γὰρ ἄν," ἔφη, " τινὰ τοὺς ἐνδεχομένους λόγους εὑρεῖν ἐν τῷ παρόντι καιρῷ πρὸς τὸ πρόβλημα;" τοῦ δὲ Νικοστράτου πάνυ

[1] ἐλλόγιμος . . . καλὸς . . . πλούσιος Basel edition: λογισμὸν . . . κάλλος . . . πλοῦτος.

[a] *Cratylus*, 406 C: οἶνον from οἴεσθαι νοῦν ἔχειν (as one might say that *whiskey* is wit's key).





give the tipplers sword and lance, but a rattle and a ball, as we give them to children who cannot keep still. So too the god put the reed in the hands of those fired with wine, which is the bluntest of missiles and the most pliable of weapons, so that when they are quickest to strike, they can do least harm. For it is proper to see that errors of the tipsy shall be comic rather than deplorable and tragic and a source of great disaster.

" Furthermore, wine deprives the intoxicated of the very thing that is most vital in the consideration of the greatest issues. It makes the man who has less intelligence or practical experience loth to follow the prudent and lend an ear to the experienced. Hence in fact Plato says that the very word ' wine ' (*oinos*) derives from ' weening ' to have sense (*oiesthai noun echein*).[a] For each of those drinking supposes himself, not so much important or handsome or rich, though he does suppose all that, as he fancies himself prudent. This is why wine is loud-voiced and infects everyone with the urge to chatter at random and the notion that he is a great leader. It is not fitting for him to take orders but rather to give them, to lead, not follow. But in fact," he concluded, " a man could easily gather evidence on this side ; it is plain to see, but we must hear the other side as well, if there is anyone, young or old, to stand up for it."

2. At this my brother[b] most maliciously and trickily inquired, " Do you think, then, that anyone would be likely now, on the spur of the moment, to discover such arguments as are possible to bring to bear on the question ? " Nicostratus replied that he

[b] Comparing 726 D below, Hubert conjectures that the brother here is the same Lamprias.

(715) φήσαντος οἴεσθαι, τοσούτων φιλολόγων καὶ πολιτικῶν παρόντων, ὑπομειδιάσας ἐκεῖνος, " εἶτ'," ἔφη, " περὶ τούτων μὲν οἴει καὶ σεαυτὸν ἱκανῶς ἂν εἰπεῖν πρὸς ἡμᾶς, πρὸς δὲ πραγματικὴν καὶ πολιτικὴν σκέψιν ἀθέτως ἔχειν διὰ τὸν οἶνον; ἢ τοῦθ' ὅμοιόν ἐστι τῷ νομίζειν ὅτι ταῖς ὄψεσιν ὁ πίνων παρορῶν τὰ μεγάλα, τὰ μικρὰ ὑπέρευ[1] μεταβλέπει, αὖθις δὲ τοῖς ὠσὶ παρακούει τῶν ἐντυγχανόντων καὶ διαλεγομένων, τῶν δ' ᾀδόντων καὶ αὐλούντων ἀκριβῶς ἀκούει; ὡς γὰρ ἐνταῦθα μᾶλλον εἰκός ἐστι
C τῶν γλαφυρῶν τὰ χρειώδη τὴν αἴσθησιν ἐπιστρέφειν, οὕτως καὶ τὴν διάνοιαν οὐ θαυμάσαιμί γ' ἂν εἴ τι τῶν φιλοσόφων καὶ περιττῶν ἐκφύγοι παρ' οἶνον, εἰς δὲ πραγματικὰς σκέψεις ἀγομένην πυκνοῦσθαι καὶ συνίστασθαι τῷ φρονεῖν εἰκός ἐστιν· ὥσπερ ὁ Φίλιππος ἐν Χαιρωνείᾳ, πολλὰ ληρῶν ὑπὸ μέθης καὶ καταγέλαστος ὤν, ἅμα τῷ προσπεσεῖν αὐτῷ περὶ σπονδῶν καὶ εἰρήνης λόγον ἔστησε τὸ πρόσωπον καὶ συνήγαγε τὰς ὀφρῦς καὶ τὸ ῥεμβῶδες[2] καὶ ἀκόλαστον ἐκσοβήσας εὖ μάλα βεβουλευμένην καὶ νήφουσαν ἔδωκε τοῖς Ἀθηναίοις ἀπόκρισιν.

D " Καίτοι τὸ πίνειν τοῦ μεθύειν διαφέρει, καὶ τοὺς μεθύοντας ὥστε ληρεῖν οἰόμεθα δεῖν ἀπιόντας καθεύδειν, οἴνῳ δὲ χρωμένους ἐπὶ πλέον καὶ διαπίνοντας, ἄλλως νοῦν ἔχοντας ἄνδρας, οὐκ ἄξιον δεδιέναι μὴ σφαλῶσι τῷ λογισμῷ καὶ τὴν ἐμπειρίαν ἀποβάλωσιν, ὁρῶντας[3] ὀρχηστάς τε καὶ κιθαριστὰς

[1] πίνων παρορῶν τὰ μεγάλα, τὰ μικρὰ ὑπέρευ Bernardakis, after Wyttenbach : πίνων γὰρ εὖ.

[2] ῥεμβῶδες Turnebus : ῥομβῶδες.





certainly did, with so many scholars and statesmen present, and my brother answered with a smile, " So you think, then, that you would yourself be quite capable of discoursing to us on this subject, but that because of the wine you are drinking you are not in a fit state to talk about a matter of practical politics ? Is this not like thinking that a man in his cups sees big things blurred but can focus on small ones very well, or that his ears fail to catch what those whom he meets and speaks to are saying, but hear the singers and flute-players perfectly ? For just as, in the latter case, it is more likely that what is useful to us would intensify our perception than what is polished and smooth, so I should not be surprised if our minds too were to miss some subtlety of philosophy under the influence of wine, whereas if they were applied to the consideration of practical matters, they would be more likely to gain firmness and consistency by the stimulus of thought. Remember Philip at Chaeronea: he talked a lot of nonsense, in his drunkenness, and made a fool of himself, but the moment he was approached with a proposal for an armistice and peace, he set his face firmly, knitted his brows, and, brushing aside his casual and careless air, gave the Athenians a deliberate and sober answer.

" Surely it is not the same thing to be drinking and to be drunk. When men have drunk till they ramble, it is time, we assume, for them to go off to bed ; but with men who can take a good deal of wine and go on drinking, who are, apart from that, men of sense, there is no reason to fear that they will miss the mark in reasoning, or be divested of their practised touch. We see that dancers and harpists do

[3] ὁρῶντας added by Xylander.

(715) οὐδέν τι χεῖρον ἐν συμποσίοις ἢ θεάτροις πράττοντας· ἡ γὰρ ἐμπειρία παροῦσα καὶ τὸ σῶμα ταῖς ἐνεργείαις ὀρθούμενον παρέχει καὶ συγκινούμενον ἀσφαλῶς.

" Πολλοῖς δ' ἰταμότητα θάρσους συνεργὸν ὁ ἄκρατος, οὐ βδελυρὰν οὐδ' ἄκρατον ἀλλ' εὔχαριν καὶ πιθανήν, προστίθησιν· ὥσπερ καὶ τὸν Αἰσχύλον
E ἱστοροῦσι τὰς τραγῳδίας ἐμπίνοντα ποιεῖν, καὶ οὐχ, ὡς Γοργίας εἶπεν, ἓν τῶν δραμάτων αὐτοῦ ' μεστὸν[1] Ἄρεως '[2] εἶναι, τοὺς Ἑπτ' ἐπὶ Θήβας, ἀλλὰ πάντα Διονύσου. ' θερμαντικὸς ' γὰρ ὢν κατὰ τὸν Πλάτωνα ' τῆς ψυχῆς μετὰ τοῦ σώματος ὁ οἶνος ' εὔδρομον τὸ σῶμα ποιεῖ καὶ πόρους ῥήγνυσι φαντασιῶν ἐφελκομένων μετὰ τοῦ θαρρεῖν τὸν λόγον· ἔνιοι γὰρ εὑρετικὴν φύσιν ἔχοντες, ἐν δὲ τῷ νήφειν ἀτολμοτέραν καὶ πεπηγυῖαν, ὅταν εἰς τὸ πίνειν ἔλθωσιν ὥσπερ ὁ λιβανωτὸς ὑπὸ θερμότητος ἀναθυμιῶνται. τὸν δὲ δὴ φόβον οὐδενὸς ἧττον ἐμποδὼν ὄντα βουλευομένοις ἐξελαύνει, καὶ πολλὰ
F τῶν ἄλλων παθῶν ἀφιλότιμα καὶ ἀγεννῆ καταβέννυσι, καὶ τὸ κακόηθες καὶ τὸ ὕπουλον ὥσπερ τινὰς διπλόας ἀναπτύσσει τῆς ψυχῆς, καὶ παντὸς ἤθους καὶ πάθους ποιεῖ καταφάνειαν ἐν τοῖς λόγοις· ἔστι δὲ παρρησίας καὶ δι' αὐτὴν ἀληθείας γονιμώ-
716 τατος· ἧς μὴ παρούσης οὐδὲν ἐμπειρίας οὐδ' ἀγχινοίας ὄφελος. ἀλλὰ πολλοὶ τῷ ἐπιόντι χρώμενοι μᾶλλον κατορθοῦσιν ἢ εἰ κρύπτουσιν ἐπιβούλως καὶ πανούργως τὸ παριστάμενον.

" Οὐδὲν οὖν δεῖ δεδιέναι κινοῦντα τὰ πάθη τὸν

[1] μεστὸν Reiske : μέγιστον.
[2] Ἄρεως Aldine edition : ἀραίως.





not perform less well at parties than they do in the theatre ; for the practised skill is there, which enables the body to be accurate in its activities and to co-ordinate its movements with precision.

" Wine gives many people a forwardness that joins forces with self-assurance, but not offensively or excessively so much as wittily and eloquently. They say that Aeschylus composed his tragedies while taking wine. It is not so true that one of his plays (the *Seven against Thebes*) is ' full of Ares,' to quote Gorgias,[a] as that all of them are full of Dionysus. For as Plato says, ' wine heats the mind as well as the body '[b] : it makes the body lively and breaks open passageways for fancies that, aided by a confident mood, bring discourse in their wake. Some people, who have a talent for invention but are too diffident and stiff when sober, will, when they immerse themselves in wine, find their spirits rise within them like incense, when heated, diffusing its essence. Wine drives out the timidity that is the greatest handicap in deliberation, and drowns out many another mean-spirited and ignoble emotion ; it shakes out the folds as it were, where duplicity and rancour lurk in the mind, and reveals every trait of character and every secret feeling in transparent language. It is the most fertile seed of frankness and thereby of truthfulness ; and if truth be not present, neither practical skill nor quick insight do any good. No indeed, many do better using whatever words come into their heads than craftily or treacherously concealing their minds.

" There is no need, therefore, to fear wine as a

[a] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8], 82 B 24.
[b] *Timaeus*, 60 A.

(716) οἶνον· κινεῖ γὰρ οὐ τὰ φαυλότατα, πλὴν ἐν τοῖς κακίστοις, ὧν οὐδέποτε νήφει τὸ βουλευόμενον· ἀλλ' ὥσπερ τὰ κουρεῖα Θεόφραστος εἰώθει καλεῖν ἄοινα συμπόσια διὰ τὴν λαλιάν, οὕτως ἄοινος ἀεὶ μέθη καὶ σκυθρωπὴ ταῖς τῶν ἀπαιδεύτων ἐνοικεῖ ψυχαῖς, ἐπιταραττομένη ὑπ' ὀργῆς τινος ἢ δυσμενείας ἢ φιλονεικίας ἢ ἀνελευθερίας· ὧν ὁ οἶνος ἀμβλύνων τὰ πολλὰ μᾶλλον ἢ παροξύνων οὐκ ἄφρο-
B νας οὐδ' ἠλιθίους ἀλλ' ἁπλοῦς ποιεῖ καὶ ἀπανούργους, οὐδὲ παρορατικοὺς τοῦ συμφέροντος ἀλλὰ τοῦ καλοῦ προαιρετικούς. οἱ δὲ τὴν πανουργίαν δεινότητα καὶ φρόνησιν ἡγούμενοι τὴν ψευδοδοξίαν καὶ ἀνελευθερίαν εἰκότως ἀβελτέρους ἀποφαίνουσι τοὺς ἐν οἴνῳ λέγοντας ἀφελῶς καὶ ἀδόλως τὸ φαινόμενον· τοὐναντίον δ' οἱ παλαιοὶ τὸν θεὸν Ἐλευθερέα καὶ Λύσιον ἐκάλουν καὶ μαντικῆς πολλὴν ἔχειν ἡγοῦντο μοῖραν, οὐ διὰ 'τὸ βακχεύσιμον καὶ μανιῶδες' ὥσπερ Εὐριπίδης εἶπεν, ἀλλ' ὅτι τὸ δουλοπρεπὲς καὶ περιδεὲς καὶ ἄπιστον ἐξαιρῶν καὶ
C ἀπολύων τῆς ψυχῆς ἀληθείᾳ καὶ παρρησίᾳ χρῆσθαι πρὸς ἀλλήλους δίδωσιν."





stimulus to the feelings. It does not rouse those that are lowest, except in the wicked—and their deliberative faculty is never in a sober state anyway. Theophrastus used to call barber shops 'wineless symposia'[a] because of the talk that goes on there; just so a grim and 'wineless drunkenness' is always lurking in the mind of an uncultured man. This may be roused by any burst of temper or ill will or contentiousness or meanness of spirit, most of which moods are blunted rather than whetted by wine, so that it makes people, not foolish and stupid, but simple and guileless, and though alert to their own advantage, yet partisans of honour. Naturally, those who mistake lack of scruple for cleverness, or consider dissembling and meanness of spirit to be good sense, will class as fools those who, in their cups, say plainly and guilelessly what they think. But the ancients did just the opposite, when they named the god *Eleuthereus* (Liberator) and *Lysios* (Releaser). They thought that he had a great gift of divination not because of the 'bacchic and mad' element, as Euripides said,[b] but because by taking from the soul its slavish and timorous and suspicious nature and freeing it from these, he grants us the boon of treating each other with truthfulness and frankness."

[a] Frag. 76 Wimmer. [b] *Bacchae*, 298-299.

# TABLE-TALK

## (QUAESTIONES CONVIVALES)

## BOOK VIII

# INTRODUCTION

THIS book is devoted largely to rather serious questions, over half of the problems being concerned with philosophy, science, or medicine. Especially interesting, from this point of view, are those on Plato's geometrician-god (2) and on the Pythagorean *symbola* (7 and 8). The etymologies of 6 and the long discussion on new diseases in 9, like the argument on swallowing in Book VII, Question 1, cast interesting light on the level of scientific and philological sophistication in Plutarch's circle.

Two pairs of dialogues are connected in dramatic situation (1 and 2, 7 and 8). All except 5, and perhaps 9, give the impression of being intended to sound like authentic reports.

On the treatment of the text see the introduction to Book VII.

EDWIN L. MINAR, JR.

(716) ΣΥΜΠΟΣΙΑΚΩΝ

ΒΙΒΛΙΟΝ ΟΓΔΟΟΝ

D Οἱ φιλοσοφίαν, ὦ Σόσσιε Σενεκίων, ἐκ τῶν συμποσίων ἐκβάλλοντες οὐ ταὐτὸ ποιοῦσι τοῖς τὸ φῶς ἀναιροῦσιν, ἀλλὰ χεῖρον, ὅσῳ λύχνου μὲν ἀρθέντος οἱ μέτριοι καὶ σώφρονες οὐδὲν ἔσονται κακίους, τὸ αἰδεῖσθαι τοῦ βλέπειν ἀλλήλους μεῖζον ἔχοντες, ἀμαθίας δὲ δὴ καὶ ἀμουσίας σὺν οἴνῳ παρ-
E ούσης οὐδ' ὁ τῆς Ἀθηνᾶς χρυσοῦς λύχνος ἐκεῖνος εὔχαριν ἂν πότον καὶ κόσμιον παράσχοι. σιωπῶντας μὲν γὰρ ἐμπίπλασθαι μετ' ἀλλήλων κομιδῇ συῶδες καὶ ἴσως ἀδύνατον· ὁ δὲ λόγον μὲν ἀπολιπὼν ἐν συμποσίῳ, τὸ δὲ τεταγμένως χρῆσθαι λόγῳ καὶ ὠφελίμως οὐ προσιέμενος πολὺ γελοιότερός ἐστιν τοῦ πίνειν μὲν οἰομένου δεῖν[1] καὶ τρώγειν τοὺς δειπνοῦντας, ἄκρατον δὲ τὸν οἶνον αὐτοῖς ἐγχέοντος καὶ τοὔψον ἀνήδυντον καὶ ἀκάθαρτον παρατιθέντος. οὔτε γὰρ ποτὸν οὐδὲν οὕτ' ἐδεστὸν οὕτως ἀηδὲς καὶ βλαβερόν ἐστιν μὴ θεραπευθὲν ὃν προσήκει
F τρόπον, ὡς λόγος ἀκαίρως καὶ ἀνοήτως ἐν συμποσίῳ περιφερόμενος. τὴν γοῦν μέθην οἱ λοιδοροῦντες φιλόσοφοι λήρησιν πάροινον ἀποκαλοῦσιν·

[1] δεῖν Stephanus : ἀεὶ



# TABLE-TALK

## BOOK EIGHT

People who would banish philosophy from the symposium, Sossius Senecio, are even more at fault than one who would take away the lights. For if the lamp is removed, moderate and prudent men will not be any worse behaved than before, since they have in their self-respect a greater safeguard than seeing and being seen ; but if ignorance and lack of culture keep company with wine, not even that famous golden lamp of Athena [a] could make the party refined and orderly. Of course for a group of men to say nothing at all, while stuffing themselves with food, would be downright swinish—perhaps even impossible. Still, one who permits conversation in a drinking-party, but makes no move to see that the conversation is orderly and profitable, is much more ridiculous than the man who approves of serving wine and dessert at dinner, but pours the wine unmixed and sets on food unseasoned and uncleaned. For no drink or food is so disagreeable or unwholesome, for lack of the right treatment, as is conversation that drifts about randomly and foolishly at a party. At any rate, those philosophers who wish to give indulgence in wine a bad name define it as

[a] See Homer, *Odyssey*, xix. 34, where Athena, though invisible to Telemachus, lights the way for him and Odysseus.

(716) τὸ δὲ λῆρεῖν οὐδέν ἐστιν ἀλλ' ἢ λόγῳ κενῷ χρῆσθαι καὶ φλυαρώδει· λαλιᾶς δ' ἀτάκτου καὶ φλυαρίας εἰς ἄκρατον ἐμπεσούσης ὕβρις καὶ παροινία τέλος ἀμουσότατον καὶ ἀχαριστότατον.

Οὐ φαύλως οὖν καὶ παρ' ἡμῖν ἐν τοῖς Ἀγριω-
717 νίοις τὸν Διόνυσον αἱ γυναῖκες ὡς ἀποδεδρακότα ζητοῦσιν, εἶτα παύονται καὶ λέγουσιν ὅτι πρὸς τὰς Μούσας καταπέφευγεν καὶ κέκρυπται παρ' ἐκείναις, μετ' ὀλίγον δέ, τοῦ δείπνου τέλος ἔχοντος, αἰνίγματα καὶ γρίφους ἀλλήλαις προβάλλουσιν, τοῦ μυστηρίου διδάσκοντος, ὅτι λόγῳ τε δεῖ χρῆσθαι παρὰ πότον θεωρίαν τινὰ καὶ μοῦσαν ἔχοντι καὶ λόγου τοιούτου τῇ μέθῃ παρόντος ἀποκρύπτεται τὸ ἄγριον καὶ μανικόν, ὑπὸ τῶν Μουσῶν εὐμενῶς κατεχόμενον.

Ἃ τοίνυν ἐν τοῖς Πλάτωνος γενεθλίοις πέρυσι καὶ ἀκοῦσαι καὶ εἰπεῖν συνέτυχεν ἡμῖν, πρῶτα τοῦτο περιέχει τὸ βυβλίον· ἔστι δὲ τῶν Συμποσιακῶν ὄγδοον.

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Α

*Περὶ ἡμερῶν ἐν αἷς γεγόνασί τινες τῶν ἐπιφανῶν· ἐν ᾧ καὶ περὶ τῆς λεγομένης ἐκ θεῶν γενέσεως*

Collocuntur Diogenianus, Plutarchus, Florus, Tyndares

B 1. Τῇ ἕκτῃ τοῦ Θαργηλιῶνος ἱσταμένου τὴν Σωκράτους ἀγαγόντες γενέθλιον τῇ ἑβδόμῃ τὴν

[a] A Stoic definition; *cf.* von Arnim, *S.V.F.* iii. 643. The same definition is cited for a somewhat different purpose at *Mor.* 504 B.

[b] The festival was apparently celebrated differently in Chaeronea and in Orchomenus. In the latter place, according to Plutarch (*Mor.* 299 F), the priest of Dionysus pursued





"vinous babbling," [a] and babbling means, precisely, engaging in empty and frivolous conversation. The outcome of undisciplined chatter and frivolity, when it reaches the extreme of intemperance, is violence and drunken behaviour—an outcome wholly inconsistent with culture and refinement.

It is not an accident that in the Agrionia, as it is celebrated here, the women search for Dionysus as though he had run away, then desist and say that he has taken refuge with the Muses and is hidden among them, and then after a while, when their dinner is over, quiz each other with riddles and conundrums.[b] The meaning of the ritual is that when drinking we ought to engage in conversation that has something speculative, some instruction in it, and that when conversation like this accompanies indulgence in wine, the wild and manic element is hidden away, benevolently restrained by the Muses.

Well, what I happened to hear and say last year at the birthday celebration for Plato supplies matter for the first chapter of this book, which is the eighth of the *Table-Talk*.

## QUESTION 1

The days on which certain eminent persons were born; also, stories of birth from divine parents.

Speakers: Diogenianus, Plutarch, Florus, Tyndares

1. On the sixth of Thargelion [c] we celebrated the birthday of Socrates, and on the seventh that of Plato,

with a sword the women of the family descended from the daughters of Minyas, who had been punished for rejecting the worship of Dionysus.

[c] The month of Thargelion corresponds roughly to our May.

(717) Πλάτωνος ἤγομεν, καὶ τοῦτο πρῶτον λόγους ἡμῖν παρεῖχε τῇ συντυχίᾳ πρέποντας, ὧν κατῆρξεν Διογενιανὸς ὁ Περγαμηνός. ἔφη γὰρ οὐ φαύλως εἰπεῖν Ἴωνα περὶ τῆς τύχης ὅτι πολλὰ τῆς σοφίας διαφέρουσα πλεῖστ' αὐτῇ ὅμοια ποιεῖ· τοῦτο μέντοι μουσικῶς ἔοικεν ἀπαυτοματίσαι τὸ μὴ μόνον οὕτω σύνεγγυς, ἀλλὰ καὶ πρότερον τῇ τάξει[1] γεγονέναι τὸν πρεσβύτερον καὶ καθηγητήν.

Ἐμοὶ δὲ πολλὰ λέγειν ἐπῆλθε τοῖς παροῦσι τῶν εἰς ταὐτὸ καιροῦ συνδραμόντων· οἷον ἦν τὸ περὶ τῆς
C Εὐριπίδου γενέσεως καὶ τελευτῆς, γενομένου μὲν ἡμέρᾳ καθ' ἣν οἱ Ἕλληνες ἐναυμάχουν ἐν Σαλαμῖνι πρὸς τὸν Μῆδον,[2] ἀποθανόντος δὲ καθ' ἣν ἐγεννήθη Διονύσιος ὁ πρεσβύτερος τῶν ἐν Σικελίᾳ τυράννων· ἅμα τῆς τύχης, ὡς Τίμαιος ἔφη, τὸν μιμητὴν ἐξαγούσης τῶν τραγικῶν παθῶν καὶ τὸν ἀγωνιστὴν εἰσαγούσης.

Ἐμνήσθησαν δὲ καὶ τῆς Ἀλεξάνδρου τοῦ βασιλέως τελευτῆς καὶ τῆς Διογένους τοῦ Κυνὸς ἡμέρᾳ μιᾷ γενομένης. καὶ τὸν μὲν Ἄτταλον ἐν τοῖς ἑαυτοῦ γενεθλίοις τὸν βασιλέα τελευτῆσαι συνεφωνεῖτο· Πομπήιον δὲ Μᾶγνον οἱ μὲν ἐν τοῖς γενεθλίοις ἔφασαν, οἱ δὲ πρὸ μιᾶς ἡμέρας τῶν
D γενεθλίων ἀποθανεῖν περὶ Αἴγυπτον. ἦκεν δὲ καὶ

[1] τάξει Meziriacus : δόξῃ. [2] Μῆδον Xylander : δῆμον.

[a] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 36 B 3; *cf. Nachträge*, i. 501. 41.





and this coincidence of dates furnished us with our first topic of conversation. The first to speak was Diogenianus of Pergamum ; he praised Ion's remark about fortune, that though very different from wisdom, it brings out many similar results.[a] Certainly this fortuitous conjunction seems charmingly appropriate, not only that their birthdays came together as they did, but that the older man and the teacher should have come first in order.

I myself was inspired to mention to the company a good many chronological coincidences, like the stories about the birth and death of Euripides, who was born on the day the Greeks fought the naval battle against the Mede at Salamis,[b] and died on the day when Dionysius, the elder of the two Sicilian tyrants, was born.[c] At the same moment, as Timaeus says,[d] fortune ushered from the stage the man who devised imitations of tragic events and ushered in the man who acted a tragic part.

Someone mentioned also the death of King Alexander and of Diogenes the Cynic, which took place on the same day. There was general agreement, too, that King Attalus died on his own birthday ; but there was a difference of opinion about the death of Pompey the Great in Egypt, some saying that he died on his birthday and some on the day before his birthday.[e] Pindar came to mind, too, born during

[b] The naval battle against Xerxes in 480 B.C.

[c] A slip of Plutarch, who apparently meant to say " the day that Dionysius became tyrant." This was in 406 B.C.

[d] Frag. 119 Müller (*Frag. Hist. Graec.* i. 223), 105 Jacoby (*Frag. Gr. Hist.* iii. B, p. 632).

[e] The last two examples are also cited in *Life of Camillus*, xix, where Plutarch is apparently drawing on his lost work *On Days*.

(717) Πίνδαρος ἐπὶ μνήμην ἐν Πυθίοις γενόμενος, πολλῶν καὶ καλῶν ὕμνων τῷ θεῷ χορηγός.

2. Ὁ δὲ Φλῶρος οὐδὲ Καρνεάδην ἀπαξιοῦν ἔφη μνήμης ἐν τοῖς Πλάτωνος γενεθλίοις, ἄνδρα τῆς Ἀκαδημίας εὐκλεέστατον ὀργιαστήν· Ἀπόλλωνος γὰρ ἀμφοτέρους ἑορτῇ γενέσθαι, τὸν μὲν[1] Θαργηλίοις Ἀθήνησιν, τὸν δὲ Κάρνεια Κυρηναίων ἀγόντων· "ἑβδόμῃ δ' ἀμφοτέρας ἑορτάζουσιν, καὶ τὸν θεὸν ὡς ταύτῃ γενόμενον ὑμεῖς," εἶπεν, "οἱ προφῆται καὶ ἱερεῖς Ἑβδομαγενῆ καλεῖτε. διὸ τοὺς Ἀπόλλωνι τὴν Πλάτωνος τέκνωσιν ἀνατιθέντας οὐκ ἂν οἶμαί τινα φάναι καταισχύνειν τὸν θεόν, ἐπὶ
Ε μείζονα πάθη καὶ νοσήματα τοῦτον ἡμῖν διὰ Σωκράτους ἰατρὸν ὥσπερ ἑτέρου Χείρωνος ἀπειργασμένον." ἅμα δὲ τῆς λεγομένης Ἀρίστωνι τῷ Πλάτωνος πατρὶ γενέσθαι καθ' ὕπνον ὄψεως καὶ φωνῆς ἀπαγορευούσης μὴ συγγενέσθαι τῇ γυναικὶ μηδ' ἅψασθαι δέκα μηνῶν ἐμνημόνευσεν.

3. Ὑπολαβὼν δὲ Τυνδάρης ὁ Λακεδαιμόνιος, "ἄξιον μέν ἐστιν," ἔφη, "περὶ Πλάτωνος ᾄδειν καὶ λέγειν τὸ

οὐδὲ ἐῴκει
ἀνδρός γε θνητοῦ παῖς ἔμμεναι ἀλλὰ θεοῖο·

[1] μὲν Bernardakis : μὲν γὰρ.

[a] Apollo was called Hebdomagenes (as here), Hebdomeios, and Hebdomagetes. Perhaps the legend of his birth on the seventh of the month (also mentioned *Mor.* 292 E) arose because, as a god of seasons and months, he was connected with the division of the lunar month into weeks of seven days (Roscher, *Lex. d. gr. u. r. Myth.* i, p. 425). See also Callimachus, *Hymn.* iv. 249 ff., where swans circle Delos, singing, seven times at the birth of Apollo.





the Pythian games to be the author of many a beautiful hymn for Apollo, the god of the festival.

2. Florus said that on Plato's birthday we ought not to disdain to mention Carneades, a very celebrated adherent of the Academy, since both were born during a festival of Apollo, one during the Thargelia in Athens, the other while the Cyreneans were celebrating the Carneia. "They celebrate both on the seventh," he said, "and you interpreters and priests give the epithet Seventh-born to the god because he was born on that day.[a] Therefore I do not think anyone would say that those who attribute Plato's parentage to Apollo are bringing disgrace on the god, who made him, through the agency of Socrates (as if he had been a second Cheiron), a physician to heal greater ailments and sicknesses than those healed by Asclepius."[b] He also mentioned the vision which is said to have appeared to Ariston, Plato's father, in his sleep, which spoke and forbade him to have intercourse with his wife, or to touch her, for ten months.[c]

3. Tyndares the Lacedaemonian[d] replied, "It is fitting to celebrate Plato with the line,

He seemed the scion not of mortal man, but of a god.[e]

[b] The words "those healed by Asclepius" are not represented in the Greek, but they are implied. (Reiske proposed to add the words ἢ Ἀσκληπιὸν in the text.) Asclepius the hero was, like Achilles, a pupil of the centaur Cheiron, and became the patron of medicine. Plato's philosophy is medicine for the soul or mind.

[c] For this legend of Plato's birth see Diogenes Laertius, iii. 2.

[d] A Platonist, as appears also from his speech in Question 2 below (718 c). *Cf.* 728 E.

[e] Homer, *Iliad*, xxiv. 258.

(717) τοῦ δὲ[1] θείου δέδια μὴ δόξῃ τῷ ἀφθάρτῳ[2] μάχεσθαι τὸ γεννῶν οὐχ ἧττον ἢ τὸ γεννώμενον· μεταβολὴ
F γάρ τις καὶ αὐτὴ καὶ πάθος· ὥς που καὶ Ἀλέξανδρος ὑπενόησεν, εἰπὼν μάλιστα θνητὸν καὶ φθαρτὸν ἐπιγινώσκειν ἑαυτὸν ἐν τῷ συγγίνεσθαι γυναικὶ καὶ καθεύδειν, ὡς τὸν μὲν ὕπνον ἐνδόσει γινόμενον ὑπ' ἀσθενείας, γένεσιν δὲ πᾶσαν οἰκείου τινὸς εἰς ἕτε-
718 ρον ἔκστασιν καὶ φθορὰν[3] οὖσαν. ἀναθαρρῶ δὲ πάλιν αὐτοῦ Πλάτωνος ἀκούων πατέρα καὶ ποιητὴν τοῦ τε κόσμου καὶ τῶν ἄλλων γεννητῶν τὸν ἀγέννητον καὶ ἀίδιον θεὸν ὀνομάζοντος, οὐ διὰ σπέρματος δήπου γενομένων, ἄλλῃ δὲ δυνάμει τοῦ θεοῦ τῇ ὕλῃ γόνιμον ἀρχήν, ὑφ' ἧς ἔπαθεν καὶ μετέβαλεν, ἐντεκόντος·

λήθουσι[4] γάρ τοι κἀνέμων διέξοδοι
θήλειαν ὄρνιν, πλὴν ὅταν παρῇ τόκος.

καὶ οὐδὲν οἶομαι δεινόν, εἰ μὴ πλησιάζων ὁ θεὸς ὥσπερ ἄνθρωπος, ἀλλ' ἑτέραις τισὶν ἁφαῖς δι' ἑτέρων καὶ ψαύσεσι τρέπει καὶ ὑποπίμπλησι θειοτέρας γονῆς τὸ θνητόν. ' καὶ οὐκ ἐμὸς ὁ μῦθος,' "
B εἶπεν, " ἀλλ' Αἰγύπτιοι τόν τ' Ἆπιν οὕτως λοχεύε-

[1] δὲ Meziriacus: γὰρ.
[2] ἀφθάρτῳ Xylander (in his translation): φθαρτῷ.
[3] καὶ φθορὰν Reiske: καταφθορὰν.
[4] λήθουσι Gomperz (*cf.* Diog. Laert. iv. 35): πλήθουσι.

[a] *Cf. Life of Alexander*, xxii. 677 B, *Mor.* 65 F.
[b] *e.g.*, *Timaeus*, 28 C.
[c] Sophocles, frag. 436 Nauck, 477 Pearson; also cited by Diogenes Laertius, iv. 35. Sophocles seems to be alluding to the notion that " wind-eggs " (laid without previous copula-





But I suspect that begetting is no less inconsistent with the immortality of the divine than is being begotten. For it, too, is a kind of change, and a vicissitude. This seems to have been in Alexander's mind, also, when he said he recognized most clearly that he was mortal and perishable during the time he lay with a woman or slept,[a] because sleep comes as the result of a yielding, through weakness, and all generation is the destruction and transformation of something of one's own into something different. I am reassured when I hear Plato himself naming the uncreated and eternal god as the father and maker of the cosmos and of other created things.[b] They were created not through semen, surely; it was by a different potency that God begot in matter the principle of generation, under whose influence it became receptive and was transformed.

The hen knows not the passing of the winds,
Except when brooding-time is near.[c]

And I do not find it strange if it is not by a physical approach, like a man's, but by some other kind of contact or touch, by other agencies, that a god alters mortal nature and makes it pregnant with a more divine offspring. ' Not mine the tale,' "[d] he said in conclusion, " but the Egyptians say that Apis is brought

tion) were the result of impregnation of the female by the winds. (The " passing of the winds " is through the hen's body.) This explanation is apparently not accepted by Aristotle, *De Gen. Animal.* iii. 1 (749 a 35 ff.), *Historia Animal.* vi. 2 (560 a 5 ff.). Plutarch is, of course, comparing the hen's unawareness with that of a mortal woman impregnated in a mystical or spiritual way, by a god. (It is doubtful whether Sophocles also had in mind the Orphics' primal wind-egg, Aristophanes, *Birds*, 695.)
[d] Euripides, frag. 484 Nauck.

(718) σθαί φασιν ἐπαφῇ τῆς σελήνης, καὶ ὅλως ἄρρενι θεῷ πρὸς γυναῖκα θνητὴν ἀπολείπουσιν ὁμιλίαν· ἀνάπαλιν δ' οὐκ ἂν οἴονται θνητὸν ἄνδρα θηλείᾳ θεῷ τόκου καὶ κυήσεως ἀρχὴν παρασχεῖν διὰ τὸ τὰς οὐσίας[1] τῶν θεῶν ἐν ἀέρι καὶ πνεύμασιν καί τισι θερμότησι καὶ ὑγρότησι τίθεσθαι."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Β

Πῶς Πλάτων ἔλεγε τὸν θεὸν ἀεὶ γεωμετρεῖν;

Collocuntur Diogenianus, Plutarchus, Tyndares, Florus, Autobulus

1. Ἐκ δὲ τούτου γενομένης σιωπῆς, πάλιν ὁ Διογενιανὸς ἀρξάμενος, "βούλεσθ'," εἶπεν, "ἐπεὶ C λόγοι περὶ θεῶν γεγόνασιν, ἐν τοῖς Πλάτωνος γενεθλίοις αὐτὸν Πλάτωνα κοινωνὸν παραλάβωμεν, ἐπισκεψάμενοι τίνα λαβὼν γνώμην ἀπεφήνατ' ἀεὶ[2] γεωμετρεῖν τὸν θεόν; εἴ γε δὴ θετέον εἶναι τὴν ἀπόφασιν ταύτην Πλάτωνος."

Ἐμοῦ δὲ ταῦτ' εἰπόντος ὡς γέγραπται μὲν ἐν οὐδενὶ σαφῶς τῶν ἐκείνου βυβλίων, ἔχει δὲ πίστιν ἱκανὴν καὶ τοῦ Πλατωνικοῦ χαρακτῆρός ἐστιν, εὐθὺς ὑπολαβὼν ὁ Τυνδάρης,

"Οἶει γάρ," εἶπεν, "ὦ Διογενιανέ, τῶν περιττῶν τι καὶ δυσθεωρήτων αἰνίττεσθαι τὸν λόγον, οὐχ ὅπερ αὐτὸς εἴρηκε καὶ γέγραφεν πολλάκις,

[1] οὐσίας Junius: θυσίας.
[2] ἀεὶ added by Meziriacus.

[a] Apis was the sacred bull, the earthly incarnation of Osiris. On his birth *cf.* Plutarch, *De Iside*, xliii. 368 c, and Herodotus, iii. 28. He was sometimes identified by the Greeks with Epaphus, the son of the cow-maiden Io and of





to birth by a touch of the moon,[a] and in general they allow sexual intercourse with a mortal woman to a male god, but in the contrary case they would not think that a mortal man could impart to a female divinity the principle of birth and pregnancy,[b] because they think that the substance of the gods consists of air and breath, and of certain heats and moistures."

## QUESTION 2

What Plato meant by saying that God is always doing geometry.

Speakers: Diogenianus, Plutarch, Tyndares, Florus, Autobulus

1. After this a silence fell. Diogenianus, making a new start, said, "If you please, let us on Plato's birthday take Plato himself as partner in the conversation, and since we have spoken about the gods, consider what he had in mind when he asserted that God is always doing geometry—if indeed this statement is to be attributed to Plato."

I remarked that while this statement is not made explicitly in any of Plato's writings, it is well enough attested and is in harmony with his character, and Tyndares immediately took up the argument:

"Do you think, Diogenianus, that this saying conceals a reference to some recondite or difficult doctrine, and not merely to what he himself said and wrote many times, when he sang the praise of

Zeus; *cf.* Plutarch's word ἐπαφῇ ("touch") here, and note Aeschylus, *Prometheus*, 848 f.

[b] Plutarch rejects this distinction, *Life of Numa*, iv. 4, on the ground that "intercourse is a reciprocal matter, and . . . both parties to it enter into a like communion."

(718) D ὑμνῶν γεωμετρίαν ὡς ἀποσπῶσαν ἡμᾶς προσισχομένους[1] τῇ αἰσθήσει καὶ ἀποστρέφουσαν ἐπὶ τὴν νοητὴν καὶ ἀίδιον φύσιν, ἧς θέα τέλος ἐστὶ φιλοσοφίας οἷον ἐποπτεία τελετῆς; ὁ γὰρ ἡδονῆς καὶ ἀλγηδόνος ἧλος, ᾧ πρὸς τὸ σῶμα τὴν ψυχὴν προσηλοῖ, μέγιστον κακὸν ἔχειν ἔοικεν τὸ τὰ αἰσθητὰ ποιεῖν ἐναργέστερα τῶν νοητῶν καὶ καταβιάζεσθαι πάθει[2] μᾶλλον ἢ λόγῳ κρίνειν τὴν διάνοιαν· ἐθιζομένη γὰρ ὑπὸ τοῦ σφόδρα πονεῖν καὶ ἥδεσθαι τῷ περὶ τὰ σώματα πλανητῷ καὶ μεταβλητῷ προσέχειν ὡς ὄντι τοῦ ἀληθῶς ὄντος τυφλοῦται καὶ τὸ ' μυρίων ' ἀντάξιον ' ὀμμάτων ' E ὄργανον ψυχῆς καὶ φέγγος ἀπόλλυσιν, ᾧ μόνῳ θεατόν ἐστι τὸ θεῖον. πᾶσι μὲν οὖν τοῖς καλουμένοις μαθήμασιν, ὥσπερ ἀστραβέσι καὶ λείοις κατόπτροις, ἐμφαίνεται τῆς τῶν νοητῶν ἀληθείας ἴχνη καὶ εἴδωλα· μάλιστα δὲ γεωμετρία κατὰ τὸν Φιλόλαον[3] ἀρχὴ καὶ μητρόπολις οὖσα τῶν ἄλλων ἐπανάγει καὶ στρέφει τὴν διάνοιαν, οἷον ἐκκαθαιρομένην καὶ ἀπολυομένην ἀτρέμα τῆς αἰσθήσεως. διὸ καὶ Πλάτων αὐτὸς ἐμέμψατο τοὺς περὶ Εὔδοξον καὶ Ἀρχύταν καὶ Μέναιχμον εἰς ὀργανικὰς καὶ μηχανικὰς κατασκευὰς τὸν τοῦ στερεοῦ διπλασια-

[1] προσισχομένους Turnebus: προισχομένους.
[2] πάθει Xylander: καὶ πάθει.
[3] Φιλόλαον Hubert: Φίλωνα previous editors: φίλαον T.

[a] As the celebrant passes through lesser rites to ascend to the highest initiation, in which he is privileged to " view " the sacred secrets, so the philosopher passes, with the help of geometry, from study of physical objects to the vision of the ideas.

[b] *Phaedo*, 83 D: " Every pleasure and pain has a kind of nail, and nails and pins her [the soul] to the body, and gives her a bodily nature, making her think that whatever the body says is true " (tr. Church).





geometry for drawing us away from the world of sense to which we cling, and turning us toward the intelligible and eternal level of existence, the contemplation of which is the goal of philosophy, as being a ' viewer ' is the goal of a mystery-rite ? [a] For the nail of pleasure and pain, by which he represents the soul as fastened to the body,[b] seems to have this as its greatest disadvantage, that it makes the objects of sense-perception clearer than those of intellectual knowledge, and forces the understanding to judge by emotion rather than by reason. Being habituated, through the experience of intense pain and pleasure, to paying heed to the shifting and changeable aspects of physical things, as though they were true being, the understanding is blinded to truth and loses that organ—that light within the mind, worth ' thousands of eyes,' [c] by which alone the divine may be contemplated. Now in all of the so-called mathematical sciences, as in smooth and undistorted mirrors, there appear traces and ghost-images of the truth about objects of intellectual knowledge ; but geometry especially, being, as Philolaüs says, the source and mother-city of the rest,[d] leads the understanding upward and turns it in a new direction, as it undergoes, so to speak, a complete purification and a gradual deliverance from sense-perception. It was for this reason that Plato himself reproached Eudoxus and Archytas and Menaechmus for setting out to remove the problem of doubling the cube into the realm of instruments

[c] Plato, *Republic*, vii. 527 E.

[d] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8], 44 A 7 a.

(718) σμὸν ἀπάγειν ἐπιχειροῦντας, ὥσπερ[1] πειρωμένους δίχα λόγου[2] δύο μέσας ἀνὰ λόγον, ἢ[3] παρείκοι, λα-
F βεῖν· ἀπόλλυσθαι γὰρ οὕτω καὶ διαφθείρεσθαι τὸ γεωμετρίας ἀγαθὸν αὖθις ἐπὶ τὰ αἰσθητὰ παλινδρομούσης καὶ μὴ φερομένης ἄνω μηδ' ἀντιλαμβανομένης τῶν ἀιδίων καὶ ἀσωμάτων εἰκόνων, πρὸς αἷσπερ ὢν ὁ θεὸς ἀεὶ θεός ἐστιν."

2. Μετὰ δὲ τὸν Τυνδάρην ὁ Φλῶρος, ἑταῖρος ὢν[4]
719 αὐτοῦ καὶ προσποιούμενος ἀεὶ μετὰ παιδιᾶς ἐραστὴς εἶναι καὶ φάσκων, "ὤνησας," ἔφη, "τὸν λόγον οὐ σεαυτοῦ ποιησάμενος ἀλλὰ κοινόν· ἐλέγξαι γὰρ ἔδωκας αὐτὸν ἀποδεικνύοντα μὴ θεοῖς οὖσαν ἀλλ' ἡμῖν ἀναγκαίαν τὴν γεωμετρίαν· οὐ γάρ τί που καὶ θεὸς δεῖται μαθήματος οἷον ὀργάνου στρέφοντος ἀπὸ τῶν γενητῶν καὶ περιάγοντος ἐπὶ τὰ ὄντα τὴν διάνοιαν· ἐν αὐτῷ γὰρ ἔστιν ἐκείνῳ καὶ σὺν αὐτῷ καὶ περὶ αὐτόν. ἀλλ' ὅρα μή τι σοι προσῆκον ὁ Πλάτων καὶ οἰκεῖον αἰνιττόμενος λέληθεν, ἅτε δὴ τῷ Σωκράτει τὸν Λυκοῦργον ἀναμιγνὺς οὐχ ἧττον ἢ τὸν Πυθαγόραν, ὡς[5] ᾤετο Δικαίαρχος. ὁ γὰρ Λυκοῦργος οἶσθα δήπουθεν ὅτι τὴν ἀριθμητικὴν
B ἀναλογίαν, ὡς δημοκρατικὴν καὶ ὀχλικὴν οὖσαν, ἐξέβαλεν ἐκ τῆς Λακεδαίμονος, ἐπεισήγαγεν δὲ τὴν

[1] ὥσπερ Turnebus : ὅπερ.
[2] δίχα λόγου Wilamowitz : διαλόγου T : δι' ἀλόγου Holwerda.
[3] ἢ Herwerden : μὴ. [4] ὢν Basel edition : ἦν.
[5] ὡς added by Osann.

[a] *Cf.* Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8], 47 A 15; Plutarch, *Life of Marcellus*, xiv.
[b] With the last clause *cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 249 c: πρὸς οἷσπερ θεὸς ὢν θεῖός ἐστιν ("those things a god's nearness whereunto makes him truly god," Hackforth).
[c] Tyndares is a Spartan. [d] Frag. 41 Wehrli.





and mechanical devices, as if they were trying to find two mean proportionals not by the use of reason but in whatever way would work.[a] In this way, he thought, the advantage of geometry was dissipated and destroyed, since it slipped back into the realm of sense-perception instead of soaring upward and laying hold of the eternal and immaterial images in the presence of which God is always God."[b]

2. After Tyndares, Florus, who was his close companion and kept humorously pretending to be in love with him, said, "Thank you for not monopolizing your argument but sharing it. You have granted us the power of refuting it, since you prove that geometry is necessary not for the gods, but for us. For surely a god does not need mathematics as an instrument to turn his understanding from created things and bring it to bear on what really exists! For it is in him they exist, by his help, and by connexion with him. But consider now whether Plato may not, without your noticing, have been hinting at something close and familiar to you,[c] because, I mean, he combined with the spirit of Socrates that of Lycurgus no less than that of Pythagoras (whom Dicaearchus suggested).[d] You know, of course, that Lycurgus expelled arithmetical proportion from Lacedaemon, because of its democratic and rabble-rousing character. He introduced the geometric proportion,[e]

[e] On these two kinds of proportion see especially Plato, *Laws*, vi. 757 B, Aristotle, *Politics*, III. v. 8; v. i. 7, *Nicomachean Ethics*, II. vi. 7; and *cf. Mor.* 484 B, 643 C. In the arithmetical (like 1 : 2 :: 2 : 3), the terms on both sides differ by the same *amount*; in the geometric (like 1 : 2 :: 2 : 4), they differ by the same *proportion*. Isocrates (*Areopagiticus*, xxi) maintained that the geometrical proportion was the governing principle of the Athenian democracy in its great days.

(719) γεωμετρικήν, ὀλιγαρχίᾳ σώφρονι καὶ βασιλείᾳ νομίμῃ πρέπουσαν· ἡ μὲν γὰρ ἀριθμῷ τὸ ἴσον ἡ δὲ λόγῳ τὸ κατ' ἀξίαν ἀπονέμει· καὶ οὐ πάνθ' ὁμοῦ μίγνυσιν, ἀλλ' ἔστιν χρηστῶν καὶ πονηρῶν εὔσημος ἐν αὐτῇ διάκρισις, οὐ ζυγοῖς οὐδὲ κλήροις ἀρετῆς δὲ καὶ κακίας διαφορᾷ τὸ οἰκεῖον ἀεὶ διαλαγχανόντων. ταύτην ὁ θεὸς ἐπάγει τὴν ἀναλογίαν τοῖς πράγμασι, δίκην καὶ νέμεσιν, ὦ φίλε Τυνδάρη, προσαγορευομένην καὶ διδάσκουσαν ἡμᾶς τὸ δίκαιον ἴσον, ἀλλὰ μὴ τὸ ἴσον δεῖν ποιεῖσθαι δίκαιον· ἦν γὰρ
C οἱ πολλοὶ διώκουσιν ἰσότητα, πασῶν ἀδικιῶν οὖσαν μεγίστην, ὁ θεὸς ἐξαιρῶν, ὡς ἀνυστόν ἐστι, τὸ κατ' ἀξίαν διαφυλάττει, γεωμετρικῶς τῷ κατὰ λόγον τὸ[1] κατὰ νόμον ὁριζόμενος."

3. Ταῦθ' ἡμεῖς ἐπῃνοῦμεν. ὁ δὲ Τυνδάρης φθονεῖν ἔφασκεν καὶ παρεκάλει τὸν Αὐτόβουλον ἅψασθαι Φλώρου καὶ κολάσαι τὸν λόγον. ὁ δὲ τοῦτο μὲν ἀπεῖπεν, ἰδίαν δέ τινα δόξαν ἀντιπαρήγαγεν. ἔφη γὰρ οὔτε τὴν γεωμετρίαν[2] ἄλλου τινὸς ἢ τῶν περὶ τὰ πέρατα συμπτωμάτων καὶ παθῶν εἶναι θεωρητικήν, οὔτε τὸν θεὸν ἑτέρῳ τινὶ τρόπῳ κοσμοποιεῖν ἢ περατοῦντα τὴν ὕλην ἄπειρον οὖσαν,
D οὐ μεγέθει καὶ πλήθει, διὰ δ' ἀταξίαν καὶ πλημμέλειαν αὐτῆς τὸ ἀόριστον καὶ ἀπεράτωτον ἄπειρον εἰωθότων καλεῖν τῶν παλαιῶν. καὶ γὰρ ἡ μορφὴ

[1] τὸ Wyttenbach : καὶ.
[2] οὔτε τὴν γεωμετρίαν Xylander : οὐτόπον γεωμετρεῖν T : οὔτε τὸ γεωμετρεῖν $T^2$.

[a] One of the three sons of Plutarch known by name. He had at least five children (*RE*, *s.v.* "Plutarchos (2)," cols. 648-651).





which is appropriate to a moderate oligarchy or a lawful monarchy. The arithmetical distributes an equal amount to each, measuring by number, whereas the geometric distributes to each an amount corresponding to his worth, measuring by proportion. It does not mix everything together, but has within it a clear principle of distinction between good and bad; people receive their due not as the balance or the lot directs, but always by the distinction of good and bad in them. This is the proportion that God applies in the judgement of our actions, my dear Tyndares. It is given the names of justice and retribution, and teaches us to consider justice equal (fair) but not to consider equality justice. The equality which the mob seeks, which is in reality the greatest injustice of all, God roots out, as far as is feasible; and he maintains distinction by worth, setting the proportionate relation, in geometrical fashion, as the standard of lawfulness."

3. When the rest of us applauded this speech, Tyndares pretended to be jealous, and called upon Autobulus [a] to tackle Florus and chastise him for his words. This he declined to do, but he brought forward a contrary argument of his own. He said that geometry has no other subject than the properties and characteristics of limits, and that God in the process of world-making uses no other method than that of imposing limitation on matter, which is by itself unlimited. The ancients used the term "unlimited" of the unbounded and indeterminate character of matter, not with reference to size or number but because of its lack of order and harmony. For

(719) καὶ τὸ σχῆμα πέρας ἐστὶ τοῦ μεμορφωμένου[1] καὶ ἐσχηματισμένου παντός, ὧν στερήσει καθ' αὑτὴν ἄμορφος ἦν καὶ ἀσχημάτιστος· ἀριθμῶν δὲ καὶ λόγων ἐγγενομένων, οἷον δεθεῖσα καὶ περιληφθεῖσα γραμμαῖς ἐκ δὲ τῶν γραμμῶν ἐπιπέδοις καὶ βάθεσιν, εἴδη τὰ πρῶτα καὶ διαφορὰς σωμάτων ὥσπερ θεμελίων παρέσχεν πρὸς γένεσιν ἀέρος καὶ γῆς ὕδατός τε καὶ πυρός· ὀκταέδρων γὰρ καὶ εἰκοσαέδρων, ἔτι δὲ πυραμίδων καὶ κύβων ἰσότητας ἐν
E πλευραῖς καὶ ὁμοιότητας ἐν γωνίαις καὶ ἁρμονίας ἀνασχεῖν ἐξ ὕλης ἀτάκτου καὶ πλανητῆς ἄνευ τοῦ περιορίζοντος καὶ διαρθροῦντος ἕκαστα γεωμετρικῶς ἄπορον ἦν καὶ ἀδύνατον. ὅθεν ἀπείρῳ πέρατος ἐγγενομένου τὸ πᾶν ἡρμοσμένον καὶ κεκραμένον ἄριστα καὶ πεπερασμένον γέγονέν τε καὶ γίνεται, τῆς μὲν ὕλης ἀεὶ βιαζομένης εἰς τὸ ἀόριστον ἀναδῦναι καὶ φευγούσης τὸ γεωμετρεῖσθαι, τοῦ δὲ λόγου καταλαμβάνοντος αὐτὴν καὶ περιγράφοντος καὶ διανέμοντος εἰς ἰδέας καὶ διαφοράς, ἐξ ὧν τὰ φυόμενα πάντα τὴν γένεσιν ἔσχεν καὶ σύστασιν.

4. Ἐπὶ τούτοις ῥηθεῖσιν ἠξίουν καὶ ἐμὲ συμβαλέ-
F σθαι τι πρὸς τὸν λόγον αὐτοῖς. ἐγὼ δὲ τὰς μὲν εἰρημένας δόξας ὡς ἰθαγενεῖς καὶ ἰδίας αὐτῶν ἐκείνων ἐπῄνεσα καὶ τὸ εἰκὸς ἔφην ἔχειν ἱκανῶς· "ὅπως δ'," εἶπον, "ἑαυτῶν μὴ καταφρονῆτε μηδ' ἔξω βλέπητε παντάπασιν, ἀκούσατε τὸν μάλιστα παρὰ τοῖς καθηγηταῖς ἡμῶν εὐδοκιμοῦντα περὶ
720 τούτου λόγον. ἔστι γὰρ ἐν τοῖς γεωμετρικωτάτοις

[1] μεμορφωμένου Stephanus : μορφουμένου.





shape or arrangement is always a limit imposed on the material that is shaped or arranged. Without this process it was, by itself, shapeless and disorganized. When numbers and ratios have been generated in it, matter is imprisoned, as it were, and encompassed by lines and by the figures generated by lines, that is solid figures, so that it furnishes the primary kinds and distinct forms of bodies, which are the foundations, so to speak, for the genesis of air and earth, water and fire. Octahedra and icosahedra, as well as pyramids and cubes, have equalities among their sides and similarities among their angles, and proportions which could not possibly have arisen from disorderly and erratic matter without that which defines their shapes and articulates their parts, by geometrical rule. Thus from the time when limit was generated within the unlimited, the universe has been and is being perfectly harmonized and blended and defined. Matter is always struggling to break out into unboundedness, and seeking to avoid being subjected to geometry ; but reason seizes upon it and encloses it in lines and marshals it in the patterns and distinctions which are the source and origin of all that comes to be.[a]

4. After this speech they asked me also to contribute something to the argument. I praised the views expressed as genuine products of their own conception, and said that they had sufficient plausibility. "But," I said, "that you may not neglect your own school, nor depend entirely on others, listen to the explanation of this phrase which is most highly approved among our professors. Now among the

[a] The cosmology of this paragraph is derived from Plato's *Timaeus*. For the "regular solids" see especially 53 c.

(720) θεωρήμασιν, μᾶλλον δὲ προβλήμασι, τὸ δυεῖν εἰδῶν δοθέντων ἄλλο τρίτον[1] παραβάλλειν τῷ μὲν ἴσον τῷ δ' ὅμοιον· ἐφ' ᾧ καί φασιν ἐξευρεθέντι θῦσαι τὸν Πυθαγόραν· πολὺ γὰρ ἀμέλει γλαφυρώτερον τοῦτο καὶ μουσικώτερον ἐκείνου τοῦ θεωρήματος, ὃ τὴν ὑποτείνουσαν ἀπέδειξεν ταῖς περὶ τὴν ὀρθὴν ἴσον δυναμένην."

"Εὖ λέγεις," εἶπεν ὁ Διογενιανός, "ἀλλὰ τί τοῦτο πρὸς τὸν λόγον;"

"Εἴσεσθε ῥᾳδίως," εἶπον, "ἀναμνήσαντες αὐτοὺς τῆς ἐν Τιμαίῳ διαιρέσεως, ᾗ διεῖλε τριχῇ τὰ πρῶθ', ὑφ' ὧν τὴν γένεσιν ὁ κόσμος ἔσχεν, ὧν τὸ μὲν θεὸν
B τῷ δικαιοτάτῳ τῶν ὀνομάτων τὸ δ' ὕλην τὸ δ' ἰδέαν καλοῦμεν. ἡ μὲν οὖν ὕλη τῶν ὑποκειμένων ἀτακτότατόν ἐστιν, ἡ δ' ἰδέα τῶν παραδειγμάτων κάλλιστον, ὁ δὲ θεὸς τῶν αἰτίων ἄριστον. ἐβούλετ' οὖν μηθέν, ὡς ἀνυστὸν ἦν, ὑπολιπεῖν ἄχρηστον[2] καὶ ἀόριστον, ἀλλὰ κοσμῆσαι λόγῳ καὶ μέτρῳ καὶ ἀριθμῷ τὴν φύσιν, ἔν τι ποιῶν ἐκ πάντων ὁμοῦ τῶν ὑποκειμένων, οἷον ἡ ἰδέα καὶ ὅσον ἡ ὕλη γενόμενον. διὸ τοῦτο πρόβλημα δοὺς αὐτῷ, δυεῖν ὄντων τρίτον ἐποίησε καὶ ποιεῖ καὶ φυλάττει διὰ παντὸς τὸ ἴσον τῇ ὕλῃ καὶ ὅμοιον τῇ ἰδέᾳ τὸν κόσμον· ἀεὶ γὰρ ὢν
C διὰ τὴν σύμφυτον ἀνάγκην τοῦ σώματος ἐν γενέσει καὶ μετατροπῇ καὶ πάθεσι παντοδαποῖς ὑπὸ τοῦ πατρὸς καὶ δημιουργοῦ βοηθεῖται τῷ λόγῳ πρὸς

[1] ἄλλο τρίτον Xylander: ἀλλότριον.
[2] ἄχρηστον Post: ὁριστόν.

[a] Euclid, *Elements*, vi. 25.
[b] Not simply a reference to *Timaeus*, 48 E ff. (as Hubert), where the three elements are the pattern, the copy, and space,





most characteristic theorems, or rather problems, of geometry is this: given two figures, to construct a third equal to one and similar to the other.[a] They say, in fact, that Pythagoras offered sacrifice when he solved this problem; for it is surely much more elegant and inspired than that famous theorem which gave the proof that the square on the hypotenuse is equal to the sum of the squares on the sides enclosing the right angle."

"No doubt," said Diogenianus, "but what has it to do with our discussion?"

"You will easily see the point," I replied, "if you recall the threefold division, in the *Timaeus*,[b] of the first principles from which the cosmos came to birth. One of them we call, by the most appropriate of names, God, one matter, and one form. Matter is the least ordered of substances, form the most beautiful of patterns, and God the best of causes. Now God's intention was, so far as possible, to leave nothing unused or unformed, but to reduce nature to a cosmos by the use of proportion and measure and number, making a unity out of all the materials which would have the quality of the form and the quantity of the matter. Therefore, having set himself this problem, these two being given, he created a third, and still creates and preserves throughout all time that which is equal to matter and similar to form, namely, the cosmos. Being continuously involved in becoming and shifting and all kinds of events, because of its congenital forced association with its body, the cosmos is assisted by the Father and Creator, who, by means of reason, and with reference to the pattern, gives

but reminiscent of the account of creation by the Demiurge in 29 E ff.

(720) τὸ παράδειγμα τὴν οὐσίαν ὁρίζοντος· ἢ καὶ κάλλιο τοῦ συμμέτρου τὸ περὶ μέτρον[1] τῶν ὄντων."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Γ

*Διὰ τί τῆς ἡμέρας ἠχωδεστέρα ἡ νύξ;*

Collocuntur Ammonius, Boëthus, Plutarchus, Thrasyllus, Aristodemus

1. Θόρυβός τις, ἑστιωμένων ἡμῶν Ἀθήνησι παρ' Ἀμμωνίῳ, τὴν οἰκίαν περιήχησεν, ἔξωθεν ἐπιβοωμένων τὸν στρατηγόν· ἐστρατήγει δὲ τὸ τρίτον ὁ D Ἀμμώνιος. ἐπεὶ δὲ πέμψας τῶν περὶ αὐτόν τινας ἔπαυσε τὴν ταραχὴν καὶ παρέπεμψαν τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, ἐζητοῦμεν ἡμεῖς, διὰ τί τῶν ἔξωθεν βοώντων συνεξακούουσιν οἱ ἐντὸς οἱ δ' ἔξω τῶν ἐντὸς οὐχ ὁμοίως.

Καὶ ὁ Ἀμμώνιος ἔφη τοῦτο μὲν ὑπ' Ἀριστοτέλους λελύσθαι· τὴν γὰρ φωνὴν τῶν ἔνδον ἔξω φερομένην εἰς ἀέρα πολὺν καὶ ἀναπεπταμένον εὐθὺς ἐξαμαυροῦσθαι καὶ διασπείρεσθαι, τὴν δ' ἔξωθεν εἴσω κατιοῦσαν οὐδὲν τοιοῦτο πάσχειν ἀλλὰ συνέχεσθαι καὶ διαμένειν εὔσημον· ἐκεῖνο δὲ μᾶλλον λόγου δεῖσθαι, τὸ νυκτὸς ἠχωδεστέρας εἶναι τὰς E φωνὰς καὶ πρὸς τῷ μεγέθει τὴν τρανότητα καθαρῶς συνδιαφυλάττειν. "ἐμοὶ μὲν οὖν," εἶπεν, "οὐ φαύλως ἡ πρόνοια δοκεῖ μεμηχανῆσθαι τῇ ἀκοῇ σαφήνειαν, ὅτε τῆς ὄψεως οὐδὲν ἢ κομιδῇ τι μικρὸν

[1] τὸ περὶ μέτρον Jones : τὸ περίμετρον.

[a] On text and sense of the last sentence see R. M. Jones, *Class. Philol.* vii (1912), pp. 76 f., Plato, *Philebus*, 66 A-B.

[b] An Athenian, head of the Academy and Plutarch's teacher in philosophy. (*RE*, *s.v.* "Plutarchos (2)," cols.





limits to that which exists. Thus the aspect of measure in things is even more beautiful than their symmetry." [a]

## QUESTION 3

Why sounds carry better at night than in the daytime.

Speakers: Ammonius, Boëthus, Plutarch, Thrasyllus, Aristodemus

1. Once when we were dining at Ammonius'[b] house in Athens, the noise of some disturbance sounded through the house. A crowd outside was shouting for the general. (Ammonius was serving his third term in this office.) After he had sent some of his attendants and put an end to the disturbance by sending the people away, we discussed the question why those inside hear clearly people shouting outdoors, while persons outside do not hear those inside so well.

Ammonius said that this problem had been solved by Aristotle.[c] The voice of persons indoors, he said, moving out into a large mass of air and spreading out, is at once obscured and dissipated, but a voice from outside coming in is not so affected, but is kept intact and remains intelligible. The fact which needed explanation, continued Ammonius, was rather that voices are more sonorous at night and preserve not only their volume but the precise articulation. "To me," he said, "it seems a fine stroke of Providence to have given accuracy to our hearing at the time when we have no use—or at most very little—of our

651-653.) On the office of *strategos* ("general"), see note to ix. 1. 736 D.

[c] *Problemata*, 903 b 13 ff.

(720) ἔργον ἐστί· σκοτεινὸς γὰρ ὢν ὁ ἀὴρ κατ' Ἐμπεδοκλέα ' νυκτὸς ἐρημαίης ἀλαώπιδος,'[1] ὅσον τῶν ὀμμάτων ἀφαιρεῖται τοῦ προαισθάνεσθαι, διὰ τῶν ὤτων ἀποδίδωσιν. ἐπεὶ δὲ δεῖ καὶ τὰ δι' ἀνάγκης φύσει περαινόμενα τῶν αἰτίων ἀνευρίσκειν καὶ τοῦτο τοῦ φυσικοῦ ἴδιόν ἐστιν, ἡ περὶ τὰς ὑλικὰς καὶ ὀργανικὰς ἀρχὰς πραγματεία, τίς ἄν," ἔφη, " πρῶτος ὑμῶν εὐπορήσειεν λόγου τὸ πιθανὸν ἔχοντος; "

2. Ἡσυχίας δὲ γενομένης Βόηθος ἔφη νέος μὲν ὢν ἔτι καὶ σοφιστεύων ἀπὸ γεωμετρίας αἰτήμασι χρῆσθαι καὶ λαμβάνειν ἀναποδείκτους ὑποθέσεις,
F νυνὶ δὲ χρήσεσθαί τισι τῶν προαποδεδειγμένων ὑπ' Ἐπικούρου. " φέρεται τὰ ὄντ' ἐν τῷ μὴ ὄντι· πολὺ γὰρ κενὸν ἐνδιέσπαρται καὶ μέμικται ταῖς τοῦ ἀέρος ἀτόμοις· ὅταν μὲν οὖν ᾖ διακεχυμένος καὶ πλάτος ἔχων καὶ περιδρομὴν ὑπὸ μανότητος, μικρὰ καὶ λεπτὰ τὰ μεταξὺ τῶν μορίων κενὰ λείπεται
721 καὶ πολλὴν αἱ ἄτομοι κατεσπαρμέναι χώραν ἐπέχουσιν· ὅταν δὲ συσταλῇ καὶ πίλησις εἰς ὀλίγον αὐτῶν γένηται καὶ συμπέσωσιν ἀποβιασθεῖσαι πρὸς ἀλλήλας, πολλὴν εὐρυχωρίαν ἔξω καὶ διαστάσεις μεγάλας ποιοῦσιν, τοῦτο δὲ γίνεται νυκτὸς ὑπὸ ψυχρότητος· ἡ γὰρ θερμότης χαλᾷ καὶ διίστησιν καὶ λύει τὰς πυκνώσεις, διὸ πλείονα τόπον τὰ ζέοντα καὶ μαλασσόμενα καὶ τηκόμενα τῶν σωμάτων ἐπιλαμβάνει· καὶ τοὐναντίον αὖ πάλιν τὰ πηγνύμενα καὶ ψυχόμενα συγχωρεῖ πρὸς ἄλληλα

[1] ἀλαώπ δος Xylander : ἀγλαώπιδος.

[a] Frag. 49 Diels-Kranz.

[b] These things are accomplished because of the will of





vision. For the air when it is dark (as Empedocles[a] says, ' in the desolate, blind-eyed night ') repays us through our ears for whatever it takes away from our eyes of their power to see ahead. But since we must also investigate the causes which operate by the inevitable process of nature,[b] and since the proper task of the physical scientist is to study material and instrumental principles, which of you first," he said, " will supply us with a convincing solution ? "

2. When silence fell, Boëthus[c] said that when he was still young and occupied with academic pursuits, he had been accustomed to using postulates and adopting unproved assumptions, after the manner of geometry, but that he would now employ some of the demonstrated doctrines of Epicurus.[d] " Existing things are borne about in the non-existent. There is a great deal of void interspersed and mingled with the atoms of air. Now when air is dispersed and has scope and motility because of its loose structure, the empty spaces left between the particles are small and narrow and the atoms, being scattered, fill a good deal of space, but when it is compressed and the atoms are crowded into a small space, and are forced close together, they leave plenty of space outside and make the intervals large. This is what happens at night, under the influence of cold. For warmth loosens and separates and dissolves concentrations, which is why bodies when boiling or softening or melting take up more room, while on the other hand the particles in freezing and cooling bodies join to-

Providence, but through intermediate, material causes, which may be investigated by the scientist.

[c] An Epicurean, and apparently a close friend of Plutarch. See above, v. 1 ; *De Pythiae Oraculis*, *Mor.* 396 D.

[d] Frag. 323 Usener.

(721) καὶ συνάγεται καὶ ἀπολείπει[1] κενότητας ἐν τοῖς περιέχουσιν ἀγγείοις καὶ τόπους[2] ἐξ ὧν ὑποκε-
B χώρηκεν. ἡ δὲ φωνὴ προσφερομένη καὶ προστυγχάνουσα σώμασι πολλοῖς καὶ ἀθρόοις ἢ τυφλοῦται παντάπασιν ἢ διασπάσματα λαμβάνει μεγάλα καὶ πολλὰς ἀντικρούσεις καὶ διατριβάς· ἐν δὲ κενῷ καὶ σωμάτων ἐρήμῳ διαστήματι λεῖον δρόμον ἔχουσα καὶ συνεχῆ καὶ ἄπταιστον ἐξικνεῖται πρὸς τὴν ἀκοήν, ὑπὸ τάχους ἅμα τῷ λόγῳ διασῴζουσα τὴν
C σαφήνειαν. ὁρᾷς γὰρ ὅτι καὶ τῶν ἀγγείων τὰ κενὰ πληττόμενα μᾶλλον ὑπακούει ταῖς[3] πληγαῖς καὶ τὸν ἦχον ἀποτείνει μακράν, πολλάκις δὲ καὶ κύκλῳ περιφερόμενον διαδίδωσι πολύ· τὸ δ' ἀγγεῖον ἐμπλησθὲν ἢ στερεοῦ σώματος ἤ τινος ὑγροῦ παντά-
D πασιν γίνεται κωφὸν καὶ ἄναυδον, ὁδὸν οὐκ ἐχούσης οὐδὲ χώραν ᾗ δίεισι τῆς φωνῆς. αὐτῶν δὲ τῶν σωμάτων χρυσὸς μὲν καὶ λίθος ὑπὸ πληρότητος ἰσχνόφωνα καὶ δυσηχῆ καὶ ταχὺ κατασβέννυσι τοὺς φθόγγους ἐν αὑτοῖς· εὔφωνος δὲ καὶ λάλος ὁ χαλκός, ᾗ πολύκενος καὶ ὄγκον ἐλαφρὸς καὶ λεπτός, οὐ πολλοῖς συντεθλιμμένος ἐπαλλήλοις σώμασιν, ἀλλ' ἄφθονον ἔχων τὸ τῆς παρεικούσης[4] καὶ ἀναφοῦς μεμιγμένον οὐσίας, ᾗ ταῖς τ' ἄλλαις κινήσεσιν εὐπορίαν δίδωσι τήν τε φωνὴν εὐμενῶς ὑπολαμβά-
D νουσα παραπέμπει, μέχρι ἂν ἁψάμενός τις ὥσπερ ἐν ὁδῷ καταλάβῃ καὶ τυφλώσῃ[5]· ἐνταῦθα δ' ἔστη καὶ ἀπεπαύσατο τοῦ πρόσω χωρεῖν διὰ τὴν ἀντίφραξιν.[6] ταῦτ'," ἔφη, " δοκεῖ μοι τὴν νύκτα ποιεῖν

[1] ἀπολείπει Basel edition : ἀπολείπει καὶ.
[2] τόπους Doehner : τόποις. [3] ταῖς added by Doehner.





gether more compactly and leave vacuums—spaces from which they have withdrawn—in the vessels which hold them. A sound which approaches and strikes a large number of particles collected in a mass is either silenced completely or undergoes serious convulsions and many collisions and delays. But in an empty stretch, void of atoms, it travels a smooth, continuous, and unimpeded path to the organ of hearing, preserving, by its velocity, not only the sense of the message but its fine detail. You have noticed, too, that empty vessels when struck are more responsive and send the sound a long way, and often the sound goes round and round and there is much communication of it ; but a vessel filled either with solid matter or with some liquid becomes completely mute and soundless, since the sound has no way or passage by which to go through. Of physical bodies themselves, gold and stone, because of their compactness, are weak-voiced and dull-sounding, and quickly extinguish sounds within them, but bronze is melodious and vocal, because it has much empty space within its structure and is light and fine in its spatial mass, not constricted by crowding particles, but containing an abundance of yielding and impalpable substance. This gives easy passage to other motions and especially to sound, receiving it hospitably and speeding it on its journey, until someone, like a highway-robber, seizes and detains and blindfolds it. There it comes to a halt, ceasing to move on because of the obstruction. This," concluded Boëthus, " is in my opinion what makes the night sonorous and the

[4] παρεικούσης Usener : ἐπιεικοῦς.
[5] τυφλώσῃ Usener : τ. τὸ κενόν.
[6] ἀντίφραξιν Xylander : ἀντίπραξιν.

(721) ἠχώδη, τὴν δ' ἡμέραν ἧττον, θερμότητι καὶ διαχύσει[1] τοῦ ἀέρος μικρὰ[2] τὰ διαστήματα τῶν ἀτόμων ποιοῦσαν· μόνον," ἔφη, " μηδεὶς ἐνιστάσθω πρὸς τὰς πρώτας ὑποθέσεις."

3. Κἀγώ, τοῦ Ἀμμωνίου κελεύοντος εἰπεῖν τι πρὸς αὐτόν, " αἱ μὲν πρῶταί σοι τῶν ὑποθέσεων," ἔφην, " ὦ φίλε Βόηθε, καίπερ πολὺ[3] τὸ κενὸν ἔχουσαι μενέτωσαν· τῇ δὲ φωνῇ τὸ κενὸν οὐκ ὀρθῶς πρὸς σωτηρίαν καὶ κίνησιν ὑποτίθεσθε. σιωπῆς γὰρ οἰκεῖον καὶ ἡσυχίας τὸ ἀναφὲς καὶ
E ἀπαθὲς καὶ ἄπληκτον, ἡ δὲ φωνὴ πληγὴ σώματος διηχοῦς, διηχὲς δὲ τὸ συμπαθὲς αὑτῷ καὶ συμφυὲς εὐκίνητον δὲ καὶ κοῦφον καὶ ὁμαλὸν καὶ ὑπήκοον τοῦ πλήττοντος[4] δι' εὐτονίαν καὶ συνέχειαν, οἷος μόνος[5] ἐστὶ παρ' ἡμῖν ὁ ἀήρ· καὶ γὰρ ὕδωρ καὶ γῆ καὶ πῦρ ἄφωνα καθ' ἑαυτά, φθέγγεται δὲ πνεύματος ἐμπεσόντος ἅπαντα καὶ ψόφους καὶ πατάγους ἀναδίδωσιν· χαλκῷ δὲ κενοῦ[6] μὲν οὐδὲν μέτεστιν, ὁμαλῷ δὲ πνεύματι καὶ λείῳ κεκραμένος εὔπληκτός
F ἐστι καὶ ἠχώδης· εἰ δὲ δεῖ τῇ ὄψει τεκμαίρεσθαι, φαίνεται μᾶλλον ὁ σίδηρος ἔχων τι σαθρὸν καὶ πολύκενον καὶ τενθρηνώδες, ἔστι δὲ κακόφωνος σφόδρα καὶ τῶν μεταλλικῶν κωφότατος.[7] οὐδὲν οὖν ἔδει τῇ νυκτὶ παρέχειν πράγματα συσπῶντας αὐτῆς τὸν ἀέρα καὶ συντείνοντας ἑτέρωθι δ' αὖ χώρας καὶ κενότητας ἀπολείποντας, ὥσπερ ἐμποδὼν ὄντα τῇ φωνῇ τὸν ἀέρα καὶ φθείροντα τὴν οὐσίαν, ἧς αὐτὸς οὐσία καὶ σῶμα[8] καὶ δύναμίς ἐστιν.

[1] διαχύσει Usener : διαλύσει. [2] μικρὰ Usener : μακρὰ.
[3] καίπερ πολὺ Meziriacus, Paton : περὶ πολύ.
[4] πλήττοντος added by Wyttenbach.
[5] μόνος added by Post.
[6] κενοῦ Basel edition : κινουμένωι.





day less so. Daytime, by its warmth and the expansion of the air, makes the intervals between the atoms small. Only let no one interpose a veto of my basic assumptions."

3. Ammonius urged me to say something in answer to Boëthus, so I began, " Let your basic assumptions stand, my dear Boëthus, though they do have in them a good deal of ' emptiness.' But you are incorrect in regarding void as a source of the preservation or movement of sound. For absence of contact and effect and impact is characteristic of silence and inactivity, but sound is an impact on a sound-conducting body, and a sound-conductor is a body whose parts are affected together and are cohesive, but also easily moved and volatile and uniform and, because of its tension and coherence, responsive to an impact. The only example of such a body, among things we know, is air. For water and earth and fire are all soundless in themselves, but each gives forth with a roar or a rattle when struck by a breath of air. There is no void in the structure of bronze, but an admixture of even and smooth air gives it sensitivity to impact, and resonance. If we may judge by appearances, it is rather iron that is found to have in its structure an element of weakness or porousness or honeycombing, and it is most cacophonous, and the least vocal of metallic substances. There was no need, accordingly, to trouble the night with contraction and increased tension of its air, so as to leave passages and vacuums elsewhere, as though the air were a hindrance to sound or destroyed its substance. Air is itself the substance and body and power of sound.

[7] κωφότατος Xylander : κουφώτατος.
[8] σῶμα Reiske : σχῆμα.

(721) "Ἄνευ δὲ τούτων ἔδει δή που τὰς ἀνωμάλους νύκτας, οἷον ὁμιχλώδεις καὶ δυσχειμέρους, ἠχωδεστέρας εἶναι τῶν αἰθρίων καὶ κεκραμένων ὁμαλῶς
722 (διὰ τὸ δεῦρο μὲν συνωθεῖν τὰς ἀτόμους ἐκεῖ δ' ὅθεν μεθίστανται χώραν ἔρημον ἀπολείπειν σωμάτων), καὶ τὸ δὴ προχειρότατον, ἡμέραν ψυχρὰν ἠχωδεστέραν εἶναι νυκτὸς ἀλεεινῆς καὶ θερινῆς· ὧν οὐδέτερον ἀληθές ἐστιν.

"Ὅθεν[1] τὸν λόγον τοῦτον ἀπολελοιπὼς ἐπιβάλλω τὸν Ἀναξαγόραν, ὑπὸ τοῦ ἡλίου λέγοντα κινεῖσθαι τὸν ἀέρα κίνησιν τρομώδη καὶ παλμοὺς ἔχουσαν, ὡς δῆλόν ἐστι τοῖς διὰ τοῦ φωτὸς ἀεὶ διάττουσι ψήγμασι μικροῖς καὶ θραύμασιν, ἃ δή τινες τίλας καλοῦσιν· ταῦτ' οὖν φησιν ὁ ἀνὴρ πρὸς τὴν θερμότητα σίζοντα καὶ ψοφοῦντα δι' ἡμέρας
B δυσηκόους τῷ ψόφῳ τὰς φωνὰς ποιεῖν, νυκτὸς δ' ὑφίεσθαι[2] τὸν σάλον αὐτῶν καὶ τὸν ἦχον."

4. Ἐμοῦ δὲ ταῦτ' εἰπόντος Ἀμμώνιος ἔφη· "γελοῖοι μὲν ἴσως φανούμεθα, καὶ Δημόκριτον ἐλέγχειν οἰόμενοι καὶ Ἀναξαγόραν ἐπανορθοῦσθαι θέλοντες· οὐ μὴν ἀλλ' ἀφαιρετέον γε τῶν Ἀναξαγόρου σωμάτων τὸν σιγμόν· οὔτε γὰρ πιθανὸς οὔτ' ἀναγκαῖος, ἀλλ' ὁ τρόμος ἀρκεῖ τῶν σωμάτων καὶ ἡ κίνησις ἐν τῷ φωτὶ κλονουμένων τὰς φωνὰς διασπᾶν καὶ διαρρίπτειν πολλάκις. ὁ γὰρ ἀήρ, ὥσπερ εἴρηται, σῶμα τῆς φωνῆς καὶ οὐσίαν ἐμπαρέχων ἑαυτόν, ἐὰν μὲν ᾖ σταθερός, εὐθύπορα καὶ λεῖα καὶ συνεχῆ τὰ τῶν ψόφων μόρια καὶ κινήματα πόρ-
C ρωθεν διαδίδωσι· νηνημία γὰρ ἠχῶδες καὶ γαλήνη,





"Apart from these points, inequable nights, for example cloudy or stormy ones, ought to be by your theory more sonorous than nights that are clear and uniform in composition, because then the atoms are forced together in one place, and leave the place they are driven from empty of matter. It is also very obvious that a cold day would be more sonorous than a hot summer night. But neither of these things is true.

"So now I shall leave this argument of yours and cite Anaxagoras, who says that the air is moved by the sun with a quivering, vibrating motion, as is clear from the little bits and fragments always dancing in the sunlight, which some call motes. Anaxagoras [a] says that these, hissing and buzzing in the heat, by their noise make other sounds hard to hear in the daytime, but that at night their dancing and their noise abate."

4. When I finished, Ammonius said, "We shall doubtless seem ridiculous if we not only suppose that we have refuted Democritus but want to correct Anaxagoras as well. Still, we must deprive Anaxagoras' bodies of their hissing, for it is neither probable nor necessary. The vibration and movement of the atoms set churning in the light is often sufficient to split the sounds and scatter them. For if the air, which as you said is the material basis of sound and provides its essence, is calm, it passes on the particles and waves of sound straight and smooth and continuous from a distant source. A windless calm transmits sound, and the opposite condition does not, as

[a] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 59 A 74; *cf.* Aristotle, *Problemata*, 903 a 8 ff.

[1] ὅθεν Turnebus : ὁ. [2] ὑφίεσθαι Doehner : φαίνεσθαι.

(722) καὶ τοὐναντίον, ὡς Σιμωνίδης φησίν,

οὐδὲ γὰρ ἐννοσίφυλλος ἀήτα τότ' ὦρτ' ἀνέμων,
ἅ τις κατεκώλυε κιδναμένα μελιαδέα γᾶρυν
ἀραρεῖν ἀκοαῖσι βροτῶν·

πολλάκις μὲν γὰρ οὐδὲ τὸ σχῆμα τῆς φωνῆς ὁ τοῦ ἀέρος σάλος ἔναρθρον ἐᾷ πρὸς τὴν αἴσθησιν ἐξικνεῖσθαι καὶ διαμεμορφωμένον, ἀεὶ μέντοι τι τοῦ πλήθους φθείρει[1] καὶ τοῦ μεγέθους. ἡ μὲν οὖν νὺξ αὐτὴ καθ' ἑαυτὴν οὐδὲν ἔχει κινητικὸν ἀέρος, ἡ δ' ἡμέρα μέγα,[2] τὸν ἥλιον, ὥσπερ αὐτὸς ὁ Ἀναξαγόρας εἴρηκεν."

5. Ὑπολαβὼν δὲ Θράσυλλος ὁ Ἀμμωνίου υἱός, D "εἶτ'," ἔφη, "τί παθόντες, ὦ πρὸς Διός, ἑκάστοτε νῷ θεωρητὰ[3] κινήματα τοῦ ἀέρος οἰόμεθα δεῖν αἰτιᾶσθαι, τὸν δ' ἐμφανῆ σάλον καὶ σπαραγμὸν αὐτοῦ παρορῶμεν; 'ὁ γὰρ δὴ μέγας ἡγεμὼν ἐν οὐρανῷ Ζεὺς' οὗτος οὐ λανθάνων οὐδ' ἀτρέμα διακινῶν τὰ σμικρότατα τοῦ ἀέρος ἀλλ' εὐθὺς ἐκφανεὶς ἀνίστησιν καὶ κινεῖ πάντα πράγματα

δεξιὰ σημαίνων, λαοὺς δ' ἐπὶ ἔργον ἐγείρων·

οἱ δ' ἕπονται, καθάπερ ἐκ παλιγγενεσίας 'νέα ἐφ' ἡμέρῃ φρονέοντες,' ὥς φησι Δημόκριτος, οὔτ' ἀφώνοις οὔτ' ἀπράκτοις ἐνεργείαις· ᾗ καὶ τὸν ὄρθρον ὁ Ἴβυκος οὐ κακῶς 'κλυτὸν' προσεῖπεν, ἐν ᾧ κλύειν ἤδη καὶ[4] φθέγγεσθαι συμβέβηκεν. τῆς

[1] φθείρει Wyttenbach : φέρει.
[2] μέγα Basel edition : μετὰ.
[3] ἑκάστοτε νῷ θεωρητὰ Post (νῷ Bases) : τὰ ἀθεώρητα Reiske : ἀεί ποτε τἀθεώρητα Kronenberg : εἶπας τῶι θεωρητὰ T.
[4] ἤδη καὶ Meziriacus : καὶ ἤδη.





Simonides says [a] :

Nor had there then risen a leaf-shaking breeze,
Such as, spread abroad, would prevent a honey-sweet voice
From coming fitly to mortals' ears.

Often the turbulence of the air prevents even the pattern of a sound from reaching us articulate and well-defined, but in any case it always diminishes somewhat its volume or extent. Night has, in and of itself, nothing to cause movement in the air, but day has one important thing, the sun, as Anaxagoras himself has said."

5. Ammonius' son Thrasyllus [b] replied to him, "Why, in the name of Zeus, do we always think we must attribute these phenomena to movements of the air seen by mind alone and ignore its visible tossings and convulsions? 'The mighty leader of the heavenly train, Zeus,' [c] he does not secretly or gently stir the particles of air, to rouse all things and set them moving, but by showing himself from the first,

With signs on the right, and rousing the peoples to labour. [d]

Men follow him, as though born anew, every morning, 'thinking fresh thoughts for each day,' in the words of Democritus,[e] with actions that lack neither voice nor fulfilment. Thus Ibycus [f] aptly addressed early dawn as 'loud,' because at that time of day we first

[a] Frag. 41 Bergk, 52 Edmonds (*Lyra Graeca*, ii. 312).
[b] Not mentioned elsewhere.
[c] A quotation from Plato, *Phaedrus*, 246 E.
[d] Aratus, *Phaenomena*, 6.
[e] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 68 B 158.
[f] Frag. 7 Bergk.

(722) E δὲ νυκτὸς ἀκύμων τὰ πολλὰ καὶ ἄκλυστος[1] ὢν ὁ ἀήρ, ἀναπαυομένων ἁπάντων, εἰκότως τὴν φωνὴν ἄθραυστον ἀναπέμπει καὶ ἀκέραιον πρὸς ἡμᾶς."

6. Παρὼν οὖν Ἀριστόδημος[2] ὁ Κύπριος, "ἀλλ' ὅρα," εἶπεν, "ὦ Θράσυλλε, μὴ τοῦτο μὲν αἱ νυκτομαχίαι καὶ νυκτοπορίαι τῶν μεγάλων στρατοπέδων ἐλέγχουσιν, οὐδὲν ἧττον ἠχωδεστέρας ποιοῦσαι τὰς φωνάς, καίπερ ἐν ταραχῇ καὶ σάλῳ τοῦ ἀέρος ὄντος. ἔχει δέ τι καὶ τὸ παρ' ἡμᾶς αἴτιον· αὐτοὶ γὰρ ὢν φθεγγόμεθα νύκτωρ τὰ πολλὰ θορυβώδη καὶ μετὰ πάθους ἐπείγοντος ἐγκελευόμενοί τισιν ἢ διαπυνθανόμενοι συντόνους ποιούμεθα τὰς γεγωνήσεις. τὸ γάρ, ἐν ᾧ μάλιστα καιρῷ F πεφύκαμεν ἡσυχίαν ἄγειν, ἐξανιστὰν ἡμᾶς ἐπὶ πράξεις καὶ λόγους οὐ μικρὸν οὐδ' ἀτρεμαῖόν ἐστιν, ἀλλὰ μέγα καὶ μεγάλης τινὸς ἀνάγκη χρείας ἐπιταχυνόμενον, ὥστε καὶ τὰς φωνὰς φέρεσθαι σφοδροτέρας."

723

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Δ

*Διὰ τί τῶν ἱερῶν ἀγώνων ἄλλος ἄλλον ἔχει στέφανον, τὸν δὲ φοίνικα πάντες· ἐν ᾧ καὶ διὰ τί τὰς μεγάλας φοινικοβαλάνους Νικολάους καλοῦσιν*

Collocuntur Herodes, Sospis, Protogenes, Praxiteles, Caphisias

1. Ἰσθμίων ἀγομένων ἐν τῇ δευτέρᾳ τῶν Σώσπιδος ἀγωνοθεσιῶν τὰς μὲν ἄλλας ἑστιάσεις διεφύγομεν, ἑστιῶντος αὐτοῦ πολλοὺς μὲν ἅμα ξένους πάντας δὲ πολλάκις τοὺς πολίτας· ἅπαξ δὲ τοὺς μάλιστα φίλους καὶ φιλολόγους οἴκοι δεχο-

[1] ἄκλυστος Turnebus : ἄκλυτος.
[2] Ἀριστόδημος Wyttenbach : Ἀ. πρὸς ἡμᾶς.





hear and speak. But at night the air, being mostly motionless and waveless, when everything is resting, naturally conducts sound to us unbroken and intact."

6. Aristodemus of Cyprus,[a] who was also present, said, "But Thrasyllus, don't you think that night-battles and night-marches by large armies refute your view? They do not make sounds any less loud, even though the air is in great turmoil and vibration. A part of the cause of the phenomenon we are discussing lies within ourselves. Most of the speech that we ourselves emit at night is related to some disturbance or prompted by some emotion; we are shouting commands or questions at someone and raise our voices. For what rouses us to words and deeds at the time when we are usually at rest is never anything insignificant or unexciting, but something important, urging us with the compulsion of some great need, so that our voices too travel with greater force."

## QUESTION 4

Why at the various athletic festivals different kinds of wreaths are awarded, but the palm-frond at all of them; also, why large dates are called "Nicolaüses."

Speakers: Herodes, Sospis, Protogenes, Praxiteles, Caphisias

1. During the Isthmian Games, the second time Sospis[b] was exhibitor, I avoided the other banquets, at which he entertained a great many foreign visitors at once, and several times entertained all the citizens. Once, however, when he entertained in his home his

[a] Not otherwise known.
[b] Probably a Corinthian, best known from this passage. *Cf.* ix. 5, 12, 13, below.

(723)
B μένου καὶ αὐτοὶ παρῆμεν.[1] ἀπηρμένων δὲ τῶν πρώτων τραπεζῶν ἧκέν τις Ἡρώδῃ τῷ ῥήτορι παρὰ γνωρίμου νενικηκότος ἐγκωμίῳ φοίνικα καὶ στέφανόν τινα τῶν πλεκτῶν κομίζων. ὁ δὲ ταῦτα μὲν δεξιωσάμενος ἀπέπεμψε πάλιν, ἔφη δ' ἀπορεῖν, τί δήποτε τῶν ἀγώνων στέφανον ἄλλος ἄλλον ἔχει, τὸν δὲ φοίνικα κοινῇ πάντες. " οὐ γὰρ ἐμὲ γοῦν," ἔφη, " πείθουσιν οἱ τὴν ἰσότητα τῶν φύλλων, οἷον ἀντανισταμένων ἀεὶ καὶ συνεκτρεχόντων, ἀγῶνι καὶ ἁμίλλῃ παραπλήσιόν τι ποιεῖν φάσκοντες αὐτήν τε τὴν ' νίκην ' παρὰ τὸ μὴ εἶκον ὠνομάσθαι· καὶ γὰρ
C ἄλλα πάμπολλα μονονοὺ μέτροις τισὶ καὶ σταθμοῖς ἀκριβῶς τὴν τροφὴν διανέμοντα τοῖς ἀντιζύγοις πετάλοις ἰσότητα θαυμαστὴν καὶ τάξιν ἀποδίδωσιν. ἐπεὶ πιθανώτεροι τούτων εἰσὶν οἱ τὸ κάλλος καὶ τὴν εὐφυΐαν ἀγαπῆσαι τοὺς παλαιούς, ὡς Ὅμηρον ' ἔρνεϊ φοίνικος ' ἀπεικάσαντα τὴν ὥραν τῆς Φαιακίδος, ὑπονοοῦντες· οὐ γὰρ ἀγνοεῖτε δήπουθεν, ὅτι καὶ ῥόδοις καὶ λυχνίσιν, ἔνιοι δὲ καὶ μήλοις καὶ ῥοιαῖς ἔβαλλον ὡς καλοῖς γεραίροντες ἀεὶ τοὺς
D νικηφόρους. ἀλλ' οὐδὲν οὕτως ἐπιφανῶς ἐκπρεπέστερον ἔχει τῶν ἄλλων ὁ φοῖνιξ, ἅτε μηδὲ καρπὸν ἐν τῇ Ἑλλάδι φέρων ἐδώδιμον ἀλλ' ἀτελῆ καὶ ἄπεπτον. εἰ γὰρ ὥσπερ ἐν Συρίᾳ καὶ ἐν Αἰγύπτῳ παρεῖχε τὴν βάλανον ὄψει τε θεαμάτων καὶ γλυκύτητι τραγημάτων πάντων ἥδιστον, οὐκ ἂν ἦν ἕτερον αὐτῷ παραβαλεῖν· ὁ γοῦν βασιλεύς, ὥς

[1] παρῆμεν Basel edition : παρ' ἡμῖν.

[a] In ix. 14, Herodes appears as a member of the circle of Ammonius at Athens. [b] Nausicaä, *Odyssey*, vi. 163.





closest friends, all men of learning, I was present too. At the clearing away of the first course, someone came in to present Herodes the professor of rhetoric,[a] as a special honour, with a palm-frond and a plaited wreath sent by a pupil who had won a contest with an encomiastic oration. After accepting them, he sent them back again, remarking that he did not understand why, of the various games, each one has as prize a different kind of wreath, but all use the palm-frond. " I for one am not convinced," he said, " by the explanation that the equality of the leaves is similar to a contest or a race, because they spring up in opposition to each other and run along together, and that the word *nike* (' victory ') itself is derived from the fact that they do not ' yield ' (*me eikon*). For there are many other plants as well which accurately distribute nourishment to leaves in opposing pairs, all but doling it out by measure or weight, and achieve an amazing evenness and regularity. There is more plausibility in the view that the ancients admired the beauty and shapeliness of the tree, like Homer when he compared the beauty of the Phaeacian maiden [b] to ' the shoot of a palm tree.' Incidentally, you are doubtless aware that some used to pelt the victors with roses and rose-campion, too, and some even with apples and pomegranates, in each case with the idea of honouring them with beautiful things. Still, the palm has nothing to set it apart so obviously from other trees, since in Greece the fruit it bears is not even edible, but remains immature and unripe. If, as in Syria and Egypt, it bore dates, the most pleasant of all sights to see and the sweetest of all dried fruits, there would be no other tree to compare with it. The king, they say, being very

(723) φασιν, ἀγαπήσας διαφερόντως τὸν Περιπατητικὸν φιλόσοφον Νικόλαον, γλυκὺν ὄντα τῷ ἤθει ῥαδινὸν δὲ τῷ μήκει τοῦ σώματος διάπλεων δὲ τὸ πρόσωπον ἐπιφοινίσσοντος ἐρυθήματος, τὰς μεγίστας καὶ καλλίστας τῶν φοινικοβαλάνων Νικολάους ὠνόμαζεν, καὶ μέχρι νῦν οὕτως ὀνομάζονται."

2. Ταῦτ' εἰπὼν ὁ Ἡρώδης οὐκ ἀτερπέστερον ἐμβάλλειν ἔδοξεν τοῦ ζητουμένου τὸ περὶ τοῦ Νικολάου. " διὸ καὶ μᾶλλον," ἔφη, " προθυμητέον," ὁ
E Σῶσπις,[1] " ὡς ἕκαστον αὐτῷ τι[2] συνεπεισενεγκεῖν εἰς τὸ ζητούμενον. ἐγὼ δ' εἰσφέρω πρῶτος, ὅτι δεῖ τὴν τῶν νικηφόρων δόξαν ἄφθιτον, ὡς ἀνυστόν ἐστι, καὶ ἀγήρω διαμένειν· ὁ δὲ φοῖνιξ μακρόβιον μέν ἐστιν ἐν τοῖς μάλιστα τῶν φυτῶν, ὥς που καὶ τὰ Ὀρφικὰ ταῦτα μεμαρτύρηκεν

ζῶον δ' ἴσον ἀκροκόμοισιν
φοινίκων ἔρνεσσιν,

μόνῳ δ' αὐτῷ σχεδὸν ὑπάρχει τὸ κατὰ πολλῶν οὐκ ἀληθῶς λεγόμενον· τί δὲ τοῦτ' ἔστι; τὸ ' ἐμπεδόφυλλον ' εἶναι καὶ ἀείφυλλον· οὔτε γὰρ δάφνην οὔτ' ἐλαίαν οὔτε μυρσίνην οὔτ' ἄλλο τι τῶν μὴ φυλλορροεῖν λεγομένων ὁρῶμεν ἀεὶ ταὐτὰ φύλλα διατηροῦν, ἀλλὰ τοῖς πρώτοις ἀπορρέουσιν ἑτέρων
F ἐπιβλαστανόντων, ὥσπερ πόλεις ἕκαστον ἀείζωον διαμένει καὶ ἀδιάλειπτον[3]· ὁ δὲ φοῖνιξ, οὐθὲν ἀπο-

[1] ὁ Σῶσπις added here by Hubert, after ἔφη by Leonicus.
[2] τι Hubert : τις.
[3] ἀδιάλειπτον Kronenberg : ἀμείλικτον.

[a] Plutarch plays on the etymological identity of ἐπιφοινίσσοντος (" ruddy ") and φοῖνιξ (" palm ").





fond of the Peripatetic philosopher Nicolaüs, who was sweet in character and slender and tall physically, and whose face was overspread with a ruddy glow,[a] dubbed the largest and handsomest dates 'Nicolaüses,' and so they are called to this day." [b]

2. In this speech we thought that Herodes' digression about Nicolaüs was not less pleasing than the main question. " All the more reason," said Sospis, " for each of us to be eager to add to the main discussion some extra contribution of his own. I will contribute first the remark that the fame of victors ought to remain unfading and exempt from old age, as far as is possible. Now the palm is one of the most long-lived of plants, as the Orphic poems somewhere attest :

They lived as long as the high-fronded shoots of the palms. [c]

To it alone, practically, belongs a characteristic falsely attributed to many others, namely that of being ' firm-leaved ' and always in leaf.[d] For we observe that neither the laurel nor the olive nor the myrtle, nor any other of the trees that are said not to shed their leaves, always keeps the same leaves, but as the first are shed others are growing in their place ; like cities, each is ever-living and continuous. But the

[b] The king mentioned here is apparently Herod the Great of Judaea, for whom Nicolaüs of Damascus performed many services. There are also traditions (erroneous, according to Jacoby) that Augustus called dates (or a certain kind of cakes) after Nicolaüs because he frequently used to send them to him as gifts. On Nicolaüs see Jacoby, *Frag. Gr. Hist.*, ch. 90, esp. T 1, 10, 13.

[c] Kern, *Orphicorum Fragmenta*, 225.

[d] Empedocles, Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 31 B 77 (from 649 c, above). The palm does in fact, however, lose its leaves.

(723) βάλλων ἀφ' αὐτοῦ τῶν φυομένων, βεβαίως ἀείφυλλός ἐστιν, καὶ τοῦτο δὴ τὸ κράτος αὐτοῦ μάλιστα τῆς νίκης τῷ ἰσχυρῷ συνοικειοῦσιν."

3. Παυσαμένου δὲ τοῦ Σώσπιδος Πρωτογένης ὁ γραμματικὸς ὀνόματι καλέσας Πραξιτέλην τὸν περιηγητήν, " οὕτω δὴ τούτους," ἔφη, " τοὺς ῥήτορας ἐάσομεν περαίνειν τὸ οἰκεῖον, ἐξ εἰκότων καὶ 724 πιθανῶν ἐπιχειροῦντας, αὐτοὶ δ' ἀφ' ἱστορίας οὐδὲν ἂν ἔχοιμεν τῷ λόγῳ συμβάλλεσθαι; καίτοι δοκῶ μοι μνημονεύειν ἐν τοῖς Ἀττικοῖς ἀνεγνωκὼς ἔναγχος, ὅτι πρῶτος ἐν Δήλῳ Θησεὺς ἀγῶνα ποιῶν ἀπέσπασε κλάδον τοῦ ἱεροῦ φοίνικος· ᾗ καὶ σπάδιξ ὠνομάσθη."

4. Καὶ ὁ Πραξιτέλης, " ἔστι[1] ταῦτ'," εἶπεν, " ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦ Θησέως αὐτοῦ πυνθάνεσθαι φήσουσιν, ᾧτινι λόγῳ φοίνικος, οὐ δάφνης οὐδ' ἐλαίας, κλάδον ἀπέσπασεν ἀγωνοθετῶν. σκόπει δή, μὴ Β Πυθικόν ἐστι τὸ νικητήριον, ὡς Ἀμφικτύονος εἰσαγαγόντος[2] κἀκεῖ πρῶτον ἐπὶ τιμῇ τοῦ θεοῦ φοίνικι[3] τοὺς νικῶντας ἐκόσμησαν, ἅτε δὴ καὶ τῷ θεῷ μὴ δάφνας μηδ' ἐλαίας ἀλλὰ φοίνικας ἀνατιθέντες, ὡς ἐν Δήλῳ Νικίας χορηγήσας Ἀθηναίων καὶ ἐν Δελφοῖς Ἀθηναῖοι καὶ Κύψελος πρότερον Κορίνθιος. ἐπεὶ καὶ φίλαθλος ἄλλως καὶ[4] φιλόνι-

[1] ἔστι added by Wilamowitz.
[2] εἰσαγαγόντος added by Hubert.
[3] φοίνικι Herwerden : δάφνῃ καὶ φοίνικι.
[4] ἄλλως καὶ Basel edition : ἀλλ' ὡς.

[a] Also a speaker in v. 3, above.
[b] For this story of Theseus *cf.* Pausanias, viii. 48. 3.
[c] *Cf. Life of Nicias*, iii. Nicias dedicated a bronze palm-





palm-tree, which sheds none of the leaves that grow on it, is truly always in leaf, and it is this strength that it has which people particularly associate with the vigour that brings victory."

3. At the conclusion of Sospis' remarks, Protogenes, the professor of literature, addressed Praxiteles the geographer,[a] " Shall we let these rhetoricians ply their own trade like this, making conjectures on the ground of likelihood and probability, without ourselves having something to contribute to the discussion from our researches? I seem to recall reading recently in a history of Athens that Theseus, when he was first to hold an athletic festival in Delos, tore off a branch of the sacred palm tree, which is why such a branch was called *spadix*." [b]

4. " You are right," answered Praxiteles, " but they will say they want to know of Theseus himself why he tore off a branch of palm rather than of laurel or olive when founding the games. Consider whether the prize is not proper to the Pythian games, because Amphictyon introduced it and it was at the Pythian games that people first, in honour of the god, decked victors with laurel and palm. Indeed, people used to dedicate to the god not laurel nor olive but palm—Nicias, for example, did so when performing sacred ceremonies on behalf of the Athenians at Delos,[c] the Athenians did so at Delphi [d] and, in earlier times, so did Cypselus the Corinthian.[e] Our god is fond of

tree as a thank-offering to Apollo. At the time of the Athenian disaster in Sicily, the golden dates dropped from it, according to *Mor.* 397 F.
[d] A bronze palm-tree, with golden fruit, was dedicated by the Athenians after the Persian Wars. *Cf. Life of Nicias*, xiii ; Pausanias, x. 15. 4.
[e] *Cf. Mor.* 164 A, 399 F.

(724) κος ἡμῖν ὁ θεός, αὐτὸς μὲν[1] κιθαρίσει καὶ ᾠδῇ κοὶ βολαῖς δίσκων, ὡς δ' ἔνιοί φασι, καὶ πυγμῇ ἁμιλλώμενος, ἀνθρώποις δὲ προσαμύνων ἀγωνιζομένοις, ὡς Ὅμηρος ἐμαρτύρησεν, τὸν μὲν Ἀχιλλέα λέγοντα ποιήσας

ἄνδρε δύω περὶ τῶνδε κελεύομεν, ὥπερ ἀρίστω,
πὺξ μάλ' ἀνασχομένω πεπληγέμεν· ᾧ δέ κ' Ἀπόλλων
δώῃ καμμονίην,

C τῶν δὲ τοξοτῶν τὸν μὲν εὐξάμενον τῷ θεῷ κατορθῶσαι καὶ λαβεῖν τὰ πρωτεῖα, τὸν δὲ γαῦρον ἀστοχῆσαι τοῦ σκοποῦ μὴ εὐξάμενον. καὶ μὴν οὐδ' Ἀθηναίους εἰκός ἐστιν Ἀπόλλωνι καθιερῶσαι τὸ γυμνάσιον ἀλόγως καὶ αὐτομάτως, ἀλλὰ παρ' οὗ τὴν ὑγίειαν ἔχομεν θεοῦ, τοῦτον εὐεξίαν τε διδόναι καὶ ῥώμην ἐπὶ τοὺς ἀγῶνας ᾤοντο. κούφων δὲ καὶ βαρέων ἀγωνισμάτων ὄντων, πύκτῃ μὲν Ἀπόλλωνι Δελφούς, δρομαίῳ δὲ Κρῆτας ἱστοροῦσι θύειν καὶ Λακεδαιμονίους. σκύλων δὲ Πυθοῖ καὶ ἀκροθινίων καὶ τροπαίων ἀναθέσεις ἆρ' οὐ συμμαρτυ-
D ροῦσιν ὅτι τῆς εἰς τὸ νικᾶν καὶ κρατεῖν δυνάμεως τῷ θεῷ τούτῳ πλεῖστον μέτεστιν;"

5. Ἔτι δ' αὐτοῦ λέγοντος ὑπολαβὼν Καφισίας[2] ὁ Θέωνος υἱός, "ἀλλὰ ταῦτά γ'," εἶπεν, "οὐχ ἱστορίας οὐδὲ περιηγητικῶν ὅδωδε βυβλίων, ἀλλ' ἐκ μέσων ἀνεσπασμένα τῶν Περιπατητικῶν τόπων εἰς τὸ πιθανὸν ἐπικεχείρηται, καὶ προσέτι τραγικῶς μηχανὴν ἄραντες, ὦ φίλοι,[3] δεδίττεσθε τῷ θεῷ τοὺς

[1] μὲν Hubert : ἐν.
[2] Καφισίας Wilamowitz : Κάφισος.
[3] ὦ φίλοι Duebner : ὀφείλετε.





athletic games and a lover of victory ; he was himself a contestant in lyre-playing and singing and discus-throwing, and, as some say, even in boxing.[a] He is the protector of men engaged in contests, too, as Homer testifies when he makes Achilles say

> Let us bid two men, whoever are best, fight with fists raised high a boxing match for these prizes, and to whichever Apollo grants to outlast the other . . .,[b]

and when he represents the archer who prayed to the god as succeeding and winning first prize, and the one who scorned to pray as missing the mark because of this.[c] Again, it is not likely that the Athenians would have dedicated their gymnasium to Apollo without reason, or absent-mindedly ; but they considered that the god from whom we have health also gives us good condition and strength for athletic contests. There is a distinction between light and heavy contests, and they say that whereas the Delphians sacrifice to Apollo the Boxer, the Cretans and Lacedaemonians sacrifice to Apollo the Runner. Do not the dedications of arms and the finest of the battle-spoil and trophies at Pytho attest that this god has much influence in the realm of victory and the winning of power ? "

5. Before he had finished speaking, Praxiteles was interrupted by Theon's son Caphisias[d] : " This does not have the odour of scholarly research or of geographical treatises ; it is drawn right out of the Peripatetic commonplace-collections, in an attempt at rhetorical persuasion. And what is more, my friends, in raising this imposing tragic stage-machine you are trying to use the god to intimidate your op-

[a] *Cf.* Pausanias, v. 7. 10.
[b] *Iliad*, xxiii. 659 ff.
[c] *Iliad*, xxiii. 850 ff.
[d] Only named here.

(724) ἀντιλέγοντας. ὁ μὲν οὖν θεός, ὥσπερ προσήκει, πᾶσιν ἴσος ἐστὶν μετ' εὐμενείας.

"Ἡμεῖς δ' ἑπόμενοι Σώσπιδι (καλῶς γὰρ ὑφηγεῖται) πάλιν ἐχώμεθα τοῦ φοίνικος ἀμφιλαφεῖς
E τῷ λόγῳ λαβὰς διδόντος. Βαβυλώνιοι μὲν γὰρ ὑμνοῦσι καὶ ᾄδουσιν ὡς ἑξήκοντα καὶ τριακόσια χρειῶν γένη παρέχον αὐτοῖς τὸ δένδρον· ἡμῖν δὲ τοῖς Ἕλλησιν ἥκιστα μέν ἐστι χρειώδης, ἀθλητικῆς δὲ φιλοσοφίας[1] καὶ τὸ ἄκαρπον ἂν εἴη· κάλλιστος γὰρ ὢν καὶ μέγιστος ὑπ' εὐταξίας οὐ γόνιμός ἐστι παρ' ἡμῖν, ἀλλὰ τὴν τροφὴν ὥσπερ ἀθλητοῦ περὶ τὸ σῶμα τῆς εὐταξίας ἀναλισκούσης σμικρὸν αὐτῷ καὶ φαῦλον εἰς σπέρμα περίεστιν. ἴδιον δὲ παρὰ ταῦτα πάντα καὶ μηδενὶ συμβεβηκὸς ἑτέρῳ τὸ μέλλον λέγεσθαι· φοίνικος γὰρ ξύλον ἂν ἄνωθεν ἐπιθεὶς βάρη πιέζῃς, οὐ κάτω θλιβόμενον ἐνδίδωσιν,
F ἀλλὰ κυρτοῦται πρὸς τοὐναντίον ὥσπερ ἀνθιστάμενον τῷ βιαζομένῳ· τοῦτο δὴ καὶ περὶ τοὺς ἀθλητικοὺς ἀγῶνάς ἐστιν· τοὺς μὲν γὰρ ὑπ' ἀσθενείας καὶ μαλακίας εἴκοντας αὐτοῖς πιέζουσι κάμπτοντες, οἱ δ' ἐρρωμένως ὑπομένοντες τὴν ἄσκησιν οὐ μόνον τοῖς σώμασιν ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῖς φρονήμασιν ἐπαίρονται καὶ αὔξονται."[2]

725 ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ε

Διὰ τί πρὸ ἡμέρας ἐκ τοῦ Νείλου οἱ πλέοντες ὑδρεύονται;

Collocuntur complures amici

Αἰτίαν τις ἐζήτησεν, δι' ἣν οἱ ναύκληροι τὰς ὑδ-

[1] ἀθλητικῆς . . . φιλοσοφίας Bernardakis : ἀθλητικὴ . . . φιλοσοφία. [2] αὔξονται Hubert : αὐξοῦνται.

[a] The same idea is presented by a different speaker at *Mor.* 641 A.





ponents. The god, though, is, as he ought to be, impartial in his favour to everyone.

"But let us follow Sospis—for he is an excellent guide—and again take hold of the palm tree, which provides two handles for the argument. In the first place, the Babylonians sing hymns of praise to the tree as serving them in three hundred and sixty ways. To us Greeks it is of very little use, but its very failure to bear fruit is appropriate to the philosophy of athletics. For though it is very beautiful and large, sterility, in our country, goes along with its shapeliness. As with an athlete, its shapeliness expends the nourishment it gets, building up its body ; so that it has little material left, and of poor quality, to produce seed.[a] Secondly, the thing I am going to mention next is unique beyond anything we have spoken of, and is true of no other tree. If you impose weight on a piece of palm-wood, it does not bend down and give way, but curves up in the opposite direction, as though resisting him who would force it.[b] This is the way with athletic contests, too. Those who cannot stand the strain because of weakness and softness are pressed down and forced to bend, but those who stoutly bear up under training are raised up and exalted, not in body only but in mind as well."

QUESTION 5

Why sailors draw water from the Nile before daybreak.

Speakers : several friends of Plutarch

Someone raised the question why seamen draw water

[b] *Cf.* Plutarch, *Quaest. Nat.* xxxii ; Gellius, *Noctes Atticae*, iii. 6 (citing Aristotle, frag. 229 Rose) ; Xenophon, *Cyropaedia*, vii. 5. 11 ; Theophrastus, *Hist. Plant.* v. 6. 1 ; Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* xvi. 223.

(725) ρείας ἐκ τοῦ Νείλου νυκτὸς οὐχ ἡμέρας ποιοῦνται. καί τισι μὲν ἐδόκουν τὸν ἥλιον δεδιέναι, τῷ προθερμαίνειν τὰ ὑγρὰ μᾶλλον εὔσηπτα ποιοῦντα· πᾶν γὰρ τὸ θερμανθὲν καὶ χλιανθὲν ἀεὶ πρὸς μεταβολὴν ἑτοιμότερόν ἐστιν καὶ προπέπονθεν ἀνέσει τῆς ποιότητος· ἡ δὲ ψυχρότης πιέζουσα συνέχειν δοκεῖ καὶ φυλάττειν ἕκαστον ἐν ᾧ πέφυκεν, οὐχ ἥκιστα δὲ[1] τὸ ὕδωρ· ὕδατος γὰρ ἡ ψυχρότης σχετικόν ἐστι
B φύσει· δηλοῦσιν αἱ χιόνες, τὰ κρέα δύσσηπτα τηροῦσαι πολὺν χρόνον. ἡ δὲ θερμότης τά τ' ἄλλα καὶ τὸ μέλι[2] τῆς ἰδίας ποιότητος ἐξίστησι· φθείρεται γὰρ ἑψηθέν· ἂν δ' ὠμὸν[3] διαμένῃ, καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοις πρὸς τὸ μὴ φθείρεσθαι βοηθεῖ. μεγίστην δὲ τῇ αἰτίᾳ πίστιν παρεῖχεν τὰ λιμναῖα τῶν ὑδάτων· χειμῶνος γὰρ οὐδὲν διαφέροντα τῶν ἄλλων ποθῆναι, τοῦ θέρους γίνεται πονηρὰ καὶ νοσώδη· διὸ χειμῶνι μὲν τῆς νυκτὸς ἀναλογεῖν δοκούσης θέρει δὲ τῆς ἡμέρας, μᾶλλον οἴονται διαμένειν ἄτρεπτον καὶ ἀπαθὲς τὸ ὕδωρ, ἂν νυκτὸς λαμβάνηται.

Τούτοις ἐπιεικῶς οὖσι πιθανοῖς ἐπανέκυψεν λόγος
C ὥσπερ ἄτεχνον πίστιν[4] ναυτικῇ βεβαιούμενος ἐμπειρίᾳ· νυκτὸς γὰρ ἔφασαν λαμβάνειν τὸ ὕδωρ ἔτι τοῦ ποταμοῦ καθεστῶτος καὶ ἡσυχάζοντος, ἡμέρας δέ, πολλῶν ἀνθρώπων ὑδρευομένων καὶ πλεόντων, πολλῶν δὲ θηρίων διαφερομένων, ἀναταραττόμενον γίνεσθαι παχὺ καὶ γεῶδες· τὸ δὲ τοιοῦτον εὔσηπτον εἶναι. πάντα γὰρ τὰ μεμιγμένα τῶν ἀμίκτων ἐπισφαλέστερα πρὸς σῆψίν ἐστιν· ποιεῖ γὰρ ἡ μῖξις

[1] οὐχ and δὲ added by Basel edition.
[2] μέλι Basel edition : μέλι καὶ.
[3] δ' ὠμὸν Basel edition : δὲ μόνον.
[4] ἄτεχνον πίστιν Minar : ἀτέχνῳ πίστει Wyttenbach : ἀτεχνῶς πίστιν T, but ναυτικὴν and ἐμπειρίαν.





from the Nile at night and not during the day. Some thought they were afraid of the sun, which by its heat renders liquids more subject to corruption. For anything heated or warmed is always more prone to change, and has suffered in advance a relaxation of its quality. Cold, on the other hand, seems to compress and hold together and preserve anything in its existing state, and this is eminently true of water. The cold state of water has preservative qualities,[a] as is shown by snow, which keeps meat largely immune to decay for a long while. But warmth alters everything from its normal state, as is well shown by honey, which is spoiled by boiling, but if left uncooked, helps preserve other things from going bad. The best evidence adduced for this explanation was that of the water of pools. In winter it is no less potable than other water, but in summertime it becomes noxious and unhealthful. Thus, since night seems analogous to winter and day to summer, the sailors have the idea that the water will be more likely to remain unchanged and free from taint if it is drawn at night.

In the face of this argument, so eminently persuasive, rose another to bolster a layman's faith, as it were, with the confirmation of nautical experience. Some stated, namely, that the sailors draw water at night because the river is still quiet and peaceful, whereas in the daytime numbers of people are drawing water or using boats and many sorts of animals are moving about in it, it is roiled and becomes turbid and muddy. In this condition it is liable to go bad, for all mixtures are more likely to putrefy than what is unmixed. Mixing produces conflict, conflict pro-

[a] *Cf. supra*, Book III, Question 10.

(725) μάχην, ἡ δὲ μάχη μεταβολήν, μεταβολὴ δέ τις ἡ σῆψις· διὸ τάς τε μίξεις τῶν χρωμάτων οἱ ζωγράφοι φθορὰς ὀνομάζουσιν καὶ τὸ βάψαι "μιῆναι"[1] κέκληκεν ὁ ποιητής, ἡ δὲ κοινὴ συνήθεια τὸ ἄμικτον
D καὶ καθαρὸν ἄφθαρτον καὶ ἀκήρατον. μάλιστα δὲ γῆ μιχθεῖσα πρὸς ὕδωρ ἐξίστησιν καὶ φθείρει τὸ πότιμον καὶ οἰκεῖον· ὅθεν εὔσηπτα μᾶλλόν ἐστι τὰ στάσιμα καὶ κοῖλα, πολλῆς ἀναπιμπλάμενα γῆς, τὰ δὲ ῥέοντα φεύγει καὶ διακρούεται τὴν προσφερομένην· καὶ καλῶς Ἡσίοδος ἐπῄνεσεν ὕδωρ[2]

κρήνης ἀενάου καὶ ἀπορρύτου, ἥ τ' ἀθόλωτος·

ὑγιεινὸν γὰρ τὸ ἀδιάφθορον, ἀδιάφθορον δὲ τὸ ἄμικτον καὶ καθαρόν. οὐχ ἥκιστα δ' αἱ τῆς γῆς διαφοραὶ τῷ λόγῳ μαρτυροῦσιν· τὰ γὰρ ὀρεινὴν διεξιόντα γῆν καὶ λιθώδη στερρότερα τῶν ἑλείων καὶ πεδινῶν ἐστιν, πολλὴν γὰρ οὐκ ἀποσπᾷ γῆν· ὁ δὲ Νεῖ-
E λος ὑπὸ μαλθακῆς χώρας περιεχόμενος, μᾶλλον δ' ὥσπερ αἷμα σαρκὶ κεκραμένος, γλυκύτητος μὲν ἀπολαύει καὶ χυμῶν ἀναπίμπλαται δύναμιν ἐμβριθῆ καὶ τρόφιμον ἐχόντων, συμμιγὴς δὲ φέρεται καὶ θολερός· ἂν δ' ἀναταράττηται, καὶ μᾶλλον· ἡ γὰρ κίνησις ἀναμίγνυσι τῷ ὑγρῷ τὸ γεῶδες, ὅταν δ' ἠρεμήσῃ, κάτω ῥέπον διὰ βάρος ἄπεισιν. ὅθεν ὑδρεύονται τῆς νυκτός, ἅμα καὶ τὸν ἥλιον προλαμβάνοντες, ὑφ' οὗ τὸ λεπτότατον καὶ κουφότατον ἀεὶ τῶν ὑγρῶν αἰρόμενον διαφθείρεται.

[1] μιῆναι Turnebus : διῆναι.
[2] ὕδωρ added by Reiske.

[a] On the effects of mixture (of foods) *cf. supra*, Book IV, Question 1 (*e.g.* 663 A).





duces change, and putrefaction is a kind of change.[a] This is why painters call a blending of colours a "deflowering," and Homer calls dyeing "tainting,"[b] and common usage regards the unmixed and pure as virgin and undefiled. Earth in particular, when mixed with water, alters and destroys its natural potable quality, so that the waters of stagnant enclosed ponds are more likely to turn putrid, having much mud intermixed, whereas flowing streams avoid mixture or shake off any earth that enters their course. Hesiod aptly praises the water of

> An ever-flowing and a running spring, and one untroubled[c];

for that is healthy which is uncorrupted, and the uncorrupted is the unmixed and pure. An excellent confirmation of the argument is found in differences of terrain. Waters that flow through a mountainous and stony country are clearer than those of the marshes and plains, since they do not carry off much earth. The Nile, encompassed by soft terrain, or rather interspersed through it as blood is through flesh, has the benefit of its sweetness, and is filled with fluids that are heavy and nourishing; but in its flow it is impure and turbid. If it is roiled, this is even more the case, for motion mixes mud and liquid, but when the river is quiet the mud sinks anp disappears, because of its weight. This is why they draw water at night, but also in order to anticipate the sun, which by continually evaporating the finest and lightest element in the liquid, causes deterioration.

[b] *Iliad*, iv. 141; *cf. Mor.* 393 c.
[c] *Works and Days*, 595.

(725) ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ς'

F Περὶ τῶν ὀψὲ παραγινομένων ἐπὶ τὸ δεῖπνον· ἐν ᾧ καὶ πόθεν ἀκράτισμα καὶ ἄριστον καὶ δεῖπνον ὠνομάσθη

Collocuntur filii Theonis et Plutarchi, Plutarchus, Soclarus, Theo, Lamprias, alii

1. Τῶν υἱῶν μου τοὺς νεωτέρους ἐν θεάτρῳ προσδιατρίψαντας ἀκροάμασι καὶ βράδιον ἐπὶ τὸ
726 δεῖπνον ἐλθόντας οἱ Θέωνος υἱοὶ "κωλυσιδείπνους" καὶ "ζοφοδορπίδας" καὶ τοιαῦτα μετὰ παιδιᾶς ἔσκωπτον· οἱ δ' ἀμυνόμενοι πάλιν ἐκείνους "τρεχεδείπνους" ἀπεκάλουν. καί τις εἶπε τῶν πρεσβυτέρων τρεχέδειπνον εἶναι τὸν ὑστερίζοντα τοῦ δείπνου· θᾶττον γὰρ ἢ βάδην ἐπειγόμενον, ὅταν βραδύνῃ, φαίνεσθαι· καὶ Γάββα τοῦ[1] παρὰ Καίσαρι γελωτοποιοῦ χάριεν ἀπεμνημόνευσεν· ἐκεῖνος γὰρ "ἐπιθυμοδείπνους" ἐκάλει τοὺς ὀψὲ παραγινομένους ἐπὶ δεῖπνον, ἀσχολουμένους γὰρ αὐτοὺς ὅμως διὰ τὸ φιλόδειπνον οὐκ ἀπολέγεσθαι τὰς κλήσεις.

2. Ἐγὼ δ' εἶπον, ὅτι καὶ Πολύχαρμος ἐν Ἀθή-
B ναις δημαγωγῶν καὶ τοῦ βίου διδοὺς ἀπολογισμὸν ἐν ἐκκλησίᾳ, "ταῦτ'," εἶπεν, "ἄνδρες Ἀθηναῖοι, τἀμά· καὶ πρὸς τούτοις, οὐδέποτε κληθεὶς ἐπὶ δεῖπνον ὕστατος ἀφικόμην." δημοτικὸν γὰρ εὖ μάλα δοκεῖ τὸ τοιοῦτο, καὶ τοὐναντίον οἱ ἄνθρωποι

[1] Γάββα τοῦ Buecheler : γὰρ βάττου.

[a] Theon was a close friend of Plutarch, and is mentioned more often in his works than any contemporary save the author's brother Lamprias. See *RE*, *s.v.* "Plutarchos (2)," col. 686, *s.v.* "Theon," cols. 2059-2066.





QUESTION 6

On people who arrive late at dinner; also, the origin of the words *akratisma* ("breakfast"), *ariston* ("breakfast" or "luncheon") and *deipnon* ("dinner").

Speakers: Sons of Plutarch and of Theon, Plutarch, Soclarus, Theon, Lamprias, and others

1. My younger sons, having stayed too long at some musical performances in the theatre, arrived rather late at dinner, and Theon's [a] sons twitted them playfully with epithets like "dinner-stoppers" [b] and "dusk-diners." [c] In self-defence they retorted by calling the others "run-to-dinners." [d] One of the older persons present commented that a "run-to-dinner" is one who is late for dinner: when he is delayed, he comes on the scene hurrying at a faster pace than a walk. He recalled a witticism of Gabba,[e] Caesar's jester, who used to call those who arrived late "dinner-lovers," on the ground that in spite of having other engagements they did not refuse invitations—because of their love of dining out.

2. I mentioned that Polycharmus,[f] an Athenian popular leader, when giving in the assembly an answer to criticism of his way of life, ended by saying, "This is how I have lived, men of Athens; and in addition I have never, when invited to dinner, been the last to arrive." This kind of thing is regarded as very democratic, and on the other hand those who are

[b] A name given to certain snails (Athenaeus, ii. 63 d).
[c] Alcaeus, frag. 37 Bergk (said of Pittacus).
[d] This word is used of parasites (Athenaeus, i. 4 a, vi. 242 c) and also by Juvenal, iii. 67, mockingly, of some article of apparel worn by parasites.
[e] Gabba was a court-jester to Augustus.
[f] Otherwise unknown.

(726) τοὺς ὀψὲ παραγινομένους ἀναγκαζόμενοι περιμένειν ὡς ἀηδεῖς καὶ ὀλιγαρχικοὺς βαρύνονται.

3. Ὁ δὲ Σώκλαρος ὑπερδικῶν τῶν νεανίσκων, "ἀλλ' οὐδὲ τὸν Πιττακόν," ἔφη, "ζοφοδορπίδαν ὁ Ἀλκαῖος ὡς ὀψὲ δειπνοῦντα λέγεται προσειπεῖν, ἀλλ' ὡς ἀδόξοις τὰ πολλὰ καὶ φαύλοις ἡδόμενον συμπόταις· τὸ μέντοι πρωιαίτερον[1] δειπνεῖν ὄνειδος ἦν πάλαι, καὶ τὸ ἀκράτισμά φασιν οὕτως λέγεσθαι διὰ τὴν ἀκρασίαν."

C 4. Ὑπολαβὼν δ' ὁ Θέων, "ἥκιστ'," εἶπεν, "εἰ δεῖ[2] τοῖς τὸν ἀρχαῖον βίον διαμνημονεύουσιν πιστεύειν. φασὶ γὰρ ἐκείνους, ἐργατικοὺς ἅμα καὶ σώφρονας ὄντας, ἕωθεν ἐσθίειν ἄρτον ἐν ἀκράτῳ, καὶ μηθὲν ἄλλο· διὸ τοῦτο μὲν ἀκράτισμα καλεῖν διὰ τὸν ἄκρατον, ὄψον δὲ τὸ παρασκευαζόμενον εἰς δεῖπνον αὐτοῖς· ὀψὲ γὰρ δειπνεῖν ἀπὸ τῶν πράξεων γενομένους."

Ἐκ τούτου καὶ τὸ δεῖπνον καὶ τὸ ἄριστον, ἀφ' ὅτου λάβοι τοὔνομα, ζήτησιν παρέσχεν. καὶ τὸ μὲν ἄριστον ἐδόκει τῷ ἀκρατίσματι ταὐτὸν εἶναι, μάρτυρι[3] τῷ Ὁμήρῳ χρωμένοις[4] λέγοντι τοὺς περὶ τὸν Εὔμαιον

D ἐντύνοντ' ἄριστον ἅμ' ἠοῖ φαινομένῃφι,

καὶ πιθανὸν ἐδόκει διὰ τὴν ἑωθινὴν αὔραν[5] ἄριστον

[1] πρωιαίτερον Wyttenbach : πρότερον.
[2] εἰ δεῖ Wyttenbach : ἔδει. [3] μάρτυρι Reiske : μαρτυρεῖ.
[4] χρωμένοις added by Reiske.
[5] αὔραν Kaltwasser : ὥραν.

[a] It is mainly from this passage that Ziegler concludes that this Soclarus was an intimate friend of the author and a resident of Chaeronea (*RE*, *s.v.* "Plutarchos (2)," col. 684).





forced to wait for late arrivals resent them as snobbish and oligarchical.

3. Soclarus,[a] however, spoke up as advocate for the young men : "In spite of what you say, Alcaeus called Pittacus a 'dusk-diner,' according to the story, not because he dined late but because he mostly preferred the company of obscure and undistinguished people.[b] In fact, dining too early was a cause for reproach in ancient times ; and they say that the *akratisma* ('breakfast') is so named from *akrasia* ('incontinence')."

4. "Not so," Theon interrupted, "if we are to believe those who have written accounts of life in the early days. They say that people then, being both hard-working and temperate, would eat in the morning a piece of bread dipped in *akratos* ('unmixed wine') and nothing else. So they called breakfast *akratisma* because of the *akratos*.[c] What was prepared for their dinner they called *opson*, because they dined late (*opse*), when they got away from business activities."[d]

Our next topic of inquiry was the etymology of *deipnon* ("dinner") and *ariston* ("breakfast" or "luncheon"). We decided that the *ariston* is the same meal as the *akratisma*, relying on the testimony of Homer, who says the associates of Eumaeus

Were setting breakfast (*ariston*) on at break of dawn.[e]

It seemed likely to us that the word *ariston* was de-

[b] Alcaeus, frag. 37 Bergk ; a different interpretation, Diogenes Laertius, i. 81.
[c] *Cf.* Athenaeus, i. 11 c.
[d] ὄψον is, primarily, any kind of cooked or prepared food. The word has no etymological connexion with ὀψέ ("late").
[e] *Odyssey*, xvi. 2.

(726) ὠνομάσθαι καθάπερ τὸ αὔριον· τὸ δὲ δεῖπνον, ὅτι τῶν πόνων διαναπαύει· πράξαντες γάρ τι δειπνοῦσιν ἢ μεταξὺ πράττοντες· ἔστι δὲ καὶ τοῦτο παρ' Ὁμήρου λαβεῖν λέγοντος

ἦμος δὲ δρυτόμος περ ἀνὴρ ὠπλίσσατο δεῖπνον.

εἰ μὴ νὴ Δία τὸ ἄριστον αὐτόθεν ἀπραγμόνως προσφερόμενοι καὶ ῥᾳδίως ἀπὸ τῶν τυχόντων, τὸ δὲ δεῖπνον ἤδη παρεσκευασμένον, ἐκεῖνο μὲν ῥᾷστον, τοῦτο δ' ὥσπερ διαπεπονημένον ἐκάλεσαν.

5. Ὑβριστὴς δ' ὢν καὶ φιλόγελως φύσει ὁ ἀ-
E δελφὸς ἡμῶν Λαμπρίας ἔφη μυρίῳ τὰ Ῥωμαϊκὰ δείξειν οἰκειότερα τῶν Ἑλληνικῶν ὀνόματα, τοσαύτης ἀδείας τῷ φλυαρεῖν δεδομένης. "τὸ μὲν γὰρ δεῖπνόν φασι 'κῆναν' διὰ τὴν κοινωνίαν καλεῖσθαι· καθ' ἑαυτοὺς γὰρ ἡρίστων ἐπιεικῶς οἱ πάλαι Ῥωμαῖοι συνδειπνοῦντες τοῖς φίλοις. τὸ δ' ἄριστον ἐκλήθη 'πράνδιον'[1] ἀπὸ τῆς ὥρας· ἔνδιον γὰρ τὸ δειλινόν, καὶ τὴν μετ' ἄριστον ἀνάπαυσιν ἐνδιάζειν· ἢ πρωινήν τινα σημαίνοντες ἐδωδήν, ἢ τροφὴν ᾗ χρῶνται πρὶν ἐνδεεῖς γενέσθαι. καὶ μήν, ἵν' ἀφῶ τὰ στρώματ'," ἔφη, "τὸν οἶνον τὸ μέλι, τοὔλαιον τὸ γεύσασθαι τὸ προπιεῖν ἕτερα πάμπολλα τοῖς
F αὐτοῖς ὀνόμασι καταφανῶς χρώμενα, τίς οὐκ ἂν

[1] πράνδιον Stephanus : πρανδε.

[a] Actually, ἄριστον seems to be related to ἦρι, "early," and ἔδομαι, "eat." It was originally an "early meal," but the time varied with custom, so that sometimes it must be called "luncheon." The first vowel is long in this sense.

[b] *Iliad*, xi. 86.





rived from *aura* ("morning breeze"), as is *aurion* ("to-morrow").[a] *Deipnon* ("dinner"), on the other hand, is so called because it "brings rest" (*dianapauei*) from labour; people dine when they have finished working, or in the intervals of work. This, too, can be gathered from a phrase of Homer,

At the time of day when a woodsman prepares his dinner.[b]

Still, it may be that since people took breakfast (*ariston*) wherever they were and without trouble or effort, using whatever food was at hand, while dinner (*deipnon*) was by then a prepared meal, they derived the word *ariston* from *rhaiston* ("easiest") and *deipnon* from *diapeponemenon* ("elaborated").

5. My brother Lamprias, who has a saucy disposition and loves a joke, promised to show, since we had permitted this much nonsense, that the Latin words are much more appropriate than the Greek. "They say that *cena* ('dinner') has its name from *koinonia* ('fellowship'). The ancient Romans generally took their early meal alone, but had dinner along with their friends. The *ariston* they called *prandium* because of the time of day. For afternoon is *endion*, and they called the rest after the *ariston*, *endiazein* ('taking a siesta').[c] By the word they meant to signify either an 'early' (*proïnen*) meal or the nourishment which they take 'before being in need' (*prin endeeis*) of it. What is more," Lamprias continued, "leaving aside couch covers, wine, honey, olive oil, tasting, proposing toasts and so many other things which obviously are called by the same name in Latin as in Greek, who

[c] πράνδιον (Lat. *prandium*) seems to be analysed as πρὸ ἔνδιον, "before noon;" ἔνδιον is the basis of the word ἐνδιάζειν, "take a siesta;" so that the Roman's *prandium* is the meal "before the siesta."

(726) εἴποι ἐπὶ κῶμον[1] Ἑλληνικῶς ‘κωμισσᾶτον’ λέγεσθαι, καὶ τὸ κεράσαι ‘μισκῆρε’ καθ’ Ὅμηρον

ἡ δ’ αὖτ’ ἐν[2] κρητῆρι μελίφρονα οἶνον ἔμισγε,[3]

καὶ ‘μῆνσαν’[4] μὲν τὴν τράπεζαν ἀπὸ τῆς ἐν μέσῳ θέσεως, ‘πᾶνιν’[5] δὲ τὸν ἄρτον ὡς ἀνιέντα τὴν πεῖναν, τὸν δὲ στέφανον ‘κορῶναν’ ἀπὸ τῆς κεφαλῆς ὡς Ὅμηρος τὸ κράνος εἴκασέ που στεφάνῃ, τὸ
727 δ’ ἔδειν ‘ἔδερε’[6] καὶ ‘δέντης’ τοὺς ὀδόντας καὶ ‘λάβρα’ τὰ χείλη[7] ἀπὸ τοῦ λαμβάνειν τὴν βορὰν δι’ αὐτῶν;

“Ἢ καὶ τούτων οὖν ἀκουστέον ἀγελαστὶ λεγομένων ἢ μηδ’ ἐκείνοις εὐκόπως οὕτως διὰ τῶν ὀνομάτων ὥσπερ τριγχίων τὰ μὲν ἐκκόπτουσι μέρη τὰ δὲ καθαιροῦσιν παραδύσεις διδῶμεν.”

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ζ

*Περὶ συμβόλων Πυθαγορικῶν, ἐν οἷς παρεκελεύοντο χελιδόνα οἰκίᾳ μὴ δέχεσθαι καὶ τὰ στρώματα συνταράττειν εὐθὺς ἀναστάντας*

Collocuntur Lucius, Sulla, Plutarchus, Philinus

B 1. Σύλλας ὁ Καρχηδόνιος εἰς Ῥώμην ἀφικομένῳ

[1] κῶμον Basel edition, Xylander: βωμὸν.
[2] ἡ δ’ αὖτ’ ἐν] ἡ δὲ τρίτη Homer.
[3] ἔμισγε] ἐκίρνα Homer.
[4] μῆνσαν Basel edition: μηνεα.
[5] πᾶνιν Hubert: πᾶν.
[6] δ’ ἔδειν ἔδερε Buecheler (*cf.* τὸ δ’ ἔ⟨δειν ἐ⟩κάλουν ἔδερε Graf): δὲ καίρε δέρε T: δὲ δέρειν καίδερε Wyttenbach.
[7] τὰ χείλη Wyttenbach: τάχια· ἢ.

[a] *Odyssey*, x. 356.
[b] *Iliad*, vii. 12.
[c] When Lamprias (or rather the persons he is satirizing; *cf.* the last sentence) says that the Latin expressions discussed





could deny that *comissatum* (‘revel’) is derived from the Greek word *komos* (‘carousal’), or that mixing is called *miscere* from Homer's line

She then in a bowl the honey-sweet wine did mix (*emisge*),[a]

and a table called *mensa* from standing in the middle (*meson*), bread called *panis* as relieving hunger (*peina*), a wreath is called *corona* from ‘head,’ since Homer somewhere likens a helmet (*kranos*) to a wreath,[b] or that *edere* (‘eat’) is derived from *edein*, or *dentes* (‘teeth’) from *odontes*, or that they call lips *labra* because we seize (*lab-*) our food (*bora*) with them?

“Now we ought either to give a straight-faced hearing to these latter derivations, or refuse so easily to allow the ones set forth earlier to overwhelm our vocabulary, so to speak, breaking through parts and tearing down other parts of its fortification-wall.”[c]

## QUESTION 7

On the Pythagorean precepts not to receive a swallow as guest in the house, and to shake up the bedclothes immediately after rising.

Speakers: Lucius, Sulla, Plutarch, Philinus

1. Sulla the Carthaginian,[d] having proclaimed a

here are “more appropriate” than the Greek, he means, apparently, that they are more subtle, or have a sort of “hidden meaning,” in being derived—sometimes by a punning twist—from Greek words. Actually, while many pairs are cognates, the Latin are not derived from the Greek, with the possible exceptions of *oleum* from ἔλαιον and *comissatum* from κῶμος, through κωμάζω.

[d] Sextius Sulla is a frequent speaker, on a variety of topics, in the *Table-Talk*, and has an important role in the *De Facie*.

(727) μοι διὰ χρόνου τὸ ὑποδεκτικόν, ὡς Ῥωμαῖοι καλοῦσιν, καταγγείλας δεῖπνον ἄλλους τε τῶν ἑταίρων παρέλαβεν οὐ πολλοὺς καὶ Μοδεράτου τινὰ τοῦ Πυθαγορικοῦ μαθητήν, ὄνομα Λεύκιον, ἀπὸ Τυρρηνίας. οὗτος οὖν ὁρῶν Φιλῖνον τὸν ἡμέτερον ἐμψύχων ἀπεχόμενον, οἷον εἰκός, εἰς τοὺς Πυθαγόρου λόγους προήχθη· καὶ Τυρρηνὸν ἀπέφηνεν, οὐ πατρόθεν, ὥσπερ ἕτεροί τινες, ἀλλ' αὐτὸν ἐν Τυρρηνίᾳ καὶ γεγονέναι καὶ τεθράφθαι καὶ πεπαιδεῦσθαι
C τὸν Πυθαγόραν ἰσχυριζόμενος οὐχ ἥκιστα τοῖς συμβόλοις, οἷόν ἐστι καὶ τὸ συνταράττειν ἀναστάντας ἐξ εὐνῆς τὰ στρώματα καὶ χύτρας τύπον ἀρθείσης ἐν σποδῷ μὴ ἀπολείπειν ἀλλὰ συγχεῖν καὶ χελιδόνας οἰκίᾳ μὴ δέχεσθαι μηδὲ σάρον ὑπερβαίνειν μηδὲ γαμψώνυχον οἴκοι τρέφειν· ταῦτα γὰρ ἔφη τῶν Πυθαγορικῶν λεγόντων καὶ γραφόντων μόνους ἔργῳ Τυρρηνοὺς ἐξευλαβεῖσθαι καὶ φυλάττειν.

2. Λεχθέντων δὲ τούτων ὑπὸ τοῦ Λευκίου, μάλιστα τὸ τῶν χελιδόνων ἀτοπίαν ἔχειν ἐδόκει, ζῷον ἀσινὲς καὶ φιλάνθρωπον εἴργεσθαι τοῖς γαμψωνύχοις ὁμοίως, ἀγριωτάτοις οὖσιν καὶ φονικωτά-

[a] The Latin is *cena adventicia* (Suetonius, *Vitellius*, xiii. 2; Philarg. ad Verg. *Ecl.* v. 74; *cf.* Petronius, *Satyricon*, xc. 5), or *adventoria* (Martial, xii, praef.). The grammarian Caper (Keil, *Gramm. Lat.* vii. 107. 10) prefers the former.

[b] Lucius the Pythagorean, who also appears in Question 8 of this Book, is not the son of Florus (702 F), but is probably to be identified with the Lucius of the *De Facie*.

[c] An intimate and perhaps a compatriot of Plutarch, who appears many times as a character in his dialogues. His vegetarianism is brought out in other passages as well as in this one. See *RE*, *s.v.* "Plutarchos (2)," col. 681.





welcome-dinner (as the Romans call it) [a] to celebrate my arrival in Rome after a long absence, invited a small number of close friends, including a certain pupil of Moderatus the Pythagorean, named Lucius, who was a native of Etruria.[b] When he saw my friend Philinus [c] abstaining from the flesh of living creatures,[d] he was naturally led to speak about the doctrines of Pythagoras. He claimed him as an Etruscan,[e] not through the lineage of his father, as others have done, but insisting that Pythagoras was born, raised, and educated in Etruria. He stressed in support the *symbola* ("signs"),[f] like those bidding one on rising from bed to shake up the bedclothes, and not to leave the mark of a pot in the ashes when it is lifted, but to stir them up, not to receive swallows as guests in the house, not to step over a broom, and not to raise in the house a bird with hooked talons. He said that though the Pythagoreans have handed these precepts down in oral and written tradition, the Etruscans are the only people who in fact carefully observe and abide by them.

2. After Lucius' discussion of these topics, we commented that the rule about the swallows seemed especially strange—keeping out a harmless creature which is friendly to man, just the same as the savage and murderous birds with hooked talons. The ex-

[d] On the diet of Philinus *cf. Mor.* 660 E-F.

[e] On the lineage of Pythagoras see Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 14. 8.

[f] The Pythagorean *symbola* ("precepts") and *acusmata* ("oral teachings") contain much material from myth, folklore, and magic. It was probably largely rationalized and allegorized from the beginning of the school (sixth century B.C.). See Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 58 c, and Nilsson, *Gesch. d. gr. Religion*, i, pp. 665-670, where further references are given.

(727)
D τοις· καὶ γὰρ ᾧ μόνῳ τινὲς τῶν παλαιῶν ᾠοντο λύειν τὸ σύμβολον, ὡς πρὸς τοὺς διαβόλους καὶ ψιθύρους τῶν συνήθων ἠνιγμένον, οὐδ' αὐτὸς ὁ Λεύκιος ἐδοκίμαζεν· ψιθυρισμοῦ μὲν γὰρ ἥκιστα χελιδόνι μέτεστι, λαλιᾶς δὲ καὶ πολυφωνίας οὐ μᾶλλον ἢ κίτταις καὶ πέρδιξι καὶ ἀλεκτορίσιν.

"Ἆρ' οὖν," ὁ Σύλλας ἔφη, "διὰ τὸν μῦθον τὸν περὶ τὴν παιδοφονίαν ἀφοσιοῦνται τὰς χελιδόνας, ἄπωθεν ἡμᾶς πρὸς ἐκεῖνα τὰ πάθη διαβάλλοντες, ἐξ ὧν τὸν Τηρέα καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας τὰ[1] μὲν δρᾶσαι τὰ δὲ παθεῖν ἄθεσμα καὶ σχέτλια λέγουσι, καὶ μέχρι νῦν Δαυλίδας ὀνομάζουσιν τὰς ὄρνιθας, Γοργίας δ' ὁ σοφιστής, χελιδόνος ἀφείσης ἐπ' αὐτὸν ἀπόπατον,
E ἀναβλέψας πρὸς αὐτήν, 'οὐ καλὰ ταῦτ',' εἶπεν, 'ὦ Φιλομήλα'; ἢ καὶ τοῦτο κενόν[2] ἐστιν; τὴν γὰρ ἀηδόνα, ταῖς αὐταῖς τραγῳδίαις ἔνοχον οὖσαν, οὐκ ἀπείργουσιν οὐδὲ ξενηλατοῦσιν."

3. "Ἴσως," ἔφην ἐγώ, "καὶ ταῦτ' ἔχει λόγον, ὦ Σύλλα. σκόπει δὲ μὴ πρῶτον μέν, ᾧ λόγῳ τὸ γαμψώνυχον οὐ προσίενται, τούτῳ καὶ ἡ χελιδὼν ἀδοξεῖ παρ' αὐτοῖς· σαρκοφάγος γάρ ἐστιν καὶ μάλιστα τοὺς τέττιγας, ἱεροὺς καὶ μουσικοὺς ὄντας, ἀποκτίννυσι καὶ σιτεῖται· καὶ πρόσγειος αὐτῆς ἡ πτῆσίς ἐστιν, τὰ μικρὰ καὶ λεπτὰ τῶν ζῴων ἀγ-
F ρευούσης, ὥς φησιν Ἀριστοτέλης. ἔπειτα μόνη τῶν ὁμωροφίων ἀσύμβολος ἐνοικεῖ καὶ ἀτελὴς ἐν-

[1] τὰ Xylander: τὰς.
[2] κενόν Meziriacus: κοινόν.

[a] In the well-known story Philomela was changed into a swallow and Procne into a nightingale. The emotions Plutarch refers to include both Tereus' lust for his sister-in-law and the anger which impelled Procne to kill her own son (and





planation which some of the ancients had regarded as sufficient in itself to explain the hidden meaning, that the precept conceals a reference to slanderous, whispering associates, was rejected by Lucius himself. Whispering is actually not a characteristic of swallows, nor is chattering or garrulity any more characteristic of them than of jays or partridges or hens.

"Well then," said Sulla, "do they avoid the swallow because of the myth about the slaying of the child, going so far afield to set us against those emotions which led, in the story, to the unholy and cruel things that were done by or to Tereus and Procne and Philomela?[a] Even now people call these birds the 'ladies from Daulis.' Gorgias the sophist, when a swallow let fall a dropping on him, looked up at her and said, 'Watch your manners, Philomela!'[b] Or is this explanation also worthless? For they do not bar the nightingale or deport her as an alien, though she had her part in the same tragic events."

3. "Doubtless, Sulla," I said, "there is much in what you say. But consider the following points. Is the swallow perhaps in bad repute among the Pythagoreans for the same reason as the birds with hooked talons? She is a flesh-eater, and is especially prone to kill and feed on cicadas, sacred and musical insects.[c] Also, she flies close to the ground, hunting tiny, minute creatures, as Aristotle remarks.[d] Then she alone, of the creatures that share man's roof, lives and eats there without making a contribution or

his) in requital. Daulis is a city in Phocis, where Tereus lived.

[b] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 82 A 23.

[c] On the cicada see especially *Anacreontea*, 34 (L.C.L.), Steier in *RE*, *s.v.* "tettix."

[d] Frag. 353 Rose.

(727) διαιτᾶται· καίτοι ὅ γε πελαργὸς οὔτε σκέπης μετ-
ἔχων οὔτ' ἀλέας οὔτ' ἀδείας τινὸς ἢ βοηθείας παρ'
ἡμῖν ἐπίβαθρόν τι τῆς στέγης[1] δίδωσιν, τὰ γὰρ
ἐπίβουλα καὶ πολέμια τῶν ἀνθρώπων, φρύνους
καὶ ὄφεις, ἀναιρεῖ περιιών· ἡ δὲ πάντων τυχοῦσα
τούτων, ὅταν ἐκθρέψῃ καὶ τελειώσῃ τοὺς νεοσσούς,
728 ἄπεισιν ἀχάριστος γενομένη καὶ ἄπιστος.[2] ὃ δὲ
δεινότατόν ἐστι, μόνα τῶν συνοίκων μυῖα καὶ
χελιδὼν οὐχ ἡμεροῦται πρὸς ἄνθρωπον οὐδ' ἀν-
έχεται ψαῦσιν οὐδ' ὁμιλίαν οὐδὲ κοινωνίαν ἔργου
τινὸς ἢ παιδιᾶς, ἡ μὲν μυῖα φοβουμένη τῷ πάσχειν
κακῶς καὶ διασοβεῖσθαι πολλάκις, ἡ δὲ χελιδὼν τῷ
φύσει μισάνθρωπος εἶναι καὶ δι' ἀπιστίαν ἀτιθάσευ-
τος ἀεὶ καὶ ὕποπτος· εἴπερ οὖν δεῖ τὰ τοιαῦτα μὴ
κατ' εὐθυωρίαν ἀλλ' ἀνακλάσαντας ὥσπερ ἐμφάσεις
ἑτέρων ἐν ἑτέροις θεωρεῖν, παράδειγμα τὰς χελι-
δόνας τοῦ ἀβεβαίου καὶ ἀχαρίστου θέμενος οὐκ ἐᾷ
τοὺς ἕνεκα καιροῦ προσφερομένους καὶ ὑποδυο-
B μένους ποιεῖσθαι συνήθεις ἐπὶ πλέον, ἑστίας καὶ
οἴκου καὶ τῶν ἁγιωτάτων μεταδιδόντας."

4. Ταῦτ' εἰπὼν ἐγώ μοι δοκῶ ποιῆσαι λόγων
ἄδειαν· εὐθαρσῶς γὰρ ἤδη τοῖς ἄλλοις συμβόλοις
προσῆγον, ἠθικὰς ἐπιεικῶς ποιούμενοι τὰς λύσεις
αὐτῶν. τῆς μὲν γὰρ χύτρας τὸν τύπον ἔφη Φιλῖνος
ἀφανίζειν αὐτοὺς διδάσκοντας ὅτι δεῖ μηδὲν ὀργῆς
ἔνδηλον ἀπολείπειν ἴχνος, ἀλλ' ὅταν ἀναζέσασα

[1] στέγης Reiske : γῆς T : διαίτης Paton.
[2] ἄπιστος Turnebus : ἄπυστος.





paying a share. Yet the stork, which receives neither shelter nor warmth nor any security or help from us, pays a rent for his roof-top perch, by making the rounds and killing toads and snakes, which are treacherous and hostile to man, while the swallow, though she does get all these benefits, is gone as soon as she has hatched and raised her young, like the suspicious ingrate that she is. But the most telling point is that of all creatures that share man's dwelling, the fly and the swallow alone cannot be domesticated. They will not let themselves be touched, or allow any companionship, or share in any task or recreation. Flies are timid because they are harshly treated and constantly shooed away ; but the swallow is shy because of inborn misanthropy and because, not trusting us, she is always untamable and suspicious. Now if the proper method, in studying this kind of subject-matter, is not simply to seek a direct answer, but to note reflections, as it were, of one thing in another, then the intention of Pytha goras, in making the swallow an example of fickleness and thanklessness, was to forbid us, when persons come to us and take shelter because of some emer gency, to make them our close associates for any longer period than is necessary, or allow them to share in the hearth and the household or our most sacred concerns."

4. My words seem to have amounted to a removal of inhibitions for the rest, for now they confidently attacked the other " signs," proposing explanations that were mainly ethical. For example, Philinus said that the Pythagoreans obliterate the mark of a pot from the ashes as a lesson that we must let no obvious trace of anger remain. Rather, once the boiling over

(728) παύσηται καὶ καταστῇ, πᾶσαν ἐξαληλίφθαι μνησικακίαν.

Ἡ δὲ τῶν στρωμάτων συντάραξις ἐνίοις μὲν ἐδόκει μηθὲν ἔχειν ἀποκεκρυμμένον, ἀλλ' αὐτόθεν φαίνεσθαι τὸ μὴ πρέπον, ἀνδρὶ συγκεκοιμημένης γαμετῆς χώραν ὁρᾶσθαι καὶ τύπον ὥσπερ ἐκμαγεῖον
C ἀπολειπόμενον.

Ὁ δὲ Σύλλας μᾶλλον εἴκαζε κοιμήσεως μεθημερινῆς ἀποτροπὴν εἶναι τὸ σύμβολον, ἀναιρουμένης ἔωθεν εὐθὺς τῆς πρὸς τὸν ὕπνον παρασκευῆς· ὡς νυκτὸς ἀναπαύεσθαι δεῖν, ἡμέρας δὲ πράττειν ἀναστάντας καὶ μὴ περιορᾶν οἷον ἴχνος σώματος[1]· οὐδὲν γὰρ ἀνδρὸς ὄφελος καθεύδοντος, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ τεθνηκότος. τούτοις δὲ συμμαρτυρεῖν ἐδόκει καὶ τὸ παρεγγυᾶν τοὺς Πυθαγορικοὺς τοῖς ἑταίροις μηδενὸς ἀφαιρεῖν βάρος, συνεπιτιθέναι δὲ καὶ συνεπιφορτίζειν, ὡς μηδεμίαν σχολὴν μηδὲ ῥᾳστώνην ἀποδεχομένους.

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Η

*Διὰ τί μάλιστα οἱ Πυθαγορικοὶ ἐμψύχων τοὺς ἰχθῦς παρῃτοῦντο;*

Collocuntur Empedocles, Lucius, Theo, Sulla, Plutarchus, Nestor

1. Ἐπεὶ δὲ τούτων λεγομένων ὁ Λεύκιος οὔτε
D ψέγων οὔτ' ἐπαινῶν, ἀλλ' ἡσυχίαν ἄγων, σιγῇ δὲ καὶ καθ' ἑαυτὸν ὁρῶν ἤκουεν, ὀνομαστὶ καλέσας τὸν Σύλλαν ὁ Ἐμπεδοκλῆς, "Λεύκιος," εἶπεν, "ὁ ἑταῖρος εἰ μὲν ἄχθεται τοῖς λεγομένοις, ὥρα πεπαῦσθαι καὶ ἡμᾶς· εἰ δὲ ταῦτα τῶν ὑπὸ τὴν ἐχεμυθίαν

[1] κώματος Sandbach.

[a] Only named here.





is ended and there is peace, all remembrance of evil must be erased from the mind.

The shaking up of the bedclothes seemed to some to have no hidden meaning ; they thought there was impropriety in the very fact, when a man's wife had slept with him, of the place being seen, marked as with a seal-impression.

Sulla thought it more likely that the precept was intended to discourage daytime napping, sleeping equipment being removed the first thing in the morning. One should rest at night and in the daytime get up and be active, without neglecting to remove every trace of a dead body. You might as well say dead, for a man asleep is no more use than a dead man. He thought there was additional evidence for this interpretation in the fact that the Pythagoreans recommend to their comrades not to relieve anyone of a load but to help add to his burden and increase the load, thus showing their disapproval of all slacking and indolence.

## QUESTION 8

Why the Pythagoreans used to abstain from fish more strictly than from any other living creature.

Speakers : Empedocles, Lucius, Theon, Sulla, Plutarch, Nestor

1. Since, during this discussion, Lucius listened without a word of approval or disapproval, but held his peace and quietly kept his eyes to himself, Empedocles [a] said, addressing himself to Sulla, " If our friend Lucius finds the conversation disagreeable, the time has come for us too to have done with it. But though these may be among the topics that lie under

(728) ἐστίν, ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνό γε δοκῶ μήτ' ἄρρητον εἶναι μήτ' ἀνέξοιστον πρὸς ἑτέρους, ὅτι δὴ μάλιστα τῶν ἰχθύων ἀπείχοντο· καὶ γὰρ ἱστορεῖται τοῦτο περὶ τῶν παλαιῶν Πυθαγορικῶν, καὶ τοῦ καθ' ἡμᾶς Ἀλεξικράτους ἐνέτυχον μαθηταῖς ἄλλα μὲν ἔμψυχ'[1]
E ἔστιν ὅτε μετρίως προσφερομένοις καὶ νὴ Δία θύουσιν, ἰχθύος δὲ μὴ γεύσασθαι τὸ παράπαν ὑπομένουσιν. ἦν δὲ Τυνδάρης ὁ Λακεδαιμόνιος αἰτίαν ἔλεγεν, οὐκ ἀποδέχομαι.[2] ἔλεγε δὲ τῆς ἐχεμυθίας τοῦτο γέρας εἶναι καὶ[3] τοὺς ἰχθῦς καλεῖν ἔλλοπας[4] οἷον ἰλλομένην τὴν ὄπα καὶ καθειργομένην ἔχοντας· καὶ τὸν ὁμώνυμον ἐμοὶ τῷ Παυσανίᾳ[5] Πυθαγορικῶς παραινεῖν[6] τὰ δόγματα ' στεγάσαι φρενὸς ἔλλοπος
F εἴσω,'[7] καὶ ὅλως θεῖον ἡγεῖσθαι τὴν σιωπὴν τοὺς ἄνδρας, ἅτε δὴ καὶ τῶν θεῶν ἔργοις καὶ πράγμασιν ἄνευ φωνῆς ἐπιδεικνυμένων ἃ βούλονται τοῖς ξυνετοῖς."

2. Τοῦ δὲ Λευκίου πράως καὶ ἀφελῶς εἰπόντος, ὡς ὁ μὲν ἀληθὴς ἴσως λόγος καὶ νῦν ἀπόθετος καὶ ἀπόρρητος εἴη, τοῦ δὲ πιθανοῦ καὶ εἰκότος οὐ φθόνος ἀποπειρᾶσθαι, πρῶτος Θέων ὁ γραμματικὸς

[1] ἔμψυχ' added by Hubert (*cf.* Athen. vii. 308 b).
[2] ἔλεγεν, οὐκ ἀποδέχομαι supplied by Reiske, Bernardakis.
[3] καὶ added by Wyttenbach.
[4] ἔλλοπας added by Xylander.
[5] Παυσανίᾳ Diels : παυσαμένωι.
[6] παραινεῖν Wyttenbach : περαίνειν.
[7] Diels, after Wyttenbach : στεγούσαι φρενὸς ἀλλ' ὅπερ ἐλάσσω.

[a] At *Mor.* 670 D, Plutarch makes another speaker say that, of sea-creatures, the Pythagoreans abstained especially





the ban of silence, I do not suppose that the fact is secret or esoteric that they used to abstain especially from fish.[a] Not only is this reported of the ancient Pythagoreans, but I have also met pupils of Alexicrates, our contemporary, who sometimes used the flesh of other living creatures in moderation, and even offered it in sacrifice, but who could not bear to taste fish at all. The reason advanced by the Lacedaemonian Tyndares [b] I cannot accept, that this abstention is out of regard for their silence, and that they call fish *ellops* (' silent ') [c] because they keep their mouths shut and under restraint. He said it was in accordance with the Pythagorean rule that my namesake exhorted Pausanias to ' hide within a silent (*ellops*) mind ' his doctrines,[d] and that in general the early Pythagoreans considered silence a godlike thing, since even the gods reveal their wishes, to those who can understand them, by acts and deeds without speech."

2. Lucius said, quietly and simply, that while the true reason is doubtless now as before secret and incommunicable, no one would mind our seeing what plausible or probable answer we could find. Theon, the professor of literature, was the first speaker, and

from the anemone and the red mullet. On food-taboos and vegetarianism in general see Porphyry, *De Abstinentia*; Haussleiter, *Der Vegetarismus in der Antike* (Berlin, 1935); Delatte, " Faba Pythagorae Cognata," *Serta Leodiensia* (Liège, 1930), pp. 33-57.

[b] See note to 717 E.

[c] ἔλλοψ probably meant " scaly " (*cf.* λέπας), but Plutarch and others thought it meant " mute " ; it is derived here from the roots ἰλ-, " shut," and ὀπ-, " voice." *Cf.* also Athenaeus, vii. 308 b-d.

[d] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 31 B 5. (Empedocles' poem was addressed to his friend Pausanias.)

(728) εἶπεν, ὅτι Τυρρηνὸν μὲν ἀποδεῖξαι Πυθαγόραν μέγ'
729 ἔργον εἴη καὶ οὐ ῥᾴδιον· " Αἰγυπτίων δὲ τοῖς σοφοῖς
συγγενέσθαι πολὺν χρόνον ὁμολογεῖται ζηλῶσαί τε
πολλὰ καὶ δοκιμάσαι μάλιστα τῶν περὶ τὰς ἱερατι-
κὰς ἁγιστείας, οἷόν ἐστι καὶ τὸ τῶν κυάμων· οὔτε
γὰρ σπείρειν οὔτε σιτεῖσθαι κύαμον Αἰγυπτίους,
ἀλλ' οὐδ' ὁρῶντας ἀνέχεσθαί φησιν ὁ Ἡρόδοτος.
ἰχθύων δὲ[1] τοὺς ἱερεῖς ἴσμεν ἔτι νῦν ἀπεχομένους·
ἁγνεύοντες δὲ καὶ τὸν ἅλα φεύγουσιν, ὡς μήτ' ὄψον
προσφέρεσθαι μήτ' ἄρτον[2] ἁλσὶ θαλαττίοις μεμιγ-
μένον. ἄλλοι μὲν οὖν ἄλλας αἰτίας φέρουσιν· ἔστι
δ' ἀληθὴς μία, τὸ πρὸς τὴν θάλατταν ἔχθος ὡς
B ἀσύμφυλον ἡμῖν καὶ ἀλλότριον μᾶλλον δ' ὅλως
πολέμιον τῇ φύσει τοῦ ἀνθρώπου στοιχεῖον. οὐ
γὰρ τρέφεσθαι τοὺς θεοὺς ἀπ' αὐτῆς, ὥσπερ οἱ
Στωικοὶ τοὺς ἀστέρας, ὑπολαμβάνουσιν, ἀλλὰ
τοὐναντίον εἰς ταύτην ἀπόλλυσθαι τὸν πατέρα καὶ
σωτῆρα τῆς χώρας, ὃν Ὀσίριδος ἀπορροὴν ὀνομά-
ζουσιν· καὶ θρηνοῦντες τὸν ἐν τοῖς ἀριστεροῖς μέρεσι
γεννώμενον ἐν δὲ τοῖς δεξιοῖς φθειρόμενον αἰνίτ-
τονται τὴν τοῦ Νείλου τελευτὴν καὶ φθορὰν ἐν τῇ
θαλάττῃ γινομένην. ὅθεν οὔτε τὸ ὕδωρ πότιμον
αὐτῆς οὔθ' ὧν τρέφει τι καὶ γεννᾷ καθαρὸν ἡγοῦνται
καὶ οἰκεῖον, οἷς μήτε πνεύματος κοινοῦ μήτε συμ-
C φύλου νομῆς μέτεστιν, ἀλλ' ὁ σῴζων πάντα τἄλλα

[1] δὲ Hubert: δὲ καί. [2] ἄρτον added by Hubert.

[a] Herodotus, ii. 37.





remarked that it is a considerable task, and not an easy one, to prove that Pythagoras was an Etruscan. " But it is fully agreed that he associated for a long while with the wise men of Egypt, and that he emulated them in many ways and considered them to be of very great authority in matters of priestly ritual. An example is abstention from beans; Herodotus[a] says that the Egyptians neither plant nor eat beans, and cannot even bear to look at them; and we know that even now the priests abstain from fish. They also consider it a religious duty to avoid salt, so that neither cooked food nor bread seasoned with salt from the sea is served.[b] Various reasons are given for this, but only one is true: their hatred for the sea as an element unrelated and alien, or rather completely hostile to man by nature. They do not believe that the gods are nourished by it, as the Stoics suppose the stars are,[c] but on the contrary, that the father and saviour of their country, whom they call an emanation of Osiris, perishes in it.[d] When they mourn for him who is brought forth on the left and perishes on the right, they are referring cryptically to the death and destruction of the Nile in the sea.[e] Hence they neither consider sea-water potable, nor any of the creatures it nourishes as ritually pure or edible, since they do not partake of air in common with us nor live in our congenial habitat. No, the air which preserves and nourishes everything else is

[b] On the Egyptians and salt *cf. Mor.* 352 F, 363 E, and *supra*, Book V, Question 10.

[c] *Cf.* von Arnim, *S.V.F.* i. 121 (the sun), ii. 690 (the stars nourished by exhalation from the earth).

[d] The Nile is an emanation (" effusion," " outpouring ") of Osiris: Plutarch, *De Iside et Osiride*, xxxvi. 365 B and the passages cited there.

[e] *Ibid.* xxxii. 363 E.

(729) καὶ τρέφων ἀὴρ ἐκείνοις ὀλέθριός ἐστιν, ὡς παρὰ φύσιν καὶ χρείαν γεγονόσι καὶ ζῶσιν. οὐ δεῖ δὲ θαυμάζειν, εἰ τὰ ζῷα διὰ τὴν θάλατταν ἀλλότρια καὶ οὐκ ἐπιτήδεια καταμίγνυσθαι εἰς αἷμα καὶ πνεῦμα νομίζουσιν αὐτῶν, οἵ γε μηδὲ τοὺς κυβερνήτας ἀξιοῦσι προσαγορεύειν ἀπαντῶντες, ὅτι τὸν βίον ἀπὸ θαλάττης ἔχουσιν."

3. Ταῦτ' ἐπαινέσας ὁ Σύλλας προσεῖπε περὶ τῶν Πυθαγορικῶν, ὡς μάλιστα μὲν ἐγεύοντο τῶν ἱεροθύτων ἀπαρξάμενοι τοῖς θεοῖς, ἰχθύων δὲ θύσιμος οὐδεὶς οὐδ' ἱερεύσιμός ἐστιν.

D Ἐγὼ δέ, παυσαμένων ἐκείνων, Αἰγυπτίοις μὲν ἔφην ὑπὲρ τῆς θαλάττης πολλοὺς μαχεῖσθαι καὶ φιλοσόφους καὶ ἰδιώτας, ἐκλογιζομένους ὅσοις ἀγαθοῖς εὐπορώτερον καὶ ἡδίω τὸν βίον ἡμῶν πεποίηκεν. "ἡ δὲ τῶν Πυθαγορικῶν πρὸς τὸν ἰχθῦν ἐκεχειρία διὰ τὸ μὴ σύμφυλον ἄτοπος καὶ γελοία, μᾶλλον δ' ἀνήμερος ὅλως καὶ Κυκλώπειόν τι τοῖς ἄλλοις γέρας νέμουσα τῆς συγγενείας καὶ τῆς οἰκειότητος, ὀψοποιουμένοις καὶ ἀναλισκομένοις ὑπ' αὐτῶν. καίτοι βόλον ἰχθύων πρίασθαί ποτέ φασι τὸν Πυθαγόραν, εἶτ' ἀφεῖναι κελεῦσαι τὴν σαγήνην, οὐχ ὡς ἀλλοφύλων καὶ πολεμίων ἀμελήσαντα τῶν
E ἰχθύων ἀλλ' ὡς ὑπὲρ φίλων καὶ οἰκείων γεγονότων αἰχμαλώτων λύτρα καταβάλλοντα. διὸ τοὐναντίον," ἔφην, "ὑπονοεῖν τῶν ἀνδρῶν ἡ ἐπιείκεια καὶ πρα-

[a] For similar ideas *cf. supra*, Book IV, Question 4 "Whether the sea provides better food than the land."

[b] *Cf. Mor.* 363 E.

[c] The Cyclops promised Odysseus: "No-man I shall eat:





fatal to them, since they are born and live contrary to nature and propriety.[a] It is not surprising if the Egyptians think that sea-creatures are because of the sea foreign to them and unfit to be compounded with their blood and breath—a people who will not even greet sea-captains when they meet them, because they make a living from the sea." [b]

3. Agreeing with this, Sulla added, concerning the Pythagoreans, that if they tasted flesh it was most often that of sacrificial animals, and after a preliminary offering to the gods, but that no fish is fit for dedication or sacrifice.

When they had finished, I said that many people, both philosophers and laymen, would defend the sea against the Egyptians, by reckoning up the great contributions it has made to the ease and pleasure of human life. "The idea that the Pythagoreans maintain a truce with fish because fish are not related to us is grotesque and ridiculous, or rather completely savage. It bestows upon other creatures a Cyclopean gift [c] for their kinship and close relationship—that of being dressed and eaten! Yet they say that Pythagoras once bought a netful of fish and then ordered the net to be cast off. He was not indifferent to fish as being of another race or hostile, but paid a ransom for them as for friends and relatives who had been captured.[d] Therefore, to reverse your argument, the nobility and gentleness of those men makes me sus-

last, after his companions. . . . This shall be your gift." Homer, *Odyssey*, ix. 369 f.

[d] *Cf. Mor.* 91 c. In Porphyry, *Vita Pythag.* xxv, and Iamblichus, *Vita Pythag.* xxxvi, the release of the fish is related in connexion with Pythagoras' miraculous prediction of the number that would be found in a net being drawn in; no reason is given.

(729) ὁτης δίδωσιν, μήποτ' ἄρα μελέτης ἕνεκεν τοῦ δικαίου καὶ συνηθείας ἐφείδοντο μάλιστα τῶν ἐναλίων, ὡς τἆλλα μὲν αἰτίαν ἀμωσγέπως παρέχοντα τοῦ κακῶς πάσχειν τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ, τοὺς δ' ἰχθῦς οὐδὲν ἀδικοῦντας ἡμᾶς, οὐδ' εἰ πάνυ πεφύκασι δυνάμενοι.[1] πάρεστι δὲ τῶν τε λόγων καὶ τῶν ἱερῶν εἰκάζειν τοῖς παλαιοῖς, ὡς οὐ μόνον ἐδωδὴν ἀλλὰ καὶ φόνον ζῴου μὴ βλάπτοντος ἔργον ἐναF γὲς καὶ ἄθεσμον ἐποιοῦντο· πλήθει δ' ἐπιχεομένῳ καθειργόμενοι καὶ χρησμοῦ τινος, ὥς φασιν, ἐκ Δελφῶν ἐπικελευσαμένου τοῖς καρποῖς ἀρήγειν φθειρομένοις, ἤρξαντο μὲν καθιερεύειν· ἔτι δ' ὅμως ταραττόμενοι καὶ δειμαίνοντες 'ἔρδειν' μὲν ἐκάλουν καὶ 'ῥέζειν,'[2] ὥς τι μέγα δρῶντες τὸ θύειν ἔμψυχον, ἄχρι δὲ νῦν παραφυλάττουσιν ἰσχυρῶς τὸ μὴ σφάττειν πρὶν ἐπινεῦσαι κατασπενδόμενον. οὕτως εὐλαβεῖς πρὸς ἅπασαν ἀδικίαν ἦσαν. καίτοι,
730 ἵνα τἆλλ' ἐάσωμεν, εἰ μόνον ἀλεκτορίδων ἀπείχοντο πάντες ἢ δασυπόδων, οὐκ ἂν ἦν χρόνου βραχέος ὑπὸ πλήθους οὔτε πόλιν οἰκεῖν οὔτε καρπῶν ὄνασθαι· διὸ τῆς ἀνάγκης ἐπαγούσης τὸ πρῶτον, ἤδη καὶ δι' ἡδονὴν ἔργον ἐστὶν παῦσαι τὴν σαρκοφαγίαν. τὸ δὲ τῶν θαλαττίων γένος οὔτ' ἀέρα τὸν αὐτὸν οὔθ' ὕδωρ ἀναλίσκον ἡμῖν οὔτε καρποῖς προσιόν, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἑτέρῳ κόσμῳ περιεχόμενον καὶ χρώμενον ὅροις ἰδίοις, οὓς ὑπερβαίνουσιν αὐτοῖς ἐπίκειται δίκη ὁ θάνατος, οὔτε μικρὰν οὔτε μεγάλην τῇ γαστρὶ πρόφασιν κατ' αὐτῶν δίδωσιν· ἀλλὰ

[1] δυνάμενοι Hubert (after Xylander) : δυναμένους.
[2] ῥέζειν Xylander : ῥαίζειν.





pect that they were especially disposed to spare sea-creatures out of regard for justice and a common morality, with the thought that each of the rest in some way or other gives man an excuse to treat it badly, while fish do us no harm, no matter how capable they are of doing so. It is possible to conclude, both from the words and from the religious observances of the ancients, that they considered it an unholy and unlawful act not only to eat but even to kill a living being that did them no harm. But when they began to be crowded by their ever-increasing numbers, and an oracle from Delphi (as the story goes) bade them succour the fruits of the earth which were being destroyed, they began to make sacrifices. Yet they were still revolted and terrified by what they did and called it simply 'making' or 'doing.'[a] They considered it doing some great thing to sacrifice living animals, and even now people are very careful not to kill the animal till a drink-offering is poured over him and he shakes his head in assent. Such precaution they took to avoid any unjust act. Yet, leaving other considerations aside, if everyone should abstain from eating chickens alone, say, or hares, in a short time their number would make it impossible to maintain city life or to reap a harvest. Thus though necessity alone introduced the custom, the pleasures of life now also add to the difficulty of abolishing our carnivorous habits. The tribe of sea-creatures, however, provides our belly no pretext large or small for aggression against it ; it neither uses the same air or water as ourselves nor attacks our crops, but is surrounded as it were by another world, with boundaries of its own which cannot be transgressed except on penalty of death. It is very obvious that angling or

[a] *i.e.* making or doing sacrifice ; a common euphemism.

(730) παντὸς ἰχθύος ἄγρα καὶ σαγηνεία λαιμαργίας καὶ
B φιλοψίας περιφανῶς ἔργον ἐστίν, ἐπ' οὐδενὶ δικαίῳ
ταραττούσης τὰ πελάγη καὶ καταδυομένης εἰς τὸν
βυθόν. οὔτε γὰρ τρίγλαν ἔστιν δήπου 'ληιβότειραν' οὔτε σκάρον 'τρυγηφάγον' οὔτε κεστρεῖς τινας ἢ λάβρακας 'σπερμολόγους' προσειπεῖν, ὡς τὰ χερσαῖα κατηγοροῦντες ὀνομάζομεν· ἀλλ' οὐδ' ὅσα γαλῇ καὶ μυΐ[1] κατοικιδίῳ μικρολόγως ἐγκαλοῦμεν, ἔχοι τις ἂν αἰτιάσασθαι τὸν μέγιστον ἰχθῦν. ὅθεν ἀνείργοντες ἑαυτοὺς οὐ νόμῳ μόνον[2] τῆς πρὸς
C ἄνθρωπον ἀδικίας ἀλλὰ καὶ φύσει τῆς πρὸς ἅπαν τὸ μὴ βλάπτον, ἥκιστα τῶν ὄψων ἐχρῶντο τοῖς ἰχθύσιν ἢ τὸ παράπαν οὐκ ἐχρῶντο· καὶ γὰρ ἄνευ τῆς ἀδικίας ἀκρασίαν τινὰ καὶ λιχνείαν ἐμφαίνειν ἔοικεν ἡ περὶ ταῦτα πραγματεία πολυτελὴς οὖσα καὶ περίεργος. ὅθεν Ὅμηρος οὐ μόνον τοὺς Ἕλληνας ἰχθύων ἀπεχομένους πεποίηκε παρὰ τὸν Ἑλλήσποντον στρατοπεδεύοντας, ἀλλ' οὐδὲ τοῖς ἁβροβίοις Φαίαξιν οὐδὲ τοῖς ἀσώτοις μνηστῆρσιν, ἀμφοτέροις οὖσιν νησιώταις, θαλάττιον παρατέθεικεν ὄψον· οἱ δ' Ὀδυσσέως ἑταῖροι, τοσαύτην πλέοντες θάλατταν, οὐδαμοῦ καθῆκαν ἄγκιστρον οὐδὲ πόρκον οὐδὲ δίκτυον ἀλφίτων παρόντων·

ἀλλ' ὅτε δὴ νηὸς ἐξέφθιτο ἤια πάντα,

μικρὸν ἔμπροσθεν ἢ ταῖς τοῦ Ἡλίου βουσὶν ἐπιχει-
D ρεῖν, ἰχθῦς ἀγρεύοντες, οὐκ ὄψον ἀλλὰ τροφὴν

[1] μυΐ Reiske : μυίαι.
[2] μόνον Bernardakis : μόνῳ.





seining for any kind of fish is an act of gluttony and of gormandize, disturbing the waters and descending into the depths with no rightful excuse. Certainly no one can call the red mullet 'crop-devouring' or the parrot-wrasse 'grape-eater' or the grey mullet or sea-bass 'seed-stealing'—our reproachful epithets for land-animals.[a] Not even our niggardly complaints about the marten or the domestic mouse could be applied to a fish—even the largest of them. Therefore the Pythagoreans, restraining themselves, not only, according to positive law, from injustice toward man, but also according to natural law from harming anything harmless, used fish least of all foods, or made no use of it. In fact, even apart from the question of right, there must be some tinge of self-indulgence and high living in the whole industry or we should not invest such funds and display so much ingenuity in it. This is why Homer not only represented the Greeks as abstaining from fish, though their camp was on the shore of the Hellespont, but did not even set a fish-course before the soft-living Phaeacians or the dissolute suitors, though both groups were islanders. The companions of Odysseus, in so long a voyage, never let down a hook or a fish-trap or a net as long as they had flour;

But when all the stores were gone from out the ship,[b]

a little while before they laid hands on the cattle of the Sun, in order to provide themselves — not with a

[a] The first of these adjectives is applied by Homer to a wild sow (*Odyssey*, xviii. 29); the second, in a slightly different form, by Archilochus to an ass (frag. 97 Bergk, Edmonds, 102 Diehl); the third by Aristophanes to birds generally (*Birds*, 232, 579).
[b] *Odyssey*, xii. 329 ff.

(730) ἀναγκαίαν ἐποιοῦντο

γναμπτοῖς ἀγκίστροισιν· ἔτειρε δὲ γαστέρα λιμός,

ὑπὸ τῆς αὐτῆς ἀνάγκης ἰχθύσι τε χρωμένων καὶ τὰς τοῦ Ἡλίου βοῦς κατεσθιόντων. ὅθεν οὐ παρ' Αἰγυπτίοις μόνον οὐδὲ Σύροις, ἀλλὰ καὶ παρ' Ἕλλησι γέγονεν ἁγνείας μέρος ἀποχὴ ἰχθύων, μετὰ τοῦ δικαίου καὶ τὸ περίεργον οἶμαι τῆς βρώσεως ἀποδιοπομπουμένοις."

4. Ὑπολαβὼν δ' ὁ Νέστωρ, "τῶν δ' ἐμῶν," ἔφη, "πολιτῶν ὥσπερ Μεγαρέων οὐδεὶς λόγος; καίτοι πολλάκις ἀκήκοας ἐμοῦ λέγοντος, ὅτι οἱ ἐν Λέπτει[1] τοῦ Ποσειδῶνος ἱερεῖς, οὓς ἱερομνήμονας καλοῦμεν, ἰχθῦς οὐκ ἐσθίουσιν· ὁ γὰρ θεὸς λέγεται φυτάλμιος. E οἱ δ' ἀφ' Ἕλληνος τοῦ παλαιοῦ καὶ πατρογενείῳ Ποσειδῶνι θύουσιν, ἐκ τῆς ὑγρᾶς τὸν ἄνθρωπον οὐσίας φῦναι δόξαντες, ὡς καὶ Σύροι· διὸ καὶ σέβονται τὸν ἰχθῦν, ὡς ὁμογενῆ καὶ σύντροφον, ἐπιεικέστερον Ἀναξιμάνδρου φιλοσοφοῦντες· οὐ γὰρ ἐν τοῖς αὐτοῖς ἐκεῖνος ἰχθῦς καὶ ἀνθρώπους, ἀλλ' ἐν ἰχθύσιν ἐγγενέσθαι τὸ πρῶτον ἀνθρώπους ἀποφαίνεται καὶ τραφέντας ὥσπερ οἱ γαλεοὶ[2] καὶ γενομένους ἱκανοὺς ἑαυτοῖς βοηθεῖν ἐκβῆναι τηνικαῦτα καὶ γῆς λαβέσθαι. καθάπερ οὖν τὸ πῦρ τὴν ὕλην, ἐξ ἧς ἀνήφθη, μητέρα καὶ πατέρ' οὖσαν, F ἤσθιεν, ὡς ὁ τὸν Κήυκος γάμον εἰς τὰ Ἡσιόδου παρεμβαλὼν εἴρηκεν, οὕτως ὁ Ἀναξίμανδρος τῶν ἀνθρώπων πατέρα καὶ μητέρα κοινὸν ἀποφήνας τὸν ἰχθῦν διέβαλεν πρὸς τὴν βρῶσιν."

[1] οἱ ἐν Λέπτει Bernardakis : ἀεὶ οἱ.
[2] γαλεοὶ Emperius : παλαιοί.





dinner, but with sustenance—they caught fish

With curved hooks, for hunger gnawed our bellies.[a]

It was the same compulsion that forced them to use fish and to devour the cattle of the Sun. We can conclude that abstinence from fish has been an element of sanctity not only among Egyptians or Syrians, but among Greeks as well. The intention, I think, is to do what is right, but also to get rid of the complicated luxury involved in the consumption of fish."

4. Nestor [b] exclaimed, in reply, "Do you take no account of my countrymen, like the proverbial Megarians? Yet you have often heard me say that in Leptis the priests of Poseidon, whom we call 'remembrancers,' do not eat fish, for the god is called 'life-fostering.' Those descended from Hellen of old have also sacrificed to 'patriarchal Poseidon,' believing as the Syrians do that man developed from the moist element. So they also revere the fish, as being one with us in race and nurture, which is more reasonable as philosophy than Anaximander's theory.[c] He affirms, not that men and fish were developed in the same environment, but that men were first engendered and nourished inside fish, as dog-fishes are, and when they were mature enough to look out for themselves, at that point they came out and took to the land. As fire consumes its mother and father, the wood from which it is kindled (as remarked by the interpolator who inserted the *Marriage of Ceïx* [d] among the works of Hesiod), so Anaximander, by revealing the fish as the common father and mother of mankind, made it scandalous to eat them."

[a] *Odyssey*, xii. 332. [b] Not otherwise known.
[c] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 12 A 30.
[d] Hesiod, frag. 177 Rzach.

731

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Θ

Εἰ δυνατόν ἐστι συστῆναι νοσήματα καινὰ καὶ δι' ἃς αἰτίας

Collocuntur Philo, Plutarchus, Diogenianus, alii

1. Φίλων ὁ ἰατρὸς διεβεβαιοῦτο τὴν καλουμένην ἐλεφαντίασιν οὐ πρὸ πολλοῦ πάνυ χρόνου γνώριμον γεγονέναι· μηδένα γὰρ τῶν παλαιῶν ἰατρῶν τοῦ πάθους τούτου πεποιῆσθαι λόγον, εἰς ἕτερα μικρὰ καὶ γλίσχρα καὶ δυσθεώρητα τοῖς πολλοῖς ἐνταθέντας. ἐγὼ δὲ καὶ μάρτυν αὐτῷ παρεῖχον ἐκ φιλοσοφίας Ἀθηνόδωρον, ἐν τῷ προτέρῳ τῶν Ἐπιδημιῶν ἱστοροῦντα πρῶτον ἐν τοῖς κατ' Ἀσκλη-
B πιάδην χρόνοις οὐ μόνον τὴν ἐλεφαντίασιν ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸν ὑδροφόβαν ἐκφανῆ γενέσθαι. θαυμάζοντες οὖν οἱ παρόντες, εἰ νέα πάθη τότε πρῶτον ἔσχεν ἐν τῇ φύσει γένεσιν καὶ σύστασιν,[1] οὐχ ἧττον ᾠοντο θαυμάσιον εἶναι τὸ λαθεῖν τηλικαῦτα συμπτώματα χρόνον τοσοῦτον· ἐρρύησαν δέ πως μᾶλλον οἱ πλείους ἐπὶ τὸ δεύτερον ὡς ἀνθρώπινον μᾶλλον, ἥκιστα τὴν φύσιν ἔν γε τούτοις φιλόκαινον εἶναι καὶ νέων πραγμάτων ὥσπερ ἐν πόλει τῷ σώματι δημιουργὸν ἀξιοῦντες.

2. Ὁ δὲ Διογενιανὸς ἔφη καὶ τὰ τῆς ψυχῆς νοσήματα καὶ πάθη κοινήν τινα καὶ πάτριον ὁδὸν
C βαδίζειν. "καίτοι παντοδαπὸν μέν," εἶπεν, "ἡ μοχθηρία καὶ πολύτολμον, αὐτοκρατὲς δ' ἡ ψυχὴ

[1] σύστασιν Reiske : στάσιν.

[a] A resident of Hyampolis, who speaks on medical or botanical subjects also in ii. 6, iv. 1, and vi. 2.

[b] Not certainly identifiable. Wellmann assumes from this passage that he was a contemporary of Plutarch.





## QUESTION 9

Whether it is possible for new diseases to come into being, and from what causes.

Speakers : Philo, Plutarch, Diogenianus, and others

1. Philo, the physician,[a] was maintaining that the disease called elephantiasis had been known for only a short time, since none of the ancient physicians had written a treatise on it, though they expatiated on many others that were minute and petty and, to most, obscure. I supplied him with an additional witness from the field of philosophy in the person of Athenodorus,[b] who wrote, in the first book of his *Epidemics*, that both elephantiasis and hydrophobia first made their appearance in the time of Asclepiades.[c] Those present expressed surprise at the idea that new diseases first came into existence and took shape at that date ; but they thought it would be no less amazing if such striking symptoms had escaped notice for so long. The majority were rather inclined, however, toward the second hypothesis, because it rather placed the blame on mankind, for they regarded nature as not being at all given to innovation in such matters—nor likely to foment revolutions in man's body as if in some body politic.

2. Diogenianus added that even diseases and passions of the mind follow a common, traditional course. " Surely wickedness is a versatile and audacious thing, while the mind is self-governed and

[c] A Bithynian physician who practised in Rome in the first century B.C. There are citations of a work *On Elephantiasis*, in which hydrophobia was also mentioned, attributed to Democritus by some ancient writers, but by Diels-Kranz (*Frag. der Vorsok.*[8] 68 B 300. 10, ii. 216. 8 ff.) to Bolus of Mendê (third century B.C.).

(731) καὶ κύριον ὑφ' αὑτῆς, εἰ βούλοιτο, μεταβάλλειν καὶ τρέπεσθαι ῥᾳδίως· ἔχει δέ τινα τάξιν τὸ ἄτακτον αὐτῆς καὶ τὰ μέτρα τηρεῖ τοῖς πάθεσιν, ὥσπερ ἡ θάλαττα ταῖς ὑπερεκχύσεσι, καὶ καινὸν οὐδὲν οὐδὲ τοῖς παλαιοῖς ἀνιστόρητον ἐξήνθηκε κακίας εἶδος· ἀλλὰ πολλαὶ μὲν ἐπιθυμιῶν διαφοραί, μυρία δὲ κινήματα φόβου καὶ σχήματα, τὰς δὲ λύπης καὶ ἡδονῆς μορφὰς ἔργον ἐστὶ μὴ ἀπειπεῖν ἐξαριθμούμενον·

οὐ μήν[1] τι νῦν γε κἀχθές, ἀλλ' ἀεί ποτε
ζῇ ταῦτα, κοὐδεὶς οἶδεν ἐξ ὅτου 'φάνη·

πόθεν γε δὴ σώματι νόσημα καινὸν ἢ πάθος ὀψίγονον, ἰδίαν μὲν ὥσπερ ἡ ψυχὴ κινήσεως ἀρχὴν οἰκοθεν οὐκ ἔχοντι, συνημμένῳ δὲ κοιναῖς πρὸς τὴν φύσιν αἰτίαις καὶ κεκραμένῳ κρᾶσιν, ἧς καὶ τὸ ἀόριστον[2] ἐντὸς ὅρων πλανᾶται, καθάπερ πλοῖον ἐν περιδρόμῳ σαλεῦον; οὔτε γὰρ ἀναίτιος νόσου σύστασίς ἐστιν, τὴν ἐκ μὴ ὄντος παρανόμως ἐπεισάγουσα γένεσιν τοῖς πράγμασιν, αἰτίαν τε καινὴν ἔργον ἐξευρεῖν μὴ καινὸν ἀέρα καὶ ξένον ὕδωρ καὶ τροφὰς ἀγεύστους τοῖς πρότερον ἐξ ἑτέρων τινῶν κόσμων ἢ μετακοσμίων ἀποφήναντι δεῦρο νῦν πρῶτον ἐπιρρεούσας. ἐκ τούτων γὰρ νοσοῦμεν οἷς καὶ ζῶμεν, ἴδια δὲ σπέρματα νόσων οὐκ ἔστιν, ἀλλ' αἱ τούτων μοχθηρίαι πρὸς ἡμᾶς καὶ ἡμῶν περὶ ταῦτα πλημμέλειαι τὴν φύσιν ἐπιταράττουσιν. αἱ δὲ ταραχαὶ διαφορὰς ἀιδίους ἔχουσιν πολλάκις νέοις χρωμένας ὀνόμασιν· τὰ γὰρ ὀνόματα τῆς συνηθείας

[1] μήν: γάρ Sophocles. [2] ἀόριστον Xylander: ἄριστον.

[a] Sophocles, *Antigonê*, 456.





capable, on its own responsibility, if it will, of altering its course. Yet the mind's disorder preserves a certain order, and in its states of passion it observes a certain moderation, as the sea does in times of high water. No new kind of vice not mentioned by the ancients has broken out, though there are many different desires, and countless causes and forms of fear; and it is almost too hard to enumerate all the forms of pain and pleasure.

Their life is not of now and yesterday,
But always; no one knows when first they came.[a]

How indeed could the body develop a new malady, a late-born disease, when it does not have within it, like the soul, a source of motion of its own, but is linked with the rest of nature by the bond of common causes and is so tempered in its composition that even the play of its irregularity is held within limits, as if it were a ship tossing about its anchor? For there cannot be a new disease without a cause, introducing into the world, contrary to natural law, a coming-to-be from not-being; and to find a new cause for disease would be hard, unless one could demonstrate that a new kind of air, or a strange type of water, or foods never tasted by former generations, are flowing into our world from some other worlds, or from the spaces between them. For it is the things that sustain life which also cause sickness. There are no special seeds of disease; it is the disagreement of our food and drink with us or our mistakes in using them that upsets our system. Such disturbances have different forms which are lasting, though new names are often employed, because the names are a matter of usage, while the diseases are part of the order of

(731) ἐστὶν τὰ δὲ πάθη τῆς φύσεως· ὅθεν ἐν ἀφωρισμένοις τούτοις ἐκεῖνα ποικιλλόμενα τὴν ἀπάτην πεποίηκεν· ὡς δὲ τοῖς τοῦ λόγου μορίοις καὶ ταῖς πρὸς ἄλληλα τούτων συντάξεσι καινὸν ἐγγενέσθαι βαρβαρισμὸν ἢ σολοικισμὸν ἐξαίφνης ἀδύνατόν[1] ἐστιν, οὕτως αἱ τοῦ σώματος κράσεις ὡρισμένας ἔχουσι τὰς ὀλισθήσεις καὶ παραβάσεις, τρόπον τινὰ τῇ φύσει καὶ τῶν παρὰ φύσιν ἐμπεριεχομένων.

F "Ταύτῃ γε κομψοὶ καὶ οἱ μυθογράφοι· τὰ γὰρ παντάπασιν ἔκφυλα καὶ τεράστια τῶν ζῴων γενέσθαι λέγουσιν ἐν τῇ γιγαντομαχίᾳ, τῆς σελήνης ἐκτρεπομένης καὶ τὰς ἀνατολὰς οὐχ ὅθεν εἴωθεν ποιουμένης· οἱ δὲ καινὰ νοσήματα τὴν φύσιν ὥσπερ
732 τέρατα γεννᾶν ἀξιοῦσιν, μήτε πιθανὴν μήτ' ἀπίθανον αἰτίαν τῆς ἐξαλλαγῆς πλάσσοντες, ἀλλὰ τὸ ἄγαν καὶ τὸ μᾶλλον ἐνίων παθῶν καινότητα καὶ διαφορὰν ἀποφαίνοντες· οὐκ ὀρθῶς, ὦ μακάριε Φίλων· ἐπίτασις γὰρ καὶ αὔξησις μέγεθος ἢ πλῆθος προστίθησι, τοῦ δὲ γένους οὐκ[2] ἐκβιβάζει τὸ ὑποκείμενον· ὥσπερ οὐδὲ τὴν ἐλεφαντίασιν οἶομαι, σφοδρότητα τῶν ψωρικῶν τινος τούτων οὖσαν, οὐδὲ τὸν ὑδροφόβαν τῶν στομαχικῶν ἢ μελαγχολικῶν. καίτοι τοῦτό γε θαυμαστὸν εἰ μηδ' Ὅμηρος ἀγνοῶν ἐλάνθανεν ὑμᾶς· τὸν γὰρ 'λυσσητῆρα κύνα' δῆλός ἐστιν ἀπὸ τοῦ πάθους τούτου προσ-
B αγορεύων, ἀφ' οὗ καὶ ἄνθρωποι λυσσᾶν λέγονται."

3. Ταῦτα τοῦ Διογενιανοῦ διελθόντος, ὁ Φίλων αὐτός τε μέτρια διελέχθη πρὸς τὸν λόγον αὐτοῦ,

[1] ἀδύνατόν Meziriacus : δυνατόν.
[2] οὐκ added by Xylander.

[a] A barbarism involves the misuse of a single word, a solecism an ungrammatical combination of words.





nature. Thus, among the restricted number of diseases, the variety of their names is a source of confusion. But just as, given the parts of speech and the rules of syntax, it is impossible that a new kind of barbarism or solecism [a] should suddenly arise, so the combinations of bodily elements are subject to a restricted number of dislocations and malfunctions. In a way, even unnatural conditions are within the frame of nature.

"The mythographers are experts, too, in this field at least; their account puts the birth of completely unnatural and monstrous creatures at the time of the battle of the gods and giants, when the moon turned from its course and did not rise in the same quarter as usual. But our friends here are accusing nature of producing new diseases as though giving birth to monsters, without devising any sort of reason for such a change, either plausible or implausible, but calling an excessive or unusual degree of certain affections a new and distinct kind. This is not logical, my dear Philo, for an intensification or increase adds size or number, but does not force the thing concerned into another class. I do not think this is true of elephantiasis either, which is an extreme form of some skin disease, or of hydrophobia, which is an extreme form of some stomach trouble or melancholy. What is more, it is surprising we have not noticed that Homer himself was acquainted with hydrophobia. It is clear that when he used the term 'rabid dog,' [b] he took the epithet from this malady, from which the term 'rabid' is applied to human beings too."

3. When Diogenianus had finished, Philo made a fitting reply to his argument, and called upon me to

[b] Teucer so refers to Hector, *Iliad*, viii. 299.

(732) κἀμὲ συνειπεῖν παρεκάλει τοῖς ἀρχαίοις ἰατροῖς, ὡς ἀμελείας ἢ ἀγνοίας τῶν μεγίστων ὀφλισκάνουσιν, εἴ γε μὴ[1] ταῦτα τὰ πάθη νεώτερα φαίνεται τῆς ἐκείνων ἡλικίας.

Πρῶτον οὖν ὁ Διογενιανὸς οὐκ ὀρθῶς ἀξιοῦν ἔδοξεν ἡμῖν τὰς ἐπιτάσεις καὶ ἀνέσεις μὴ ποιεῖν διαφορὰς μηδὲ τοῦ γένους ἐκβιβάζειν· οὕτω γὰρ οὔτ' ὄξος ὀξίνου φήσομεν διαφέρειν οὔτε πικρότητα στρυφνότητος οὔτε πυρῶν αἶραν οὔτε μίνθον ἡδυόσμων. καίτοι περιφανῶς ἐκστάσεις αὗται καὶ μεταβολαὶ ποιοτήτων εἰσίν, αἱ μὲν ἀνέσεις μαραι-
C νομένων αἱ δ' ἐπιτάσεις σφοδρυνομένων· ἢ μηδὲ φλόγα πνεύματος λεπτοῦ μηδὲ φλογὸς αὐγὴν μηδὲ πάχνην δρόσου μηδὲ χάλαζαν ὄμβρου διαφέρειν λέγωμεν, ἀλλ' ἐπιτάσεις εἶναι ταῦτα πάντα καὶ σφοδρότητας· ὥρα δὲ καὶ τυφλότητα μηθὲν ἀμβλυωπίας φάναι διαφέρειν μηδὲ ναυτίας χολέραν, ἀλλὰ τῷ μᾶλλον καὶ ἧττον παραλλάττειν. καίτοι ταῦτα πρὸς λόγον οὐθέν ἐστιν· ἂν[2] γὰρ αὐτὴν λέγωσι δεξάμενοι τὴν ἐπίτασιν καὶ τὴν σφοδρότητα νῦν γεγονέναι πρῶτον, ἐν τῷ ποσῷ γινομένης τῆς
D καινότητος οὐκ ἐν ποιῷ, μένει τὸ παράδοξον ὁμοίως.

Ἔπειτα τοῦ Σοφοκλέους ἐπὶ τῶν ὅτι μὴ πρότερον ἦν ἀπιστουμένων, εἰ γέγονεν νῦν, οὐ φαύλως εἰπόντος

ἅπαντα τἀγένητα πρῶτον ἦλθ'[3] ἅπαξ,

[1] μὴ Turnebus : δὴ.
[2] ἐστιν· ἂν Basel edition : ἐστιᾶν.
[3] τἀγένητα . . . ἦλθ' Valckenaer, Ellendt : τὰ γένη τοῦ . . . ἦλθεν.

[a] Frag. 776 Nauck.





help in defending the ancient physicians, since, if these diseases were not found to be more recent than their time, they must be convicted either of negligence or of ignorance of important facts.

In the first place, we thought Diogenianus was wrong in supposing that intensifications and relaxations do not produce distinct kinds and do not force anything into another class. If this were so, we should say that there was no difference between vinegar and sour wine, or bitter and astringent, or wheat and darnel, or between one kind of mint and another. Yet all of these are very clearly qualitative losses of identity and transformations. In some cases, where there is a lowering of intensity, it consists in a weakening of the quality, and in others, where there is an increase in tension, in a strengthening of the quality. Or shall we say, too, that flame is no different from refined air, or a radiance from a flame, or frost from dew, or hail from rain, but that these are all increases of tension and strength ? And now comes the moment to say that blindness is no different from poor eyesight, nor cholera from nausea —that they are only cases of modification by more or less. Still, this is all unnecessary to our argument ; for if our adversaries concede that the intensification and the strengthening itself has now come into existence for the first time, and that the novelty is in the category of quantity, not in that of quality, the paradox remains as before.

Secondly, in line with Sophocles' apt remark about things not believed because they did not occur before, though they have occurred now—

Naught unexampled
But makes its first appearance once—[a]

(732) ἐδόκει καὶ λόγον ἔχειν τὸ μὴ δρόμῳ, καθάπερ ὕσπληγος μιᾶς πεσούσης, ἐκδραμεῖν[1] τὰ πάθη πρὸς τὴν γένεσιν, ἄλλων δ' ἄλλοις ἀεὶ κατόπιν ἐπιγινομένων ἕκαστον ἐν χρόνῳ τινὶ λαβεῖν τὴν πρώτην γένεσιν.

" Εἰκάσαι δ' ἄν τις," ἔφην ἐγώ, " τὰ μὲν ἀπ' ἐνδείας ὅσα τε καῦμα προσπῖπτον ἢ ψῦχος ἐμποιεῖ, ταῦτα πρῶτον τοῖς σώμασι παραγενέσθαι, πλησ-
E μονὰς δὲ καὶ θρύψεις καὶ ἡδυπαθείας ὕστερον ἐπελθεῖν μετ' ἀργίας καὶ σχολῆς δι' ἀφθονίαν τῶν ἀναγκαίων πολὺ περίττωμα ποιούσας καὶ πονηρόν, ἐν ᾧ ποικίλα νοσημάτων εἴδη παντοδαπάς τε τούτων ἐπιπλοκὰς πρὸς ἀλλήλας καὶ μίξεις ἀεί τι νεωτερίζειν.

" Τὸ μὲν γὰρ κατὰ φύσιν τέτακται καὶ διώρισται, τάξις γὰρ ἢ τάξεως ἔργον ἡ φύσις· ἡ δ' ἀταξία καθάπερ ἡ Πινδαρικὴ ψάμμος ' ἀριθμὸν περιπέφευγεν,' καὶ τὸ παρὰ τὴν φύσιν εὐθὺς ἀόριστον καὶ ἄπειρόν ἐστιν. ἀληθεύειν μὲν γὰρ ἁπλῶς ψεύδεσθαι δ' ἀπειραχῶς παρέχει τὰ πράγματα· καὶ ῥυθμοὶ καὶ ἁρμονίαι λόγους ἔχουσιν, ἃ δὲ πλημμελοῦσιν ἄν-
F θρωποι περὶ λύραν καὶ ᾠδὴν καὶ ὄρχησιν, οὐκ ἄν τις περιλάβοι. καίτοι καὶ Φρύνιχος ὁ τῶν τραγῳδιῶν ποιητὴς περὶ αὑτοῦ φησιν ὅτι

σχήματα δ' ὄρχησις τόσα μοι πόρεν, ὅσσ' ἐνὶ πόντῳ
κύματα ποιεῖται χείματι νὺξ ὀλοή.

" Καὶ Χρύσιππος τὰς ἐκ δέκα μόνων ἀξιωμάτων συμπλοκὰς πλήθει φησὶν ἑκατὸν μυριάδας





we considered it probable that diseases did not rush into existence in a racing start, at the drop of one barrier, as it were, but that they kept arriving one after another, so that each individually, after an interval, came into being for the first time.

" One might conjecture," I said, " that those which come as a result of a deficiency, and those which heat and cold produce, would assail the body first, and that those arising from surfeit and luxuries and over-indulgence would appear later, along with idleness and leisure, which come when primary wants are well provided for. The superfluities accumulate a vicious residue in the body and that is a breeding-ground for a medley of new diseases with ever new mutual complications and combinations.

" That which is according to nature is ordered and delimited, for nature is, precisely, order or else the handiwork of order, while disorder, like Pindar's sand, ' has eluded number,' [a] and what is contrary to nature is simply what is unbounded and unlimited. The facts allow just one true statement, but an infinite number of false ones. Both rhythm and pitch go by formula, but no one could include in a formula the mistakes people make in playing the lyre or singing or dancing. And in fact Phrynichus [b] the tragic poet says of himself,

> As many figures Dance gives me as baleful night
> Makes waves upon a stormy sea.

" Chrysippus says that the number of compound propositions that can be made from only ten simple

[a] *Ol.* ii. 179.
[b] Frag. 3 Bergk.

[1] ἐκδραμεῖν Basel edition : ἐκδρομὴν.

(732) ὑπερβάλλειν· ἀλλὰ τοῦτο μὲν ἤλεγξεν Ἵππαρχος, ἀποδείξας ὅτι τὸ μὲν καταφατικὸν περιέχει συμπεπλεγμένων μυριάδας δέκα καὶ πρὸς ταύταις τρισχίλια[1] τεσσαράκοντ' ἐννέα, τὸ δ' ἀποφατικὸν αὐτοῦ
733 μυριάδας τριάκοντα μίαν καὶ πρὸς ταύταις ἐνακόσια πεντήκοντα δύο· Ξενοκράτης δὲ τὸν τῶν συλλαβῶν ἀριθμόν, ὃν τὰ στοιχεῖα μιγνύμενα πρὸς ἄλληλα παρέχει, μυριάδων ἀπέφηνεν εἰκοσάκις καὶ μυριάκις μυρίων. τί δὴ θαυμαστόν ἐστιν εἰ, τοσαύτας μὲν ἐν ἑαυτῷ τοῦ σώματος δυνάμεις ἔχοντος, τοσαύτας δὲ διὰ σίτων καὶ ποτῶν ἐπεισαγομένου ποιότητας ἑκάστοτε, χρωμένου δὲ κινήσεσι καὶ μεταβολαῖς μήτε καιρὸν ἕνα μήτε τάξιν ἀεὶ μίαν
B ἐχούσαις, αἱ πρὸς ἀλλήλας συμπλοκαὶ τούτων ἁπάντων ἔστιν ὅτε καινὰ καὶ ἀσυνήθη νοσήματα φέρουσιν; οἷον ὁ Θουκυδίδης ἱστορεῖ τὸν Ἀθήνησι λοιμὸν γενέσθαι, τεκμαιρόμενος αὐτοῦ τὸ μὴ σύντροφον μάλιστα τῷ τὰ σαρκοφάγα μὴ γεύεσθαι τῶν νεκρῶν· οἱ δὲ περὶ τὴν Ἐρυθρὰν θάλασσαν νοσήσαντες, ὡς Ἀγαθαρχίδας ἱστόρηκεν, ἄλλοις τε συμπτώμασιν ἐχρήσαντο καινοῖς καὶ ἀνιστορήτοις, καὶ δρακόντια μικρὰ τὰς κνήμας διεσθίοντα καὶ τοὺς βραχίονας ἐξέκυψεν, ἁψαμένων δ' αὖθις ἐνεδύετο καὶ φλεγμονὰς ἀκαρτερήτους ἐνειλούμενα τοῖς μυώδεσι παρεῖχεν· καὶ τοῦτο τὸ πάθος οὔτε
C πρότερον οἶδεν οὐδεὶς οὔθ' ὕστερον ἄλλοις ἀλλ' ἐκείνοις γε μόνοις γενόμενον, ὡς ἕτερα πολλά. καὶ γὰρ ἐν δυσουρίᾳ τις γενόμενος πολὺν χρόνον ἐξέδωκε κριθίνην καλάμην γόνατ' ἔχουσαν. καὶ

[1] τρισχίλια Hubert : χίλια.

[a] Von Arnim, *S.V.F.* ii. 210. *Cf. Mor.* 1047 c.





propositions exceeds a million.[a] (Hipparchus,[b] to be sure, refuted this by showing that on the affirmative side there are 103,049 compound statements, and on the negative side 310,952.) Xenocrates asserted that the number of syllables which the letters will make in combination is 1,002,000,000,000.[c] Why then should it seem surprising, when the body has in it so many factors and assimilates so many different qualities every time one eats or drinks, and employs motions and shifts that have no single proper moment or routine, that the complications of all these with each other sometimes produce new and unfamiliar ailments? For instance, take the plague at Athens, as described by Thucydides, who judges it to be no ordinary thing precisely because scavenging birds and animals did not touch the corpses.[d] Some persons living in the vicinity of the Red Sea, according to Agatharchidas,[e] contracted a sickness with new and unexampled symptoms, including the following: little worms[f] would eat their way through the flesh of the lower leg or arm and emerge from the skin. When they were touched, they went back in, and produced an intolerable inflammation, as they encased themselves in the muscular tissues. No one knows of this disease ever occurring before, or of its afterwards ever attacking anyone else, but this people alone. There are many similar examples. There was even a case of a person who, after experiencing difficulty in urination for a long time, passed a barley-stalk with joints;

[b] The famous mathematician and astronomer (second century B.C.).

[c] Xenocrates, frag. 11 Heinze.

[d] Thucydides (ii. 50) actually says that they either did not taste the corpses or died afterwards.

[e] Frag. 14 Müller (*Frag. Hist. Graec.* iii. 195).

[f] "Guinea-worms," *Filaria medinensis.*

(733) τὸν ἡμέτερον ξένον Ἔφηβον Ἀθήνησιν ἴσμεν ἐκβαλόντα μετὰ πολλοῦ σπέρματος θηρίδιον δασὺ καὶ πολλοῖς ποσὶ ταχὺ βαδίζον. τὴν δὲ Τίμωνος ἐν Κιλικίᾳ τήθην Ἀριστοτέλης ἱστόρηκεν φωλεύειν τοῦ ἔτους ἑκάστου δύο μῆνας, μηδενὶ πλὴν μόνῳ τῷ ἀναπνεῖν ὅτι ζῇ διάδηλον οὖσαν. καὶ μὴν ἔν γε τοῖς Μενωνείοις[1] σημεῖον ἡπατικοῦ πάθους ἀναγέγραπται τὸ τοὺς κατοικιδίους μῦς ἐπιμελῶς παραφυλάττειν καὶ διώκειν· ὃ νῦν οὐδαμοῦ γινόμενον
D ὁρᾶται. διὸ μὴ θαυμάζωμεν, ἂν γένηταί τι τῶν οὐ πρότερον ὄντων, μηδ' εἴ τι τῶν πρότερον ὄντων[2] ὕστερον ἐκλέλοιπεν· αἰτία γὰρ ἡ τῶν σωμάτων φύσις, ἄλλην ἄλλοτε λαμβάνουσα κρᾶσιν.

"Τὸ μὲν οὖν ἀέρα καινὸν ἐπεισάγειν ἢ ξένον ὕδωρ, εἰ μὴ βούλεται Διογενιανός, ἐάσωμεν· καίτοι τούς γε Δημοκριτείους ἴσμεν καὶ λέγοντας καὶ γράφοντας, ὅτι[3] κόσμων ἐκτὸς φθαρέντων καὶ σωμάτων ἀλλοφύλων ἐκ τῆς ἀπειρίας[4] ἐπιρρεόντων ἐνταῦθα πολλάκις ἀρχαὶ παρεμπίπτουσιν λοιμῶν καὶ παθῶν οὐ συνήθων. ἐάσωμεν δὲ καὶ τὰς φθορὰς τὰς κατὰ μέρος παρ' ἡμῖν ὑπό τε σεισμῶν καὶ αὐ-
E χμῶν καὶ ὄμβρων, αἷς καὶ τὰ πνεύματα καὶ τὰ νάματα γηγενῆ φύσιν ἔχοντα συννοσεῖν ἀνάγκη καὶ συμμεταβάλλειν.

"Ἀλλὰ τὴν περὶ τὰ σιτία καὶ τὰ ὄψα καὶ τὰς ἄλλας διαίτας τοῦ σώματος ἐξαλλαγήν, ὅση γέγονεν, οὐ παραλειπτέον. πολλὰ γὰρ τῶν ἀγεύστων καὶ ἀβρώτων πρότερον ἥδιστα νῦν γέγονεν, ὥσπερ

[1] Μενωνείοις Reinesius : μελωνειοις.
[2] μηδ' εἴ τι τῶν πρότερον ὄντων added by Meziriacus (εἰ Bernardakis : ἂν Meziriacus).
[3] ὅτι Reiske : ὅτι καὶ.
[4] ἀπειρίας Turnebus : ἀπορίας.





and I know it as a fact that my host Ephebus at Athens emitted, along with a large amount of semen, a hairy creature which ran rapidly on many legs. Aristotle relates that the grandmother of Timon, in Cilicia, used to hibernate for two months of every year, giving no sign of life except that she breathed.[a] What is more, in the works of Meno [b] it is given as a sign of liver disease that a patient watches attentively for the mice of the household and pursues them—a phenomenon that is nowhere observed nowadays. Therefore let us not be surprised if something previously nonexistent has come to be, nor if something that existed before has ceased. The cause of this is the structure of our bodies, which varies from time to time in the combination of its elements.

"As for the introduction of new air or strange water, let us give that up, if Diogenianus does not like it, though we do know that the Democriteans both say and write that when worlds perish, out beyond our own, and foreign atoms flow in from the infinite, then sources of plagues and unusual diseases may find their way into our midst. Let us also give up the partial destructions that take place on earth, from earthquakes, droughts, and rainstorms—occasions when the winds and streams, whose origin is from the earth, must likewise suffer deterioration and change.

"But we must not disregard the great changes that have occurred in the consumption of grains and cooked food and other elements of our diet. Many items that used never to be eaten or even tasted are now much enjoyed, like wine with honey or the

[a] Frag. 43 Rose.
[b] *Suppl. Ar.* iii. 1, p. 77.

(733) οἰνόμελι καὶ μήτρα· λέγουσι δὲ μηδ' ἐγκέφαλον ἐσθίειν τοὺς παλαιούς· διὸ καὶ Ὅμηρον εἰπεῖν

τίω δέ μιν ἔγκαρος[1] αἴσῃ,

τὸν ἐγκέφαλον οὕτως, διὰ τὸ ῥίπτειν καὶ ἀποβάλλειν μυσαττομένους, προσειπόντα· σικύου δὲ πέπονος καὶ μήλου Μηδικοῦ καὶ πεπέρεως πολλοὺς ἴσμεν ἔτι τῶν πρεσβυτέρων γεύσασθαι μὴ δυνα-
F μένους. ὑπό τε δὴ τούτων εἰκός ἐστι ξενοπαθεῖν τὰ σώματα καὶ παραλλάττειν ταῖς κράσεσιν ἡσυχῇ ποιότητα καὶ περίττωμα ποιούντων ἴδιον· τὴν δὲ τάξιν αὖ τῶν ἐδεστῶν καὶ μετακόσμησιν οὐ μικρὰν ἔχειν διαφοράν· αἱ γὰρ καλούμεναι ψυχραὶ τράπεζαι πρότερον, ὀστρέων, ἐχίνων,[2] ὠμῶν λαχάνων, ὥσπερ ἐλαφρῶν ὅπλων,[3] ἀπ' οὐρᾶς ἐπὶ στόμα μεταχθεῖσαι τὴν πρώτην ἀντὶ τῆς ἐσχάτης τάξιν ἔχουσιν.

734 " Μέγα δὲ καὶ τὸ τῶν καλουμένων προπομάτων· οὐδὲ γὰρ ὕδωρ οἱ παλαιοὶ πρὶν ἐντραγεῖν ἔπινον· οἱ δὲ νῦν ἄσιτοι προμεθυσθέντες ἅπτονται τῆς τροφῆς διαβρόχῳ τῷ σώματι[4] καὶ ζέοντι, λεπτὰ καὶ τομὰ καὶ ὀξέα προσφέροντες ὑπέκκαυμα τῆς ὀρέξεως, εἶθ' οὕτως ἐμφορούμενοι τῶν ἄλλων. οὐδενὸς δὲ πρὸς μεταβολὴν καὶ τὸ ποιῆσαι νοσημάτων καινῶν γένεσιν ἀσθενέστερόν ἐστιν ἡ περὶ τὰ λουτρὰ τῆς σαρκὸς πολυπάθεια καθάπερ σιδήρου πυρὶ μαλασ-

[1] ἔγκαρος Hubert, after Eustathius, p. 757 : ἐν καρὸς.
[2] ἐχίνων Turnebus : ἔχειν.
[3] ὅπλων Kronenberg, after Bernardakis : ὁ πλάτων





womb of the sow. They say that the ancients did not even eat brains, which is why Homer said, ' I care for him no more than brains,'[a] speaking of brains in this way because they found them revolting and so rejected and discarded them ; and we know that many older people still cannot eat ripe cucumber, citron, or pepper. Probably the body is affected in an unusual way by these things, and is altered in its constitution as they imperceptibly produce a peculiar quality or residue. It is also probable that the order and rearrangement of foods makes a considerable difference ; for the ' cold course,' as it used to be called, with oysters, sea-urchins, and raw vegetables, has like a body of light-armed troops been shifted from the rear to the front, and holds first place instead of last.

" The serving of the so-called aperitives is a great change too. The ancients did not even drink water before the dessert course, but nowadays people get themselves intoxicated before eating a thing, and take food after their bodies are soaked and feverish with wine, serving hors-d'œuvre of light and sharp-flavoured and sour foods as a stimulant to the appetite and then, in this condition, eating heartily of the rest of the meal. As influential as anything in causing change and breeding new diseases is the multiplication of effects in bathing the body, which, like

[a] The word ἔγκαρος (" brain ") is thought to occur only as a result of misinterpretation of this line of Homer (*Iliad*, ix. 378), where the preferred reading is ἐν καρὸς αἴσῃ " I care no more for him than a κάρ." But this last word is also difficult ; it may be related to κήρ (" destruction "), to κόρις (" bug "), or to κείρω (" cut " ; *i.e.* " a chip ").

[4] σώματι Basel edition : πόματι.

(734) σομένης καὶ ῥεούσης, εἶτα βαφὴν ὑπὸ ψυχροῦ καὶ στόμωσιν ἀναδεχομένης·

ἔνθα μὲν εἰς Ἀχέρων τε Πυριφλεγέθων τε ῥέουσιν·

B τοῦτο γὰρ ἄν τις εἰπεῖν μοι δοκεῖ τῶν ὀλίγον ἡμῶν ἔμπροσθεν γεγονότων, βαλανείου θύρας ἀνοιχθείσης. ἐκεῖνοι γὰρ οὕτως ἀνειμένοις ἐχρῶντο καὶ μαλακοῖς, ὥστ' Ἀλέξανδρος μὲν ὁ βασιλεὺς ἐν τῷ λουτρῶνι πυρέττων ἐκάθευδεν, αἱ δὲ Γαλατῶν γυναῖκες εἰς τὰ βαλανεῖα πόλτου χύτρας εἰσφέρουσαι μετὰ τῶν παίδων ἤσθιον ὁμοῦ λουόμεναι. νῦν δὲ λυττῶσιν ἔοικε τὰ βαλανεῖα καὶ ὑλακτοῦσι καὶ σπαράττουσιν· ὁ δ' ἑλκόμενος ἀὴρ ἐν αὐτοῖς, ὑγροῦ μῖγμα καὶ πυρὸς γεγονώς, οὐδὲν ἐᾷ τοῦ σώματος ἡσυχίαν ἄγειν, ἀλλὰ πᾶσαν ἄτομον κλονεῖ καὶ ταράττει καὶ μεθίστησιν ἐξ ἕδρας, ἄχρι οὗ κατασβέσωμεν αὐτοὺς
C πεπυρωμένους καὶ ζέοντας.

" Οὐδὲν οὖν," ἔφην, " ὦ Διογενιανέ, δεῖται ὁ λόγος αἰτιῶν ἐπεισοδίων ἔξωθεν οὐδὲ μετακοσμίων, ἀλλ' αὐτόθεν ἡ περὶ τὴν δίαιταν μεταβολὴ τὰ μὲν γεννᾶν[1] τὰ δ' ἀφανίζειν τῶν νοσημάτων οὐκ ἀδύνατός ἐστιν."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ι

*Διὰ τι τοῖς φθινοπωρινοῖς ἐνυπνίοις ἥκιστα πιστεύομεν;*

Collocuntur Florus, Favorinus, Autobulus ceterique filii Plutarchi

1. Προβλήμασιν Ἀριστοτέλους φυσικοῖς ἐντυγ-
D χάνων Φλῶρος εἰς Θερμοπύλας κομισθεῖσιν αὐτός τε πολλῶν ἀπορίων, ὅπερ εἰώθασι πάσχειν ἐπι-

[1] γεννᾶν Castiglioni : οὖν γενᾶν.





iron, is made soft and fluid by heat, then plunged into cold water to be tempered.

Here flow in Acheron and Pyriphlegethon ! [a]

This, I believe, is what a member of the generation just before ours would say, if he could look into the door of our bath-chamber. Our ancestors had their baths so mild and gentle that King Alexander used to sleep in the bath-chamber when he had a fever, and the women of the Gauls used to take a bowl of porridge into the bath-chamber and eat while they bathed, along with their children. Now the bathing establishments are like rabid, barking dogs that tear and rend the flesh. The air one breathes there, being a mixture of moisture and heat, leaves no part of the body in peace, but agitates and disturbs every atom and drives it out of place, until we quench the fire and fever that are in us.

" So you see, Diogenianus," I concluded, " that our argument has no need of causes entering from without or of the spaces between worlds, but the change in our way of life, right here on earth, is capable of creating new diseases and making old ones vanish."

## QUESTION 10

Why we trust our dreams least in the autumn.

Speakers : Florus, Favorinus, Autobulus, other sons of Plutarch

1. Florus, who was engaged in reading a copy of Aristotle's *Scientific Problems* that had been brought to Thermopylae, was himself full of questions, as is

[a] Altered from Homer, *Odyssey*, x. 513.

(734) εικῶς αἱ φιλόσοφοι φύσεις, ὑπεπίμπλατο καὶ τοῖς ἑταίροις μετεδίδου, μαρτυρῶν αὐτῷ τῷ Ἀριστοτέλει λέγοντι τὴν πολυμάθειαν πολλὰς ἀρχὰς ποιεῖν. τὰ μὲν οὖν ἄλλα μεθ' ἡμέραν οὐκ ἄχαριν ἡμῖν ἐν τοῖς περιπάτοις διατριβὴν παρέσχεν· τὸ δὲ λεγόμενον περὶ τῶν ἐνυπνίων, ὡς ἐστιν ἀβέβαια καὶ ψευδῆ μάλιστα περὶ τοὺς φυλλοχόους μῆνας, οὐκ οἶδ' ὅπως ἐφ' ἑτέροις λόγοις πραγματευσαμένου
E τοῦ Φαβωρίνου μετὰ τὸ δεῖπνον ἀνέκυψεν.

Τοῖς μὲν οὖν σοῖς ἑταίροις ἐμοῖς δ' υἱοῖς ἐδόκει λελυκέναι τὴν ἀπορίαν Ἀριστοτέλης, καὶ οὐδὲν ὤοντο δεῖν ζητεῖν οὐδὲ λέγειν ἀλλ' ἢ τοὺς καρπούς, ὥσπερ ἐκεῖνος, αἰτιᾶσθαι. νέοι γὰρ ὄντες ἔτι καὶ σφριγῶντες πολὺ πνεῦμα γεννῶσιν ἐν τῷ σώματι καὶ ταραχῶδες· οὐ γὰρ τὸν οἶνον εἰκός ἐστι μόνον ζεῖν[1] καὶ ἀγανακτεῖν, οὐδὲ τοὖλαιον ἂν ᾖ νεουργὸν ἐν τοῖς λύχνοις ψόφον ἐμποιεῖν, ἀποκυματιζούσης τὸ πνεῦμα τῆς θερμότητος, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰ σιτία τὰ πρόσφατα καὶ τὴν ὀπώραν ἅπασαν ὁρῶμεν ἐντεταμένην καὶ οἰδοῦσαν, ἄχρι ἂν ἀποπνεύσῃ τὸ φυσῶδες καὶ ἄπεπτον. ὅτι δ' ἐστὶ τῶν βρωμάτων ἔνια
F δυσόνειρα καὶ ταρακτικὰ τῶν καθ' ὕπνον ὄψεων, μαρτυρίοις ἐχρῶντο τοῖς τε κυάμοις καὶ τῇ κεφαλῇ τοῦ πολύποδος, ὧν ἀπέχεσθαι κελεύουσι τοὺς δεομένους τῆς διὰ τῶν ὀνείρων μαντικῆς.

2. Ὁ δὲ Φαβωρῖνος αὐτὸς τὰ μὲν ἄλλα δαιμονιώτατος Ἀριστοτέλους ἐραστής ἐστι καὶ τῷ Περιπάτῳ νέμει μερίδα τοῦ πιθανοῦ πλείστην· τότε μέντοι λόγον τινὰ τοῦ Δημοκρίτου παλαιὸν ὥσπερ

[1] ζεῖν Turnebus : ζῆν.

[a] Frag. 62 Rose. [b] Frag. 242 Rose.





natural for a philosophical spirit, and shared them with his friends too, proving Aristotle's own statement that "great learning gives many starting-points." [a] Most of the questions raised provided us with a pleasant pastime during our daytime walks; but the common saying about dreams—that they are especially likely to be unreliable or false in the fall months—somehow came up after dinner, after Favorinus had finished a discourse on other topics.

Your friends, my sons, thought that Aristotle [b] had solved the problem, and that there was no point in any further inquiry or discussion, except to say, as he had, that the harvest is to blame. For fruit and grains when fresh and juicy generate a great deal of unruly vapour in the body. It is logical to expect not only wine to seethe and protest and olive-oil, when it is newly made, to cause sputtering in lamps, as the heat causes the vapour to rise in waves, but in fact we can see that the new grain too, and all kinds of fruit stretch and swell, till they exhale and let out the unripe and gassy part. They argued that there are some foods which bring bad dreams and interfere with appearances in sleep, and cited in evidence the bean and the head of the cuttlefish, from which people are instructed to abstain when they resort to divination through dreams.

2. Favorinus [c] is an enthusiastic admirer of Aristotle on all counts, and considers the Peripatetics the most convincing of the schools; but on this occasion he advanced an old argument of Democritus. Taking

[c] Probably the same as the famous sophist and polymath of Arelatê, a pupil of Dio Chrysostom and somewhat younger than Plutarch. The latter dedicated two books to him, and he wrote, in turn, a book entitled *Plutarch, or On the Academic Position.*

(734) ἐκ καπνοῦ καθελὼν ἠμαυρωμένον οἷος ἦν ἐκκαθαί-
735 ρειν καὶ διαλαμπρύνειν, ὑποθέμενος τοῦτο δὴ τοὐ-
πιδήμιον ὅ φησιν Δημόκριτος ἐγκαταβυσσοῦσθαι
τὰ εἴδωλα διὰ τῶν πόρων εἰς τὰ σώματα καὶ ποιεῖν
τὰς κατὰ τὸν ὕπνον ὄψεις ἐπαναφερόμενα· φοιτᾶν
δὲ ταῦτα πανταχόθεν ἀπιόντα καὶ σκευῶν καὶ
ἱματίων καὶ φυτῶν, μάλιστα δὲ ζῴων ὑπὸ σάλου
πολλοῦ καὶ θερμότητος οὐ μόνον ἔχοντα μορφοει-
δεῖς τοῦ σώματος ἐκμεμαγμένας ὁμοιότητας (ὡς
Ἐπίκουρος οἴεται μέχρι τούτου Δημοκρίτῳ συνεπό-
μενος, ἐνταῦθα δὲ προλιπὼν τὸν λόγον), ἀλλὰ καὶ
τῶν κατὰ ψυχὴν κινημάτων καὶ βουλευμάτων
B ἑκάστῳ καὶ ἠθῶν καὶ παθῶν ἐμφάσεις ἀναλαμβά-
νοντα συνεφέλκεσθαι, καὶ προσπίπτοντα μετὰ τού-
των ὥσπερ ἔμψυχα φράζειν καὶ διαγγέλλειν[1] τοῖς
ὑποδεχομένοις τὰς τῶν μεθιέντων αὐτὰ δόξας καὶ
διαλογισμοὺς καὶ ὁρμάς, ὅταν ἐνάρθρους καὶ ἀσυγ-
χύτους φυλάττοντα προσμίξῃ τὰς εἰκόνας. τοῦτο
δὲ μάλιστα ποιεῖ δι' ἀέρος λείου τῆς φορᾶς αὐτοῖς
γινομένης ἀκωλύτου καὶ ταχείας. ὁ δὲ φθινοπω-
ρινός, ἐν ᾧ φυλλοχοεῖ τὰ δένδρα, πολλὴν ἀνωμαλίαν
ἔχων καὶ τραχύτητα διαστρέφει καὶ παρατρέπει
πολλαχῇ τὰ εἴδωλα καὶ τὸ ἐναργὲς αὐτῶν ἐξίτηλον
καὶ ἀσθενὲς ποιεῖ τῇ βραδυτῆτι τῆς πορείας ἀ-
μαυρούμενον, ὥσπερ αὖ πάλιν πρὸς ὀργώντων καὶ
C διακαιομένων ἐκθρώσκοντα πολλὰ καὶ ταχὺ κομι-
ζόμενα τὰς ἐμφάσεις νεαρὰς καὶ σημαντικὰς ἀποδί-
δωσιν.

3. Εἶτα διαβλέψας πρὸς τοὺς περὶ τὸν Αὐτόβου-
λον καὶ μειδιάσας, " ἀλλ' ὁρῶ," εἶπεν, " ὑμᾶς οἵους[2]

[1] διαγγέλλειν Wyttenbach : διαστέλλειν.
[2] οἵους Hatzidakis : οἵους τε.





it down all blackened with smoke, as it were, he set about cleaning and polishing it. He used as foundation the familiar commonplace found in Democritus that spectral films penetrate the body through the pores and that when they rise they make us see things in our sleep. These films that come to us emanate from everything—from utensils, clothing, plants, and especially from animals, because of their restlessness and their warmth. The films have not only the impressed physical likeness in contour of an animal—so far Epicurus agrees with Democritus, though he drops the subject at this stage—but they catch up and convey by attraction spectral copies of each man's mental impulses, designs, moral qualities, and emotions. When they strike the recipient thus accompanied, they speak to him, as if they were alive, and report to him the thoughts, reasoning and impulses of those from whom they escape, whenever the copies are still preserved whole and undistorted till contact is made. They are best preserved when the air affords a smooth passage that is unimpeded and rapid. The air of autumn, however, a time when trees are shedding their leaves, is extremely uneven and rough ; it twists and turns the films from their paths in all directions, destroying or diminishing their clarity, which fades because their movement is so slow. Just so, on the other hand, when the films come leaping forth in large numbers at high speed from bodies that are tumid and heated, and are received quickly, they make impressions that are fresh and whose meaning is clear.

3. Favorinus now looked with a smile at Autobulus and his group. " I see," he said, " that you are dis-

(735) ὄντας ἤδη σκιαμαχεῖν πρὸς τὰ εἴδωλα καὶ δόξῃ παλαιᾷ καθάπερ γραφῇ προσφέροντας ἀφὴν οἴεσθαί τι ποιεῖν."

Καὶ ὁ Αὐτόβουλος, "παῦε ποικίλλων," ἔφη, "πρὸς ἡμᾶς· οὐ γὰρ ἀγνοοῦμεν, ὅτι τὴν Ἀριστοτέλους δόξαν εὐδοκιμῆσαι βουλόμενος ὥσπερ σκιὰν αὐτῇ τὴν Δημοκρίτου παραβέβληκας. ἐπ'[1] ἐκείνην οὖν
D τρεψόμεθα κἀκείνῃ μαχούμεθα κατηγορούσῃ τῶν νέων καρπῶν καὶ τῆς φίλης ὀπώρας οὐ προσηκόντως. τὸ γὰρ θέρος αὐτοῖς μαρτυρεῖ καὶ τὸ μετόπωρον, ὅτε μάλιστα χλωρὰν καὶ φλείουσαν, ὡς Ἀντίμαχος ἔφη, τὴν ὀπώραν, γεννωμένην ἄρτι, προσφερόμενοι[2] ἧττον ἀπατηλοῖς καὶ ψευδέσιν ἐνυπνίοις σύνεσμεν· οἱ δὲ φυλλοχόοι μῆνες ἤδη τῷ χειμῶνι παρασκηνοῦντες ἐν πέψει τὰ σιτία καὶ τὰ περιόντα τῶν ἀκροδρύων ἰσχνὰ καὶ ῥυσὰ καὶ πᾶν ἀφεικότα τὸ πληκτικὸν[3] ἐκεῖνο καὶ μανικὸν ἔχουσιν. καὶ μὴν οἴνου γε τὸν νέον οἱ πρωιαίτατα πίνοντες Ἀνθεστηριῶνι πίνουσι μηνὶ μετὰ χειμῶνα, καὶ τὴν
E ἡμέραν ἐκείνην ἡμεῖς μὲν Ἀγαθοῦ Δαίμονος, Ἀθηναῖοι δὲ Πιθοίγια προσαγορεύουσιν· γλεύκους δὲ ζέοντος ἔτι[4] ἀφαιρεῖσθαι καὶ τοὺς ἐργάτας δεδιότας ὁρῶμεν.

"Ἀφέντες οὖν τὸ συκοφαντεῖν τὰ τῶν θεῶν δῶρα μετίωμεν ἑτέραν ὁδόν, ἣν ὑφηγεῖται τοὔνομα τοῦ

[1] ἐπ' added by Madvig.
[2] προσφερόμενοι Reiske : π. τοὺς κάρπους.
[3] πληκτικὸν Emperius : πληκτίζον. [4] ἔτι Reiske : ἀεί.

[a] "Shadow-boxing." The illusion of depth in a painted scene is demonstrated by feeling the smooth surface.
[b] Frag. 36 Kinkel, 40 Wyss.





posed to start a shadow-fight [a] at once against the spectre-images, and you think you can dispose of an ancient doctrine by the test of touch as if it were a painted scene."

"None of your tricks with us!" said Autobulus. "We can see that in order to win approval for the opinion of Aristotle you have put that of Democritus beside it as a contrasting shadow. So we are going to turn our attention to Aristotle's theory and do battle with it, since it brings a wrongful accusation against the fresh fruit and grain and our beloved early-autumn season. Summer is a witness for our clients, as is late-autumn (*metoporon*), since it is when we consume the fruits, at the very moment of turning, at the greenest and brightest—as Antimachus says [b] —that we are less haunted by deceptive and false dreams. The months when the leaves are falling, on the other hand, are already next door to winter; the grains are all ripened, the remaining fruits are dry and shrivelled and have lost all the upsetting and manic quality to which you referred. What is more, those who drink the new wine at the very earliest, do so in the month of Anthesterion, after winter is gone. (We call the occasion the Day of the Good Genius, and the Athenians call it the Pithoigia.) [c] But we observe that even the vintage-workers are afraid to pilfer the must while it is still fermenting.

"Now, let us stop quibbling about the gifts of the gods and follow up another trail, along which we are

[c] See above, iii. 7 ("Why the sweet new wine is least intoxicating"), 655 E, where Plutarch compares the two festivals mentioned here. The *Pithoigia* ("opening of jars") was the first day of the *Anthesteria*, in honour of Dionysus, and fell on the eleventh of the month Anthesterion, or about 2 March.

(735) χρόνου[1] τῶν ὑπηνεμίων καὶ ψευδῶν ὀνείρων. φυλλοχόος γὰρ ὀνομάζεται διὰ ψυχρότητα καὶ ξηρότητα τηνικαῦτα τῶν φύλλων ἀπορρεόντων, πλὴν εἴ τι θερμόν ἐστιν ἢ λιπαρὸν ὡς ἐλαῖαι καὶ δάφναι καὶ φοίνικες ἢ διερὸν ὡς μυρσίνη καὶ κιττός· τούτοις γὰρ ἡ κρᾶσις βοηθεῖ τοῖς δ' ἄλλοις οὔ· οὐ γὰρ παραμένει τὸ ἐχέκολλον καὶ συνεκτικόν, ἢ πυκνου-
F μένης ψυχρότητι τῆς ἰκμάδος ἢ ξηραινομένης δι' ἔνδειαν ἢ δι' ἀσθένειαν. ἔστι μὲν οὖν καὶ φυτοῖς ὑγρότητι καὶ θερμότητι τεθηλέναι καὶ αὐξάνεσθαι, μᾶλλον δὲ τοῖς ζῴοις· καὶ τοὐναντίον ἡ ψυχρότης καὶ ἡ ξηρότης ὀλέθριον. διὸ χαριέντως Ὅμηρος εἴωθεν 'διεροὺς βροτοὺς' καλεῖν, καὶ τὸ μὲν χαίρειν 'ἰαίνεσθαι,' 'ῥιγεδανὸν' δὲ καὶ 'κρυερὸν' τὸ
736 λυπηρὸν καὶ τὸ φοβερόν· ὁ δ' ἀλίβας καὶ ὁ σκελετὸς ἐπὶ τοῖς νεκροῖς λέγονται,[2] λοιδορουμένης τῷ ὀνόματι τῆς ξηρότητος. ἔτι τὸ μὲν αἷμα κυριωτάτην τῶν ἐν ἡμῖν ἔχον δύναμιν ἅμα καὶ θερμόν ἐστι καὶ ὑγρόν, τὸ δὲ γῆρας ἀμφοῖν ἐνδεές. ἔοικε δὲ τοῦ ἐνιαυτοῦ περιιόντος οἷον γῆρας εἶναι τὸ φθινόπωρον· οὔπω[3] γὰρ ἥκει τὸ ὑγρόν, οὐκέτι δὲ τὸ θερμὸν ἔρρωται· δεῖγμα δὴ γεγονὸς ἀτεχνῶς ξηρότητος ἅμα καὶ ψυχρότητος ἐπισφαλῆ ποιεῖ τὰ σώματα πρὸς τὰς νόσους. τοῖς δὲ σώμασι τὰς ψυχὰς συμ-
B παθεῖν ἀνάγκη, καὶ μάλιστα παχνουμένου τοῦ πνεύματος ἀμαυροῦσθαι τὸ μαντικόν, ὥσπερ κάτοπτρον ὁμίχλης ἀναπιμπλάμενον. οὐδὲν οὖν τρανὸν οὐδ' ἔναρθρον οὐδ' εὔσημον ἐν ταῖς φαντασίαις ἀποδίδωσι, μέχρι οὗ τραχὺ καὶ ἀλαμπὲς καὶ συνεσταλμένον ἐστίν."

[1] χρόνου Reiske : χρόνου καὶ.
[2] λέγονται Doehner, after Eustathius : γέγονε.





directed by the name we give to the season of empty and false dreams. It is called 'fall'[a] because at that time, on account of the cold and dryness, the leaves fall, except those that have some warmth or oiliness in them, like olive, laurel, and palm trees, or some moisture, like the myrtle and ivy. Their composition saves these, but not the rest; in them the glutinous, cohesive quality is not permanent, the juice being either congealed by the cold or dried up because of its weakness and scantiness. Now it is proper to plants to flourish and grow by moisture and warmth, but even more so to animals. Conversely, cold and drouth are fatal to them. Thus Homer aptly spoke of 'humid mortals,' and called rejoicing 'warming,' but called the painful and fearful 'chill' and 'cold.' 'Dropless' (*alibas*) and 'dried' (*skeletos*) are words used of the dead; they are derogatory references to their dry condition. Furthermore the blood, whose power is sovereign among all substances found in us, is both warm and moist, while old age is deficient in both of these qualities. As the year revolves, the late autumn is like its old age: the wet season has not yet come, and the hot season is no longer in full vigour. Thus it is literally a sample offered of the combination of dry and cold; and it makes our systems susceptible to disease. It is inevitable, however, that our minds should share the body's experience, and especially that when the vital spirit is congealed, the light of divination should be dimmed, like a mirror that is fogged. It gives us nothing clear or connected or significant in our visions, as long as it is rough and lacklustre and constricted."

[a] *i.e.* "leaf-shedding."

[3] οὔπω Xylander : οὔτω.

# TABLE-TALK

## (QUAESTIONES CONVIVALES)

## BOOK IX

# INTRODUCTION

THE dramatic date of the conversation that occupies Book IX of the *Symposiac Questions* cannot be determined, but it may belong to Plutarch's student days at Athens under Ammonius, head of the Platonic Academy. About half the *dramatis personae* are not mentioned elsewhere, namely Hermeias the geometer, Zopyrio the schoolmaster, Maximus the rhetor, *i.e.* teacher and exponent of the art of oratory, Hylas the teacher of literature, Menephylus the Peripatetic philosopher, Dionysius a farmer, Meniscus the physical trainer and Thrasybulus, whose occupation is not given ; conceivably the last of these is to be identified with Ammonius's son Thrasyllus (722 C). The musician Erato reappears at 645 D ff., again in the company of Ammonius ; on this occasion Plutarch expressly calls himself a " young man " (649 A). Protogenes is found again at 698 D ff. and 723 F ff. where, as in this book (741 C), he takes the line of " exposing " the teachers of rhetoric. He may be identical with Protogenes of Tarsus, who plays a chief part in the *Amatorius*, and recounts the myth in *De Sera Numinis Vindicta*. Herodes the teacher of rhetoric is found again at an entertainment given by Sospis (? the Roman name Sospes), when the latter, also a rhetor, was in charge of the Isthmian games (723 A). Marcus, teacher of literature, and Glaucias, a rhetor, recur at

628 A ff., and the latter at 635 A ff. and 714 A ff. Trypho the doctor is a guest of Erato at 646 F ff. and of Plutarch at Chaeronea at 683 C ff. The company is completed by Plutarch's brother Lamprias, whose characteristic sense of humour is allowed some scope in Question 5.

The text is based on that of K. Hubert in the Teubner series, from which all information about the readings of manuscripts has been derived. Vindobonensis 148, the archetype of all surviving manuscripts, now ceases with the word Ἀφροδίτην at 747 E, having lost its last pages; for the short remaining section recourse must be had to copies made before the loss, of which the most important are Paris 2074, of the xiv century, Vaticanus 139, written soon after A.D. 1296, and Paris 1672, written soon after A.D. 1302. At a few places Hubert's text has been modified by the introduction of a new correction or the revival of an old one, and an uncertain conjecture has sometimes been admitted where the wording, but not the general sense, is in doubt.

The apparatus criticus does not mention every error, however trivial or obvious, of the archetype. By "Anon. 1 (Turn.)," "Anon. 2 (Turn.)," "Anon. 3 (Turn.)" I indicate the three hands (small and neat, medium, and large) which, in that order, entered corrections in the margins of Adrian Turnebus' copy of the Aldine edition, now Rés. J. 94 in the Bibliothèque Nationale at Paris (*cf.* Wyttenbach's edition, Praefatio, § 4). "Anon. (Turn. ?)" denotes a reading stated in the Frankfurt edition of 1599 to be derived from the margins of Turnebus' books. "Anon. (Amyot)" denotes a correction in the margins of Amyot's copy of the Basel edition, now Rés. J. 103

in the Bibliothèque Nationale ; it was acquired by him on 10 November 1569 and bears on its last page the date " 8 idus Sept. 1570." He is known to have collected the emendations of others (see Wyttenbach, Praefatio, § 5), but some, to which *forte*, *puto*, or some such word is attached, seem to be his own : these I record as " Amyot." " Amyot trans.," and similarly " Xylander trans." etc., indicate that the correction, although not explicitly made, is implied by the translator's version.

I wish to thank Mr. A. S. F. Gow of Trinity College, Cambridge, Professor J. H. Plumley of Christ's College, Cambridge, and Professor R. P. Winnington-Ingram of King's College, London for advice and information on various points.

F. H. Sandbach

Trinity College
Cambridge

# ΣΥΜΠΟΣΙΑΚΩΝ

## ΒΙΒΛΙΟΝ ΕΝΑΤΟΝ

C Τὸ ἔνατον τῶν Συμποσιακῶν, ὦ Σόσσιε Σενεκίων, περιέχει λόγους τοὺς[1] Ἀθήνησιν ἐν τοῖς Μουσείοις γενομένους τῷ[2] καὶ μάλιστα τὴν ἐννεάδα ταῖς Μούσαις προσήκειν. ὁ δ' ἀριθμὸς ἂν ὑπερβάλλῃ τὴν συνήθη δεκάδα τῶν ζητημάτων, οὐ θαυμαστέον· ἔδει γὰρ πάντα ταῖς Μούσαις ἀποδοῦναι τὰ τῶν Μουσῶν καὶ μηδὲν ἀφελεῖν ὥσπερ ἀφ' ἱερῶν, πλείονα καὶ καλλίονα τούτων ὀφείλοντας αὐταῖς.

### ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Α

Περὶ στίχων εὐκαίρως ἀναπεφωνημένων καὶ ἀκαίρως

Collocuntur Ammonius, Erato, alii

D 1. Ἀμμώνιος Ἀθήνησι στρατηγῶν ἀπόδειξιν

[1] ? omit τοὺς.

[2] τῷ (substituted for καὶ in Basel edition) added by Anon. 1 in Turnebus' copy.

[a] It is not known whether there was any public festival of the Muses at Athens. The reference may be to some private celebration in the Academy, which was formally an association for their worship.



# TABLE-TALK

## BOOK NINE

THE ninth book of *Table-Talk*, Sossius Senecio, contains the conversations held at Athens during the festival of the Muses,[a] the reason being that the number nine is peculiarly appropriate to the Muses. Should it prove that the number of questions exceeds the customary ten, you must not be surprised. It was my duty to render to the Muses all that belonged to the Muses, and not to commit the sacrilege of robbing them of anything; in fact it would need an even finer and larger offering than this to repay my debt to them.

### QUESTION 1

On opportune and inopportune quotation from the poets

Speakers: Ammonius, Erato, and others

1. WHILE in office as *strategos*[b] at Athens, Am-

[b] At this date there was a single *strategos* who, with the *archon* and *keryx*, was one of the three principal civil officials at Athens. Inscriptions (*Inscr. Graec.* II². 2017; 2052; 2113) show that he sometimes concerned himself with the training of the *epheboi*, young men who for two years, between the ages of 18 and 20, received a physical, military, and cultural education under state supervision. Ammonius filled the office three times, see 720 c.

(736) ἔλαβεν ἐν[1] τῷ Διογενείῳ τῶν γράμματα καὶ γεωμετρίαν καὶ τὰ ῥητορικὰ καὶ μουσικὴν μανθανόντων ἐφήβων, καὶ τοὺς εὐδοκιμήσαντας τῶν διδασκάλων ἐπὶ δεῖπνον ἐκάλεσεν. παρῆσαν δὲ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων φιλολόγων συχνοὶ καὶ πάντες ἐπιεικῶς οἱ συνήθεις. ὁ μὲν οὖν Ἀχιλλεὺς μόνοις τῶν ἀγωνισαμένων τοῖς μονομαχήσασι δεῖπνον κατήγγειλεν, βουλόμενος, ὥς φασιν, εἴ τις ἐν τοῖς ὅπλοις ὀργὴ πρὸς ἀλλήλους καὶ χαλεπότης γένοιτο, ταύτην ἀφεῖναι καὶ καταθεσθαι τοὺς ἄνδρας ἑστιάσεως κοινῆς καὶ τραπέζης μετασχόντας· τῷ δ' Ἀμμωνίῳ συνέβαινε τοὐναν-
E τίον· ἀκμὴν γὰρ ἡ τῶν διδασκάλων ἅμιλλα καὶ φιλονεικία σφοδροτέραν ἔλαβεν ἐν ταῖς κύλιξι γενομένων· ἤδη δὲ καὶ προτάσεις καὶ προκλήσεις ἦσαν ἄκριτοι καὶ ἄτακτοι.

2. Διὸ πρῶτον μὲν ἐκέλευσεν ᾄσαι τὸν Ἐράτωνα πρὸς τὴν λύραν· ᾄσαντος δὲ τὰ πρῶτα τῶν Ἔργων ‘οὐκ ἄρα μοῦνον ἔην Ἐρίδων γένος,’ ἐπῄνεσεν[2] ὡς τῷ[3] καιρῷ πρεπόντως[4] ἁρμοσάμενον· ἔπειτα περὶ στίχων εὐκαιρίας ἐνέβαλεν λόγον, ὡς μὴ μόνον χάριν ἀλλὰ καὶ χρείαν ἔστιν ὅτε μεγάλην ἐχούσης. καὶ ὁ μὲν ῥαψῳδὸς εὐθὺς ἦν διὰ στόματος πᾶσιν,

[1] ἐν added by Madvig.
[2] ἐπῄνεσεν Muretus : ἐπῄνησα.
[3] ὡς τῷ Anon. 1 (Turn.) : πως τὸ.
[4] πρεπόντως Xylander, Anon. 2 (Turn.) : προτρέποντος.

[a] The school of Diogenes, a centre for the instruction of the *epheboi* (*Inscr. Graec.* II². 2018 ; 2067; 2097), was named after a Diogenes, who about 230 B.C. surrendered the Mace-





monius heard a demonstration given in the school of Diogenes[a] by the young men who were studying literature, geometry, rhetoric, or music ; afterwards he invited the successful teachers to dinner. Nearly all our friends were present, and quite a number of other men with literary interests. Now the reason why the only competitors to whom Achilles promised a dinner were those who had fought in single combat,[b] was his wish, so we are told, that the contestants should, through sharing an entertainment at a common table, discard and relinquish any anger or ill-feeling that they might have conceived against one another in arms. For Ammonius, however, things went the opposite way : the competition and rivalry between the teachers took a sharper edge over the cups, and it was not long before there was a disorderly confusion of theses and challenges.

2. For this reason, as a start, he asked Erato to sing to the lyre, and when he sang the opening of the *Works* of Hesiod,

> It's wrong to think there is one kind of strife alone,[c]

complimented him on the aptness with which he had matched the occasion. He followed this up by introducing the topic of appropriate verses from the poets, saying that a well-timed quotation was often not only felicitous but also very useful. Everybody immediately began to talk of the rhapsode at the

donian posts in Athens for a payment of 150 talents, *cf. Life of Aratus*, xxxiv.

[b] At the funeral games in honour of Patroclus, *Iliad*, xxiii. 810.

[c] *Works and Days*, 11, the first line of the poem proper, what precedes being a proem. Hesiod distinguishes desirable emulation from bitter hostility.

(736) F ἐν τοῖς Πτολεμαίου γάμοις ἀγομένου[1] τὴν ἀδελφὴν καὶ πρᾶγμα δρᾶν ἀλλόκοτον νομιζομένου καὶ ἄθεσμον[2] ἀρξάμενος ἀπὸ τῶν ἐπῶν ἐκείνων

Ζεὺς δ' Ἥρην ἐκάλεσσε[3] κασιγνήτην ἄλοχόν τε·

καὶ ὁ παρὰ Δημητρίῳ τῷ βασιλεῖ ἀπρόθυμος ὢν[4] ᾄδειν μετὰ τὸ δεῖπνον, ὡς δὲ[5] προσέπεμψεν αὐτῷ τὸν υἱὸν ἔτι παιδάριον ὄντα τὸν Φίλιππον, ἐπιβαλὼν εὐθὺς

τὸν παῖδά μοι τόνδ' ἀξίως Ἡρακλέους
ἡμῶν τε θρέψαι·

737 καὶ Ἀνάξαρχος ὑπ' Ἀλεξάνδρου μήλοις βαλλόμενος[6] παρὰ δεῖπνον ἐπαναστὰς[7] καὶ εἰπὼν

βεβλήσεταί τις θεῶν βροτησίᾳ χερί.

πάντων δ' ἄριστος[8] Κορίνθιος παῖς αἰχμάλωτος, ὅθ' ἡ πόλις ἀπώλετο καὶ Μόμμιος ἐκ τῶν ἐλευθέρων

[1] ἀγομένου placed here by Stephanus: after πᾶσιν in MSS.
[2] νομιζομένου καὶ ἄθεσμον Basel edition, Xylander: ὁ μὲν οὐκ ἐᾷ θεσμόν.
[3] ἐκάλεσσε] προσέειπε Homer.
[4] ὢν Anon. 2 (Turn.): ἦν.
[5] ὡς δὲ Nauck: ὥστε.
[6] βαλλόμενος Aldine edition: μελλόμενος.
[7] ἐπαναστὰς Basel edition: ἐπαναστάντας.
[8] ἄριστος] ἄριστα Reiske.

[a] Ptolemy II Philadelphus married his full sister Arsinoë II, perhaps in 278 B.C., continuing a practice of the Pharaohs. Greek sentiment allowed marriage with a half-sister, but not with a full sister.
[b] Homer, *Iliad*, xviii. 356; the same precedent is invoked by Theocritus, xvii. 130 ff.
[c] Presumably Demetrius II, king of Macedon 239–229 B.C., father of Philip V (born 238 B.C.).





marriage of Ptolemy, who in taking his sister to wife was considered to be committing an unnatural and unlawful act[a]: he started his recitation with the verses that begin

Then Zeus to Hera, his wife and sister, lifted his voice.[b]

Then there was the guest of King Demetrius[c] who was reluctant to sing after dinner, but when Demetrius sent him his son Philip, still a small boy, with the request, capped it immediately with

Worthily both of Heracles and us
Bring up this boy.[d]

And Anaxarchus[e] on being pelted with apples by Alexander at a dinner party got up to retaliate with the words

A god shall take a hit from mortal hand.[f]

Best of all was the young Corinthian prisoner of war, when his city was destroyed[g] and Mummius, who

[d] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.*, Adespoton 399. In the Hellenistic age selected passages, even in iambics, from tragedies were sung as isolated numbers, *cf. Symbolae Osloenses*, xxxi (1955), pp. 26 ff. The boy of the play (? Euripides' *Augê*) must have had as father Heracles, to whom Demetrius was thus flatteringly compared.
[e] A native of Abdera, who accompanied Alexander the Great on his Persian campaign. Arrian, *Anabasis*, iv. 10 and Philodemus, *De Vitiis*, iv. 5 agree with Plutarch, against Aelian, *Varia Hist.* ix. 37 and Diogenes Laertius, ix. 60, in making him encourage Alexander's dreams of divinity.
[f] Euripides, *Orestes*, 271, where Orestes threatens to shoot the Furies. Philodemus represents Anaxarchus as threatening Alexander with his goblet.
[g] 146 B.C. The whole population was sold into slavery. Perhaps the text implies that Mummius, the Roman commander, expected educated boys to fetch a higher price.

(737) τοὺς ἐπισταμένους γράμματα παῖδας συσκοπῶν[1] ἐκέλευσε γράψαι στίχον, ἔγραψε

τρὶς μάκαρες Δαναοὶ καὶ τετράκις, οἳ τότ' ὄλοντο·

καὶ γὰρ παθεῖν τι τὸν Μόμμιόν φασι καὶ δακρῦσαι καὶ πάντας ἀφεῖναι ἐλευθέρους τοὺς τῷ παιδὶ προσήκοντας. ἐμνήσθησαν[2] δὲ[3] καὶ τῆς Θεοδώρου B τοῦ[4] τραγῳδοῦ γυναικὸς οὐ προσδεξαμένης αὐτὸν ἐν τῷ συγκαθεύδειν ὑπογύου τοῦ ἀγῶνος ὄντος, ἐπεὶ δὲ νικήσας εἰσῆλθεν πρὸς αὐτήν, ἀσπασαμένης καὶ εἰπούσης

Ἀγαμέμνονος παῖ, νῦν ἐκεῖν' ἔξεστί σοι.

3. Ἐκ δὲ τούτου πολλὰ καὶ τῶν ἀκαίρων ἐνίοις ἐπῆλθε λέγειν, ὡς οὐκ ἄχρηστον εἰδέναι καὶ φυλάττεσθαι. οἷον Πομπηίῳ Μάγνῳ φασὶν ἀπὸ τῆς μεγάλης ἐπανήκοντι στρατείας τὸν διδάσκαλον τῆς θυγατρὸς ἀπόδειξιν διδόντα βιβλίου κομισθέντος ἐνδοῦναι τῇ[5] παιδὶ τοιαύτην ἀρχὴν

ἦλυθες ἐκ πολέμου· ὡς ὄφελες αὐτόθ' ὀλέσθαι.

Κασσίῳ δὲ Λογγίνῳ λόγου προσπεσόντος ἀδεσπότου, τὸν υἱὸν ἐπὶ ξένης τεθνάναι, καὶ τὸ ἀληθὲς C ἔχοντος εἰπεῖν οὐδενὸς[6] οὐδ' ἀνελεῖν τὸ ὕποπτον, εἰσελθὼν συγκλητικὸς ἀνὴρ πρὸς αὐτὸν ἤδη πρεσ-

[1] συσκοπῶν l'ost : εὐσυσκόπων.
[2] ἐμνήσθησαν (or ἐμνήσθημεν) F. H. S., *cf.* 717 c : ἐμνήσθη.
[3] δὲ Madvig : τε.
[4] τοῦ added by Reiske ; an alternative is to delete τραγῳδοῦ as an intrusive explanation. [5] τῇ Basel edition : τῷ.
[6] οὐδενὸς added here by Bernardakis, after καὶ by Reiske.

[a] Homer, *Odyssey*, v. 306.
[b] Perhaps the best known of all tragic actors, Theodorus





was reviewing such free-born boys as could read and write, ordered him to write down a line of verse : he wrote

O thrice and four times happy Greeks who perished then.[a]

It is said indeed that Mummius was affected to the point of tears and let all the boy's relations go free. Mention was also made of the wife of Theodorus [b] the tragic actor who would not receive him to sleep with her while the competition was imminent, but when he entered her room victorious welcomed him with the words

Agamemnon's child, you have permission now.[c]

3. After this it occurred to some of the guests to recount a large number of inopportune quotations also, on the ground that it has its uses to know of such and be on one's guard. For example they say that on Pompey the Great's homecoming from his great campaign [d] his daughter's tutor, to provide a display of her proficiency, had a book fetched and gave the child this line to start from :

Thou hast come from the war ; oh that thou had'st perished there.[e]

Then there once came to the ears of Cassius Longinus [f] an anonymous report that his son had died abroad ; no one was in a position to say what was the truth or put an end to misgiving. An elderly senator came

lived in the fourth century ; he also wrote tragedies. *Cf. De Gloria Atheniensium*, 348 E and Aristotle, *Politics*, 1336 b 28.
[c] Sophocles, *Electra*, 2. See Athenaeus, 579 a, for another use of this quotation. [d] 61 B.C.
[e] Homer, *Iliad*, iii. 428, spoken by Helen to Paris.
[f] There were many men of this name : the best known is C. Cassius, who took part in the assassination of Julius Caesar.

(737) βύτερος, "οὐ καταφρονήσεις," ἔφη, "Λογγῖνε, λαλιᾶς ἀπίστου καὶ κακοήθους φήμης, ὥσπερ οὐκ εἰδὼς οὐδ' ἀνεγνωκὼς[1] τὸ

φήμη δ' οὔ τις πάμπαν ἀπόλλυται."

ὁ δ' ἐν Ῥόδῳ στίχον αἰτήσαντι γραμματικῷ ποιουμένῳ δεῖξιν ἐν τῷ θεάτρῳ προτείνας

ἔρρ' ἐκ νήσου θᾶσσον, ἐλέγχιστε ζωόντων

ἄδηλον εἴτε παίζων ἐφύβρισεν εἴτ' ἄκων ἠστόχησεν.

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Β

Τίς αἰτία, δι' ἣν τὸ ἄλφα προτέτακται τῶν στοιχείων;

Collocuntur Ammonius, Hermeas, Protogenes, Plutarchus

D 1. Ταῦτα μὲν οὖν παρηγόρησεν ἀστείως τὸν θόρυβον· ἔθους δ' ὄντος ἐν τοῖς Μουσείοις κλήρους περιφέρεσθαι καὶ τοὺς συλλαχόντας ἀλλήλοις προτείνειν φιλόλογα ζητήματα, φοβούμενος ὁ Ἀμμώνιος μὴ τῶν ὁμοτέχνων τινὲς ἀλλήλοις E συλλάχωσι, προσέταξεν ἄνευ κλήρου γεωμέτρην γραμματικῷ προτεῖναι καὶ ῥητορικῷ μουσικόν, εἶτ' ἔμπαλιν ἀναστρέφειν τὰς ἀνταποδόσεις.

2. Προὔτεινεν οὖν[2] Ἑρμείας ὁ γεωμέτρης Πρω-

[1] οὐδ' ἀνεγνωκὼς Basel edition: οὐ δρᾶν ἐγνωκὼς.
[2] οὖν Wyttenbach: οὖν ὁ.

[a] Hesiod, *Works and Days*, 763. The senator (and probably Hesiod) meant that a rumour once started cannot be scotched; but the line was current (*cf.* Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1153 b 28) in the sense "there is no smoke without fire."

[b] Presumably undertaking to find in it matter for comment.





to visit him and said: "Longinus, surely you will pay no attention to unreliable gossip and malicious rumour? One would think you did not know or had never read the line

No rumour ever quite in nothing ends." [a]

And once in Rhodes a teacher of literature, giving a display in the theatre, asked to be given a line [b]; a man offered him

Clear out double quick from the island, most wicked of all men alive! [c]

It is doubtful, however, whether he was committing an unintentional blunder or making a rude joke.

## QUESTION 2

What is the reason why alpha stands first in the alphabet?

Speakers: Ammonius, Hermeias, Protogenes, Plutarch

1. This talk provided a happy means of reducing the disturbance. Nevertheless, it being the custom at the festival of the Muses for lots to be handed round and for those whom the draw brought together to propound learned problems to one another, Ammonius, fearing that some professors of the same subject might be drawn together,[d] directed that, without any balloting, a geometer should put a problem to a teacher of literature and a musician to a teacher of rhetoric, and that afterwards they should change round and pay one another back in kind.

2. The first problem was put to Protogenes the

[c] Homer, *Odyssey*, x. 72.

[d] The quarrelsomeness of men of the same trade was proverbial.

(737) τογένει τῷ γραμματικῷ πρῶτος αἰτίαν εἰπεῖν, δι' ἣν τὸ ἄλφα προτάττεται τῶν γραμμάτων ἁπάντων. ὁ δὲ τὴν ἐν ταῖς σχολαῖς λεγομένην ἀπέδωκε. τὰ μὲν γὰρ φωνήεντα τῷ δικαιοτάτῳ λόγῳ πρωτεύειν[1] τῶν ἀφώνων καὶ ἡμιφώνων· ἐν δὲ τούτοις τῶν μὲν μακρῶν ὄντων τῶν δὲ βραχέων τῶν δ' ἀμφότερα καὶ διχρόνων λεγομένων, ταῦτ' εἰκότως τῇ δυνάμει διαφέρειν. αὐτῶν δὲ τούτων πάλιν ἡγεμονικωτάτην ἔχειν τάξιν τὸ προτάττεσθαι τῶν ἄλλων δυεῖν ὑποF τάττεσθαι δὲ μηδετέρῳ πεφυκός, οἷόν ἐστι τὸ ἄλφα· τουτὶ γὰρ οὔτε τοῦ ἰῶτα δεύτερον οὔτε τοῦ ὖ τατόμενον ἐθέλειν ὁμολογεῖν οὐδ' ὁμοπαθεῖν ὥστε συλλαβὴν μίαν ἐξ ἀμφοῖν γενέσθαι, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἀγανακτοῦν καὶ ἀποπηδῶν ἰδίαν ἀρχὴν ζητεῖν ἀεί· ἐκείνων δ' ὁποτέρου[2] βούλῃ προταττόμενον ἀκολουθοῦντι καὶ συμφωνοῦντι χρῆσθαι καὶ συλλαβὰς ὀνομάτων ποιεῖν, ὥσπερ τοῦ "αὔριον" καὶ τοῦ 738 "αὐλεῖν" καὶ τοῦ "Αἴαντος" καὶ τοῦ "αἰδεῖσθαι" καὶ μυρίων ἄλλων. διὸ τοῖς τρισίν, ὥσπερ οἱ πένταθλοι, περίεστι καὶ νικᾷ τὰ μὲν πολλὰ τῷ φωνᾶεν εἶναι, τὰ δ' αὖ φωνάεντα τῷ[3] δίχρονον, ταῦτα δ' αὐτὰ τῷ πεφυκέναι καθηγεῖσθαι δευτερεύειν δὲ μηδέποτε μηδ' ἀκολουθεῖν.

3. Παυσαμένου δὲ τοῦ Πρωτογένους, καλέσας ἔμ' ὁ Ἀμμώνιος, "οὐδέν," ἔφη, "σὺ τῷ Κάδμῳ βοηθεὶς ὁ Βοιώτιος, ὃν φασι τὸ ἄλφα πάντων προ-

[1] πρωτεύειν Wyttenbach : πρωτεύει.
[2] ὁποτέρου Anon. 2 (Turn.) : ὁπότερον.
[3] τῷ Anon. (Turn.?) : ἐν τῷ.

[a] See note on 738 D *infra*.
[b] Long-jump, sprint, discus, javelin, wrestling. A competitor first in three events was unbeatable.
[c] Legendary Phoenician founder of Thebes and author of





teacher of literature by the geometer Hermeias, who asked him for the reason why *alpha* is put first of all the letters. He replied with the stock reason given in schools. First, there was every justification for the vowels' taking precedence of the consonants and semivowels[a]; then among the vowels some were long, some short, and others, the so-called ambiguous, long and short; the last were naturally superior by reason of this capacity, and among them, in turn, the leading position belonged to the one that could be prefixed to either, but suffixed to neither, of the others. *Alpha* was of this nature; if placed after *iota* or *upsilon* it refused, he said, to come to terms or fall in with them, to effect the formation of a single syllable from the two vowels; it sprang away, as it were, in distaste, and always tried to make its own start. On the other hand, if given a position before whichever you pleased of the other two, it made use of them, as they harmoniously followed its lead, to form syllables of words, as for example *aurion* (tomorrow), *aulein* (play a wind instrument), *aias* (Ajax), *aideisthai* (be ashamed), and countless other words. And so, like a competitor in the pentathlon,[b] it was superior on three counts, beating the majority of letters by being a vowel, the vowels by being of ambiguous quantity, and the ambiguous vowels by its characteristic of leading the way and never following or taking second place.

3. When Protogenes had finished, Ammonius called on me. "Aren't you," he asked, "as a Boeotian, going to give any support to Cadmus,[c] who is said to have placed *alpha* first because it is the

the Greek alphabet, the Phoenician origin of which is in fact likely.

(738) τάξαι διὰ τὸ Φοίνικας οὕτω καλεῖν τὸν βοῦν, ὃν[1] οὐ δεύτερον οὐδὲ τρίτον, ὥσπερ Ἡσίοδος, ἀλλὰ πρῶτον τίθεσθαι τῶν ἀναγκαίων;" "οὐδέν," ἔφην ἐγώ· "τῷ γὰρ ἐμῷ πάππῳ βοηθεῖν, εἴ τι
B δύναμαι, δίκαιός εἰμι μᾶλλον ἢ τῷ τοῦ Διονύσου. Λαμπρίας γὰρ ὁ ἐμὸς πάππος ἔλεγεν πρώτην φύσει φωνὴν τῶν ἐνάρθρων ἐκφέρεσθαι διὰ τῆς τοῦ ἄλφα δυνάμεως· τὸ γὰρ ἐν τῷ στόματι πνεῦμα ταῖς περὶ τὰ χείλη μάλιστα πλάττεσθαι κινήσεσιν, ὧν πρώτην ἀνοιγομένων τὴν ἄνω διάστασιν οὖσαν ἐξιέναι τοῦτον τὸν ἦχον, ἁπλοῦν ὄντα κομιδῇ καὶ μηδεμιᾶς δεόμενον πραγματείας, μηδὲ τὴν γλῶτταν παρακαλοῦντα μηδ' ὑπομένοντ',[2] ἀλλὰ κατὰ χώραν ἀποκειμένης ἐκείνης ἐκπεμπόμενον· ᾗ καὶ τὰ νήπια ταύτην πρώτην ἀφιέναι φωνήν. ὠνομάσθαι[3] δὲ[4] καὶ
C τὸ 'ἀίειν'[5] ἐπὶ τῷ φωνῆς αἰσθάνεσθαι καὶ πολλὰ τῶν ὁμοίων, ὥσπερ καὶ τὸ 'ᾄδειν' καὶ τὸ[6] 'αὐλεῖν' καὶ τὸ 'ἀλαλάζειν.' οἶμαι δὲ καὶ τὸ 'αἴρειν' καὶ τὸ 'ἀνοίγειν' οὐκ ἀπὸ τρόπου τῇ τῶν χειλῶν

[1] ὃν added by Wyttenbach, (Amyot, Xylander trans.).
[2] ὑπομένοντ' Basel edition: ὑπομένον.
[3] ὠνομάσθαι Basel edition: ὀνομάσαι.
[4] δὲ added by Wyttenbach. But ὀνομάσαι καὶ may be sound, if some preceding words have fallen out.
[5] ἀίειν Anon. 2 (Turn.): ἀεὶ εἶναι.
[6] τὸ added by Aldine edition.

[a] Hesiod, *Works and Days*, 405: "First buy an ox, and then a woman." Both the name and the form of the Greek letter *alpha* are derived from the Semitic letter *aleph*, the name of which means "ox." In the Greek A the horns of the ox's head point downwards.

[b] Dionysus was son of Cadmus' daughter Semelê.

[c] This poetic word is not in fact so confined in usage but can mean the hearing of any sound.





Phoenician name for an ox, which they, like Hesiod, reckoned not the second or third, but the first of necessities?"[a] "Not a bit," I replied, "it is my own grandfather whom I must by rights support with what ability I have rather than Dionysus'.[b] My grandfather Lamprias, you see, used to say that of all articulate sounds the first to be naturally uttered is that which has the phonetic value of *alpha*. He argued that the breath in the mouth is mainly shaped by the movements of the lips; their first movement is their vertical separation as they are opened, which emits this sound, an absolutely simple one that requires no effort, and neither asks for nor submits to assistance from the tongue, being pronounced while that organ remains in its original position, which is of course the reason why babies utter this sound first. And that, he would say, is why the perception of the sound of a voice is called *aiein* (to hear),[c] and there are many parallels, for example *adein* (to sing), *aulein* (to play a wind-instrument), *alalazein* (to yell).[d] And I believe that *airein* (to raise) and *anoigein* (to open) are

[d] *alalazein* is an onomatopoeic word representing a repeated open-mouthed shout, which gives a sound like that we write as *a*. The other examples, however, illustrate the fact that ancient "etymology" proceeds in ways that we find mistaken or unintelligible. It does not conceive of words as having developed according to phonetic laws from more primitive forms, but as showing in their present form the true nature of the thing they indicate. *Adein* (to sing) begins with an *a* because *a* is the sound, so it is maintained, that a wordless singer naturally produces (*cf.* tra-la-la, as a representation of wordless song); *anoigein* (to open) begins with an *a* because if we open the lips and make a sound, that sound is *a*. We cannot blow an *aulos* (an instrument of the clarinet type) without parting the lips, and so putting them in the position for making the sound of *a*; therefore *aulein* (to play an *aulos*) begins with an *a*.

(738) ἀνοίξει καὶ ἄρσει, καθ' ἣν οὗτος ἐκπίπτει τοῦ στόματος ὁ φθόγγος, ὠνομάσθαι. διὸ καὶ τὰ τῶν ἀφώνων γραμμάτων ὀνόματα πλὴν ἑνὸς ἅπαντα προσχρῆται τῷ ἄλφα καθάπερ φωτὶ τῆς περὶ αὐτὰ τυφλότητος· τοῦ δὲ πῖ μόνον ἄπεστιν ἡ δύναμις αὕτη· τὸ γὰρ φῖ καὶ τὸ χῖ τὸ μέν ἐστι πῖ τὸ δὲ κάππα δασυνόμενον."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Γ

Κατὰ ποίαν ἀναλογίαν ὁ τῶν φωνηέντων καὶ ἡμιφώνων[1] ἀριθμὸς συντέτακται;

Collocuntur Hermeas, Plutarchus, Zopyrio

D 1. Πρὸς ταῦτα[2] τοῦ Ἑρμείου φήσαντος ἀμφοτέρους ἀποδέχεσθαι τοὺς λόγους, "τί οὖν," ἔφην, "οὐ[3] καὶ σὺ διῆλθες ἡμῖν, εἴ τις ἔστι λόγος τοῦ ἀριθμοῦ τῶν στοιχείων, ὥς γ' ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ; τεκμήριον δὲ ποιοῦμαι τὸ μὴ κατὰ τύχην τῶν ἀφώνων καὶ ἡμιφώνων πρός τ' ἄλληλα καὶ πρὸς[4] τὰ φωνήεντα γεγονέναι τὸ πλῆθος, ἀλλὰ κατὰ τὴν πρώτην ἀναλογίαν ἀριθμητικὴν δὲ καλουμένην ὑφ' ὑμῶν[5]· ἐννέα γὰρ ὄντων καὶ ὀκτὼ καὶ ἑπτά,[6] τῷ αὐτῷ[7] τὸν μέσον ἀριθμὸν ὑπερέχειν καὶ ὑπερέχεσθαι συμβέβηκε. τῶν[8] δ' ἄκρων ὁ μέγιστος πρὸς τὸν ἐλά-

[1] ? add καὶ ἀφώνων. [2] ταῦτα Basel edition: γὰρ τὰ.
[3] οὐ Anon. 2 (Turn.): αὖ.
[4] πρὸς transferred here (from after πρός τε) by Stephanus.
[5] ὑφ' Anon. 1 (Turn.), ὑμῶν Meziriacus: ἀφ' ἡμῶν.
[6] καὶ ἑπτά added by Xylander.
[7] τῷ αὐτῷ Graf: οὕπω.
[8] συμβέβηκε. τῶν Xylander, (Amyot): συμβεβηκότων. ? read συμβέβηκε τῶν ἄκρων· ὁ δὲ μέγιστος κτλ., *cf.* Plato, *Timaeus*, 36 A, Theo Smyrnaeus, p. 113 Hiller.





also names appropriate to the opening and raising of the lips that accompanies the emission from the mouth of this sound *a*. For this reason all the mute letters, with one exception, have names that employ an added *alpha*, as a kind of light to their darkness. Only *pi* lacks this sound, for *phi* and *chi* are to be counted as aspirated *pi* and *kappa*."

## QUESTION 3

In what kind of numerical proportion do the vowels and semivowels stand to one another? [a]

Speakers: Hermeias, Plutarch, Zopyrio

1. Hermeias replied that he accepted both explanations. "Well then," I said, "isn't it time you expounded to us any reason there may be for the number of letters in the alphabet? I am sure there is one, and find evidence in the fact that the mutes and semivowels stand in no chance numerical relation either to one another or to the vowels, but are in primary, or as you geometers call it, arithmetical proportion: since they are nine, eight, and seven,[b] they have the property that the middle number exceeds the one extreme by the same amount as that by which it falls short of the other. Next, the largest number has the same relation to the smallest as that

[a] A badly-worded and inaccurate summary of this question, which really is, Why are there 24 letters in the alphabet? The writer has confined himself to Plutarch's introductory remarks. Even so he should have mentioned mutes as well as vowels and semivowels (see critical note).

[b] The Greeks divided their alphabet into nine mutes: β, γ, δ, θ, κ, π, τ, χ, φ; seven vowels: α, ε, η, ι, ο, υ, ω; and eight semivowels: ζ, λ, μ, ν, ξ, ρ, σ, ψ.

(738) χιστον ἔχει λόγον, ὃν[1] ὁ τῶν Μουσῶν πρὸς τὸν τοῦ Ἀπόλλωνος· ἡ γὰρ ἐννεὰς δήπου ταῖς Μούσαις ἡ δ' ἑβδομὰς τῷ Μουσηγέτῃ προσκεκλήρωται· συντε-
E θέντα[2] δ' ἀλλήλοις διπλασιάζει τὸν μέσον εἰκότως, ἐπεὶ καὶ τὰ ἡμίφωνα τῆς ἀμφοῖν τρόπον τινὰ κοινωνεῖ δυνάμεως."

2. Καὶ ὁ Ἑρμείας,[3] "Ἑρμῆς," ἔφη, "λέγεται θεῶν ἐν Αἰγύπτῳ γράμματα πρῶτος εὑρεῖν· διὸ καὶ τὸ τῶν γραμμάτων Αἰγύπτιοι πρῶτον ἶβιν γράφουσιν, ὡς Ἑρμῇ προσήκουσαν, οὐκ ὀρθῶς κατά γε τὴν ἐμὴν δόξαν ἀναύδῳ καὶ ἀφθόγγῳ προεδρίαν ἐν
F γράμμασιν ἀποδόντες. Ἑρμῇ δὲ μάλιστα τῶν ἀριθμῶν ἡ τετρὰς ἀνάκειται, πολλοὶ δὲ καὶ τετράδι μηνὸς ἱσταμένου γενέσθαι τὸν θεὸν ἱστοροῦσιν· τά τε δὴ πρῶτα καὶ Φοινίκεια διὰ Κάδμον ὀνομασθέντα τετράκις ἡ τετρὰς γενομένη παρέσχεν, καὶ τῶν αὖθις ἐφευρεθέντων δὲ Παλαμήδης τε πρό-

[1] ὃν added by Stephanus.
[2] συντεθέντα Stephanus, (Amyot trans.): συντιθέντα.
[3] ὁ Ἑρμείας Wyttenbach: θερμασίας.

[a] Apollo was born on the seventh day of the month, *cf.* 717 D *supra* and Lydus, *De Mensibus*, ii. 12.

[b] Hermes was identified with the ibis-headed Thoth or Theuth, to whom Plato, *Phaedrus*, 274 D ascribes the invention of letters. Two species of ibis, the crested ibis and the sacred ibis (which forms part of the usual writing of Thoth's name), occur in Egyptian hieroglyphs, but neither is used as a uniliteral phonetic sign. Modern Egyptologists, when listing the alphabetic phonetic signs, always begin with the vulture, which stands for a glottal stop: this would suit Plutarch's "inarticulate and voiceless," particularly as by his time the sound was hardly pronounced, although still written. The modern order of phonetic signs is, however, barely a hundred years old: there seems to be no evidence, unless it is to be found in this passage, to show which of these signs the Egyptians themselves placed first, or even that they had any fixed order of signs. It should be added that the crested ibis does occasionally function as a syllabic sign, representing a pair of vocalized consonants, and in cryptographic writing of Ptolemaic times is known to replace the sign for j, which was itself, owing to sound changes, sometimes confused with that for the glottal stop.

[c] Homeric *Hymn to Hermes*, 19. *Cf.* also scholiast on Aristophanes, *Plutus*, 1126, Apuleius, *De Mundo*, 2, Lydus, *De Mensibus*, ii. 9.

[d] Plutarch imagines an early alphabet probably consisting of α β γ δ ε η ι κ λ μ ν ο π ρ σ τ. Φοινικήϊα seems to be early Ionic for "letters of the alphabet," which then numbered 20, not 16.





of the Muses to that of Apollo, the number nine being, as we know, assigned to the Muses and seven to their Leader.[a] Then if we add together these extremes, they are twice the middle number, reasonably so, since the semivowels in a sense share the quality of both vowels and mutes."

2. "Hermes," said Hermeias, "was, we are told, the god who first invented writing in Egypt. Hence the Egyptians write the first of their letters with an ibis, the bird that belongs to Hermes, although in my opinion they err in giving precedence among the letters to one that is inarticulate and voiceless.[b] Well, of all numbers four is particularly associated with Hermes; and many writers record that his birthday was actually on the fourth day of the month.[c] Now not only did four multiplied by four provide the original letters of the alphabet, named the 'Phoenician letters' because of Cadmus,[d] but also four of those that were invented later were

(738) τερος τέτταρα καὶ Σιμωνίδης αὖθις ἄλλα τοσαῦτα προσέθηκεν. καὶ μὴν ὅτι[1] πάντων ἀριθμῶν πρῶτος τέλειος ἡ μὲν τριὰς ὡς ἀρχὴν καὶ μέσον[2] ἔχουσα καὶ τέλος, ἡ δ' ἑξὰς ὡς ἴση τοῖς αὑτῆς μέρεσι γινομένη, δῆλόν ἐστι· τούτων τοίνυν ἡ μὲν ἑξὰς ὑπὸ τῆς τετράδος, ἡ δὲ τριὰς ὑπὸ τῆς ὀγδοάδος[3] πολλαπλασιασθεῖσα, πρώτου κύβου πρῶτος τέλειος, τὸ τῶν τεττάρων καὶ εἴκοσι παρέσχηκε πλῆθος."

3. Ἔτι δ' αὐτοῦ λέγοντος ὁ γραμματιστὴς Ζωπυρίων δῆλος ἦν καταγελῶν καὶ παρεφθέγγετο· παυσαμένου δ' οὐ κατέσχεν ἀλλὰ φλυαρίαν τὰ 739 τοιαῦτα πολλὴν ἀπεκάλει· μηδενὶ γὰρ λόγῳ συντυχίᾳ δέ τινι καὶ τὸ πλῆθος τῶν γραμμάτων γεγονέναι τοσοῦτον καὶ τὴν τάξιν οὕτως ἔχουσαν, ὥσπερ, ἔφη, καὶ τὸ τῆς Ἰλιάδος τὸν πρῶτον στίχον τῷ τῆς Ὀδυσσείας ἰσοσύλλαβον εἶναι καὶ πάλιν τῷ τελευταίῳ τὸν τελευταῖον ἐκ τύχης καὶ αὐτομάτως ἐπηκολουθηκέναι.

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Δ

Ποτέραν χεῖρα τῆς Ἀφροδίτης ἔτρωσεν ὁ Διομήδης;

Collocuntur Hermeas, Maximus, Zopyrio

B 1. Μετὰ δὲ ταῦτα τὸν μὲν Ἑρμείαν βουλόμενόν τι προβαλεῖν[4] τῷ Ζωπυρίωνι ἀπεκωλύσαμεν· ὁ δὲ ῥήτωρ Μάξιμος ἄπωθεν ἠρώτησεν αὐτὸν ἐκ τῶν

[1] ὅτι Madvig : ὃ. [2] μέσον Basel edition : μέσην.
[3] ἡ δὲ . . . ὀγδοάδος added by Madvig.
[4] προβαλεῖν Basel edition : προλαβεῖν.

[a] Palamedes is supposed by Pliny, *Nat. Hist.* vii. 192, to





added by Palamedes, and subsequently the same number once more by Simonides.[a] A further point is this. It is clear that in the series of numbers the first perfect number is three, as having a beginning, a middle and an end, or six, as being equal to the sum of its factors.[b] Now of these, six multiplied by four, or three, the first perfect number, multiplied by eight, the first cube, has given our total of twenty-four."

3. While he was still talking, Zopyrio the schoolmaster was obviously laughing at him and kept on making audible comments; when he came to an end, he let himself go and stigmatized all such talk as complete nonsense. Both the number of the letters of the alphabet and their order, he said, were what they were by coincidence, and not for any reason, just as it was an accidental consequence of chance that the number of syllables in the first line of the *Iliad* was the same as that in the first line of the *Odyssey*,[c] while the same thing was again true of their last lines.[d]

## QUESTION 4

Which of Aphroditê's hands did Diomedes wound?

Speakers: Hermeias, Maximus, Zopyrio

1. After this Hermeias wanted to set a problem to Zopyrio, but we stopped him. Maximus, however, the teacher of rhetoric, who was at a distance, put him a question taken from the Homeric poems,

have invented ζ υ φ χ, Simonides θ ξ ψ ω, but there were other versions.

[b] 1 + 2 + 3 = 6. *Cf.* Nicomachus of Gerasa, i. 16. 2, Theon of Smyrna, chap. 32, p. 45 Hiller.

[c] 17 syllables. [d] 16 syllables.

(739) Ὁμήρου, ποτέραν χεῖρα τρώσειεν τῆς Ἀφροδίτης ὁ Διομήδης. ταχὺ δὲ τοῦ Ζωπυρίωνος ἀντερομένου ποτέρῳ σκέλει χωλὸς ἦν ὁ Φίλιππος, " οὐχ ὅμοιον," εἶπεν ὁ Μάξιμος· " οὐδὲν γὰρ ὁ Δημοσθένης ὑπονοεῖν[1] περὶ τούτου δέδωκεν· σὺ δ' ἐὰν ἀπορεῖν ὁμολογήσῃς, ἕτεροι δείξουσιν ὅπου τὴν τετρωμένην χεῖρα φράζει τοῖς νοῦν ἔχουσιν ὁ ποιητής." ἔδοξεν οὖν ἡμῖν ὁ Ζωπυρίων διηπορῆσθαι, καὶ τὸν Μάξιμον, ἐκείνου σιωπῶντος, ἠξιοῦμεν ἐπιδεικνύναι.

C 2. " Πρῶτον οὖν," ὁ Μάξιμος ἔφη, " τῶν ἐπῶν οὕτως ἐχόντων

ἔνθ' ἐπορεξάμενος μεγαθύμου Τυδέος υἱὸς
ἄκρην οὔτασε χεῖρα, μετάλμενος ὀξέι δουρί,

δῆλόν ἐστιν, ὅτι[2] τὴν ἀριστερὰν[3] πατάξαι βουλόμενος οὐκ ἐδεῖτο μεταπηδήσεως,[4] ἐπεὶ κατὰ τὴν ἀριστερὰν τὴν δεξιὰν εἶχεν ἐξ ἐναντίου προσφερόμενος· καὶ γὰρ εὔλογον ἦν τὴν ἐρρωμενεστέραν χεῖρα καὶ μᾶλλον τοῦ Αἰνείου φερομένου περιεχομένην ἐκεῖνόν τε τρῶσαι καὶ αὐτὴν[5] τρωθεῖσαν προέσθαι τὸ σῶμα. δεύτερον, εἰς τὸν οὐρανὸν αὐτῆς ἀνακομισθείσης, καὶ τὴν Ἀθηνᾶν ἀναγελῶσαν ἐποίησεν[6]·

D ἦ μάλα δή τινα Κύπρις Ἀχαιιάδων ἀνιεῖσα
Τρωσὶν ἅμα σπέσθαι, τοὺς νῦν ἔκπαγλα φίλησεν,

[1] ὑπονοεῖν (or οὐδὲ . . . ὑπόνοιαν) F. H. S., *cf.* 729 E, 363 D: ὑπολόγια.
[2] ὅτι Basel edition: οὐ.
[3] ἀριστερὰν added by Xylander, Anon. 2 (Turn.).
[4] μεταπηδήσεως Basel edition: μεταδήσεως.
[5] αὐτὴν Hubert: τὴν.
[6] ἀναγελῶσαν ἐποίησεν F. H. S. doubtfully: ἀναγελῶσαι λέγουσιν. ἀναγελάσαι λέγουσαν (anacoluthon) Duebner. Castiglioni suggests a lacuna after καὶ.





namely which of Aphroditê's hands did Diomedes wound? Zopyrio quickly countered by asking which was Philip's lame leg. " That's not a parallel," replied Maximus, " as Demosthenes has not even given a hint on the subject.[a] But if you will admit that you are baffled, there are those who will show you where the poet indicates the wounded hand to those who have any wits." It seemed to us that Zopyrio was completely at a loss for an answer, and, as he said nothing, we asked Maximus to show us his proof.

2. " In the first place," said Maximus, " the verses run

Then in a forward lunge great-hearted Tydeus' son
Wounded the base of her hand, leaping with pointed spear.[b]

It is clear that if he had wanted to strike her left hand he would not have needed to jump to the side, as in advancing directly on her he would have had his right hand opposite her left. It was in fact reasonable that he should wound the hand that, being the stronger, gave more support to Aeneas as he was carried away, and that that hand should, on being wounded, drop the body. Secondly, when she got back to heaven, the poet represented Athena as jeering at her:

Cypris, no doubt, inciting some woman of the Greeks
To follow Trojan men, for whom her love is unbounded,

[a] *De Corona*, 67.
[b] Homer, *Iliad*, v. 335-336. Aphroditê carries her wounded son Aeneas out of the battle, but drops him when hit herself. The word translated " leaping " means " leaping on her." The sense " leaping sideways," or " from side to side " that Maximus forces on it is unparalleled, but known for the prosaic equivalent μεταπηδᾶν.

(739) τῶν τινα καρρέζουσα Ἀχαιιάδων βαθυκόλπων,[1]
πρὸς χρυσῇ περόνῃ κατεμύξατο χεῖρα ἀραιήν.

οἶμαι δὲ καὶ σέ," εἶπεν, " ὦ βέλτιστε διδασκάλων, ὅταν τινὰ τῶν μαθητῶν φιλοφρονούμενος καταψᾷς καὶ καταρρέζῃς, μὴ τῇ ἀριστερᾷ χειρὶ τοῦτο ποιεῖν ἀλλὰ τῇ δεξιᾷ· καθάπερ εἰκός ἐστι καὶ τὴν Ἀφροδίτην, ἐπιδεξιωτάτην θεῶν οὖσαν, οὕτω φιλοφρονεῖσθαι τὰς ἡρωίδας."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ε

Ε Διὰ τί Πλάτων εἰκοστὴν ἔφη τὴν Αἴαντος ψυχὴν[2] ἐπὶ τὸν κλῆρον ἐλθεῖν;

Collocuntur Sospis, Hylas, Lamprias, Ammonius, Marcus

1. Ταῦτα τοὺς ἄλλους ἅπαντας ἡδίους ἐποίησεν, μόνον δὲ τὸν γραμματικὸν Ὕλαν ὁ ῥήτωρ Σῶσπις ὁρῶν ἀποσιωπῶντα[3] καὶ βαρυθυμούμενον (οὐ πάνυ γὰρ εὐημέρησεν ἐν ταῖς ἐπιδείξεσιν) ἀνεφώνησεν

οἵη δ' Αἴαντος ψυχὴ Τελαμωνιάδαο·

τὰ δὲ[4] λοιπὰ μεῖζον[5] φθεγγόμενος ἤδη πρὸς ἐκεῖνον ἐπέραινεν,

ἀλλ' ἴθι[6] δεῦρο, ἄναξ, ἵν' ἔπος καὶ μῦθον ἀκούσῃς ἡμέτερον· δάμασον δὲ μένος καὶ ἀτειρέα[7] θυμόν.

[1] βαθυκόλπων] ἐϋπέπλων Homer.
[2] τὴν Αἴαντος ψυχὴν index prefixed to the book : ψυχὴν τοῦ Αἴαντος.
[3] ἀποσιωπῶντα Basel edition : ἀποσιωπῶν.
[4] δὲ added by Hubert.
[5] μεῖζον Xylander : μείζον ἢ.
[6] ἴθι] ἄγε Homer.
[7] ἀτειρέα] ἀγήνορα Homer.

[a] *i.e.* with dress hanging in deep folds at the breast.
[b] *Iliad*, v. 420-425, where there is no word of Athena's laughing : but Zeus smiles at line 426.





While stroking the hair of some full-bosomed [a] Grecian girl,
Has scratched her delicate hand against a golden pin.[b]

Now, I imagine that when you, most excellent of schoolmasters, show favour to one of your pupils by stroking and caressing him, you do it not with your left hand, but with your right. Similarly it stands to reason that Aphroditê, being the most dexterous of goddesses, also showed her favour to the ladies of the time in that way." [c]

## QUESTION 5

Why did Plato say that the soul of Ajax came twentieth to the drawing of lots ? [d]

Speakers : Sospis, Hylas, Lamprias, Ammonius, Marcus

1. All this had put everyone in a more pleasant humour, except Hylas the teacher of literature. Observing him to be maintaining a dejected silence (he had not exactly been successful in the demonstrations), Sospis the teacher of rhetoric declaimed the line

Alone the soul of Ajax, son of Telamon,[e]

and finished the rest of the passage in raised tones, now addressed directly to Hylas,

But come, my Lord, that thou may'st hear the words I speak,
Come hither, quelling thy anger and unyielding heart.[f]

[c] This argument recurs in Eustathius on *Iliad*, v. 424. Perhaps Virgil knew the problem, *cf. Aeneid*, xi. 277 : " Veneris violavi volnere dextram."
[d] What Plato in fact says (*Republic*, 620 B) is that Ajax picked up the lot that entitled him to twentieth place in the choice of a future life.
[e] Homer, *Odyssey*, xi. 543.
[f] *Odyssey*, xi. 561-562.

(739) F ἔτι δ' ἀνώμαλος ὢν[1] ὑπ' ὀργῆς ὁ Ὕλας ἀπεκρίνατο σκαιῶς· τὴν μὲν Αἴαντος ἔφη ψυχὴν εἰκοστὴν λαχοῦσαν[2] ἐν Ἅιδου διαμείψασθαι κατὰ τὸν Πλάτωνα φύσιν λέοντος, αὐτῷ[3] δὲ πολλάκις παρίστασθαι καὶ τὰ τοῦ κωμικοῦ γέροντος,

ὄνον γενέσθαι κρεῖττον ἢ τοὺς χείρονας
ὁρᾶν ἑαυτοῦ ζῶντας ἐπιφανέστερον.

καὶ ὁ Σῶσπις γελάσας, "ἀλλ' ἕως μέλλομεν ἐνδύε-
740 σθαι τὸν[4] κανθήλιον, εἴ τι[5] κήδει Πλάτωνος, δίδαξον ἡμᾶς, ᾧτινι λόγῳ τὴν τοῦ Τελαμωνίου ψυχὴν πεποίηκεν ἀπὸ κλήρου βαδίζουσαν εἰκοστὴν ἐπὶ τὴν αἵρεσιν." ἀποσκορακίσαντος δὲ[6] τοῦ Ὕλα (χλευάζεσθαι γὰρ ᾤετο δυσημερῶν) ὑπολαβὼν ὁ ἀδελφὸς ἡμῶν, "τί οὖν;" εἶπεν, "οὐ δευτερεῖα μὲν ὁ Αἴας κάλλους καὶ μεγέθους καὶ ἀνδρείας ἀεὶ φέρεται 'μετ' ἀμύμονα Πηλείωνα,' τὰ δ' εἴκοσι δευτέρα δεκάς, ἡ δὲ δεκὰς ἐν τοῖς ἀριθμοῖς κράτιστος, ὡς ἐν τοῖς Ἀχαιοῖς ὁ Ἀχιλλεύς;" γελασάντων δ' ἡμῶν, "ταῦτα μέν," ὁ Ἀμμώνιος εἶπεν, "ὦ Λαμπρία, κείσθω σοι πεπαιγμένα πρὸς Ὕλαν·
B ἡμῖν δὲ μὴ παίζων ἀλλ' ἀπὸ σπουδῆς, ἐπεὶ τὸν λόγον ἑκὼν ἐξεδέξω, δίελθε περὶ τῆς αἰτίας."

2. Θορυβηθεὶς οὖν ὁ Λαμπρίας, εἶτα χρόνον οὐ πολὺν ἐπισχὼν ἔφη πολλαχοῦ μὲν ἡμῖν τὸν Πλάτωνα προσπαίζειν διὰ τῶν ὀνομάτων· ὅπου δὲ μῦθόν τινα τῷ περὶ ψυχῆς λόγῳ μίγνυσι, χρῆσθαι

[1] ἀνώμαλος ὢν Doehner, *cf.* 74 E : ὁμολογῶν.
[2] λαχοῦσαν Basel edition : λαλοῦσαν.
[3] αὐτῷ Hubert : αὐτῷ.
[4] τὸν Anon. (Amyot), Xylander trans. : τὸ.
[5] εἴ τι Basel edition : ἔτι.
[6] δὲ added by Xylander.





Hylas, still ruffled by his ill-temper, made an awkward reply, saying that the soul of Ajax, by Plato's account, on drawing the twentieth turn in the underworld, had exchanged his former shape for that of a lion. Personally, however, he often in point of fact thought of what the old man said in the comedy :

I'd rather be reborn an ass than see
Inferior men live more renowned than me.[a]

"Well," rejoined Sospis with a laugh, "in the interval before we put on our donkey-skins, explain to us, as you care for Plato, what was in his mind when he described the soul of the Telamonian as having drawn twentieth place when he came forward to choose his fate." Hylas replied with curses, imagining that he was being made fun of for his lack of success ; so my brother spoke up, saying, "Surely now, is it not true that Ajax always wins the second prize, 'after the faultless son of Peleus,'[b] for beauty, size, and bravery, while twenty is the second ten, and ten is as pre-eminent among numbers as Achilles was among the Achaeans ?" We laughed, and then Ammonius said, "That will do, Lamprias, as your piece of fun with Hylas ; we, however, want none of your jests, but a serious discussion of the reason, seeing that you have volunteered to take on the question."

2. Lamprias was flustered, then after a short pause said that Plato often treats us to a jesting play on words, but it is in those passages where he combines myth with his arguments about the soul that he makes

[a] Menander, *Theophorumenê*, frag. 1. 18-19 Koerte, where the speaker imagines himself offered a choice of shapes in a second life.
[b] Homer, *Odyssey*, xi. 551=470.

(740) μάλιστα τῷ νῷ. τοῦ τε γὰρ οὐρανοῦ τὴν νοητὴν φύσιν ἅρμα καλεῖν πτηνὸν διὰ[1] τὴν ἐναρμόνιον τοῦ κόσμου περιφοράν, ἐνταῦθά τε[2] τὸν αὐτάγγελον τῶν ἐν Ἅιδου Πάμφυλον γένος Ἁρμονίου πατρὸς Ἥρα δ' αὐτὸν ὀνομάζειν, αἰνιττόμενον ὅτι γεννῶνται μὲν C αἱ ψυχαὶ καθ' ἁρμονίαν καὶ συναρμόττονται τοῖς σώμασιν, ἀπαλλαγεῖσαι δὲ συμφέρονται[3] παντα-χόθεν εἰς τὸν ἀέρα κἀκεῖθεν αὖθις ἐπὶ τὰς δευτέρας γενέσεις τρέπονται. "τί δὴ κωλύει καὶ τὸ 'εἰκο-στὸν' εἰρῆσθαι πρὸς τὸ μὴ ἀληθὲς ἀλλ' 'εἰκὸς' τοῦ[4] λόγου καὶ πλαττόμενον, ἢ πρὸς τὸν κλῆρον[5] ὡς 'εἰκῇ' καὶ κατὰ τύχην γινόμενον; ἀεὶ μὲν γὰρ ἅπτεται τῶν τριῶν αἰτιῶν, ἅτε δὴ πρῶτος ἢ μά-λιστα συνιδών, ὅπη τὸ καθ' εἱμαρμένην τῷ κατὰ τύχην[6] αὖθίς τε τὸ ἐφ' ἡμῖν ἑκατέρῳ καὶ συναμφο-τέροις ἐπιμίγνυσθαι καὶ συμπλέκεσθαι πέφυκε. νῦν δὲ θαυμαστῶς ἣν ἔχει δύναμιν ἐν[7] τοῖς ἡμε-D τέροις πράγμασιν ἕκαστον ὑποδεδήλωκεν, τὴν μὲν

[1] διὰ added by Wyttenbach.
[2] τε Bernardakis: δὲ.
[3] συμφέρονται Basel edition: συμφέρουσαι.
[4] εἰκὸς τοῦ Turnebus: εἰκοστοῦ.
[5] κλῆρον Wyttenbach: κνερὸν.
[6] τύχην Stephanus, Anon. 2 (Turn.): ψυχὴν.
[7] ἐν added by Madvig.

[a] Plato, *Phaedrus*, 246 E, where the sense may be "winged team of horses," and there is no intention to allegorize any "intelligible nature of the heavens," by which Plutarch means the Form that is the model of the physical universe.

[b] Plato, *Republic*, 614 B has Armenius, but Proclus records that some wished to read Armonius (*sic*).

[c] Pamphylia was a district of Asia Minor, but "Pamphylian" might mean "of all tribes," and Er is taken as a modification of *aër* (air).





most use of their significance. Thus he alludes to the intelligible nature of the heavens by the phrase "winged chariot" (*harma*),[a] with reference to the harmonious (*enharmonion*) revolution of the universe. Similarly in this passage he makes the man who reports his own experience of Hades a Pamphylian by race, the son of Harmonius,[b] and gives him the name of Er,[c] in a riddling allusion to the fact that the souls are born by a union of parts (*harmonia*)[d] and are fitted (*synharmottontai*) to their bodies, on getting release from which they collect from all quarters in the air (*aër*), whence they betake themselves again to their second births. "Now is there any reason why 'twentieth' (*eikostos*) should not have been said with reference to the unreal yet likely (*eikos*) imaginative element of the story, or to the ballot as being random (*eikê*) and a matter of luck? Plato constantly touches on the three causes,[e] as is natural enough for the man who first or most particularly observed how in the course of nature the operation of destiny mingles and interweaves with that of luck, while our free-will in its turn combines with one or other of them or with both simultaneously. So in this passage he has admirably suggested the influence that each cause

[d] Plato, *Timaeus*, 41 D.

[e] A clear exaggeration. This way of formulating a tripartition of causes (*cf.* Epicurus, *Letter to Menoeceus*, 133) belongs to an age later than Plato, but a very similar division, in which "nature" replaces "fate," is assumed by Protagoras in the dialogue that bears his name, 323 D, and criticized at *Laws*, 888 E, not so much as being false in itself, but because the generality take a false view of "nature." At *Laws*, 709 B the Athenian stranger says that human affairs are governed by God (whom we might equate with "fate"), by chance, and in a minor degree by human skill (which corresponds to the phrase here translated "free will").

(740) αἵρεσιν τῶν βίων[1] τῷ ἐφ' ἡμῖν ἀποδιδούς (ἀρετὴ γὰρ ἀδέσποτον καὶ κακία), τὸ δ' εὖ βιοῦν τοὺς ὀρθῶς ἑλομένους καὶ τἀναντία τοὺς κακῶς εἱμαρμένης ἀνάγκῃ συνάπτων· αἱ δὲ τῶν κλήρων ἀτάκτως διασπειρομένων ἐπιπτώσεις τὴν τύχην παρεισάγουσιν καὶ τροφαῖς καὶ πολιτείαις, ὧν ἕκαστοι λαγχάνουσι, πολλὰ τῶν ἡμετέρων προκαταλαμβάνουσαν.[2] ὅρα δή, μὴ τῶν κατὰ τύχην αἰτίαν ζητεῖν ἄλογόν ἐστιν· ἂν γὰρ ἔν τινι λόγῳ φαίνηται γεγονὼς ὁ κλῆρος, οὐκέτι γίνεται κατὰ τύχην οὐδ' αὐτομάτως ἀλλ' ἔκ τινος εἱμαρμένης καὶ προνοίας."

E 3. Ἔτι δὲ τοῦ Λαμπρίου λέγοντος ὁ γραμματικὸς ἤδη Μᾶρκος ἐδόκει τι συλλογίζεσθαι καὶ διαριθμεῖν πρὸς αὑτόν· ἔπειτα παυσαμένου, "τῶν Ὁμηρικῶν," ἔφη, "ψυχῶν,[3] ὅσας ἐν Νεκυίᾳ κατωνόμακεν, ἡ μὲν Ἐλπήνορος οὔπω καταμεμιγμένη ταῖς ἐν[4] Ἅιδου διὰ τὸ μὴ τεθάφθαι τὸν νεκρὸν ὥσπερ ἐν μεθορίοις πλανᾶται· τὴν δὲ Τειρεσίου ταῖς ἄλλαις οὐκ ἄξιον δήπου συγκαταριθμεῖν,

> ᾧ[5] καὶ τεθνειῶτι νόον πόρε Περσεφόνεια
> οἴῳ πεπνῦσθαι

καὶ διαλέγεσθαι καὶ ξυνιέναι τῶν ζώντων, πρὶν ἢ
F πιεῖν τοῦ αἵματος. ἂν οὖν ταύτας ὑπεξελόμενος, ὦ Λαμπρία, τὰς ἄλλας διαριθμῇς, αὐτὸ συμβαίνει, τὴν Αἴαντος εἰκοστὴν εἰς ὄψιν ἀφῖχθαι τοῦ Ὀδυσ-

[1] τῶν βίων Wyttenbach : τῷ βίῳ.
[2] προκαταλαμβάνουσαν Meziriacus : προκαταλαμβάνουσιν.
[3] ἔφη ψυχῶν added by Xylander.
[4] ἐν added by Leonicus.
[5] ᾧ] τῷ Homer.





exerts in our affairs, assigning the choice of lives to our free-will (for 'goodness and wickedness obey no master'[a]), while associating with the compulsion of destiny the good life of those who choose correctly, and the contrary condition of those whose choice is bad; then, the fall of the lots as they are scattered haphazard introduces luck, which predetermines many things in our lives, by reason of the various forms of upbringing and society which different groups happen to enjoy.[b] Now consider whether it is not absurd to search for a cause for what happens by chance; if it should appear that the result of the ballot accords with any principle, the ballot ceases to be a matter of luck or accident and becomes the effect of some form of destiny or providence."

3. While Lamprias was still speaking, Marcus the teacher of literature seemed to be doing a sum and counting to himself; then, when the speech was concluded, "of all the souls that Homer named in the episode of the Dead,"[c] he said, "that of Elpenor had not yet joined those in Hades, his corpse not having had its burial, but wandered around a kind of no man's land; and it would, I take it, not be proper to count in with the others the soul of Teiresias,

> To whom even in death Persephonê gave sense,
> That he alone should have his wits[d]

and converse with and understand the living before drinking of the blood. If you subtract these two, Lamprias, and count up the others, it tallies exactly: the soul of Ajax was the twentieth to present himself

[a] Plato, *Republic*, 617 E.
[b] *Cf.* Plotinus, *Enneads*, ii. 3. 15.
[c] A term that approximately covers the eleventh book of the *Odyssey*.
[d] Homer, *Odyssey*, x. 494-495.

(740) σέως· καὶ πρὸς τοῦτο παίζειν τὸν Πλάτωνα τῇ Ὁμηρικῇ Νεκυίᾳ προσαναχρωννύμενον."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ϛ

Τί αἰνίττεται ὁ περὶ τῆς ἥττης τοῦ Ποσειδῶνος μῦθος; ἐν ᾧ καὶ διὰ τί τὴν δευτέραν Ἀθηναῖοι τοῦ Βοηδρομιῶνος ἐξαιροῦσιν;

Collocuntur Menephylus, Hylas, Lamprias

741 1. Θορυβησάντων δὲ πάντων, Μενέφυλος ὁ Περιπατητικὸς προσαγορεύσας τὸν Ὕλαν, "ὁρᾷς,"[1] εἶπεν, "ὡς οὐκ ἦν τὸ ἐρώτημα χλευασμὸς οὐδ' ὕβρις· ἀλλ' ἀφείς, ὦ μακάριε, τὸν δυστράπελον Αἴαντα καὶ δυσώνυμον, ὥς φησι Σοφοκλῆς, γενοῦ μετὰ τοῦ Ποσειδῶνος, ὃν αὐτὸς εἴωθας[2] ἱστορεῖν ἡμῖν ἡττώμενον πολλάκις, ἐνταῦθα μὲν ὑπ' Ἀθηνᾶς ἐν Δελφοῖς δ' ὑπὸ τοῦ Ἀπόλλωνος ἐν Ἄργει δ' ὑπὸ τῆς Ἥρας ἐν Αἰγίνῃ δ' ὑπὸ τοῦ Διὸς ἐν Νάξῳ δ' ὑπὸ τοῦ Διονύσου, πρᾶον δὲ πανταχοῦ καὶ ἀμήνιτον ὄντα περὶ τὰς δυσημερίας· ἐνταῦθα γοῦν καὶ
B νεὼ κοινωνεῖ[3] μετὰ τῆς Ἀθηνᾶς, ἐν ᾧ καὶ βωμός ἐστιν Λήθης[4] ἱδρυμένος." καὶ ὁ Ὕλας ὥσπερ ἡδίων γενόμενος, "ἐκεῖνο δέ σ'," εἶπεν, "ὦ Μενέφυλε, λέληθεν, ὅτι καὶ τὴν δευτέραν τοῦ Βοηδρο-

[1] ὁρᾷς Meziriacus, Amyot trans.: ὁρᾶτε.
[2] εἴωθας Xylander: εἴωθα.
[3] νεὼ κοινωνεῖ Basel edition: νέω κοινὸν οἱ* καὶ.
[4] Λήθης Xylander, Anon. 2 (Turn.): ἀληθης.

[a] Sophocles, *Ajax* 914. The Greek name Aias suggests *aiai* (alas).
[b] *Cf.* Herodotus, viii. 55.





to Odysseus' sight. It is to this that Plato makes a playful allusion, taking a piece of colour from Homer's episode of the Dead."

## QUESTION 6

What is the hidden meaning in the story of Poseidon's defeat? Included is the question why the Athenians omit the second day of the month Boëdromion.

Speakers: Menephylus, Hylas, Lamprias

1. After general applause, Menephylus the Peripatetic addressed Hylas. "You see," he said, "the question was not a piece of impertinence or insolence. But come, my dear man, renounce 'obstinate Ajax, named for ill,' as Sophocles has it,[a] and join the company of Poseidon. You are yourself always relating to us how he was worsted on many occasions, here in Athens by Athena,[b] at Delphi by Apollo,[c] at Argos by Hera,[d] in Aegina by Zeus,[e] and in Naxos by Dionysus,[f] but everywhere took his failure with an easy-going absence of resentment. Here for instance he even shares a temple with Athena,[g] in which there is, moreover, an altar dedicated to Forgetfulness." "There is another thing, Menephylus," replied Hylas, apparently in a better temper, "have you forgotten that we also omit the second day of

[c] *Cf.* Pausanias, ii. 33. 2, scholiast on Lycophron, *Alexandra*, 617, Eustathius on Periegetes, 498, Callimachus, frag. 593 Pfeiffer, Strabo, viii. 14, scholiast on Aeschylus, *Eumenides*, 27.
[d] *Cf.* Pausanias, ii. 15. 5, who says that Poseidon revenged himself by making the land waterless.
[e] *Cf.* scholiast on Pindar, *Isthmians*, viii. 92.
[f] *Cf.* Diodorus Siculus, iii. 66.
[g] The Erechtheum on the Acropolis.

(741) μιῶνος ἡμέραν ἐξαιροῦμεν οὐ[1] πρὸς τὴν σελήνην, ἀλλ' ὅτι ταύτῃ δοκοῦσιν ἐρίσαι περὶ τῆς χώρας οἱ θεοί;" "παπαί,"[2] εἶπεν ὁ Λαμπρίας, "ὅσῳ τοῦ Θρασυβούλου γέγονεν Ποσειδῶν πολιτικώτερος, εἰ μὴ κρατῶν ὡς ἐκεῖνος, ἀλλ' ἡττώ . . ."

ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ζ

*Τίς αἰτία τῆς εἰς τριάδα διαιρέσεως τῶν μελῶν;*

ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Η

*Τίνι διαφέρει τὰ ἐμμελῆ διαστήματα τῶν συμφώνων;*

ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Θ

*Τίς αἰτία συμφωνήσεως; ἐν ᾧ καὶ διὰ τί, τῶν συμφώνων ὁμοῦ κρουομένων, τοῦ βαρυτέρου γίνεται τὸ μέλος;*

ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ Ι

*Διὰ τί, τῶν ἐκλειπτικῶν περιόδων ἡλίου καὶ σελήνης ἰσαρίθμων οὐσῶν,[3] ἡ σελήνη φαίνεται πλεονάκις ἐκλείπουσα τοῦ ἡλίου;*

[1] *ἐξαιροῦμεν οὐ* Anon. (Turn. ?) : *ἐξηρημένου.*
[2] *παπαί* Meziriacus : *πάντα.*
[3] *οὐσῶν* Bernardakis : *ὄντων.*

[a] *Cf. De Fraterno Amore*, 489 B. The lunar month being of about 29½ days, the 12 Greek months were alternately of 30 and 29 days, making an annual total of 354 days. In order to prevent a change of the season in which any month fell, an extra month was from time to time intercalated. Boëdromion was an autumn month (September or October).

[b] Leader of the restored democracy at Athens in 403 B.C., when, under Spartan pressure, a general amnesty was declared.

[c] Diatonic, chromatic, enharmonic ; *cf.* 744 C, *infra.*

[d] "Melodic" intervals, for which there is no proper





Boëdromion, not to suit the moon,[a] but because that is the day on which the gods are believed to have had their territorial dispute?" "Whew!" cried Lamprias, "how much Poseidon exceeded Thrasybulus[b] in civic spirit, if in the hour of defeat not, like the other, in that of victory, ⟨he agreed to bear no grudge. . . ."⟩

QUESTION 7

What is the reason for the threefold division of melodies ?[c]

QUESTION 8

What makes the difference between consonant and melodic intervals ?[d]

QUESTION 9

What is the cause of consonance ? Included is the question why when consonant notes are struck simultaneously the melody goes with the one of lower pitch.[e]

QUESTION 10

Since the ecliptic periods of sun and moon are equal, why is the moon seen to be eclipsed more frequently than the sun ?[f]

English equivalent, fall short of consonance, but are proper to the melodic scale.

[e] *Cf. Praecepta Conjugalia*, 139 C ; [Aristotle], *Problems*, xix. 12.

[f] *Cf. De Facie in Orbe Lunae*, 932 B, 933 E. There is an 18-year cycle (223 lunar months) according to which the moon is eclipsed at an interval of either five months (five times) or six months (33 times) after the preceding eclipse ; an eclipse of the sun occurs at the preceding or following new moon, but is visible from certain areas only of the earth's surface.

(741) C

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ΙΑ

Περὶ τοῦ μὴ τοὺς αὐτοὺς διαμένειν ἡμᾶς, ἀεὶ τῆς οὐσίας ῥεούσης

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ΙΒ

Πότερόν ἐστι πιθανώτερον τὸ ἀρτίους εἶναι τοὺς σύμπαντας ἀστέρας ἢ περιττούς;

Collocuntur Sospis, Glaucias, Protogenes, Plutarchus, alii

" . . . ὅρκοις δ' ἄνδρας ἐξαπατητέον ;" καὶ ὁ Γλαυκίας, " ἐγὼ μέν," ἔφη, " κατὰ Πολυκράτους ἀκήκοα τοῦ τυράννου λεγόμενον τὸν λόγον τοῦτον· εἰκὸς δὲ καὶ καθ' ἑτέρων λέγεσθαι· σὺ δὲ πρὸς τί τοῦτ' ἐρωτᾷς ;" " ὅτι νὴ Δί'," ὁ Σῶσπις ἔφη, " τοὺς μὲν παῖδας ἀστραγάλοις ὁρῶ[1] τοὺς δ' Ἀκαδημαϊκοὺς λόγοις ἀρτιάζοντας[2]· οὐδὲν γὰρ οἱ τοιοῦτοι στοχασμοὶ[3] διαφέρουσιν τῶν ἐρωτώντων, πότερον ἄρτια τῇ χειρὶ συνειληφότες ἢ περιττὰ προτείνουσιν."[4] ἐπαναστὰς οὖν ὁ Πρωτογένης καί με καλέσας ἐξ ὀνόματος, " τί παθόντες," εἶπεν, " τοὺς ῥήτορας τούτους τρυφᾶν ἐῶμεν, ἑτέρων καταγελῶντας, αὐτοὺς δὲ μηδὲν ἐρωτωμένους μηδὲ

[1] ὁρῶ Stephanus, (Amyot) : ὁρῶν.
[2] λόγοις ἀρτιάζοντας Wyttenbach : λόγους ἁρπάζοντας.
[3] στοχασμοὶ Wilamowitz, Kronenberg : στόμαχοι. λογόμαχοι Doehner.
[4] προτείνουσιν Wilamowitz, Hartman : συντείνουσιν.

[a] *Cf. De E apud Delphos*, 392 A-E.
[b] Whether the stars are even or odd in number was for the Stoics the stock example of absolute uncertainty, *cf.* Sextus Empiricus, *Outlines of Pyrrhonism*, ii. 97, *Against the Logicians*, ii. 147, etc. It would delight an Academic to





## QUESTION 11

On the subject of our having no permanent identity, since our substance is always in flux.[a]

## QUESTION 12

Whether it is more plausible that the total number of the stars is even than that it is odd.[b]

Speakers: Sospis, Glaucias, Protogenes, Plutarch, and others

" . . . ⟨I SUPPOSE you know the saying of Lysander,⟩ that ⟨boys⟩ are to be led astray ⟨by knuckle-bones⟩, men by oaths ?"[c] " I have heard that story put on the tyrant Polycrates," said Glaucias, " but it's likely enough that it is told against others too.[d] But what is the point of your question ?" " This," replied Sospis, " that I see boys playing odd and even with knuckle-bones, and the Academics with words. There is not a bit of difference between guesswork of this kind and people who ask whether they hold an odd or an even number of things in their outstretched fist." At this Protogenes got to his feet and, calling me by name, " What's the matter with us," he asked, " that we let these orators have it all their own way, deriding others but not being asked any questions themselves or contributing anything

show that a probable answer could be given even to this question.

[c] *Cf. Apophthegmata Laconica*, 229 B, *Life of Lysander*, viii, where he is said to have followed the lead of Polycrates. Knuckle-bones were used as playthings, and particularly desirable ones (*cf.* Theophrastus, *Characters*, v. 9) would make tempting gifts.
[d] Told of Dionysius (? I) by Plutarch, *De Fortuna Alexandri*, 330 F, and of Philip of Macedon by Aelian, *Varia Hist.* vii. 12.

(741) συμβολὰς λόγων τιθέντας; εἰ μὴ νὴ Δία φήσουσι
D μηδὲν αὐτοῖς μετεῖναι τῆς ἐν οἴνῳ κοινωνίας, Δημοσθένους ἐπαινέταις καὶ ζηλωταῖς οὖσιν, ἀνδρὸς ἐν ἅπαντι τῷ βίῳ μηδέποτε πιόντος οἶνον." "οὐκ αἴτιον," ἔφην ἐγώ, "τοῦτο[1] τούτων, ἀλλ' ἡμεῖς οὐδὲν αὐτοὺς ἠρωτήκαμεν· εἰ δὲ μή τι σὺ χρησιμώτερον ἔχεις, ἐγώ μοι δοκῶ προβαλεῖν αὐτοῖς ἐκ τῶν Ὁμήρου ῥητορικῶν θέσεων μίαν ἀντινομικήν."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ΙΓ

Περὶ τοῦ ἐν τῇ τρίτῃ ῥαψῳδίᾳ τῆς Ἰλιάδος ἀντινομικοῦ ζητήματος

Collocuntur Protogenes, Plutarchus, Sospis, Glaucias

1. "Τίν'," ἔφη, "ταύτην;" "ἐγώ σοι φράσω,'
E εἶπον, "ἅμα καὶ τούτοις προβάλλων· διὸ τὸν νοῦν ἤδη προσεχέτωσαν. ὁ γὰρ Ἀλέξανδρος ἐπὶ ῥητοῖς δήπου πεποίηται τὴν πρόκλησιν οὕτως·

αὐτὰρ ἔμ' ἐν μέσσῳ καὶ ἀρηίφιλον Μενέλαον
συμβάλετ' ἀμφ' Ἑλένῃ καὶ κτήμασι πᾶσι μάχεσθαι.
ὁππότερος δέ κε νικήσῃ κρείσσων τε γένηται,
κτήμαθ' ἑλὼν εὖ πάντα γυναῖκά τε οἶκαδ' ἀγέσθω.

καὶ πάλιν ὁ Ἕκτωρ ἀναγορεύων καὶ τιθεὶς εἰς μέσον πᾶσι τὴν πρόκλησιν αὐτοῦ μονονουχὶ τοῖς

[1] τοῦτο] τὸ Pohlenz.





of their own to the conversational pool? Unless indeed they are going to say that they take no share in the society of the wine-table, in approval and emulation of Demosthenes, a man who never drank wine in the whole of his life!" "That," I replied, "is not the reason for this immunity of theirs. The fact is that we haven't asked them anything. Unless you have a more useful suggestion, I intend to put to them from among the questions in Homer belonging to the advocate's province one that involves a conflict of formulas."

## QUESTION 13

On the problem, involving a conflict of formulas, in the third rhapsody of the *Iliad*.[a]

Speakers: Protogenes, Plutarch, Sospis, Glaucias

1. "WHAT question do you mean?" he asked. "I will tell you," I replied, "and at the same time set these gentlemen their problem; so let them pay attention at once. You will agree that Alexander's challenge was made on express conditions as follows:

But in the midst match me with warlike Menelaüs,
That we may fight for Helen and for all her wealth;
Whoever wins and proves himself the better man,
Let his be all the wealth and wife to carry home.

Hector, again, in announcing and communicating Menelaüs'[b] challenge to all the world, used almost

[a] A question referred to by Eustathius, who says (415. 38) that "the ancients" held the Trojans' case to be the better. This view, here supported by Glaucias, is presumably that of Plutarch, since it rebuts that previously put forward by Sospis.

[b] Homer, *Iliad*, iii. 69-73.

(741) αὐτοῖς ὀνόμασιν κέχρηται·

ἄλλους μὲν κέλεται Τρῶας καὶ πάντας Ἀχαιοὺς
F τεύχεα κάλ' ἀποθέσθαι ἐπὶ χθονὶ πουλυβοτείρῃ,
αὐτὸν δ' ἐν μέσσῳ καὶ ἀρηίφιλον Μενέλαον
οἷους ἀμφ' Ἑλένῃ καὶ[1] κτήμασι πᾶσι μάχεσθαι.
τῷ δέ κε νικήσαντι γυνὴ καὶ κτήμαθ' ἕποιτο.

δεξαμένου δὲ τοῦ Μενελάου, ποιοῦνται τὰς συνθήκας ἐνόρκους, ἐξάρχει δ' ὁ Ἀγαμέμνων·

742 εἰ μέν κεν Μενέλαον Ἀλέξανδρος καταπέφνῃ,
αὐτὸς ἔπειθ' Ἑλένην ἀγέτω[2] καὶ κτήματα πάντα.
εἰ δέ κ' Ἀλέξανδρον κτείνῃ ξανθὸς Μενέλαος,
κτήμαθ' ἑλὼν εὖ πάντα γυναῖκά τε οἶκαδ' ἀγέσθω.

ἐπεὶ τοίνυν ἐνίκησεν μὲν οὐκ ἀνεῖλεν δ' ὁ Μενέλαος, μεταλαβόντες ἑκάτεροι τὴν ἀξίωσιν ἰσχυρίζονται τοῖς τῶν πολεμίων, οἱ μὲν ὡς νενικημένου τοῦ Πάριδος ἀπαιτοῦντες, οἱ δ' ὡς μὴ τεθνηκότος οὐκ ἀποδιδόντες. πῶς οὖν," ἔφην,[3] " τὴν δίκην ταύτην
' ἰθύντατα εἴποι ' καὶ διαιτήσειεν τὴν ἀντινομίαν,
B οὐ φιλοσόφων οὐδὲ γραμματικῶν, ἀλλὰ ῥητόρων ἔργον ἐστὶ φιλογραμματούντων ὥσπερ ὑμεῖς καὶ φιλοσοφούντων."

2. Ὁ μὲν οὖν Σῶσπις ἔφη κυριώτερον εἶναι τὸν τοῦ προκεκλημένου λόγον, ὥσπερ νόμον· " ἐκεῖνος

[1] οἷους . . . καὶ added by Basel edition from Homer.
[2] ἀγέτω] ἐχέτω Homer.
[3] ἔφην Meziriacus : ἔφη.

[a] *Iliad*, iii. 88-91.
[b] *Iliad*, iii. 255 (Idaeus to Priam).
[c] *Iliad*, iii. 281-282.
[d] *Iliad*, iii. 284.





the same words :

He bids the other Trojans and all Achaeans too
Lay down upon the fertile earth their shining armour ;
Himself between the armies with warlike Menelaüs
Shall fight alone for Helen and for all her wealth,[a]
And to the victor wife and wealth alike must go.[b]

When Menelaüs accepts, they confirm their bargain by sworn oaths, Agamemnon pronouncing the terms :

If Alexander should bring death to Menelaüs,
Then Helen shall be his and with her all her wealth [c] ;
But if fair-haired Menelaüs works Alexander's death,[d]
Let him take all the wealth and wife to carry home." [e]

Now when Menelaüs overcame Alexander without killing him, the two sides exchanged positions over their requirements, each basing their case on the form of words used by the enemy : the Greeks claimed restitution because Paris had been beaten, and the Trojans refused to hand over because he had not been killed.[f] Now the question," said I, " how a man shall ' speak most straight '[g] on this dispute and arbitrate in the conflict of formulas is the business not of philosophers or literary men, but of rhetoricians with literary and philosophical interests like you."

2. Sospis said that the formula of the challenger had greater validity, like a law.[h] " For it was he who

[e] *Iliad*, iii. 72.
[f] *Iliad*, iii. 456-460. The Trojans' rejection of the demand, made by Agamemnon, is not recorded by Homer.
[g] *Iliad*, xviii. 508.
[h] Perhaps the point of the comparison is that the terms of a law must be accepted as they stand by anyone who puts himself within its operation.

(742) γὰρ ἐφ' οἷς διαγωνιοῦνται κατήγγειλεν,[1] οἱ δὲ δεξάμενοι καὶ ὑπακούσαντες οὐκέτι κύριοι προστιθέντες. ἡ δὲ πρόκλησις οὐ περὶ φόνου καὶ θανάτου γέγονεν, ἀλλὰ περὶ νίκης καὶ ἥττης. καὶ μάλα δικαίως· ἔδει γὰρ τὴν γυναῖκα τοῦ κρείττονος εἶναι, κρείττων δ' ὁ νικῶν, ἀποθνήσκειν δὲ πολλάκις συμβαίνει καὶ ἀγαθοῖς ὑπὸ κακῶν, ὡς ὕστερον Ἀχιλλεὺς ἀπέθανεν τοξευθεὶς ὑπὸ Πάριδος· καὶ οὐκ ἂν οἶμαι φαίημεν Ἀχιλλέως ἧτταν[2] γεγονέναι τὸν θάνατον
C οὐδὲ νίκην ἀλλ' ἄδικον εὐτυχίαν τοῦ βάλλοντος. ἀλλ' ὁ Ἕκτωρ ἥττητο καὶ πρὶν ἀποθνήσκειν, μὴ δεξάμενος ἀλλὰ δείσας καὶ φυγὼν ἐπερχομένου τοῦ Ἀχιλλέως· ὁ γὰρ ἀπειπάμενος καὶ φυγὼν ἧττηται καὶ συγκεχώρηκε κρείττονα τὸν ἀντίπαλον εἶναι. διὸ[3] πρῶτον μὲν ἡ Ἶρις ἐξαγγέλλουσα τῇ Ἑλένῃ φησί,

μακρῇς ἐγχείῃσι μαχήσονται περὶ σεῖο·
τῷ δέ κε νικήσαντι φίλη κεκλήσῃ ἄκοιτις·

ἔπειθ' ὁ Ζεὺς τῷ Μενελάῳ τῆς μάχης[4] τὸ βραβεῖον ἀπέδωκεν εἰπών,

νίκη μὲν δὴ φαίνετ' ἀρηιφίλου Μενελάου.

D γελοῖον γάρ, εἰ τὸν μὲν Ποδῆν ἐνίκησεν πόρρωθεν ἀκοντίσας μὴ προσδοκήσαντα μηδὲ φυλαξάμενον,

[1] ἐκεῖνος . . . κατήγγειλεν Meziriacus, Amyot trans.: ἐκείνοις . . . κατήγγειλαν.
[2] Ἀχιλλέως ἧτταν Basel edition: Ἀχιλλεὺς ἧττον.
[3] διὸ Basel edition: δεῖ.
[4] τῆς μάχης Anon. 1 (Turn.): τῇ μάχῃ.

[a] Homer, *Iliad*, iii. 137-138.





announced the terms on which they would fight the duel, while those who as respondents accepted the terms carried no authority when they added to them. Now the challenge was not concerned with killing and death, but with victory and defeat. Quite rightly so, too: it was proper that the woman should belong to the better man, and the victor is the better man. On the other hand, it often occurs that even good men are killed by bad, as was Achilles later, when he was shot by Paris. We should not, I imagine, say that his death was a defeat for Achilles, nor should we call it a victory for the man who shot him, but an unfair piece of good luck. Hector, on the other hand, was defeated even before he was killed, when at the approach of Achilles he did not stand his ground but took to his heels in fear. The man who gives up and runs away is defeated beyond possibility of disguise, and has confessed his adversary to be the better man. That is why, in the first instance, Iris when giving her message to Helen says,

With their long spears they will do battle for you:
And then you shall be known as own wife to the victor,[a]

and later Zeus gave the decision in the contest in favour of Menelaüs, with the words

The victory was clear for warlike Menelaüs.[b]

It would indeed be a laughable state of affairs if he 'defeated' Podes with a long-range javelin-shot[c] that caught him unexpecting and off guard, but did

[b] *Iliad*, iii. 457, but spoken by Agamemnon; Zeus has a similar line, iv. 13.
[c] *Iliad*, xvii. 575-579; there is no word of "defeating" Podes, but it is perhaps implied that Menelaüs' shot was from a distance at an unsuspecting target.

(742) τοῦ δ' ἀπειπαμένου καὶ δραπετεύσαντος καὶ καταδύντος εἰς τοὺς κόλπους τῆς γυναικὸς ἐσκυλευμένου ζῶντος οὐκ ἄξιος ἦν τὰ νικητήρια φέρεσθαι, κατὰ τὴν αὐτοῦ πρόκλησιν ἐκείνου κρείττων φανεὶς καὶ περιγενόμενος."

3. Ὑπολαβὼν δ' ὁ Γλαυκίας ἔφη πρῶτον μὲν ἔν τε δόγμασι καὶ νόμοις ἔν τε συνθήκαις καὶ ὁμολογίαις κυριώτερα τὰ δεύτερα[1] νομίζεσθαι καὶ βεβαιότερα τῶν πρώτων· "δεύτεραι δ'[2] ἦσαν αἱ δι' Ἀγαμέμνονος ὁμολογίαι τέλος ἔχουσαι θάνατον οὐχὶ ἧττον τοῦ κρατηθέντος. ἔπειτ' ἐκεῖναι[3] μὲν
E λόγοις, αὗται δὲ καὶ μεθ' ὅρκων εἴποντο καὶ προσῆσαν ἀραὶ τοῖς παραβαίνουσιν, οὐχ ἑνὸς ἀνδρὸς ἀλλὰ πάντων ἀποδεχομένων καὶ συνομολογούντων· ὥστε ταύτας[4] γεγονέναι κυρίως ὁμολογίας, ἐκείνας δὲ μόνας προκλήσεις. μαρτυρεῖ δ' ὁ Πρίαμος μετὰ τὰ ὅρκια τοῦ ἀγῶνος ἀπιών,[5]

Ζεὺς μέν που τό γε οἶδε καὶ ἀθάνατοι θεοὶ ἄλλοι,
ὁπποτέρῳ θανάτοιο τέλος πεπρωμένον ἐστίν·

ᾔδει γὰρ ἐπὶ τούτοις τὰς ὁμολογίας γεγενημένας. διὸ καὶ μετὰ μικρὸν ὁ Ἕκτωρ φησίν,

ὅρκια μὲν Κρονίδης ὑψίζυγος οὐκ ἐτέλεσσεν·

ἀτελὴς γὰρ ἔμεινεν ὁ ἀγὼν καὶ πέρας ἀναμφισβήτη-
F τον οὐκ εἶχεν μηδετέρου πεσόντος. ὅθεν ἔμοιγε

[1] δεύτερα Turnebus : δὲ ὕστερα.
[2] δεύτεραι δὲ Basel edition : δευτεραῖαι.
[3] ἐκεῖναι Hubert : ἐκείνῃ.
[4] ταύτας Wyttenbach : ταῦτα.
[5] ἀπιὼν Hubert : ἀπιὼν καὶ.





not deserve to get the prize of victory from a man who, giving up the fight, turned tail and took cover in the arms of his wife, having been stripped of his armour while alive [a]; yet he had shown himself the better man and prevailed according to the terms used by that very opponent in his challenge."

3. Glaucias spoke next, saying that in the first place, whether it is a case of decisions, or laws, or contracts, or agreements, the later of two is accounted the firmer and more valid. "The 'later' agreement in this case," he continued, "was that due to Agamemnon's intermediacy, which made the issue that of the death, not the defeat, of the conquered. Secondly, the earlier agreement was a verbal one, while the subsequent one was sworn with oaths as well, with attendant curses upon those who might break it, while everybody, not just a single individual, accepted it and joined in the covenant. So this was an agreement in the proper sense, and the other only a challenge. Priam testifies to this as he leaves the place of contest after the oath-taking:

Now Zeus, methinks, and the immortal gods can tell
Which of the two is fated to meet the end of death.[b]

He knew that these were the terms on which the agreement had been made. And so again a little later Hector says,

To our oaths the high-throned child of Cronus gave no effect [c]

because, when neither combatant fell, the contest remained unfinished and had no indisputable conclu-

[a] Menelaüs had torn his helmet from his head.
[b] *Iliad*, iii. 308-309.
[c] *Iliad*, vii. 69.

(742) δοκεῖ μηδ' ἀντινομικὸν[1] γεγονέναι τὸ ζήτημα, ταῖς δευτέραις ὁμολογίαις τῶν πρώτων ἐμπεριεχομένων· ὁ γὰρ ἀποκτείνας νενίκηκεν, οὐ μὴν ὁ νικήσας ἔκτεινεν. συνελόντι[2] δ' εἰπεῖν, Ἀγαμέμνων οὐκ ἔλυσε τὴν τοῦ Ἕκτορος πρόκλησιν ἀλλ' ἐσαφήνισεν, οὐδὲ
743 μετέθηκεν ἀλλὰ προσέθηκεν τὸ[3] κυριώτατον, ἐν τῷ κτεῖναι[4] τὸ νικῆσαι θέμενος· αὕτη γάρ ἐστι νίκη παντελής, αἱ δ' ἄλλαι προφάσεις καὶ ἀντιλογίας ἔχουσιν, ὡς ἡ παρὰ Μενελάου μήτε τρώσαντος μήτε διώξαντος. ὥσπερ οὖν ἐν ταῖς ἀληθιναῖς ἀντινομίαις οἱ δικασταὶ τῷ μηδὲν ἀμφισβητήσιμον ἔχοντι προστίθενται, τὸν ἀσαφέστερον ἐάσαντες, οὕτως ἐνταῦθα τὴν ἀπροφάσιστον καὶ γνώριμον τέλος[5] ἄγουσαν ὁμολογίαν βεβαιοτέραν χρὴ καὶ κυριωτέραν νομίζειν. ὃ δὲ μέγιστόν ἐστιν, αὐτὸς ὁ δοκῶν κρατεῖν, οὐκ ἀποστὰς φυγόντος οὐδὲ παυσάμενος, ἀλλὰ πανταχόσε ' φοιτῶν ἀν' ὅμιλον

εἴ που ἐσαθρήσειεν Ἀλέξανδρον θεοειδέα,'

B μεμαρτύρηκεν ἄκυρον εἶναι καὶ ἀτελῆ τὴν[6] νίκην, ἐκείνου διαπεφευγότος· οὐδ'[7] ἠμνημόνει τῶν ὑπ' αὐτοῦ διειρημένων[8]·

ἡμέων δ' ὁπποτέρῳ θάνατος καὶ μοῖρα τέτυκται,
τεθναίη, ἄλλοι δὲ διακρινθεῖτε τάχιστα.

διὸ ζητεῖν μὲν ἀναγκαῖον ἦν αὐτῷ τὸν Ἀλέξανδρον,

[1] μηδ' ἀντινομικὸν Basel edition: μηδέν τι νομικόν.
[2] συνελόντι Anon. 2 (Turn.): ἀλλ' ἔχοντι.
[3] τὸ Basel edition: τὸν.
[4] κτεῖναι Basel edition: κλίναι.
[5] τέλος Anon. 1 (Turn.): τέλους.
[6] τὴν added by Duebner. [7] οὐδ' Wyttenbach: οὖν.
[8] διειρημένων Doehner: εἰρημένων.





sion. It is therefore my opinion that the problem never was one involving conflict of formulas, since the former agreement is embraced by the latter[a]: to kill gives victory, but the victor has not necessarily killed his opponent. To sum up, Agamemnon did not supersede Hector's challenge but clarified it. Nor did he change its terms; he added the capital point by his stipulation that victory lay in killing the adversary. This is what constitutes complete victory; any other kind admits of excuses and controversies, as did that of Menelaüs when he neither inflicted any wound on his adversary nor followed up his retreat. Now in real instances of conflict the jury give their votes to the case that has nothing controversial about it and disregard the one that is less plain; just so we must here regard as firmer and more valid the agreement that involves an unquestionable and ascertainable conclusion. The most cogent point of all is that by not retiring or giving up when his opponent escaped, but by ' traversing the crowd ' in all directions

In hope of setting eyes on godlike Alexander,[b]

the very man who appears to have the upper hand has given his testimony that the victory was invalid and inconclusive, because his adversary had made good his escape. Nor did he then forget what he had stipulated:

But for whichever of us death stands ready and doom,
Let him die; and with all speed you others may part in peace.[c]

That is why it was necessary for him to hunt for

[a] *Cf.* Hermogenes, *Stat.* 10.
[b] Homer, *Iliad*, iii. 450. [c] *Iliad*, iii. 101-103.

(743) ὅπως ἀποκτείνας συντελέσῃ τὸ τοῦ ἀγῶνος ἔργον, μὴ κτείνας δὲ μηδὲ λαβὼν οὐ δικαίως ἀπήτει τὸ νικητήριον. οὐδὲ γὰρ ἐνίκησεν, εἰ δεῖ τεκμήρασθαι τοῖς ὑπ' αὐτοῦ λεγομένοις, ἐγκαλοῦντος τῷ Διὶ καὶ τὰς ἀποτεύξεις ὀδυρομένου·

Ζεῦ πάτερ, οὔ τις σεῖο θεῶν ὀλοώτερος ἄλλος·
C ἦ τ' ἐφάμην τίσασθαι Ἀλέξανδρον κακότητος,
νῦν δέ μοι ἐν χείρεσσιν ἄγη ξίφος, ἐκ δέ μοι ἔγχος
ἠίχθη παλάμηφιν ἐτώσιον, οὐδ' ἔβαλόν μιν·

αὐτὸς γὰρ ὁμολογεῖ μηδὲν εἶναι τὸ διακόψαι τὸ ἀσπίδιον καὶ λαβεῖν ἀπορρυὲν τὸ κράνος, εἰ μὴ βάλοι μηδ' ἀποκτείνειε τὸν πολέμιον."

## ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ΙΔ

Περὶ τοῦ ἀριθμοῦ τῶν Μουσῶν ὅσα[1] λέγεται μὴ κοινῶς

Collocuntur Herodes, Ammonius, Lamprias, Trypho, Dionysius, Plutarchus, Menephylus

1. Ἐκ τούτου σπονδὰς ἐποιησάμεθα ταῖς Μούσαις, καὶ τῷ Μουσηγέτῃ[2] παιανίσαντες συνῆσαμεν τῷ Ἐράτωνι πρὸς τὴν λύραν ἐκ τῶν Ἡσιόδου τὰ περὶ τὴν τῶν Μουσῶν γένεσιν. μετὰ δὲ τὴν ᾠδὴν
D Ἡρώδης ὁ ῥήτωρ, "ἀκούετ',"[3] ἔφη, "ὑμεῖς οἱ τὴν Καλλιόπην ἀποσπῶντες ἡμῶν, ὡς[4] τοῖς βασιλεῦσιν αὐτὴν παρεῖναί φησιν,[5] οὐκ ἀναλύουσι[6] δήπου συλλογισμοὺς οὐδ' ἐρωτῶσι μεταπίπτοντας,[7] ἀλλὰ

[1] ὅσα index : εὐς.
[2] Μουσηγέτῃ Hubert : Μουσηγέτῃ Ἀπόλλωνι.
[3] ἀκούετ' Basel edition : ἀκούειν.
[4] ὡς Hubert : σὺν. [5] φησιν Madvig : φασιν.
[6] ἀναλύουσι Xylander, Anon. 2 (Turn.) : ἀναλογοῦσι.





Alexander, with the object of killing him and so completing the business of the contest; and why, when he did not catch and kill him, he had no rightful claim to the prize of victory. He was not even the victor, if one can take his own words as evidence, when he upbraids Zeus in lament over his failures :

O father Zeus, no god of them all is your equal for mischief :
I did rely on avenging the villainy of Paris,
But in my hands the sword was shattered, and from my palm
The spear shot uselessly, and I failed to hit him.[a]

He himself confesses, you see, that so long as he did not hit and kill his enemy, it meant nothing to split his shield and seize the helmet that came away from his head."

## QUESTION 14

Unusual observations on the numbers of the Muses.

Speakers : Herodes, Ammonius, Lamprias, Trypho, Dionysius, Plutarch, Menephylus

1. After this we made libations to the Muses and, having sung a paean to their Leader,[b] joined Erato in singing to the lyre Hesiod's verses about the birth of the Muses.[c] When the song was over, Herodes the teacher of rhetoric spoke up. "You hear," said he, "you who try to drag Calliopê away from us rhetoricians, how Hesiod says that she is to be found in the company of kings,[d] not, I imagine, while they analyse syllogisms or propound fallacies of equivoca-

[a] *Iliad*, iii. 365-368. [b] Apollo.
[c] *Theogony*, 35 ff. [d] *Theogony*, 80.

[7] μεταπίπτοντας F. H. S., *cf.* Epictetus, ii. 19, οὐ συλλογισμοὺς ἀναλύετε, μεταπίπτοντας : μεγάλα εἰπόντας.

(743) ταῦτα πράττουσιν ἃ ῥητόρων ἐστὶ καὶ πολιτικῶν ἔργα. τῶν δ' ἄλλων ἥ τε Κλειὼ τὸ ἐγκωμιαστικὸν προσάγεται· ' κλέα ' γὰρ ἐκάλουν τοὺς ἐπαίνους· ἥ τε Πολύμνια τὸ ἱστορικόν· ἔστι γὰρ μνήμη πολλῶν· ἐνιαχοῦ δὲ καὶ πάσας,[1] ὥσπερ ἐν Χίῳ,[2] τὰς Μούσας Μνείας καλεῖσθαι λέγουσιν. ἐγὼ δὲ μεταποιοῦμαί τι καὶ τῆς Εὐτέρπης,[3] εἴπερ, ὥς φησι Χρύσιππος, αὕτη[4] τὸ[5] περὶ τὰς ὁμιλίας ἐπιτερπὲς εἴληχε καὶ
E κεχαρισμένον· ὁμιλητικὸς[6] γὰρ οὐδὲν ἧττον ἢ δικανικὸς ὁ ῥήτωρ καὶ συμβουλευτικός· αἱ γὰρ διαλέξεις[7] ἔχουσι καὶ εὐμενείας καὶ συνηγορίας καὶ ἀπολογίας· πλείστῳ δὲ τῷ ἐπαινεῖν χρώμεθα καὶ τῷ ψέγειν ἐν τούτοις, οὐ[8] φαύλων οὐδὲ μικρῶν τυγχά-

[1] πάσας Basel edition : πλάσας.
[2] Χίῳ Wilamowitz, Holland trans. : λείωι.
[3] τῆς Εὐτέρπης Basel edition : τη . . . τερπὴς.
[4] αὕτη Graf : αὐτὴ.
[5] τὸ Anon. (Turn.?) : τί.
[6] ὁμιλητικὸς Xylander, Anon. 2 (Turn.) : ὁμιλητὴν· καὶ.
[7] διαλέξεις Hubert : ἕξεις. Perhaps another accusative has fallen out before ἔχουσι.
[8] οὐ Basel edition : ὧν.

[a] We find it obvious that Polymnia is derived from the stems *poly-* (much, many), and *hymno-* (song of praise), and do not find it easy to understand that an ancient etymologist would not necessarily think this inconsistent with her name's indicating that she is the memory (*mneia*) of many things. *Oionistikê* (augury) is obviously derived from *oiônos* (bird) as *augurium* is from *avis*, but that does not prevent Plato from finding in the word an allusion to *oiêsis*, *nous*, and *historia* (*Phaedrus*, 244 c). He has a sort of reason on his side, for it could be argued that augury need not have been called *oionistikê*; it could as well have been, *e.g. ornithoskopia*, but for the fact that such a name would not have





tion, but as they engage in the business proper to orators and statesmen. Of the other Muses Clio takes laudatory eloquence, *klea* being an old name for praise, and Polymnia history, since she is the ' memory of many things.'[a] Actually all the Muses are said to be called Mneiai (Memories) in some places, as is the case in Chios.[b] For my part I lay claim to some share in Euterpê also, if as Chrysippus says,[c] she has as her province the pleasant (*epiterpes*) and delightful elements in conversation and informal talk.[d] Such talk is as much in the orators' sphere as are litigation and public policy; expressions of goodwill, support of others' causes, and defence of others' acts all have their place in conversation.[e] We also make extensive use of praise or blame in these contexts; if we do so skilfully, we achieve results that are neither

combined the elements of *oiêsis*, *nous*, and *historia* that are included in its nature.

[b] The place-name is introduced by an uncertain emendation, there being no confirmatory evidence.

[c] *S.V.F.* ii. 1099, *cf.* Cornutus, chap. 14.

[d] No single English word represents *homilia*, which covers not only what we call conversation (*e.g.* 629 F *supra*), but also continuous, but unrhetorical, discourse such as a philosopher may address to a small audience.

[e] The text here is uncertain. Herodes appears to allude to the three branches of oratory, *forensic* or that of the law-courts, *deliberative* or that concerned with public policy, and *epideictic*, the oratory of display. He wishes to show that conversation shares the functions of all three, having praise and blame in common with epideictic oratory, support and defence with forensic oratory, and something else (perhaps a pair of things) with deliberative oratory. The word translated " expressions of goodwill " is not associated elsewhere with deliberative oratory, the normal characteristics of which are persuasion and dissuasion, *cf.* Aristotle, *Rhetoric*, 1358 b, a passage which establishes the lines of all later treatments of this subject.

(743) νοντες, ἂν τεχνικῶς τοῦτο πράττωμεν, ἂν δ' ἀπείρως καὶ ἀτέχνως, ἀστοχοῦντες· τὸ γὰρ

ὦ πόποι, ὡς ὅδε πᾶσι φίλος καὶ τίμιός ἐστιν ἀνθρώποις

. . . δὲ μᾶλλον, ὡς τὸ περὶ[1] τὰς ὁμιλίας εὐάρμοστον ἔχουσι, πειθὼ καὶ χάριν οἶμαι προσήκειν."

2. Καὶ ὁ Ἀμμώνιος, "οὐκ ἄξιον," ἔφη, "σοι νεμεσᾶν, ὦ Ἡρώδη, καὶ 'παχείῃ'[2] χειρὶ τῶν Μουσῶν ἐπιδραττομένῳ· κοινὰ γὰρ τὰ φίλων, καὶ διὰ τοῦτο πολλὰς ἐγέννησε Μούσας ὁ Ζεύς, ὅπως ᾖ
F πᾶσιν ἀρύσασθαι τῶν καλῶν ἀφθόνως· οὔτε γὰρ κυνηγίας πάντες οὔτε στρατείας οὔτε ναυτιλίας οὔτε βαναυσουργίας, παιδείας δὲ καὶ λόγου δεόμεθα πάντες

εὐρυεδοῦς ὅσοι καρπὸν αἰνύμεθα χθονός·

ὅθεν Ἀθηνᾶν μίαν καὶ Ἄρτεμιν καὶ Ἥφαιστον ἕνα,
744 Μούσας δὲ πολλὰς ἐποίησεν. ὅ τι δ' ἐννέα καὶ οὐκ ἐλάττους οὐδὲ πλείους, ἆρ' ἂν[3] ἡμῖν φράσειας; οἶμαι δέ σε πεφροντικέναι φιλόμουσον οὕτω καὶ πολύμουσον ὄντα." "τί δὲ τοῦτο σοφόν;" εἶπεν ὁ Ἡρώδης· "πᾶσι γὰρ διὰ στόματός ἐστι καὶ πάσαις[4] ὑμνούμενος ὁ[5] τῆς ἐννεάδος ἀριθμός, ὡς

[1] τὸ περὶ Basel edition : τῷ ἀέρι.
[2] παχείῃ Doehner : πειε. [3] ἆρ' ἂν Bernardakis : ἄρα.
[4] πάσαις] πᾶσιν Leonicus. [5] ὁ added by Meziriacus.

[a] Homer, *Odyssey*, x. 38-39.
[b] This guess at the sense of the words lost is based on a passage of Stoic origin in Stobaeus, *Ecl.* ii. 108 5 W. (=*S.V.F.* iii. 630): "the good man, being good at *conversation* . . . is *well-adapted* to the *mass of mankind*, as





small nor unimportant, while inexperience and clumsiness make us miss them. The line

Heavens, how loved and honoured he by all mankind [a]

⟨is claimed by some philosophers as appropriate to themselves⟩,[b] but it is rather to us orators, I think, that Persuasion and Charm belong, as being well-adapted to conversation."

2. "It would be wrong, Herodes," replied Ammonius, "to resent your laying a hand, even 'a mighty hand,'[c] on the Muses. Friends' property is common property,[d] and the reason why Zeus was father to many Muses was his wish that everyone might draw unstintedly from the well of beauty. We do not all have a use for hunting or going to war or to sea or for a mechanical trade, but education and speech are needed by every one of us,

Who take the fruits of the broad-based earth.[e]

So he made one Athena, one Artemis, one Hephaestus, but many Muses. But why nine, neither more nor less? Could you tell us that? I am sure you must have considered the question, being such a lover of the arts and master of so many." "There is nothing abstruse in that," answered Herodes, "the number nine is on the tongue of every man, and of every woman too, as having the distinction of being the

a result of which he is also one to arouse *love* and possess *charm* and *persuasiveness*." The quotation from Chrysippus may well not be the only element of Stoic origin in Herodes' words.
[c] *Cf.* Homer, *Iliad*, iii. 376, etc.
[d] A familiar proverb.
[e] Simonides, frag. 4 Diehl, *cf.* Plato, *Protagoras*, 345 c. Quoted also by Plutarch, *Mor.* 470 D, 485 C, 1061 B.

(744) πρῶτος ἀπὸ πρώτου περισσοῦ[1] τετράγωνος ὢν καὶ περισσάκις περισσός, ἅτε δὴ τὴν διανομὴν εἰς τρεῖς
B ἴσους λαμβάνων περισσούς."

Καὶ ὁ Ἀμμώνιος ἐπιμειδιάσας, " ἀνδρικῶς ταυτὶ διεμνημόνευσας· καὶ πρόσθες αὐτοῖς ἔτι τοσοῦτον, τὸν ἀριθμὸν ἐκ δυεῖν κύβων[2] τῶν πρώτων συνηρμόσθαι, μονάδος καὶ ὀγδοάδος, καὶ καθ' ἑτέραν αὖ πάλιν σύνθεσιν ἐκ δυεῖν τριγώνων, τριάδος καὶ ἑξάδος, ὧν ἑκάτερος καὶ τέλειός ἐστιν. ἀλλὰ τί ταῦτα ταῖς Μούσαις μᾶλλον ἢ τοῖς ἄλλοις θεοῖς προσῆκεν, ὥστε[3] Μούσας ἔχομεν ἐννέα, Δήμητρας δὲ καὶ Ἀθηνᾶς καὶ Ἀρτέμιδας οὐκ ἔχομεν; οὐ γὰρ δήπου καὶ σὲ πείθει τὸ Μούσας γεγονέναι τοσαύτας, ὅτι τοὔνομα τῆς μητρὸς αὐτῶν ἐκ τοσούτων γραμμάτων ἐστίν."

Γελάσαντος δὲ τοῦ Ἡρώδου καὶ σιωπῆς γενο-
C μένης, προὔτρεπεν ἡμᾶς ἐπιχειρεῖν ὁ Ἀμμώνιος. (3) εἶπεν οὖν ὁ ἀδελφός, ὅτι τρεῖς ᾔδεσαν οἱ παλαιοὶ Μούσας· " καὶ τούτου λέγειν ἀπόδειξιν ὀψιμαθές ἐστι καὶ ἄγροικον ἐν τοσούτοις καὶ τοιούτοις ἀνδράσιν. αἰτία δ' οὐχ ὡς ἔνιοι λέγουσι τὰ μελῳδούμενα γένη, τὸ διάτονον καὶ τὸ χρωματικὸν καὶ τὸ ἐναρμόνιον· οὐδ' οἱ τὰ διαστήματα παρέχοντες

[1] περισσοῦ] ? τελείου, *cf.* Cornutus, chap. 14, ὁ τῶν ἐννέα ἀριθμός, συνιστάμενος κατὰ τὸ ἐφ' ἑαυτὸν γενέσθαι τὸν πρῶτον ἀπὸ τῆς μονάδος τελειότητός τινος μετέχειν δοκοῦντα ἀριθμόν.
[2] κύβων first added by Xylander, placed here by F. H. S.
[3] ὥστε Hartman : ὅτι.

[a] An inexact phrase: it is the first square of an odd (? perfect) number, or the square of the first odd (? perfect) number.

[b] A triangular number is one that can be represented by a triangular pattern of dots, thus: ∴, ∴∴, as can a square





first square of the first odd number [a] and the first product of odd numbers, since it can of course be divided into three equal odd numbers."

Ammonius smiled at him. " You put up a good fight by your recital of these facts, and you should add to them this much more, that the number nine is compounded of two cubes, namely the first two, one and eight, and by a different addition, of two triangular numbers, three and six, each of which is also a perfect number.[b] But what had all this to do with the Muses any more than with the rest of the gods, to result in our having nine Muses, but not nine Demeters, Athenas, and Artemises? I hardly suppose that *you* are convinced by the explanation that nine Muses were born because their mother's name [c] is spelled with that number of letters."

Herodes laughed and there was a silence, whereupon Ammonius encouraged us to attack the problem. (3) So my brother said that the ancients knew of three Muses only.[d] " To give proof of this fact," he continued, " in a company so numerous and so learned would be boorish pedantry. But the reason for it does not lie, as some say, in the three types of melody, diatonic, chromatic, and enharmonic,[e] nor in the three notes that establish the intervals,

number by a square pattern, thus: ::, :::. It might be possible to translate the text of the manuscripts " the number nine is compounded of two of the primary numbers, namely one and eight," explaining that eight is the first cube (738 F), as one is the first integer. But since πρῶτα usually means " prime numbers," this is difficult. Although eight is sometimes regarded as the first cube, since a cube requires eight dots to delimit it, when Greek arithmeticians forget geometry, they speak of one as being a cube.

[c] Mnemosynê.

[d] *Cf.* Diod. Sic. iv. 7, Paus. ix. 29. 2.

[e] Enharmonic music employs quarter-tones.

(744) ὅροι, νήτη καὶ μέση καὶ ὑπάτη. καίτοι Δελφοί γε τὰς Μούσας οὕτως ὠνόμαζον, οὐκ ὀρθῶς ἑνὶ[1] μαθήματι, μᾶλλον δὲ μορίῳ μαθήματος ἑνὸς τοῦ μουσικοῦ, τῷ γ' ἁρμονικῷ, προστιθέντες. ἁπάσας δ' D ὡς ἐγὼ νομίζω τὰς διὰ λόγου περαινομένας ἐπιστήμας καὶ τέχνας οἱ παλαιοὶ καταμαθόντες ἐν τρισὶ γένεσιν οὔσας, τῷ φιλοσόφῳ καὶ τῷ ῥητορικῷ καὶ τῷ μαθηματικῷ,[2] τριῶν ἐποιοῦντο δῶρα καὶ χάριτας θεῶν ἅς[3] Μούσας ὠνόμαζον. ὕστερον δὲ καὶ καθ' Ἡσίοδον ἤδη μᾶλλον ἐκκαλυπτομένων τῶν δυνάμεων,[4] διαιροῦντες εἰς μέρη καὶ εἴδη τρεῖς πάλιν ἑκάστην ἔχουσαν ἐν αὑτῇ διαφορὰς[5] ἑώρων· ἐν μὲν γὰρ[6] τῷ μαθηματικῷ τὸ περὶ μουσικήν ἐστιν καὶ τὸ περὶ ἀριθμητικὴν[7] καὶ τὸ περὶ[8] γεωμετρίαν, ἐν δὲ τῷ φιλοσόφῳ τὸ λογικὸν καὶ τὸ ἠθικὸν καὶ τὸ φυσικόν, ἐν δὲ τῷ ῥητορικῷ τὸ ἐγκωμιαστικὸν E πρῶτον γεγονέναι λέγουσιν δεύτερον δὲ τὸ συμβουλευτικὸν ἔσχατον δὲ τὸ δικανικόν. ὧν μηδὲν ἄθεον μηδ' ἄμουσον εἶναι μηδ' ἄμοιρον ἀρχῆς κρείττονος καὶ ἡγεμονίας ἀξιοῦντες, εἰκότως ἰσαρίθμους τὰς Μούσας οὐκ ἐποίησαν ἀλλ' οὔσας ἀνεῦρον. ὥσπερ οὖν τὰ ἐννέα διαίρεσιν εἰς τρεῖς λαμβάνει τριάδας, ὧν ἑκάστη πάλιν εἰς μονάδας διαιρεῖται τοσαύτας,

[1] ἑνὶ Leonicus : ἐν.
[2] μαθηματικῷ Aldine edition : μαθητικῷ.
[3] ἅς Basel edition : τὰς.
[4] δυνάμεων Anon. 1 (Turn.) : δυναμένων.
[5] διαφορὰς Basel edition : διαφορὰν.
[6] γὰρ Hubert : τὸ.
[7] ἀριθμητικὴν Xylander : γραμματικὴν.
[8] περὶ Basel edition : πέρας.





top, middle, and bottom.[a] It is true that the Delphians gave the names of these notes to the Muses,[b] incorrectly associating them with a single science, or rather with a part of the single science of music, namely that concerned with scales. In my opinion the ancients, observing that all branches of knowledge and crafts that attain their end by the use of words belong to one of three kinds, namely the philosophical, the rhetorical, or the mathematical, considered them to be the gracious gifts of three goddesses, whom they named Muses. Later, in Hesiod's days in fact, by which time these faculties were being more clearly seen, they began to distinguish different parts and forms ; they then observed that each faculty in its turn contained three different things. The mathematical genus includes music, arithmetic, and geometry, the philosophical comprises logic, ethics, and natural science, while in the rhetorical it is said that the original laudatory kind was joined first by the deliberative, and finally by the forensic.[c] Thinking it wrong that any of these branches should be without its god or Muse or deprived of higher control and guidance, they naturally discovered, for manufacture they did not, the existence of as many Muses as there are branches. Now nine permits of division into three threes, each of which is again divided into as many ones. In the same way, correctness of dis-

[a] *Cf.* Plato, *Republic* 443 D. The note called "top" by the Greeks was the lowest in pitch : from this to the "middle" formed a fourth, "middle" to "bottom" a fifth.
[b] *Cf.* 745 B *infra.*
[c] *Cf.* Tacitus, *De Oratoribus*, xii. 2. For the three divisions of oratory see note *e* on p. 267 *supra.* Here, as often, "laudatory" replaces "epideictic," since the latter tended to deal in praise rather than blame.

(744) οὕτως ἓν μέν ἐστι καὶ κοινὸν ἡ τοῦ λόγου περὶ τὸ κύριον[1] ὀρθότης, νενέμηνται δὲ σύντρεις τῶν τριῶν γενῶν ἕκαστον, εἶτα πάλιν αὖ μοναδικῶς ἑκάστη μίαν περιέπει λαχοῦσα καὶ κοσμεῖ δύναμιν. οὐ γὰρ οἶμαι τοὺς ποιητικοὺς[2] καὶ τοὺς ἀστρολογικοὺς
F ἐγκαλεῖν ἡμῖν ὡς παραλείπουσι[3] τὰς τέχνας αὐτῶν, εἰδότας οὐδὲν ἧττον ὑμῶν[4] ἀστρολογίαν γεωμετρίᾳ ποιητικὴν δὲ μουσικῇ συνεπομένην."[5]

4. Ὡς δὲ ταῦτ' ἐρρήθη, τοῦ ἰατροῦ Τρύφωνος εἰπόντος, "τῇ δ' ἡμετέρᾳ[6] τέχνῃ τί παθὼν τὸ Μουσεῖον ἀποκέκλεικας;" ὑπολαβὼν Διονύσιος ὁ Μελιτεύς, "πολλούς," ἔφη, "συμπαρακαλεῖς[7] ἐπὶ
745 τὴν κατηγορίαν· καὶ γὰρ ἡμεῖς οἱ γεωργοὶ τὴν Θάλειαν οἰκειούμεθα, φυτῶν καὶ σπερμάτων εὐθαλούντων καὶ βλαστανόντων ἐπιμέλειαν αὐτῇ καὶ σωτηρίαν ἀποδιδόντες." "ἀλλ' οὐ δίκαι'," ἔφην ἐγώ, "ποιεῖτε· καὶ γὰρ ὑμῖν ἔστι Δημήτηρ ἀνησιδώρα καὶ Διόνυσος

δενδρέων νομὸν[8] πολυγαθὴς αὐξάνων,
ἁγνὸν φέγγος ὀπώρας,

ὡς Πίνδαρός φησιν, καὶ τοὺς ἰατροὺς Ἀσκληπιὸν ἔχοντας ἴσμεν ἡγεμόνα καὶ Ἀπόλλωνι Παιᾶνι χρωμένους πάντα, Μουσηγέτῃ μηθέν· πάντες γὰρ 'ἄν-

[1] κύριον Aldine edition: κόριον.
[2] ποιητικοὺς Bernardakis: ποιηματικοὺς.
[3] παραλείπουσι Basel edition: παραλειπούσας.
[4] ὑμῶν F. H. S.: ἡμῶν.
[5] συνεπομένην Hubert: συνεμομένην.
[6] ἡμετέρᾳ Basel edition: ἑτέρᾳ.
[7] συμπαρακαλεῖς Anon. (Amyot): συμπαρακαλεῖ.
[8] νομὸν Heyne: νόμον; τρόπον 757 F, γόνον Sandys.





course about valid truth [a] is a unity and the Muses' common property; each of the three categories into which it is divided is the province of a group of three; and by a further division each of them singly attends and embellishes the faculty she has been allotted. I do not imagine, you know, that the poets and the astronomers will charge me with passing over their arts; they understand just as well as you do that astronomy goes with geometry and poetry with music."

4. "What of our art?" exclaimed Trypho the doctor at the end of these remarks. "Why on earth have you barred the Muses' temple to it?" "There are many others," struck in Dionysius of Melitê,[b] "whom you invite to join you in your protest. Here are we farmers, who claim that Thalia belongs to us,[c] assigning to her the care and health of flourishing (*euthalountōn*) plants and growing seeds." "But," said I, "you are not playing fair. You see, you have Demeter, She-who-sends-up-gifts,[d] and Dionysus

Exultantly giving increase to the orchard-plot,
Fruit-time's holy splendour,

as Pindar says [e]; and we know that the doctors have Asclepius as their guide and that they make every use of Apollo the Healer, but none of Apollo the Leader of the Muses. All men, it is true, 'need the

[a] Meaning doubtful; the right emendation may still be to seek.
[b] An Attic deme.
[c] *Cf.* scholiast on Apollonius Rhodius, iii. 1.
[d] *Cf.* Pausanias, i. 31. 4.
[e] Pindar. frag. 153 Snell, quoted again by Plutarch, *Mor.* 365 A, 757 F. Dionysus is a divinity of all vegetation, and of trees in particular.

(745) θρωποι θεῶν χατέουσι' καθ' Ὅμηρον, οὐ πάντες δὲ πάντων. ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνο θαυμάζω, πῶς ἔλαθε Λαμπρίαν τὸ λεγόμενον ὑπὸ Δελφῶν. λέγουσι γὰρ
B οὐ φθόγγων οὐδὲ χορδῶν ἐπωνύμους γεγονέναι τὰς Μούσας παρ' αὐτοῖς, ἀλλὰ τοῦ κόσμου τριχῇ πάντα νενεμημένου πρώτην μὲν εἶναι τὴν τῶν ἀπλανῶν μερίδα, δευτέραν δὲ τὴν τῶν πλανωμένων, ἐσχάτην δὲ τὴν τῶν ὑπὸ σελήνην, συνηρτῆσθαι δὲ πάσας καὶ συντετάχθαι κατὰ λόγους ἐναρμονίους, ὧν ἑκάστης φύλακα Μοῦσαν εἶναι, τῆς μὲν πρώτης Ὑπάτην, τῆς δ' ἐσχάτης Νεάτην, Μέσην δὲ τῆς[1] μεταξύ, συνέχουσαν ἅμα καὶ συνεπιστρέφουσαν, ὡς ἀνυστόν[2] ἐστι, τὰ θνητὰ τοῖς θείοις[3] καὶ τὰ περίγεια τοῖς
C οὐρανίοις· ὡς καὶ Πλάτων ᾐνίξατο τοῖς τῶν Μοιρῶν ὀνόμασιν τὴν μὲν Ἄτροπον τὴν δὲ Κλωθὼ[4] τὴν δὲ Λάχεσιν προσαγορεύσας· ἐπεὶ ταῖς γε τῶν ὀκτὼ σφαιρῶν περιφοραῖς Σειρῆνας οὐ Μούσας ἰσαρίθμους ἐπέστησεν."[5]

5. Ὑπολαβὼν δὲ Μενέφυλος ὁ Περιπατητικός, "τὰ μὲν Δελφῶν," εἶπεν, "ἀμωσγέπως[6] μετέχει πιθανότητος· ὁ δὲ Πλάτων ἄτοπος, ταῖς μὲν ἀιδίοις καὶ θείαις περιφοραῖς ἀντὶ τῶν Μουσῶν τὰς Σειρῆνας ἐνιδρύων, οὐ πάνυ φιλανθρώπους οὐδὲ χρηστὰς δαίμονας, τὰς δὲ Μούσας ἢ παραλείπων παντάπασιν ἢ τοῖς τῶν Μοιρῶν ὀνόμασι προσαγορεύων καὶ καλῶν θυγατέρας Ἀνάγκης· ἄμουσον γὰρ ἡ Ἀν-

[1] τῆς Hubert: τὴν.
[2] ἀνυστόν Xylander, Anon. 2 (Turn.): ἂν ὕστερός.
[3] θείοις Hubert: θεοῖς.
[4] τὴν δὲ Κλωθὼ added by Anon. 1 (Turn.), here by Bernardakis.
[5] ἐπέστησεν Xylander: ἐπέστησαν.
[6] ἀμωσγέπως Doehner: ἄλλως γέ πως.





gods,' in Homer's phrase,[a] but all are not needed by all. But it puzzles me how Lamprias can have overlooked what the Delphians say. They tell us that it is not from notes of voice or string that the Muses have been given the names they have there. Rather the whole universe is divided into three regions: the first is that of the fixed stars, the second that of the planets,[b] and the last the sublunary region; they are all knit and ordered together in harmonious formulae; and each has its guardian Muse, the first region Hypatê, the lowest Neatê, and the intermediate Mesê, who holds together and intertwines, so far as is feasible, things mortal and divine, terrestrial and heavenly. Plato, too, put this in a disguised form, calling them by the names of the Fates, Atropos, Clotho, and Lachesis[c]; observe that it was Sirens, not Muses, that he set to preside over the revolutions of the eight spheres, one for each."

5. "The Delphians' opinion," said Menephylus the Peripatetic, taking up the conversation, "has in its way a measure of plausibility. But it is odd of Plato to give a home on the eternal divine revolutions not to the Muses but to the Sirens, divinities who are by no means benevolent or good, and either to pass the Muses over entirely or to call them by the names of the Fates and refer to them as daughters of Necessity. Necessity is a thing devoid of art; it is Persua-

[a] Homer, *Odyssey*, iii. 48.
[b] Including the sun and moon.
[c] Plato, *Republic*, x. 617 c. This association of the Fates with the three regions is found in Pseudo-Plutarch, *De Fato*, 568 F, and a slightly different one in *De Facie in Orbe Lunae*, 945 C and *De Genio Socratis*, 591 B. The ultimate source for such speculation was Xenocrates, *cf.* Sextus Empiricus, *Against the Logicians*, i. 149.

(745) ἀγκη μουσικὸν δ' ἡ Πειθὼ καὶ Μούσαις φίλον. διὸ
D Μοῦσα[1] πολὺ μᾶλλον οἶμαι τῆς Ἐμπεδοκλέους
Χάριτος ' στυγέει δύστλητον Ἀνάγκην.' "

6. " Πάνυ μὲν οὖν," ὁ Ἀμμώνιος ἔφη, " τὴν ἐν ἡμῖν ἀκούσιον αἰτίαν καὶ ἀπροαίρετον· ἡ δ' ἐν θεοῖς ἀνάγκη δύστλητος οὔκ ἐστ', οἶμαι δ' οὐδὲ[2] δυσπειθὴς οὐδὲ βιαία, πλὴν τοῖς κακοῖς, ὥς ἐστι νόμος[3] ἐν πόλει τοῖς[4] βλέπουσιν εἰς[5] τὸ βέλτιστον αὐτῆς ἀπαρέκτρεπτον[6] καὶ ἀπαράβατον οὐ τῷ[7] ἀδυνάτῳ τῷ δ' ἀβουλήτῳ τῆς μεταβολῆς.[8] αἵ γε μὲν δὴ[9] Ὁμήρου Σειρῆνες οὐ κατὰ λόγον ἡμᾶς τῷ μύθῳ φοβοῦσιν, ἀλλὰ κἀκεῖνος ὀρθῶς ἠνίξατο[10] τὴν τῆς μουσικῆς αὐτῶν δύναμιν οὐκ ἀπάνθρωπον οὐδ' ὀλέ-
E θριον οὖσαν ἀλλὰ ταῖς ἐντεῦθεν ἀπιούσαις ἐκεῖ ψυχαῖς, ὡς ἔοικε, καὶ πλανωμέναις μετὰ τὴν τελευτὴν ἔρωτα πρὸς τὰ οὐράνια καὶ θεῖα λήθην δὲ τῶν θνητῶν ἐμποιοῦσαν κατέχειν καὶ κατᾴδειν[11] θελγο-

[1] φίλον· διὸ Μοῦσα Anon. 2 (Turn.): Μούσαις φιλοδαμοῦσα.
[2] ἐστ', οἶμαι δ' οὐδὲ Bernardakis: ἔσομαι δὲ.
[3] νόμος Basel edition: μόνος.
[4] τοῖς Anon. 2 (Turn.): ταῖς.
[5] βλέπουσιν εἰς F. H. S. doubtfully: βελτίστοις; βελτίστοις ὡς Hubert.
[6] ἀπαρέκτρεπτον Hubert: ἀπαρέτρεπτον.
[7] τῷ Wyttenbach: τῷ μὲν.
[8] μεταβολῆς Basel edition: μεταβουλῆς.
[9] αἵ γε μὲν δὴ Anon. 1 (Turn.): ἄγομεν δὲ. ? αἱ λεγόμεναι δ' ὑφ'.
[10] ἠνίξατο Basel edition: ἠνιᾶτο.
[11] ἐμποιοῦσαν κατέχειν καὶ κατᾴδειν Leonicus: ἐμποιοῦσα κατέχει καὶ κατάδει.

[a] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*, Empedocles, frag. 116. ' Charm " (*Charis*) was used by Empedocles as a synonym for the cosmic force he usually calls " Friendship " (*Philia*).

[b] *Cf.* Plato, *Timaeus*, 48 A, where Mind persuades Necessity to guide the greatest part of the world of change to the best possible result: that is to say, the undesigned fixed factors in the physical world can often be made use of by a designing intelligence: see F. M. Cornford, *Plato's Cosmology*, pp. 160 ff. Plutarch's own interpretation of the Platonic passage (*De Animae Procreatione in Timaeo*, 1014 D, 1026 B) takes Necessity to be a psychical, not a physical, factor in the world. When Ammonius proceeds to compare Necessity with law in a city, he seems to be thinking not of Necessity *per se*, but of Necessity as guided by Mind, being affected perhaps by the Stoic identification of Necessity with Fate, Zeus, and cosmic law. For the undesirability of changing laws *cf.* Plato, *Politicus*, 299 C, Aristotle, *Politics*, 1268 b 27—1269 a 24.

[c] *Cf.* Plato, *Cratylus*, 403 C-D.





sion that is artistic, and dear to the Muses. Hence, I think, the Muse

hateth intolerable Necessity

far more than does the Charm of Empedocles." [a]

6. " She does indeed," said Ammonius, " if you mean the Necessity of our world, a constraining cause outside the sphere of our will. But the necessity that holds sway among the gods is not intolerable nor, as I believe, resistant to persuasion either [b] nor yet coercive, except for wicked men, just as in a city the law is for those who look to its best interests something inflexible and immutable, not because a change would be impossible, but because it would be undesirable. Now Homer's Sirens, it is true, frighten us, inconsistently with the Platonic myth; but the poet too conveyed a truth symbolically, namely that the power of their music is not inhuman or destructive; as souls depart from this world to the next, so it seems, and drift uncertainly after death, it creates in them a passionate love for the heavenly and divine,[c] and forgetfulness of mortality; it possesses them and enchants them with its spell, so that in

(745) μένας, αἱ δ' ὑπὸ χαρᾶς ἔπονται καὶ συμπεριπολοῦσιν. ἐνταῦθα δὲ πρὸς ἡμᾶς ἀμυδρά τις οἷον ἠχὼ τῆς μουσικῆς ἐκείνης ἐξικνουμένη διὰ λόγων ἐκκαλεῖται καὶ ἀναμιμνήσκει τὰς ψυχὰς τῶν τότε· τὰ δ' ὦτα τῶν μὲν πλείστων[1] περιαλήλιπται καὶ καταπέπλασται σαρκίνοις ἐμφράγμασι καὶ πάθεσιν, οὐ κηρίνοις· ἣ δὲ δι'[2] εὐφυΐαν αἰσθάνεται καὶ μνημονεύει, καὶ τῶν ἐμμανεστάτων ἐρώτων οὐδὲν
F ἀποδεῖ τὸ πάθος αὐτῆς, γλιχομένης καὶ ποθούσης λῦσαί τε[3] μὴ δυναμένης ἑαυτὴν ἀπὸ τοῦ σώματος. οὐ μὴν ἔγωγε παντάπασι συμφέρομαι τούτοις· ἀλλά μοι δοκεῖ Πλάτων ὡς ἀτράκτους καὶ ἠλακάτας τοὺς ἄξονας σφονδύλους δὲ τοὺς ἀστέρας, ἐξηλλαγμένως ἐνταῦθα καὶ τὰς Μούσας Σειρῆνας ὀνομάζειν,[4] ' εἰρούσας '[5] τὰ θεῖα καὶ λεγούσας ἐν Ἅιδου, καθάπερ ὁ[6] Σοφοκλέους Ὀδυσσεύς φησι Σειρῆνας εἰσαφικέσθαι

Φόρκου κόρας, θροοῦντε[7] τοὺς Ἅιδου νόμους.

746 Μοῦσαι δ' εἰσὶν ὀκτὼ μὲν[8] αἱ συμπεριπολοῦσαι[9] ταῖς ὀκτὼ σφαίραις, μία δὲ τὸν περὶ γῆν[10] εἴληχε τόπον. αἱ μὲν οὖν ὀκτὼ περιόδοις ἐφεστῶσαι τὴν

[1] τὰ δ' ὦτα τῶν μὲν πλείστων Wyttenbach : μὲν πλεῖστον.
[2] ἣ δὲ δι' Basel edition : οἱ δὲ.
[3] τε] δὲ Meziriacus. Perhaps a word, *e.g.* ἐφέπεσθαι, is lost after ποθούσης.
[4] ὀνομάζειν Basel edition : ὀνομάζεις.
[5] εἰρούσας Bernardakis : ἐρεούσας.
[6] ὁ added by Pohlenz.
[7] θροοῦντε Lobeck : αἰθροῦντος.
[8] μὲν added by Hubert.
[9] αἱ συμπεριπολοῦσαι van Herwerden : καὶ συμπεριπολοῦσι.
[10] γῆν Stephanus : γῆς.

[a] Plato, *Republic*, 616 c. In ordinary Greek the word means " distaff," but Plato used it in the archaic sense of " spindle." *Cf. Class. Rev.* xxxviii (1924), p. 7.





joyfulness they follow the Sirens and join them in their circuits. Here on earth a kind of faint echo of that music reaches us, and appealing to our souls through the medium of words, reminds them of what they experienced in an earlier existence. The ears of most souls, however, are plastered over and blocked up, not with wax, but with carnal obstructions and affections. But any soul that through innate gifts is aware of this echo, and remembers that other world, suffers what falls in no way short of the very maddest passions of love, longing and yearning to break the tie with the body, but unable to do so. Not that I fall in with this interpretation at all points. My view is that just as Plato speaks of ' shafts ' and ' spindles ' [a] instead of ' axes,' and of ' whorls ' for ' stars,' so here, too, contrary to usage, he gives the name of ' Sirens ' to the Muses, because they ' seyen ' (*eirousas*), that is ' speak,' the divine truths in the realm of Death.[b] Similarly Sophocles' Odysseus [c] says that he visited the Sirens,

Daughters of Phorcus,[d] singing the tunes [e] of Death.

There are, then, eight Muses that circle round with the eight spheres, while one has allotted to her the region of the earth. Now the eight that preside over

[b] Σειρήν is supposed to embody either εἴρειν by addition of σ or θεῖ' εἴρειν by a change, paralleled in Laconian dialect, of θ to σ.
[c] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.*, frag. 777, from an unknown play.
[d] Elsewhere father of Scylla, Hesperides, Graiae, Gorgons, and Erinyes, but never of Sirens.
[e] The word also means " laws," and Plutarch doubtless saw an allusion to that meaning here, *cf.* E. Maass, *Orpheus*, p. 270.

(746) τῶν πλανωμένων ἄστρων πρὸς τὰ ἀπλανῆ καὶ πρὸς ἄλληλα συνέχουσι καὶ διασῴζουσιν ἁρμονίαν[1]· μία δέ, τὸν μεταξὺ γῆς καὶ σελήνης τόπον ἐπισκοποῦσα καὶ περιπολοῦσα, τοῖς θνητοῖς ὅσον αἰσθάνεσθαι καὶ δέχεσθαι πέφυκε χαρίτων καὶ ῥυθμοῦ καὶ ἁρμονίας ἐνδίδωσι διὰ λόγου καὶ ᾠδῆς, πειθὼ πολιτικῆς καὶ κοινωνητικῆς συνεργὸν ἐπάγουσα παραμυθουμένην καὶ κηλοῦσαν ἡμῶν τὸ ταραχῶδες καὶ τὸ πλανώμενον ὥσπερ ἐξ ἀνοδίας ἀνακαλουμένην ἐπιεικῶς καὶ καθιστᾶσαν.[2]

B ὅσσα δὲ μὴ πεφίληκεν
Ζεύς, ἀτύζονται βοὰν
Πιερίδων ἀίοντα

κατὰ Πίνδαρον."

7. Τούτοις ἐπιφωνήσαντος τοῦ Ἀμμωνίου τὰ τοῦ Ξενοφάνους ὥσπερ εἰώθει

ταῦτα δεδοξάσθω[3] μὲν ἐοικότα τοῖς ἐτύμοισι

καὶ παρακαλοῦντος ἀποφαίνεσθαι καὶ λέγειν τὸ δοκοῦν ἕκαστον, ἐγὼ μικρὸν διασιωπήσας ἔφην ὅτι "καὶ Πλάτων αὐτὸς ὥσπερ ἴχνεσι τοῖς ὀνόμασι τῶν θεῶν ἀνευρίσκειν οἴεται τὰς δυνάμεις, καὶ ἡμεῖς ὁμοίως μὲν τιθῶμεν ἐν οὐρανῷ καὶ περὶ τὰ οὐράνια μίαν τῶν Μουσῶν[4]· καὶ εἰκὸς ἐκεῖνα μὴ πολλῆς μηδὲ ποικίλης κυβερνήσεως δεῖσθαι, μίαν

[1] ἁρμονίαν Basel edition : ἁρμονίαι.
[2] καθιστᾶσαν Meziriacus : καθιστᾶσα.
[3] δεδοξάσθω Amyot : δεδοξάσθαι.
[4] ἢ Οὐρανία φαίνεται deleted by F. H. S. after Μουσῶν.





orbits maintain and preserve the harmony of the planets with the fixed stars and with one another, while one, who oversees and patrols the region between the earth and the moon, grants mortals through speech and song all that their nature allows them to perceive and accept of grace, rhythm, and harmony, calling in Persuasion the helpmeet of the arts of state and society to cast her calming spell on the tumultuous element in us, and gently to recall our errant steps when they have lost the path and set them in their place.

> But all things that are strangers to Zeus's love
> Shrink when they hear the ringing
> Voice of the Pierides,

as Pindar says." [a]

7. Ammonius concluded these remarks with his favourite quotation from Xenophanes

> Let this be our opinion, with the look of truth, [b]

and then urged each of us to speak up and say what he thought. For a short time I kept quiet; then I said that Plato himself believes that he discovers the powers of the gods by using their names as clues [c]; "let us then similarly place one of the Muses in the heavens,[d] and suppose her concern to be with the heavenly bodies. It is likely enough that they, having a single simple nature to account for them,

[a] *Pythians*, i. 13-14, quoted again by Plutarch, *Mor.* 167 c, 1095 E. The former passage makes clear the connexion of the thought here with Plato, *Timaeus*, 47 D.
[b] Diels-Kranz, *Frag. der Vorsok.*, Xenophanes, frag. 35.
[c] *Cratylus*, 396 A, but at 401 A Plato modifies his opinion: the names show what *men* think of the gods, not necessarily their real nature.
[d] Urania, whose name is derived from *Ouranos* (heavens).

(746)
C ἔχοντα καὶ ἁπλῆν αἴτιον[1] φύσιν· ὅπου δὲ πολλαὶ πλημμέλειαι πολλαὶ δ' ἀμετρίαι καὶ παραβάσεις, ἐνταῦθα τὰς ὀκτὼ μετοικιστέον, ἄλλην ἄλλο κακίας καὶ ἀναρμοστίας εἶδος ἐπανορθουμένας.[2] ἐπεὶ δὲ τοῦ βίου τὸ μὲν σπουδῆς τὸ δὲ παιδιᾶς[3] μέρος ἐστί, καὶ δεῖται τοῦ μουσικῶς καὶ μετρίως, τὸ μὲν σπουδάζον ἡμῶν ἥ τε Καλλιόπη καὶ ἡ Κλειὼ καὶ ἡ Θάλεια, τῆς περὶ θεοὺς ἐπιστήμης καὶ θέας ἡγεμὼν οὖσα, δόξουσιν ἐπιστρέφειν καὶ συγκατορθοῦν, αἱ δὲ λοιπαὶ τὸ μεταβάλλον ἐφ' ἡδονὴν καὶ παιδιὰν ὑπ' ἀσθενείας μὴ περιορᾶν ἀνιέμενον ἀκολάστως καὶ
D θηριωδῶς, ἀλλ' ὀρχήσει καὶ ᾠδῇ καὶ χορείᾳ ῥυθμὸν ἐχούσῃ καὶ ἁρμονίᾳ καὶ λόγῳ κεραννύμενον εὐσχημόνως καὶ κοσμίως ἐκδέχεσθαι καὶ παραπέμπειν. ἐγὼ μέντοι, τοῦ Πλάτωνος ἐν ἑκάστῳ δύο πράξεων ἀπολείποντος ἀρχάς, τὴν μὲν ἔμφυτον ἐπιθυμίαν ἡδονῶν τὴν δ' ἐπείσακτον[4] δόξαν ἐφιεμένην τοῦ ἀρίστου, καὶ τὸ μὲν λόγον τὸ δὲ πάθος ἔστιν ὅτε καλοῦντος, ἑτέρας δ' αὖ πάλιν τούτων ἑκατέρου διαφορὰς[5] ἔχοντος, ἑκάστην ὁρῶ μεγάλης καὶ θείας ὡς ἀληθῶς παιδαγωγίας δεομένην. αὐτίκα τοῦ λόγου τὸ μέν ἐστι πολιτικὸν καὶ βασιλικόν, ἐφ' ᾧ τὴν Καλλιόπην τετάχθαι φησὶν ὁ Ἡσίοδος· τὸ
E φιλότιμον δ' ἡ Κλειὼ μάλιστα κυδαίνειν καὶ συνεπιγαυροῦν εἴληχεν· ἡ δὲ Πολύμνια τοῦ φιλομαθοῦς

[1] αἴτιον] ἀίδιον Meziriacus : ? ἅπαντα F. H. S., τινα Post.
[2] ἐπανορθουμένας Basel edition : ἐπανορθούμενος.
[3] σπουδῆς . . . παιδιᾶς Bernardakis : σπουδῇ . . . παιδιᾷ. Post suggests μερίζεται for μέρος ἐστί.
[4] ἐπείσακτον also at 1026 D : ἐπίκτητος Plato.
[5] διαφορὰς Anon. (Amyot) : διαφορὰν.





do not need much or varied guidance. It is to a position here on earth, where mistakes and excesses and transgressions are numerous, that the other eight Muses should be removed, each correcting a different kind of evil and disharmony. Now since life consists partly of serious activity, partly of sport, and in both we need to act artistically and without excess, Calliopê, Clio, and Thalia, who is our guide in knowledge and vision of the gods,[a] may be thought to act together to direct our steps and maintain our course when we are serious ; and when we turn to pleasure and sport, the others will not suffer us in our weakness to relax without discipline and like animals, but will take us under their care and escort us on our way in decent orderly fashion with dancing and song and with choric music that has measured motion fused with both tune and words. My own view is different. Plato lays down two principles of action in every man, the one an ' inborn desire for pleasures,' the other an ' acquired belief that aims at what is best ' [b] ; sometimes he calls the one reason, the other emotion. Now each of these two principles has further subdivisions and I observe that every one of these stands in need of extensive and, in the true sense of the word, divine tutelage. To begin with, one aspect of reason is characteristic of the statesman and the king ; to this Hesiod tells us that Calliopê is assigned.[c] It is Clio's province in particular to glorify the love of honour and add to its pride, while Polymnia belongs

[a] The suggested etymology is from *theos* (god) and *aletheia* (truth).
[b] Plato, *Phaedrus*, 237 D, quoted again, *De Animae Procreatione in Timaeo*, 1026 D.
[c] *Theogony*, 80. *Cf.* 743 D *supra* and *Praecepta Gerendae Reipublicae*, 801 E.

(746) ἐστι καὶ μνημονικοῦ τῆς ψυχῆς, διὸ καὶ Σικυώνιοι τῶν τριῶν Μουσῶν[1] μίαν Πολυμάθειαν καλοῦσιν· Εὐτέρπῃ δὲ πᾶς ἄν τις ἀποδοίη τὸ θεωρητικὸν τῆς περὶ φύσιν ἀληθείας, οὔτε καθαρωτέρας οὔτε καλλίους ἑτέρῳ γένει παραλιπὼν εὐπαθείας καὶ τέρψεις. τῆς δ' ἐπιθυμίας τὸ μὲν περὶ ἐδωδὴν καὶ πόσιν ἡ Θάλεια κοινωνητικὸν ποιεῖ καὶ συμποτικὸν ἐξ ἀπανθρώπου[2] καὶ θηριώδους, διὸ τοὺς φιλοφρόνως καὶ ἱλαρῶς συνόντας[3] ἀλλήλοις ἐν οἴνῳ 'θαλιάζειν' λέγομεν, οὐ τοὺς ὑβρίζοντας καὶ παροινοῦντας· F ταῖς δὲ περὶ συνουσίαν σπουδαῖς[4] ἡ Ἐρατὼ παροῦσα μετὰ πειθοῦς λόγον[5] ἐχούσης καὶ καιρὸν ἐξαιρεῖ καὶ κατασβέννυσι τὸ μανικὸν[6] τῆς ἡδονῆς καὶ οἰστρώδες, εἰς φιλίαν καὶ πίστιν οὐχ ὕβριν οὐδ' ἀκολασίαν τελευτώσης. τὸ δὲ δι' ὤτων καὶ ὀφθαλμῶν ἡδονῆς[7] εἶδος, εἴτε τῷ λόγῳ μᾶλλον εἴτε τῷ πάθει προσῆκον εἴτε κοινὸν ἀμφοῖν ἐστιν, αἱ λοιπαὶ δύο, Μελπομένη 747 καὶ Τερψιχόρη, παραλαβοῦσαι κοσμοῦσιν· ὥστε τὸ[8] μὲν εὐφροσύνην μὴ κήλησιν εἶναι, τὸ δὲ μὴ γοητείαν ἀλλὰ τέρψιν."

[1] Μουσῶν Basel edition: οὐσῶν.
[2] ἀπανθρώπου Leonicus: ἀνθρώπου.
[3] συνόντας Wyttenbach: συνιόντες.
[4] σπουδαῖς Wyttenbach: σπονδαῖς.
[5] λόγον Wyttenbach: ὡς λόγον.
[6] μανικὸν Wyttenbach: μαλακὸν.
[7] τὸ . . . ἡδονῆς Emperius: οἷδε καὶ ὀφθαλμῶν ἡδονὴν.
[8] τὸ Bernardakis: τὴν.





to that part of the soul that loves learning and stores it in the memory—that is why the Sicyonians call one of their three Muses Polymathia.[a] Then everyone would refer to Euterpê the study of the facts of Nature, and would reserve no purer or finer enjoyments and delights (*terpseis*) to any other kind of activity. To turn to desire, Thalia converts our concern for food and drink from something savage and animal into a social and convivial affair. That is why we apply the word *thaliazein* (merry-making) to those who enjoy one another's company over wine in a gay and friendly manner, not to those who indulge in drunken insults and violence. And when our sexual urgencies enjoy the presence of Erato,[b] accompanied by rational, apposite persuasion, she eliminates and extinguishes the mad, frantic element in the pleasure, which then reaches a conclusion in love and trust, not rape and debauchery. As for the kind of pleasure that comes by ear and eye, whether it belongs mainly to reason or to emotion or is their common property, the two remaining Muses, Melpomenê and Terpsichorê, take it under their care and give it orderliness.[c] The result is that on the one hand there is enjoyment not enchantment, on the other not delusion but delight."

[a] *i.e.* "Much-learning." See also note on 743 D *supra*.
[b] Associated with *erân* (to be enamoured).
[c] Melpomenê for the ear (*melpein*, to sing), Terpsichorê for the eye, as if Terpsihorê (*terpsis*, enjoyment, *horān*, to see), *cf.* Cornutus, chap. 14. The fixed assignment of functions to Muses is a development that had not taken place in Plutarch's time. Fancy was long free.

(747) ΠΡΟΒΛΗΜΑ ΙΕ

*Ὅτι τρία μέρη τῆς ὀρχήσεως, φορὰ καὶ σχῆμα καὶ δεῖξις· καὶ τί ἕκαστον αὐτῶν, καὶ τίνα κοινὰ ποιητικῆς καὶ ὀρχηστικῆς*

Collocuntur Thrasybulus, Ammonius

1. Ἐκ τούτου πυραμοῦντες ἐπήγοντο τοῖς παισὶ[1] νικητήριον ὀρχήσεως· ἀπεδείχθη δὲ κριτὴς μετὰ
B Μενίσκου τοῦ παιδοτρίβου Λαμπρίας ὁ ἀδελφός· ὠρχήσατο γὰρ πιθανῶς τὴν πυρρίχην καὶ χειρονομῶν ἐν ταῖς παλαίστραις[2] ἐδόκει διαφέρειν τῶν παίδων. ὀρχουμένων δὲ πολλῶν προθυμότερον ἢ μουσικώτερον, δύο τοὺς εὐδοκιμοῦντας[3] καὶ βουλομένους ἀνασῴζειν τὴν ἐμμέλειαν ἠξίουν τινὲς ὀρχεῖσθαι φορὰν παρὰ φοράν.

Ἐπεζήτησεν οὖν ὁ Θρασύβουλος τί[4] βούλεται τοὔνομα τῆς φορᾶς, καὶ παρέσχε τῷ Ἀμμωνίῳ περὶ τῶν μερῶν τῆς ὀρχήσεως πλείονα διελθεῖν.
(2) Ἔφη δὲ τρί' εἶναι, τὴν φορὰν καὶ τὸ σχῆμα καὶ τὴν δεῖξιν. "ἡ γὰρ ὄρχησις ἔκ τε κινήσεων
C καὶ σχέσεων συνέστηκεν, ὡς τὸ μέλος τῶν φθόγγων καὶ τῶν διαστημάτων· ἐνταῦθα δ' αἱ μοναὶ πέρατα[5] τῶν κινήσεών εἰσιν. φορὰς μὲν οὖν τὰς κινήσεις

[1] *πυραμοῦντες . . . τοῖς* Wyttenbach, *παισὶ* Anon. 2 (Turn.): *πυραμοῦντος ἐπῆραν τουτὲς πᾶσι.*
[2] *παλαίστραις* Basel edition: *πλάστραις.*
[3] *εὐδοκιμοῦντας* Hartman: *εὐδοκίμους.*
[4] *τί* Wilamowitz: *Ἀμμωνίου τί.*
[5] *πέρατα* Anon. 2 (Turn.): *πέρα.*

[a] The word translated "pose" is in other authors used to cover all "gesture" both fluid and static; that translated "phrase" has as one sense "change of place." The words *phora*, *schema*, *deixis* do not seem to be technical terms (*cf.* L. B. Lawler, *Trans. Am. Philol. Assoc.*, 1954, pp. 148 ff.), but to have been fluid and overlapping in meaning. Plutarch's source may have intended to define and distinguish them: if so, he had no success in getting his distinctions generally accepted. *Cf.* also H. Koller, *Glotta*, 37 (1958), p. 5.





QUESTION 15

That dancing has three elements, phrase, pose, and pointing: the nature of each, and the factors common to poetry and dancing.[a]

Speakers: Thrasybulus, Ammonius

1. After this cakes were brought in, to be the prize for dancing by the boys. My brother Lamprias was appointed, along with Meniscus the trainer, to be judge, as he gave a convincing performance of the pyrrhic dance and had been thought better at shadow-fighting than any of the boys in the wrestling-schools.[b] Many boys now danced with more zest than art: there were two who gained approval, attempting to preserve gracefulness throughout; some of the company demanded that these two should dance phrases alternately.

Thrasybulus inquired the meaning of the word "phrase," and gave Ammonius the opportunity of giving at some length an exposition of the elements of dancing, (2) which he said were three in number: the phrase, the pose, and pointing. "Dancing," he explained, "consists of movements and positions, as melody of its notes and intervals. In the case of dancing the rests are the terminating points of the movements.[c] Now they call the movements 'phrases,'

[b] Dancing, particularly by boys, was part of the gymnastic training of the wrestling-school, and many dances had a close relation to the movements of combat, armed or unarmed. The pyrrhic was, in its proper form, danced in armour, *cf.* Plato, *Laws*, 815, 830 c; Athenaeus, 631.

[c] As the notes are of the intervals in music.

(747) ὀνομάζουσι, σχήματα δὲ τὰς[1] σχέσεις καὶ διαθέσεις, εἰς ἃς φερόμεναι τελευτῶσιν αἱ κινήσεις, ὅταν Ἀπόλλωνος ἢ Πανὸς ἤ τινος Βάκχης σχῆμα διαθέντες ἐπὶ τοῦ σώματος γραφικῶς τοῖς εἴδεσιν ἐπιμένωσι. τὸ δὲ τρίτον, ἡ δεῖξις, οὐ μιμητικόν ἐστιν, ἀλλὰ δηλωτικὸν ἀληθῶς τῶν ὑποκειμένων· ὡς γὰρ οἱ ποιηταὶ τοῖς κυρίοις ὀνόμασι δεικτικῶς χρῶνται, τὸν Ἀχιλλέα καὶ τὸν Ὀδυσσέα καὶ τὴν
D γῆν καὶ τὸν οὐρανὸν ὀνομάζοντες ὡς ὑπὸ τῶν πολλῶν λέγονται, πρὸς δὲ τὰς ἐμφάσεις καὶ τὰς μιμήσεις ὀνοματοποιίαις χρῶνται καὶ μεταφοραῖς, ' κελαρύζειν ' καὶ ' καχλάζειν ' τὰ κλώμενα τῶν ῥευμάτων λέγοντες, καὶ τὰ βέλη φέρεσθαι ' λιλαιόμενα χροὸς ἆσαι,' καὶ[2] τὴν ἰσόρροπον μάχην ' ἴσας ὑσμίνη κεφαλὰς ἔχεν,' πολλὰς δὲ καὶ συνθέσεις τῶν ὀνομάτων κατὰ μέλη μιμητικῶς σχηματίζουσιν, ὡς Εὐριπίδης,

ὁ πετόμενος[3] ἱερὸν ἀνὰ Διὸς αἰθέρα γοργοφόνος,

καὶ περὶ τοῦ ἵππου Πίνδαρος,

ὅτε παρ' Ἀλφεῷ σύτο δέμας
ἀκέντητον ἐν δρόμοισι παρεχόμενον,[4]

[1] τὰς added by Papabasileios.
[2] καὶ added by Meziriacus. Perhaps more is lost.
[3] πετόμενος Nauck : πετάμενος.
[4] παρεχόμενον] παρέχων Pindar.

[a] In the artistic field *diathesis* can connote the descriptive or representative aspect of the " arrangement " or " composi-





while ' poses ' is the name of the representational positions to which the movements lead and in which they end, as when dancers compose their bodies in the attitude of Apollo or Pan or a Bacchant, and then retain that aspect like figures in a picture.[a] The third element, pointing, is something that does not copy the subject-matter, but actually shows it to us. Poetry provides a parallel. Poets employ the proper names of things to indicate or denote them, using the words 'Achilles,' ' Odysseus,' ' earth,' and ' heaven ' exactly as they are used by the ordinary man, but employ onomatopoeia and metaphor in their pursuit of imitative representation and vivid suggestion. Thus they say that broken streams ' plash ' and ' babble,' and that missiles fly ' longing to take their fill of flesh ' [b] and of an evenly matched battle ' equal heads had the melley.' [c] Then they often shape the collocation of words in their songs to imitate the matter, as does Euripides with

> The slayer of the Gorgon in his flight through Zeus's holy aether [d];

and Pindar writing of the horse,

> When by the banks of Alpheüs he galloped,
> (Ungoaded his form could be seen in the race),[e]

tion," which is its original meaning. *Cf. Mor.* 17 B, *Life of Brutus*, xxiii (994 D), *Life of Demetrius*, xxii (898 E), Athenaeus, 196 f, etc.

[b] Homer, *Iliad*, xi. 574, etc.

[c] *Iliad*, xi. 72, a metaphor of disputed meaning.

[d] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.*, Euripides, 985. The line begins with a succession of 12 short syllables.

[e] *Olympians*, i. 20. Plutarch's memory failed him (see critical note), providing a longer run of short syllables than the correct text.

(747) καὶ Ὅμηρος ἐπὶ τῆς ἱπποδρομίας,

E ἅρματα δ' αὖ χαλκῷ[1] πεπυκασμένα κασσιτέρῳ τε
ἵπποις ὠκυπόδεσσιν ἐπέτρεχον,

οὕτως ἐν ὀρχήσει τὸ μὲν σχῆμα μιμητικόν ἐστι μορφῆς καὶ ἰδέας, καὶ πάλιν ἡ φορὰ πάθους τινὸς ἐμφαντικὸν ἢ πράξεως ἢ δυνάμεως· ταῖς δὲ δείξεσι κυρίως αὐτὰ δηλοῦσι τὰ πράγματα, τὴν γῆν, τὸν οὐρανόν, αὐτούς, τοὺς[2] πλησίον· ὃ δὴ τάξει μέν τινι καὶ ἀριθμῷ γινόμενον ἔοικεν τοῖς ἐν ποιητικῇ κυρίοις ὀνόμασιν μετά τινος κόσμου καὶ λειότητος ἐκφερομένοις, ὡς τὰ τοιαῦτα·

καὶ Θέμιν αἰδοίην ἑλικοβλέφαρόν τ' Ἀφροδίτην
Ἥρην[3] τε χρυσοστέφανον καλήν τε Διώνην,

καὶ

F Ἕλληνος[4] δ' ἐγένοντο θεμιστοπόλοι βασιλῆες,
Δῶρός τε Ξοῦθός τε καὶ Αἴολος ἱππιοχάρμης·

εἰ δὲ μή, τοῖς ἄγαν πεζοῖς καὶ κακομέτροις, ὡς τὰ τοιαῦτα,

ἐγένοντο τοῦ μὲν Ἡρακλῆς τοῦ δ' Ἴφικλος,[5]

καὶ[6]

τῆς δὲ πατὴρ καὶ ἀνὴρ καὶ παῖς βασιλεῖς, καὶ ἀδελφοί,
748 καὶ πρόγονοι. κλήζει δ' Ἑλλὰς Ὀλυμπιάδα·

[1] δ' αὖ χαλκῷ] δὲ χρυσῷ Homer.
[2] αὐτούς, τοὺς Bywater : αὐτοὺς τοὺς.
[3] Ἥρην] Ἥβην Hesiod.
[4] Ἕλληνος Basel edition : Ἕλληνες.





and Homer describing the horse-race,

In turn the chariots plated with bronze and with tin
Ran after the swift-footed horses . . . [a]

Similarly in dancing the pose is imitative of shape and outward appearance. The phrase again is expressive of some emotion or action or potentiality. By pointing they literally indicate objects : the earth, the sky, themselves, or bystanders. If this is done with precision, so to say, and timing, it resembles proper names in poetry when they are uttered with a measure of ornament and smoothness. To take an example,

Revered Themis and quick-glancing Aphroditê
And Hera golden-wreathed and beautiful Dionê,[b]

or

And kings were Hellen's offspring, ministers of right,
Dorus, Xuthus, and Aeolus the charioteer.[c]

Otherwise this pointing resembles excessively prosaic and unmetrical verses like

He Heracles begat, the other Iphiclus,[d]

or

Her father, husband, son, her ancestors
And brothers kings. Olympias Greece calls her.[e]

[a] *Iliad*, xxiii. 503-504. [b] Hesiod, *Theogony*, 16-17.
[c] Hesiod, frag. 27.
[d] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.*, Adespoton 400. Alcmenê's twins, Heracles and Iphiclus, were begotten by Zeus and Amphitryo respectively. The line offends against " Porson's law."
[e] Author unknown. Olympias, a Molossian princess, was wife of Philip I of Macedon, and mother of Alexander the Great.

[5] Ἴφικλος Nauck : Ἴφιτος. [6] καὶ added by Cobet.

(748) τοιαῦτα γὰρ ἁμαρτάνεται καὶ περὶ τὴν ὄρχησιν ἐν ταῖς δείξεσιν, ἂν μὴ πιθανότητα μηδὲ χάριν μετ' εὐπρεπείας καὶ ἀφελείας ἔχωσι. καὶ ὅλως," ἔφη, "μετάθεσιν τὸ Σιμωνίδειον ἀπὸ τῆς ζωγραφίας ἐπὶ τὴν ὄρχησιν λαμβάνει.[1] ταύτην γὰρ ὀρθῶς ἔστι λέγειν ποίησιν[2] σιωπῶσαν, καὶ φθεγγομένην ὄρχησιν πάλιν[3] τὴν ποίησιν· οὐθὲν γὰρ ἔοικεν οὔτε γραφικῇ μετεῖναι ποιητικῆς οὔτε ποιητικῇ γραφικῆς,[4] οὐδὲ χρῶνται τὸ παράπαν ἀλλήλαις· ὀρχηστικῇ δὲ καὶ ποιητικῇ[5] κοινωνία πᾶσα καὶ μέθεξις ἀλλήλων ἐστί, καὶ μάλιστα μιγνύμεναι[6] περὶ τὸ[7] τῶν ὑπορχημάτων γένος ἓν ἔργον[8] ἀμφότεραι τὴν διὰ
B τῶν σχημάτων καὶ τῶν ὀνομάτων μίμησιν ἀποτελοῦσι. δόξειε δ' ἂν ὥσπερ ἐν γραφικῇ τὰ μὲν ποιήματα ταῖς γραμμαῖς, ὑφ' ὧν ὁρίζεται τὰ εἴδη . . .[9] δηλοῖ δ' ὁ μάλιστα κατωρθωκέναι δόξας ἐν[10] ὑπορχήμασι καὶ γεγονέναι πιθανώτατος ἑαυτοῦ τὸ δεῖσθαι τὴν ἑτέραν τῆς ἑτέρας· τὸ γὰρ

Πελασγὸν[11] ἵππον ἢ κύνα
Ἀμυκλαίαν ἀγωνίῳ
ἐλελιζόμενος ποδὶ μίμεο καμπύλον μέλος διώκων,

[1] λαμβάνει added by F. H. S.
[2] ταύτην . . . ποίησιν added by Wilamowitz.
[3] πάλιν Bernardakis: δὲ πάλιν.
[4] οὐθὲν γὰρ . . . γραφικῆς Wyttenbach and Hubert: ὅθεν εἶπεν οὔτε γραφικὴν εἶναι ποιητικῆς οὔτε ποιητικὴν γραφῆς.
[5] ὀρχηστικῇ . . . ποιητικῇ Basel edition: ὀρχηστικὴν . . . ποιητικήν.
[6] μιγνύμεναι F. H. S.: μιμούμεναι (deleted by Wilamowitz).
[7] τὸ added by Bernardakis.
[8] ἓν ἔργον Bergk: ἐνεργόν.
[9] Lacuna indicated by Xylander.
[10] δόξας ἐν Meziriacus: δόξειεν.





Similar faults are committed in dancing whenever pointing is used without plausibility, grace, dignity, and simplicity. In short, one can transfer Simonides' saying [a] from painting to dancing, ⟨rightly calling dance⟩ silent poetry and poetry articulate dance. There seems to be nothing of painting in poetry or of poetry in painting, nor does either art make any use whatsoever of the other, whereas dancing and poetry are fully associated and the one involves the other. Particularly is this so when they combine in that type of composition called *hyporchema*, in which the two arts taken together effect a single work, a representation by means of poses and words.[b] In comparison with painting the lines of verse are like the lines that bound the shapes ⟨while the movements and poses are like the colours and shapes⟩. And that each art needs the other is made plain by the writer who has been considered to be most successful in the composition of *hyporchemata*, and nowhere to have carried more conviction. Take this passage :

Pelasgian horse [c] or Amyclaean hound [d]
Make your model as you whirl
On competitive toe,
Chasing the melody's twists ;

[a] *Cf.* Plutarch, *Mor.* 17 F, 58 B, 346 F.
[b] The *hyporchema* was a song accompanied by a mimetic dance. The view that it was a distinct genre of poetry seems to be mistaken, *cf.* H. Koller, *Die Mimesis in der Antike*, pp. 166 ff.
[c] Thessaly, a district of which was known as Pelasgian Argos or Pelasgiotis, was renowned for its cavalry.
[d] Amyclae, once an independent town or village 2½ miles south of Sparta, was early reduced. Spartan hunting-dogs were famous.

[11] Πελασγὸν Meineke: ἀπέλαστον.

(748) τὸν μὲν οἷος[1]

ἀνὰ Δώτιον ἀνθεμόεν πεδίον
πέτεται[2] θάνατον κεράστᾳ[3]
εὑρέμεν μανίων[4] ἐλάφῳ,

τὰν δ' 'ἐπ' αὐχένι στρέφοισαν[5] τέρεν[6] κάρα πάντ' ἐπ' οἶμον' [7] καὶ τὰ ἑξῆς, μόνον οὐ[8] ... † λειόθεν[9] τὴν C ἐν ὀρχήσει διάθεσιν τὰ ποιήματα καὶ παρακαλεῖν τῷ χεῖρε καὶ τῷ πόδε, μᾶλλον δ' ὅλον ὥσπερ τισὶ μηρίνθοις ἕλκειν τὸ σῶμα τοῖς μέλεσι καὶ ἐντείνειν, τούτων λεγομένων[10] καὶ ᾀδομένων ἡσυχίαν ἄγειν μὴ δυνάμενον.[11] αὐτὸς γοῦν ἑαυτὸν οὐκ αἰσχύνεται περὶ τὴν ὄρχησιν οὐχ ἧττον ἢ τὴν ποίησιν ἐγκωμιάζων, ὅταν λέγῃ,[12]

ἐλαφρὸν ὄρχημ' οἶδα[13] ποδῶν μειγνύμεν·
Κρῆτα μὲν καλέουσι τρόπον.

ἀλλ' οὐδὲν οὕτως τὸ νῦν ἀπολέλαυκε τῆς κακομουσίας ὡς ἡ ὄρχησις. διὸ καὶ πέπονθεν ὃ φοβηθεὶς Ἴβυκος ἐποίησε,

δέδοικα μή τι παρὰ θεοῖς
ἀμπλακὼν τιμὰν πρὸς ἀνθρώπων ἀμείψω.

[1] οἷ' Reinach, as part of the poetic text.
[2] Wyttenbach : *πέταται.*
[3] Gallavotti : *κεράσασα. κεροέσσᾳ* Wyttenbach (and see Gow, *Hell. Epigrams*, ii. 70).
[4] Gallavotti : *μανύων. ματεύων* Schneidewin.
[5] Wyttenbach : *στρέφοιαν.* [6] Gallavotti : *ἕτερον.*
[7] Schneidewin : *πάντα ἕτοιμον.*
[8] Loss of words suggested by F. H. S. ; *τὰ ποιήματα*, which Wilamowitz arbitrarily deleted, requires a verb, *e.g. ὑφηγεῖσθαι.*
[9] *εἴωθεν* Anon. 2 (Turn.), Wilamowitz, *ἔνδοθεν ἐκκαλεῖν ἔοικεν* Pohlenz. *δοκεῖ ποθεῖν* Post.
[10] *λεγομένων* Bases : *δὲ λεγομένων.*





the one as he

Over the flowery plain of Dotion flies
Afire to find a way of death for the hornèd stag[b];

and her, the hound, 'turning the fine head on her neck, to try every track' and so on. Shall we not say that these lines almost dictate representation in dancing, summoning our hands and feet, or rather twitching and bracing our whole body to the tunes, as if on strings, so that when these words are spoken or sung it cannot keep still? It is evidence of the author's views that he is not ashamed to praise himself for his dancing as much as for his poetry, when he says,[c]

I know how to mix my steps in light-foot dance;
They call it the Cretan style.

But to-day nothing enjoys the benefits of bad taste so much as dancing. As a result it has really suffered what Ibycus feared when he wrote,

I dread that for some sin against the gods
I may be honoured at the hands of men.[d]

[a] In Thessalian Pelasgiotis.
[b] Author unknown, perhaps Pindar (frag. 107 Snell). Athenaeus, 15 d, thinks the best *hyporchemata* belonged to the time of Xenodemus and Pindar. Bergk, *Pindar*, ii. 2, p. 596 opts for Simonides, Reinach, *Mélanges Weil*, pp. 413 ff., for Bacchylides, neither with much ground.
[c] Included by Snell in Pindar, frag. 107 (see previous note). Athenaeus, 181 b, cites the lines with the addition of the words *τὸ δ' ὄργανον* Μολοσσόν.
[d] Ibycus, frag. 24 Diehl, *cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 242 c.

[11] *δυνάμενον* Wyttenbach : *δυναμένοις.*
[12] The MSS. have *δὲ γηρῶσαι νῦν. λέγῃ* is due to Blass ; the other eight letters defy emendation, although there have been many guesses.
[13] *οἶδα*] *ἀοιδᾷ* Bergk.

(748)
D καὶ γὰρ αὕτη πάνδημόν[1] τινα ποιητικὴν προσεταιρισαμένη τῆς δ' οὐρανίας ἐκπεσοῦσ'[2] ἐκείνης, τῶν μὲν ἐμπλήκτων[3] καὶ ἀνοήτων κρατεῖ θεάτρων, ὥσπερ τύραννος ὑπήκοον ἑαυτῇ πεποιημένη μουσικὴν ὀλίγου τὴν ἅπασαν,[4] τὴν δὲ παρὰ τοῖς νοῦν ἔχουσι καὶ θείοις ἀνδράσιν ὡς ἀληθῶς τιμὴν ἀπολώλεκε."

Ταῦτα σχεδόν, ὦ Σόσσιε Σενεκίων, τελευταῖα τῶν ἐν τοῖς Μουσείοις τότε παρ' Ἀμμωνίῳ τῷ ἀγαθῷ φιλολογηθέντων.

[1] πάνδημόν Basel edition : καὶ πάνδημόν.
[2] ἐκπεσοῦσα Basel edition : ἐμπεσοῦσα.
[3] ἐμπλήκτων Anon. 2 (Turn.) : ἐκπληκτικῶν.
[4] ὀλίγου τὴν ἅπασαν Wyttenbach : ὀλίγην τινὰ πᾶσι.

[a] An allusion to the profane and heavenly Love of Plato, *Symposium*, 180 E.

[b] Although these sentiments may be borrowed from some earlier, perhaps Peripatetic, moralizer (*cf.* H. Koller, quoted in note on 748 B *supra*), Plutarch may have thought them particularly apt to the art of the *pantomimi*, so flourishing





Dancing has indeed made a profane poetry her companion and fallen out of favour with the other heavenly kind[a]; and having tyrannously brought almost all music under her sway, she is mistress of the caprice and folly of the theatres,[b] but has lost her honour among men who have intelligence and may properly be called divine."[c]

This was about the end, Sossius Senecio, of the learned conversation then held at the feast of the Muses in the company of the excellent Ammonius.

in his day. The dancer was here the star performer (and often popular idol), supported by musicians and a choir whose songs were explanatory of the dance, whereas in the ideal *hyporchema* of the moralist dance and song were on an equal footing, and dancer and singer the same person.

[c] The word *theios* is sometimes used in a weakened sense, "marvellous." The suggestion is that, since intelligence is the divine element in man, it is to the intelligent that the word should be applied. At the same time Plutarch may have in mind an etymology that connects *theatron* (theatre) with *theios*, *cf.* Pseudo-Plutarch, *De Musica*, 1140 E, Philodemus, *De Musica*, pp. 13, 67 Kemke.

# THE DIALOGUE ON LOVE
## (AMATORIUS)

# INTRODUCTION

THIS work is a dialogue only in form, for the presence of Flavian serves merely to introduce Plutarch's son, Autobulus, and lead up to the recital of Plutarch's own part in the debate on love at the sanctuary of the Muses on Helicon. This took place years before, shortly after our author's marriage and before his son's birth, so that the latter knows of it only because his father remembered the scene vividly and repeated it often.

The recital is punctuated and sometimes motivated by a romantic upheaval in the town of Thespiae below. A rich young widow of the town is seeking to marry a handsome young man, somewhat her junior. His friends are divided about the wisdom of this alliance; the debate is at first between the adherents and the opponents of paederasty. But while both friends and enemies are arguing elsewhere, the widow takes control of the situation and abducts the boy. This recall from philosophy to life scatters both parties and Plutarch is left with the more serious members of the group to whom doctrinaire partisanship is unsuitable.

Now begins the apology for the god Love (Eros) in which his divinity is vindicated, his power affirmed, his benefits attested, and his apotheosis assured. But, in a part of the narrative now lost, conjugal love is

attacked ; and the rest of the work provides a spirited and occasionally penetrating defence of the part that women play in the marriage bond. So, fittingly enough, when Plutarch and his friends arrive at Thespiae, they find to their delight that the marriage is under way and only awaits their presence for its celebration. Love the god is as active in life as he is in philosophy.

The work has been generally admired ; those who seek an appreciation of it may consult the interesting and enthusiastic edition of Robert Flacelière (Paris, Les Belles Lettres, 1952), which also contains a good bibliography.[a]

The present editor must acknowledge a considerable debt to Flacelière's spirited translation. It often lightened his troubles, when troubles were brewing in the somewhat poor condition of the text. But his chief debt is to his learned and generous colleague, W. G. Rabinowitz, who went over every word of the translation and removed innumerable blemishes. He also suggested so many interpretations that are both new and true that if any part of this edition is an improvement on Flacelière and Hubert,[b] the gratitude for this not inconsiderable feat is to be accorded to Rabinowitz, and to him alone.

The dialogue is transmitted in two MSS. only, E

[a] It may be noted that the love celebrated in this essay is not Aphroditê, sensual love, but Eros, romantic passion. The Stoics had already advocated romantic married love (see Antipater, *Stoic. Vet. Frag.* iii, pp. 254 ff.) and Plutarch carries his preference for it a step further. *Cf.* L. A. Post, "Woman's Place in Menander's Athens," *Trans. Amer. Philol. Assoc.* lxxi (1940), pp. 420 ff., especially pp. 452-454.

[b] The Teubner edition of 1938 : see *Class. Phil.* xxxvi (1941), pp. 85 ff.

and B, both of them full of lacunae and corruptions. The recent controversy about their relationship has been warm, and sometimes hot. It is admirably summarized by Harold Cherniss in the introduction to his edition of the *De Facie* (L.C.L. *Moralia*, vol. xii, pp. 26, 27, 31, 32). The editor has collated both MSS. from photographs (*Class. Phil.* xxxvi (1941), pp. 85 ff.), but is unwilling to take part in the controversy. It does seem certain, however, for one reason or another, that B is not copied directly from E. The fact that there must have been at least one intermediary will surely give it independent value.

The work is no. 107 in the so-called Lamprias catalogue. Bernardakis (vii, p. 151) claims that a Plutarchean fragment in Stobaeus once stood in the great lacuna at 766 D. This is possible, but by no means certain.

W. C. HELMBOLD

1. ΦΛΑΟΥΙΑΝΟΣ. Ἐν Ἑλικῶνι φής, ὦ Αὐτόβουλε, τοὺς περὶ Ἔρωτος λόγους γενέσθαι, οὓς εἴτε γραψάμενος εἴτε καταμνημονεύσας τῷ πολλάκις ἐπανερέσθαι τὸν πατέρα νυνὶ μέλλεις ἡμῖν δεηθεῖσιν ἀπαγγέλλειν;

ΑΥΤΟΒΟΥΛΟΣ. Ἐν Ἑλικῶνι παρὰ ταῖς Μούσαις, ὦ Φλαουιανέ, τὰ Ἐρωτίδεια[1] Θεσπιέων ἀγόντων· ἄγουσι γὰρ ἀγῶνα πενταετηρικόν, ὥσπερ καὶ ταῖς Μούσαις καὶ τῷ Ἔρωτι φιλοτίμως πάνυ καὶ λαμπρῶς.

ΦΛΑΟΥ. Οἶσθ' οὖν ὃ σοῦ[2] μέλλομεν δεῖσθαι πάντες οἱ πρὸς τὴν ἀκρόασιν ἥκοντες;

749 ΑΥΤ. Οὔκ· ἀλλ' εἴσομαι λεγόντων.

ΦΛΑΟΥ. Ἄφελε τοῦ λόγου τὸ νῦν ἔχον ἐποποιῶν τε λειμῶνας καὶ σκιὰς καὶ ἅμα κιττοῦ τε καὶ σμιλάκων διαδρομὰς καὶ ὅσ' ἄλλα τοιούτων τόπων ἐπιλαβόμενοι γλίχονται τὸν Πλάτωνος Ἰλισσὸν καὶ τὸν ἄγνον ἐκεῖνον καὶ τὴν ἠρέμα προσάντη πόαν πεφυκυῖαν προθυμότερον ἢ κάλλιον ἐπιγράφεσθαι.

ΑΥΤ. Τί δὲ δεῖται τοιούτων, ὦ ἄριστε Φλαου-

[1] Ἐρωτίδεια Kaibel: ἐρωτικά.
[2] ὃ σοῦ Xylander: ὅσου.

[a] Thespiae, in Plutarch's day, was the principal city of Boeotia, except perhaps for Tanagra (Strabo, ix. 2. 5, 25). Thebes, Chaeronea, and the rest were not even "respectable



# THE DIALOGUE ON LOVE

(Flavian and Plutarch's son, Autobulus, converse in the presence of some others.)

1. FLAVIAN. It was on Helicon, Autobulus, that you say the conversation on love took place of which at our request you are now going to give us an account? Either you made a record of it or got it by heart from frequent probing of your father.

AUTOBULUS. Yes, Flavian, it was on Helicon in the shrine of the Muses while the people of Thespiae[a] were celebrating the Erotidia.[b] This they do every four years in honour of Eros as well as the Muses, with great zeal and splendour.

FLAVIAN. Are you aware of the petition that all of us who have come to you intend to present?

AUTOBULUS. No, but I shall be when you state it.

FLAVIAN. Discard for the moment from your recital the meadows and shady nooks of the poets, the gadding growth of ivy and smilax, and all the other commonplaces on which writers seize, as they endeavour with more enthusiasm than success to endorse their work with Plato's Ilissus,[c] his famous agnus castus and the gentle grass-grown slope.

AUTOBULUS. My dear Flavian, why should my dis-

villages." See also Frazer's *Pausanias*, v, pp. 140 ff. But Cicero (*Verr.* ii. 4. 135) speaks of the great statue of Eros as Thespiae's only attraction.

[b] See Gulick on Athenaeus, 561 e, 629 a (L.C.L.).

[c] *Phaedrus*, 229 A, 230 B.

(749) ιανέ, προοιμίων ἡ διήγησις; εὐθὺς ἡ πρόφασις, ἐξ ἧς ὡρμήθησαν οἱ λόγοι, χορὸν αἰτεῖ συμπαθῆ[1] καὶ σκηνῆς δεῖται, τά τ' ἄλλα δράματος οὐδὲν ἐλλείπει· μόνον εὐχώμεθα τῇ μητρὶ τῶν Μουσῶν ἵλεω
B παρεῖναι καὶ συνανασῴζειν τὸν μῦθον.

2. Ὁ γὰρ πατήρ, ἐπεὶ πάλαι, πρὶν ἡμᾶς γενέσθαι, τὴν μητέρα νεωστὶ κεκομισμένος ἐκ τῆς γενομένης τοῖς γονεῦσιν αὐτῶν διαφορᾶς καὶ στάσεως ἀφίκετο τῷ Ἔρωτι θύσων, ἐπὶ τὴν ἑορτὴν ἦγε τὴν μητέρα· καὶ γὰρ ἦν ἐκείνης ἡ εὐχὴ καὶ ἡ θυσία. τῶν δὲ φίλων οἴκοθεν μὲν αὐτῷ παρῆσαν οἱ συνήθεις, ἐν δὲ Θεσπιαῖς εὗρε Δαφναῖον τὸν Ἀρχιδάμου Λυσάνδρας[2] ἐρῶντα τῆς Σίμωνος καὶ μάλιστα τῶν μνωμένων αὐτὴν εὐημεροῦντα, καὶ Σώκλαρον ἐκ Τιθόρας ἥκοντα τὸν Ἀριστίωνος· ἦν[3] δὲ καὶ Πρω-
C τογένης ὁ Ταρσεὺς καὶ Ζεύξιππος ὁ Λακεδαιμόνιος, ξένοι· Βοιωτῶν δ' ὁ πατὴρ ἔφη τῶν γνωρίμων τοὺς πλείστους παρεῖναι.

Δύο μὲν οὖν ἢ τρεῖς ἡμέρας κατὰ πόλιν, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἡσυχῇ πως φιλοσοφοῦντες ἐν ταῖς παλαίστραις καὶ διὰ τῶν θεάτρων ἀλλήλοις συνῆσαν· ἔπειτα φεύγοντες ἀργαλέον ἀγῶνα κιθαρῳδῶν, ἐντεύξεσι καὶ σπουδαῖς προειλημμένον, ἀνέζευξαν οἱ πλείους ὥσπερ ἐκ πολεμίας εἰς τὸν Ἑλικῶνα καὶ κατηυλίσαντο παρὰ ταῖς Μούσαις.

[1] συμπαθῆ Post : τῷ πάθει.
[2] Λυσάνδρας Leonicus : καὶ λύσανδρον.
[3] παρῆν van Herwerden.

[a] Mnemosynê : " Memory."
[b] One of Plutarch's best friends. He appears often in the *Symposiacs* and is a speaker in *De Sollertia Animalium*.





course need such preliminaries ? The situation that gave rise to the debate merely wants a chorus to sympathize and lacks a stage, for no other element of drama is wanting. Only, let us pray to the Mother of the Muses [a] to be graciously present and help me to resuscitate the story.

2. A long time ago, before I was born, when my father had only recently married my mother, he rescued her from a dispute that had broken out between their parents and was so hotly contested that my father came here to sacrifice to Eros and brought my mother to the festival ; in fact she herself was to make the prayer and the sacrifice. His usual friends came with him from home and at Thespiae he found Daphnaeus, son of Archidamus, the lover of Simon's daughter, Lysandra, and the most favoured of all her suitors. Soclarus,[b] son of Aristion, had come from Tithora ; and there were present also Protogenes [c] of Tarsus and Zeuxippus [d] of Lacedaemon, friends of his from abroad. My father said that most of his other Boeotian acquaintances were there.

Now they passed, it seems, the first two or three days in the city, indulging mildly between spectacles in learned conversation in the athletic buildings. After that, routed by a stubborn feud among the harpists which was preceded by appeals for support and enlisting of partisans,[e] most of the visitors decamped from the hostile territory and bivouacked on Helicon as guests of the Muses.

[c] See *Mor.* 563 B.
[d] He appears as a speaker in two other works also (*Mor.* 122 B and 1086 C).
[e] The Thespians were notable for their excitability and contentiousness : Dicaearchus in Müller, *Geogr. Graec. Min.* i, p. 104 ; Aelian, *Varia Hist.* xi. 6.

(749) Ἕωθεν οὖν ἀφίκετο[1] πρὸς αὐτοὺς Ἀνθεμίων καὶ Πεισίας ἄνδρες ἔνδοξοι, Βάκχωνι δὲ τῷ καλῷ λεγομένῳ προσήκοντες καὶ τρόπον τινὰ δι' εὔνοιαν
D ἀμφότεροι τὴν ἐκείνου διαφερόμενοι πρὸς ἀλλήλους. ἦν γὰρ ἐν Θεσπιαῖς Ἰσμηνοδώρα γυνὴ πλούτῳ καὶ γένει λαμπρὰ καὶ νὴ Δία τὸν ἄλλον εὔτακτος βίον· ἐχήρευσε[2] γὰρ οὐκ ὀλίγον χρόνον ἄνευ ψόγου, καίπερ οὖσα νέα καὶ ἱκανὴ τὸ εἶδος. τῷ δὲ Βάκχωνι φίλης ὄντι καὶ συνήθους γυναικὸς υἱῷ πράττουσα γάμον κόρης κατὰ γένος προσηκούσης ἐκ τοῦ συμπαρεῖναι καὶ διαλέγεσθαι πολλάκις ἔπαθε πρὸς τὸ μειράκιον αὐτή· καὶ λόγους φιλανθρώπους ἀκούουσα καὶ λέγουσα περὶ αὐτοῦ καὶ πλῆθος ὁρῶσα γενναίων ἐραστῶν εἰς τὸ ἐρᾶν προήχθη καὶ διενο-
E εἶτο μηδὲν ποιεῖν ἀγεννές,[3] ἀλλὰ γημαμένη φανερῶς συγκαταζῆν τῷ Βάκχωνι. παραδόξου δὲ τοῦ πράγματος αὐτοῦ[4] φανέντος, ἥ τε μήτηρ ὑφεωρᾶτο τὸ βάρος τοῦ οἴκου καὶ τὸν ὄγκον ὡς οὐ κατὰ τὸν ἐραστόν,[5] τινὲς δὲ καὶ συγκυνηγοὶ τῷ μὴ καθ' ἡλικίαν τῆς Ἰσμηνοδώρας δεδιττόμενοι τὸν Βάκχωνα καὶ σκώπτοντες ἐργωδέστεροι τῶν ἀπὸ σπουδῆς ἐνισταμένων ἦσαν ἀνταγωνισταὶ πρὸς τὸν γάμον, ἠδεῖτο γὰρ ἔφηβος ἔτ' ὢν χήρᾳ συνοικεῖν. οὐ μὴν ἀλλὰ τοὺς ἄλλους ἐάσας παρεχώρησε[6] τῷ Πεισίᾳ καὶ τῷ Ἀνθεμίωνι βουλεύσασθαι τὸ συμφέρον, ὧν ὁ μὲν ἀνεψιὸς αὐτοῦ ἦν[7] πρεσβύτερος, ὁ δὲ Πεισίας

[1] ἀφίκοντο Meziriacus.
[2] ἐχήρευσε Passow : ἐχήρωσε.
[3] ἀγεννές Xylander : ἀγενές.
[4] αὐτοῦ] αὐτοῖς Reiske.
[5] ἐραστόν Post : ἐραστήν.
[6] παρεχώρησε Basel edition : παραχωρῆσαι.
[7] ἦν αὐτοῦ Benseler.





At dawn Anthemion and Pisias joined them, men of some standing and attached to Bacchon who was called The Handsome ; and because of their common affection for the youth there was a kind of quarrel between them. You must know that there lived at Thespiae Ismenodora, a woman conspicuous for her wealth and breeding who led, heaven knows, over and above this a life of decorum. She had been a widow for some little time without a word of censure, even though she was still young and comely.[a] Now Bacchon was the son of an intimate friend of hers and Ismenodora, while promoting a marriage between him and a girl related to herself, had many meetings and conversations with the youth. The result was that she came to view him with different eyes ; what with hearing, what with saying many kind things about him and observing the throng of noble lovers who courted him, she was carried so far as to fall in love with him herself. Her intentions were far from dishonourable : she desired to marry him and be his companion for life. The situation was startling enough in itself and the boy's mother had misgivings that the dignity and splendour of Ismenodora's household were too grand to suit her loved one. Some of the boy's hunting companions, moreover, used the discrepancy in ages to deter him. Their making a joke of the marriage served to counter it more effectively than did the serious intervention of others. He was still a minor and felt shy of marrying a widow. Nevertheless, he ignored the others and left the decision to Pisias and Anthemion. The latter was an older cousin of his, while Pisias was the most

[a] She was about 30 years of age, to judge from 753 A *infra*' while Bacchon was, as an *ephebus*, between 18 and 20.

(749)
F αὐστηρότατος τῶν ἐραστῶν· διὸ καὶ πρὸς τὸν γάμον ἀντέπραττε καὶ καθήπτετο τοῦ Ἀνθεμίωνος ὡς προϊεμένου τῇ Ἰσμηνοδώρᾳ τὸ μειράκιον· ὁ δ' ἐκεῖνον οὐκ ὀρθῶς ἔλεγε ποιεῖν, ἀλλὰ τἄλλα χρηστὸν ὄντα μιμεῖσθαι τοὺς φαύλους ἐραστὰς οἴκου καὶ γάμου καὶ πραγμάτων μεγάλων ἀποστεροῦντα τὸν φίλον, ὅπως ἄθικτος αὐτῶν[1] καὶ νεαρὸς ἀποδύ-
750 οιτο πλεῖστον χρόνον ἐν ταῖς παλαίστραις.

3. Ἵν' οὖν μὴ παροξύνοντες ἀλλήλους κατὰ μικρὸν εἰς ὀργὴν προαγάγοιεν, ὥσπερ διαιτητὰς ἑλόμενοι καὶ βραβευτὰς τὸν πατέρα καὶ τοὺς σὺν αὐτῷ παρεγένοντο· καὶ τῶν ἄλλων φίλων οἷον ἐκ παρασκευῆς τῷ μὲν ὁ Δαφναῖος παρῆν τῷ δ' ὁ Πρωτογένης· ἀλλ' οὗτος μὲν ἀνέδην ἔλεγε κακῶς τὴν Ἰσμηνοδώραν· ὁ δὲ Δαφναῖος, "ὦ Ἡράκλεις," ἔφη, "τί οὐκ ἄν τις προσδοκήσειεν, εἰ καὶ Πρωτογένης Ἔρωτι πολεμήσων πάρεστιν ᾧ καὶ παιδιὰ[2] πᾶσα καὶ σπουδὴ περὶ Ἔρωτα καὶ δι' Ἔρωτος,

λήθη δὲ λόγων λήθη δὲ πάτρας,

B οὐχ ὡς τῷ Λαΐῳ πέντε μόνον ἡμερῶν ἀπέχοντι τῆς πατρίδος; βραδὺς γὰρ ὁ ἐκείνου[3] καὶ χερσαῖος Ἔρως, ὁ δὲ σὸς ἐκ Κιλικίας Ἀθήναζε

λαιψηρὰ κυκλώσας πτερὰ διαπόντιος πέτεται.[4]

[1] αὐτῶν] αὐτῷ Leonicus.
[2] παιδιὰ Xylander: παιδεία.
[3] ἐκείνου Turnebus: ἐκείνων.
[4] πέτεται Athenaeus, 165 a: πέταται.

[a] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 240 A.
[b] See the excellent interpretation of Bolkestein, *Mnemosynê*, iv (1953), p. 300.





sober of his admirers. For this reason, he used his influence against the marriage and took Anthemion to task for surrendering the young man to Ismenodora. Anthemion, in his turn, found fault with Pisias, saying that in everything else he was a model, but that as a lover he was imitating the baser sort in trying to deprive one dear to him of an estate and an alliance and a great career [a] merely to keep him as long as possible untouched by these matters [b] and astripping of his clothes in the palaestra.

3. So to avoid exasperating each other and gradually falling into a rage they had chosen my father and his friends as arbiters and referees and had come to join them. And, just as though it had been arranged in advance, each of them found an advocate in this friendly circle, Anthemion Daphnaeus, Pisias Protogenes. Protogenes, however, set no bounds to his abuse of Ismenodora, at which Daphnaeus exclaimed, "Good heavens, what is one to expect next, if even Protogenes stands by to combat Love, to whom all his time, when he works and when he plays,[c] is devoted, with Love at heart, Love in hand,

Forgetful of learning, forgetful of fatherland? [d]

For it's not just five days' journey, like Laïus, that you are away from home. His love traipsed slow, a landlubber, while yours,

Circling on swift wings, flits over the sea [e]

[c] *Cf.* Plato, *Symposium*, 177 E.
[d] Possibly from Euripides' *Chrysippus*: *cf.* Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 632. The subject was Laïus' rape of the son of Pelops, to which the next phrase refers.
[e] Archilochus, frag. 92 b Diehl; Edmonds, *Elegy and Iambus*, ii, p. 142. *Cf. Mor.* 507 A.

(750) τοὺς καλοὺς ἐφορῶν καὶ συμπλανώμενος." ἀμέλει γὰρ ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἐγεγόνει τοιαύτη τις αἰτία τῷ Πρωτογένει τῆς ἀποδημίας.

4. Γενομένου δὲ γέλωτος, ὁ Πρωτογένης, "ἐγὼ δέ σοι δοκῶ," εἶπεν, "Ἔρωτι νῦν πολεμεῖν, οὐχ ὑπὲρ Ἔρωτος διαμάχεσθαι πρὸς ἀκολασίαν καὶ ὕβριν αἰσχίστοις πράγμασι καὶ πάθεσιν εἰς τὰ κάλλιστα καὶ σεμνότατα τῶν ὀνομάτων εἰσβιαζομένην;"

C Καὶ ὁ Δαφναῖος, "αἴσχιστα δὲ καλεῖς," ἔφη, "γάμον καὶ σύνοδον ἀνδρὸς καὶ γυναικός, ἧς οὐ γέγονεν οὐδ' ἔστιν ἱερωτέρα κατάζευξις;"

"Ἀλλὰ ταῦτα μέν," εἶπεν ὁ Πρωτογένης, "ἀναγκαῖα πρὸς γένεσιν ὄντα σεμνύνουσιν οὐ φαύλως οἱ νομοθέται καὶ κατευλογοῦσι πρὸς τοὺς πολλούς· ἀληθινοῦ δ' Ἔρωτος οὐδ' ὁτιοῦν τῇ γυναικωνίτιδι μέτεστιν, οὐδ' ἐρᾶν ὑμᾶς ἔγωγέ φημι τοὺς γυναιξὶ προσπεπονθότας ἢ παρθένοις, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ μυῖαι[1] γάλακτος οὐδὲ μέλιτται κηρίων ἐρῶσιν οὐδὲ σιτευταὶ καὶ μάγειροι φίλα φρονοῦσι[2] παίνοντες ὑπὸ σκότῳ μόσχους καὶ ὄρνιθας.

"Ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἐπὶ σιτίον ἄγει καὶ ὄψον ἡ φύσις μετρίως καὶ ἱκανῶς τὴν ὄρεξιν, ἡ δ' ὑπερβολὴ D πάθος ἐνεργασαμένη λαιμαργία τις ἢ φιλοψία[3] καλεῖται, οὕτως ἔνεστι τῇ φύσει τὸ δεῖσθαι τῆς ἀπ' ἀλλήλων ἡδονῆς γυναῖκας καὶ ἄνδρας, τὴν δ' ἐπὶ τοῦτο κινοῦσαν ὁρμὴν σφοδρότητι καὶ ῥώμῃ γενομένην πολλὴν καὶ δυσκάθεκτον οὐ προσηκόντως Ἔρωτα καλοῦσιν. Ἔρως γὰρ εὐφυοῦς καὶ νέας

[1] μυῖαι Reiske : μυῖα.
[2] φίλα φρονοῦσι Bernardakis : φιλοφρονοῦσι.





from Cilicia to Athens to look over the handsome lads and make the rounds with them." No doubt it had been some such reason that originally caused Protogenes' journey from home.

4. This raised a laugh and Protogenes said, "So you think that I'm at war with Love now, do you, and not fighting on his side against lechery and insolence when they try to force the foulest acts and passions into the company of the most honourable and dignified of names?"

"When you say foulest," asked Daphnaeus, "are you referring to marriage, the union of man and wife, than which there has not existed, now or ever, a fellowship more sacred?"

"Why, of course," said Protogenes, "since it's necessary for producing children, there's no harm in legislators talking it up and singing its praises to the masses. But genuine Love has no connexion whatsoever with the women's quarters. I deny that it is love that you have felt for women and girls—any more than flies feel love for milk or bees for honey or than caterers and cooks have tender emotions for the calves and fowls they fatten in the dark.

"In a normal state one's desire for bread and meat is moderate, yet sufficient; but abnormal indulgence of this desire creates the vicious habit called gluttony and gormandizing. In just the same way there normally exists in men and women a need for the pleasure derived from each other; but when the impulse that drives us to this goal is so vigorous and powerful that it becomes torrential and almost out of control, it is a mistake to give the name Love to it. Love, in fact, it is that attaches himself to a young

[3] φιλοψία Xylander : φιλοψυχία.

(750) ψυχῆς ἀψάμενος εἰς ἀρετὴν διὰ φιλίας τελευτᾷ· ταῖς δὲ πρὸς γυναῖκας ἐπιθυμίαις ταύταις, ἂν ἄριστα πέσωσιν, ἡδονὴν περίεστι καρποῦσθαι καὶ ἀπόλαυσιν ὥρας καὶ σώματος, ὡς ἐμαρτύρησεν Ἀρίστιππος, τῷ κατηγοροῦντι Λαΐδος πρὸς αὐτὸν ὡς οὐ φιλούσης ἀποκρινάμενος ὅτι καὶ τὸν οἶνον οἴεται
E καὶ τὸν ἰχθὺν μὴ φιλεῖν αὐτόν, ἀλλ' ἡδέως ἑκατέρῳ χρῆται. τέλος γὰρ ἐπιθυμίας ἡδονὴ καὶ ἀπόλαυσις· Ἔρως δὲ προσδοκίαν φιλίας ἀποβαλὼν οὐκ ἐθέλει παραμένειν οὐδὲ θεραπεύειν ἐφ' ὥρᾳ τὸ λυπρὸν[1] καὶ ἀκμάζον,[2] εἰ καρπὸν ἤθους οἰκεῖον εἰς φιλίαν καὶ ἀρετὴν οὐκ ἀποδίδωσιν.

" Ἀκούεις δέ τινος τραγικοῦ γαμέτου λέγοντος πρὸς τὴν γυναῖκα,

μισεῖς; ἐγὼ δὲ ῥᾳδίως μισήσομαι,
πρὸς κέρδος ἕλκων τὴν ἐμὴν ἀτιμίαν.

τούτου γὰρ οὐδέν ἐστιν ἐρωτικώτερος[3] ὁ μὴ διὰ κέρδος ἀλλ' ἀφροδισίων ἕνεκα καὶ συνουσίας ὑπο-
F μένων γυναῖκα μοχθηρὰν καὶ ἄστοργον· ὥσπερ Στρατοκλεῖ τῷ ῥήτορι Φιλιππίδης ὁ κωμικὸς ἐπεγγελῶν ἐποίησεν

ἀποστρεφομένης τὴν κορυφὴν φιλεῖς μόλις.

" Εἰ δ' οὖν καὶ τοῦτο τὸ πάθος δεῖ καλεῖν Ἔρωτα, θῆλυν καὶ νόθον ὥσπερ εἰς Κυνόσαργες συντε-

[1] λυπρὸν Rabinowitz : λυποῦν.
[2] ἀτιμάζον Kronenberg (see also Bolkestein, *Mnemosynê*, 1953, p. 300) ; ἀπακμάζον van Herwerden.
[3] ἐρωτικώτερον BE, corrected by the Basel edition.





and talented soul and through friendship brings it to a state of virtue ; but the appetite for women we are speaking of, however well it turns out, has for net gain only an accrual of pleasure in the enjoyment of a ripe physical beauty. To this Aristippus bore witness when he replied to the man who denounced Laïs [a] to him for not loving him : He didn't imagine, he said, that wine or fish loved him either, yet he partook of both with pleasure. The object of desire is, in fact, pleasure and enjoyment ; while Love, if he loses the hope of inspiring friendship, has no wish to remain cultivating a deficient plant which has come to its prime, if the plant cannot yield the proper fruit of character to produce friendship and virtue.

" You know the husband in the tragedy who says to his wife :

You hate me ? I can lightly bear your hate
And make a windfall of my slighted state. [b]

Yet the man who, not for gain, but for lust and intercourse, endures an evil, unloving woman is no more in love than the husband in the play. Such was the orator Stratocles whom the comic poet Philippides [c] ridiculed :

She turns away : you barely get her braids to kiss.

" If, however, such a passion must also be called Love, let it at least be qualified as an effeminate and bastard love that takes its exercise in the women's

[a] *Cf.* 767 F *infra.*
[b] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 916, Adespota 401.
[c] Frag. 31 Kock, *Com. Att. Frag.* iii, p. 310. For Stratocles and Philippides see Plutarch, *Life of Demetrius*, xii (894 c) and xxvi (900 F).

(750) λοῦντα τὴν γυναικωνῖτιν· μᾶλλον δ' ὥσπερ ἀετόν
751 τινα λέγουσι γνήσιον καὶ ὀρεινόν,[1] ὃν Ὅμηρος 'μέλανα' καὶ 'θηρευτὴν' προσεῖπεν, ἄλλα δὲ γένη νόθων ἐστὶν ἰχθῦς περὶ ἕλη καὶ ὄρνιθας ἀργοὺς λαμβανόντων, ἀπορούμενοι δὲ πολλάκις ἀναφθέγγονταί τι λιμῶδες καὶ ὀδυρτικόν· οὕτως εἷς Ἔρως[2] γνήσιος ὁ παιδικός ἐστιν, οὐ 'πόθῳ στίλβων,' ὡς ἔφη τὸν παρθένιον Ἀνακρέων, οὐδὲ 'μύρων ἀνάπλεως καὶ γεγανωμένος,' ἀλλὰ λιτὸν αὐτὸν ὄψει καὶ ἄθρυπτον ἐν σχολαῖς φιλοσόφοις ἤ που περὶ γυμνάσια καὶ παλαίστρας περὶ θήραν νέων ὀξὺ μάλα καὶ γενναῖον ἐγκελευόμενον πρὸς ἀρετὴν τοῖς ἀξίοις ἐπιμελείας.

"Τὸν δ' ὑγρὸν τοῦτον καὶ οἰκουρὸν ἐν κόλποις διατρίβοντα καὶ κλινιδίοις γυναικῶν ἀεὶ διώκοντα
B τὰ μαλθακὰ καὶ θρυπτόμενον ἡδοναῖς ἀνάνδροις καὶ ἀφίλοις καὶ ἀνενθουσιάστοις καταβάλλειν ἄξιον, ὡς καὶ Σόλων κατέβαλε· δούλοις μὲν γὰρ ἐρᾶν ἀρρένων παίδων ἀπεῖπε καὶ ξηραλοιφεῖν, χρῆσθαι δὲ συνουσίαις γυναικῶν οὐκ ἐκώλυσε· καλὸν γὰρ ἡ φιλία καὶ ἀστεῖον, ἡ δ' ἡδονὴ κοινὸν καὶ ἀνελεύθερον. ὅθεν οὐδὲ[3] δούλων[4] ἐρᾶν παίδων ἐλευθέριόν ἐστιν οὐδ' ἀστεῖον· συνουσία[5] γὰρ οὗτος ὁ ἔρως, καθάπερ ὁ[6] τῶν γυναικῶν."

[1] ὄρειον van Herwerden.
[2] Ἔρως Wilamowitz : ἔρως ὁ. [3] οὐδὲ Reiske : οὐ.
[4] δούλων Wyttenbach : δοῦλον BE.
[5] συνουσία Flacelière : οὐσία.
[6] ὁ added by Wyttenbach.

[a] The gymnasium at Cynosarges was the only one in Athens which residents of illegitimate birth or born of a foreign mother could frequent: *Life of Themistocles*, i (112 A).





quarters as bastards do in the Cynosarges.[a] Or rather, just as there is one eagle, called the true or mountain eagle, which Homer[b] qualifies as 'black' and 'the hunter,' though there are other bastard varieties which catch fish and slow-flying birds in marshes; when they grow hungry, as they often do, they give a famished and plaintive scream—just so: there is only one genuine Love, the love of boys. It is not 'flashing with desire,' as Anacreon[c] says of the love of maidens, or 'drenched with unguents, shining bright.' No, its aspect is simple and unspoiled. You will see it in the schools of philosophy, or perhaps in the gymnasia and palaestrae, searching for young men whom it cheers on with a clear and noble cry[d] to the pursuit of virtue when they are found worthy of its attention.

"But that other lax and housebound love, that spends its time in the bosoms and beds of women, ever pursuing a soft life, enervated amid pleasure devoid of manliness and friendship and inspiration—it should be proscribed, as in fact Solon[e] did proscribe it. He forbade slaves to make love to boys or to have a rubdown, but he did not restrict their intercourse with women. For friendship is a beautiful and courteous relationship, but mere pleasure is base and unworthy of a free man. For this reason also it is not gentlemanly or urbane to make love to slave boys: such a love is mere copulation, like the love of women."

[b] *Iliad*, xxi. 252; xxiv. 315 f.; see also Aristotle, *Hist. Animal.* ix. 2 (618 b 26 ff.).
[c] Frag. 13 a Bergk and Diehl; frag. 62 Edmonds (*Lyra Graeca*, ii, p. 168).
[d] Not the "starveling scream" of base-born eagles.
[e] *Life of Solon*, i (79 A-B); *cf. Mor.* 152 D.

(751) 5. Ἔτι δὲ πλείονα λέγειν προθυμουμένου τοῦ Πρωτογένους, ἀντικρούσας ὁ Δαφναῖος, " εὖ γε νὴ Δί'," ἔφη, " τοῦ Σόλωνος ἐμνήσθης καὶ χρηστέον αὐτῷ γνώμονι τοῦ ἐρωτικοῦ ἀνδρός,

C ἔσθ' ἥβης ἐρατοῖσιν ἐπ' ἄνθεσι παιδοφιλήσῃ
μηρῶν ἱμείρων[1] καὶ γλυκεροῦ στόματος.

πρόσλαβε δὲ τῷ Σόλωνι καὶ τὸν Αἰσχύλον λέγοντα,

σέβας δὲ μηρῶν[2] οὐκ ἐπηδέσω,[3]
ὦ δυσχάριστε τῶν πυκνῶν[4] φιλημάτων.

ἕτεροι μὲν γὰρ καταγελῶσιν αὐτῶν, εἰ καθάπερ θύτας καὶ μάντεις εἰς τὰ μηρία καὶ τὴν ὀσφὺν ἀποβλέπειν τοὺς ἐραστὰς κελεύουσιν· ἐγὼ δὲ παμμέγεθες τοῦτο ποιοῦμαι σημεῖον ὑπὲρ τῶν γυναικῶν· εἰ γὰρ ἡ παρὰ φύσιν ὁμιλία πρὸς ἄρρενας οὐκ ἀναιρεῖ τὴν ἐρωτικὴν εὔνοιαν οὐδὲ βλάπτει, πολὺ D μᾶλλον εἰκός ἐστι τὸν γυναικῶν καὶ[5] ἀνδρῶν ἔρωτα τῇ φύσει χρώμενον εἰς φιλίαν διὰ χάριτος ἐξικνεῖσθαι. χάρις γὰρ οὖν, ὦ Πρωτόγενες, ἡ τοῦ θήλεος ὕπειξις τῷ ἄρρενι κέκληται πρὸς τῶν παλαιῶν· ὡς καὶ Πίνδαρος ἔφη τὸν Ἥφαιστον ' ἄνευ χαρίτων ' ἐκ τῆς Ἥρας γενέσθαι· καὶ τὴν οὔπω γάμων ἔχουσαν ὥραν ἡ Σαπφὼ προσαγορεύουσα φησίν, ὅτι

σμίκρα μοι πάις ἔμμεν ἐφαίνεο[6] κἄχαρις.

[1] ἱμείρων] om. BE ; added by Stephanus.
[2] Bernardakis adds ἁγνὸν from Athenaeus, 602 e.
[3] οὐκ ἐπηδέσω Athenaeus : οὐ κατηδέσω.
[4] πυκνῶν Athenaeus : πικρῶν. [5] καὶ Xylander : ἢ.
[6] Bergk : σμικρά μοι παῖ ἔμμεναι φαίνεαι.





5. Though Protogenes would cheerfully have added other arguments, Daphnaeus cut him short. " Good heavens," said he, " many thanks for citing Solon. Let us take him as the criterion of the lover,[a]

Till he loves a lad in the flower of youth,
Bewitched by limbs and by sweet lips.

And to Solon you may add Aeschylus,[b] who says :

You had no reverence for the splendour
Of your limbs, ungrateful for our many kisses.

Others, to be sure, have a good laugh at these gentry for urging lovers to fix their gaze on hams and haunches like priests bent on sacrifice or divination. But I count this as a great argument in favour of women : if union contrary to nature with males does not destroy or curtail a lover's tenderness, it stands to reason that the love between men and women, being normal and natural, will be conducive to friendship developing in due course from favour. For, you see, Protogenes, a woman's yielding to a man was called by the ancients ' favour.' So it was that Pindar[c] declared that Hephaestus was born from Hera ' without favour.' And Sappho[d] addressed a young girl not yet ripe for marriage :

You seemed to me a small child without favour.

[a] Frag. 25 Diehl ; frag. 25 Edmonds (*Elegy and Iambus*, i, p. 138).
[b] Frag. 135 Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 44, from the *Myrmidons* ; probably spoken by Achilles over the corpse of Patroclus, reproaching him for having allowed himself to be killed. *Cf.* also *Mor.* 61 A.
[c] Perhaps a confusion of *Pyth.* ii. 42 with Hesiod, *Theogony*, 927.
[d] Frag. 34 Diehl ; frag. 48 Edmonds (*Lyra Graeca*, i, p. 220).

(751) ὁ δ' Ἡρακλῆς ὑπό τινος ἐρωτᾶται

βίᾳ δ' ἔπραξας[1] χάριτας ἢ πείσας κόρην;

ἡ δ' ἀπὸ τῶν ἀρρένων ἀκόντων μὲν μετὰ[2] βίας γινομένη[3] καὶ λεηλασίας, ἂν δ' ἑκουσίως, σὺν μαλακίᾳ καὶ θηλύτητι, 'βαίνεσθαι' κατὰ Πλάτωνα 'νόμῳ
E τετράποδος καὶ παιδοσπορεῖσθαι' παρὰ φύσιν ἐνδιδόντων, ἄχαρις χάρις[4] παντάπασι καὶ ἀσχήμων καὶ ἀναφρόδιτος.

"Ὅθεν, οἶμαι, καὶ ὁ Σόλων ἐκεῖνα μὲν ἔγραψε νέος ὢν ἔτι καὶ 'σπέρματος πολλοῦ μεστός,' ὡς ὁ Πλάτων φησί· ταυτὶ δὲ πρεσβύτης γενόμενος·

ἔργα δὲ Κυπρογενοῦς νῦν μοι φίλα καὶ Διονύσου καὶ Μουσέων, ἃ τίθησ' ἀνδράσιν εὐφροσύνας,

ὥσπερ ἐκ ζάλης καὶ χειμῶνος τῶν[5] παιδικῶν ἐρώτων ἔν τινι γαλήνῃ τῇ περὶ γάμον καὶ φιλοσοφίαν θέμενος τὸν βίον.

"Εἰ μὲν οὖν τἀληθὲς σκοποῦμεν, ὦ Πρωτόγενες,
F ἓν καὶ ταὐτόν ἐστι πρὸς παῖδας καὶ γυναῖκας πάθος τὸ τῶν Ἐρώτων· εἰ δὲ βούλοιο φιλονεικῶν διαιρεῖν, οὐ μέτρι' ἂν[6] δόξειε ποιεῖν ὁ παιδικὸς οὗτος, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ὀψὲ γεγονὼς καὶ παρ' ὥραν τῷ βίῳ νόθος καὶ σκότιος ἐξελαύνειν[7] τὸν γνήσιον Ἔρωτα καὶ πρεσβύτερον. ἐχθὲς γάρ, ὦ ἑταῖρε, καὶ πρώην

[1] δ' ἔπραξας Reiske: δὲ πράξας.
[2] μὲν μετὰ Reiske: μετὰ.
[3] γινομένη Emperius: λεγομένη.
[4] χάρις added by Winckelmann.
[5] τῶν Meziriacus: καὶ τῶν.
[6] μέτρι' ἂν Bernardakis: μέτρια.
[7] ἐξελαύνειν Meziriacus: ἐξελαύνει.





And Heracles is asked by some one or other,

Did you persuade the girl or take your favour by force? [a]

But to consort with males (whether without consent, in which case it involves violence and brigandage; or if with consent, there is still weakness and effeminacy on the part of those who, contrary to nature, allow themselves in Plato's [b] words 'to be covered and mounted like cattle')—this is a completely ill-favoured favour, indecent, an unlovely affront to Aphroditê.

"Whence I conclude that those verses I quoted were written by Solon when he was still quite young and 'teeming,' as Plato [c] says, 'with abundant seed.' Here, however, is what he wrote when he had reached an advanced age [d]:

Dear to me now are the works of the Cyprus-born,
Of Dionysus and the Muses, works that make men merry,

as though after the pelting storm of his love for boys he had brought his life into the peaceful sea of marriage and philosophy.

"If, then, Protogenes, we have regard for the truth, excitement about boys and women is one and the same thing: Love. But if, for the sake of argument, you choose to make distinctions, you will see that this boy-love of yours is not playing fair: like a late-born son, an aged man's bastard, a child of darkness, he tries to disinherit the Love that is his legitimate and elder brother. It was only yesterday, my friend, or the day before, in consequence of young

[a] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 916, Adespoton 402.
[b] A paraphrase of *Phaedrus*, 250 E; *cf. Laws*, 636 C.
[c] *Laws*, 839 B.
[d] Frag. 26 Diehl; frag. 26 Edmonds (*Elegy and Iambus*, i, p. 140).

(751) μετὰ τὰς ἀποδύσεις καὶ ἀπογυμνώσεις τῶν νέων παραδὺς[1] εἰς τὰ γυμνάσια καὶ προσανατριβόμενος ἡσυχῇ καὶ προσαγκαλιζόμενος,[2] εἶτα κατὰ μικρὸν ἐν ταῖς παλαίστραις πτεροφυήσας οὐκέτι καθεκτός
752 ἐστιν, ἀλλὰ λοιδορεῖ καὶ προπηλακίζει τὸν γαμήλιον ἐκεῖνον καὶ συνεργὸν ἀθανασίας τῷ θνητῷ γένει, σβεννυμένην ἡμῶν τὴν φύσιν αὖθις[3] ἐξανάπτοντα διὰ τῶν γενέσεων.

" Οὗτος δ' ἀρνεῖται τὴν ἡδονήν· αἰσχύνεται γὰρ καὶ φοβεῖται. δεῖ δέ τινος εὐπρεπείας ἁπτομένῳ καλῶν καὶ ὡραίων· πρόφασις οὖν φιλία καὶ ἀρετή. κονίεται δὴ[4] καὶ ψυχρολουτεῖ καὶ τὰς ὀφρῦς αἴρει καὶ φιλοσοφεῖν φησι καὶ σωφρονεῖν ἔξω διὰ τὸν νόμον· εἶτα νύκτωρ καὶ καθ' ἡσυχίαν

γλυκεῖ' ὀπώρα φύλακος ἐκλελοιπότος.

εἰ δ', ὥς φησι Πρωτογένης, οὐκ ἔστιν ἀφροδισίων παιδικῶν κοινωνία,[5] πῶς Ἔρως ἔστιν Ἀφροδίτης
B μὴ παρούσης, ἣν εἴληχε θεραπεύειν ἐκ θεῶν καὶ περιέπειν, τιμῆς τε μετέχειν καὶ δυνάμεως ὅσον ἐκείνη δίδωσιν; εἰ δ' ἔστι τις Ἔρως χωρὶς Ἀφροδίτης, ὥσπερ μέθη χωρὶς οἴνου πρὸς σύκινον[6] πόμα καὶ κρίθινον, ἄκαρπον αὐτοῦ καὶ ἀτελὲς τὸ τρακτικόν ἐστι καὶ πλήσμιον καὶ ἀψίκορον."

6. Λεγομένων δὲ[7] τούτων ὁ Πεισίας ἦν δῆλος ἀγανακτῶν καὶ παροξυνόμενος ἐπὶ τὸν Δαφναῖον· μικρὸν δ' αὐτοῦ καταλιπόντος, " ὦ Ἡράκλεις," ἔφη, " τῆς εὐχερείας καὶ θρασύτητος· ἀνθρώπους

[1] παραδὺς Basel edition : παραδοὺς.
[2] προσαγκαλιζόμενος Pohlenz : προσεγκαλῶν.
[3] αὖθις Reiske : εὐθὺς.
[4] δὴ Xylander : δὲ.
[5] ἀκοινωνία BE.
[6] προσίκυνον BE.





men's stripping their bodies naked, that he crept furtively into the gymnasia. At first he merely caressed and embraced; then gradually he grew wings in the palaestra and can no longer be restrained. He rails against and vilifies that great conjugal Love which co-operates to win immortality for the human race by kindling afresh through new generations our being, prone as it is to extinction.

" Boy-love denies pleasure; that is because it is ashamed and afraid. It needs a fair pretext for approaching the young and beautiful, so it pretends friendship and virtue. It covers itself with the sand of the wrestling-floor, it takes cold baths, it plays the highbrow and publicly proclaims that it is a philosopher and disciplined on the outside—because of the law. But when night comes and all is quiet,

Sweet is the harvest when the guard's away.[a]

If, on the one hand, as Protogenes maintains, there is no sexual partnership in paederasty, how can there be any Eros without Aphroditê, whom it is his god-given function to serve and wait upon, as well as to receive such portion of honour and power as she bestows? But if, on the other, there is an Eros without Aphroditê, then it is like drunkenness without wine, brought on by a brew of figs and barley. No fruit, no fulfilment comes of the passion; it is cloying and quickly wearied."

6. During this speech it was obvious that Pisias was full of anger and indignation against Daphnaeus; hardly had the latter ceased when Pisias exclaimed, " Good lord, what coarseness, what insolence! To

[a] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.*, Adespoton 403.

[7] δὲ added by W. C. H.

(752) ὁμολογοῦντας ὥσπερ οἱ κύνες ἐκ τῶν[1] μορίων συνηρτῆσθαι πρὸς τὸ θῆλυ μεθιστάναι καὶ μετοικίζειν
C τὸν θεὸν ἐκ γυμνασίων καὶ περιπάτων καὶ τῆς ἐν ἡλίῳ καθαρᾶς καὶ ἀναπεπταμένης διατριβῆς εἰς ματρυλεῖα καὶ κοιτίδας[2] καὶ φάρμακα καὶ μαγεύματα καθειργνύμενον ἀκολάστων γυναικῶν· ἐπεὶ ταῖς γε σώφροσιν οὔτ' ἐρᾶν οὔτ' ἐρᾶσθαι δήπου προσῆκόν ἐστιν."

Ἐνταῦθα μέντοι καὶ ὁ πατὴρ ἔφη τοῦ Πρωτογένους ἐπιλαβέσθαι καὶ εἰπεῖν,

" τόδ' ἐξοπλίζει τοὔπος Ἀργεῖον λεών,

καὶ νὴ Δία Δαφναίῳ συνδίκους ἡμᾶς προστίθησιν οὐ μετριάζων ὁ Πεισίας, ἀλλὰ τοῖς γάμοις ἀνέραστον ἐπάγων καὶ ἄμοιρον ἐνθέου φιλίας κοινωνίαν,
D ἣν τῆς ἐρωτικῆς πειθοῦς καὶ χάριτος ἀπολιπούσης μονονοὺ ζυγοῖς καὶ χαλινοῖς ὑπ' αἰσχύνης καὶ φόβου μάλα μόλις συνεχομένην ὁρῶμεν."

Καὶ ὁ Πεισίας, " ἐμοὶ μέν," εἶπεν, " ὀλίγον μέλει τοῦ λόγου· Δαφναῖον δ'[3] ὁρῶ ταὐτὸν πάσχοντα τῷ χαλκῷ· καὶ γὰρ ἐκεῖνος οὐχ οὕτως ὑπὸ τοῦ πυρός, ὡς ὑπὸ τοῦ πεπυρωμένου χαλκοῦ καὶ ῥέοντος, ἂν ἐπιχέῃ τις, ἀνατήκεται καὶ ῥεῖ συνεξυγραινόμενος· καὶ τοῦτον οὐκ ἐνοχλεῖ τὸ Λυσάνδρας κάλλος, ἀλλὰ συνδιακεκαυμένῳ[4] καὶ γέμοντι πυρὸς ἤδη[5] πολὺν χρόνον[6] πλησιάζων καὶ ἁπτόμενος ἀναπίμπραται[7]· καὶ δῆλός ἐστιν, εἰ μὴ ταχὺ φύγοι πρὸς ἡμᾶς, συντακησόμενος. ἀλλ' ὁρῶ," εἶπε,

[1] τῶν added by Duebner.
[2] κοιτίδας Post : κοπίδας. [3] δὲ Aldine ed. : δὴ BE.
[4] συνδιακεκαυμένῳ Stephanus : συνδιακεκαλυμμένῳ.
[5] ἤδη Meziriacus : δ'. [6] χρόνον Wyttenbach : χρόνον ὁ.
[7] ἀναπίμπραται Blümner : ἀναπίμπλαται.





think that human beings who acknowledge that they are locked like dogs by their sexual parts to the female should dare to transport the god from his home in the gymnasia and the parks with their wholesome fresh-air life in the sun [a] and confine him in brothels with the vanity-cases and unguents and philtres of disorderly females! Decent women cannot, of course, without impropriety either receive or bestow a passionate love."

At this point, however, my father relates that he too attacked Protogenes and said,

" This word now calls the Argive host to arms. [b]

I swear that it's Pisias' lack of moderation that makes me join forces with Daphnaeus. So marriage is to be a loveless union, devoid of god-given friendship! Yet we observe that an alliance, once it is deserted by courtship and 'favour,' [c] can scarcely be held together by such yokes and reins as shame and fear."

" As for me," said Pisias, " I don't take this statement very seriously. But Daphnaeus, I perceive, is acting like copper. It is a fact that copper is not so much affected by fire as it is by molten copper; when this is poured over it, it softens bit by bit and becomes fluid. And it is not Lysandra's [d] beauty that troubles him. Rather by his proximity and contact with one [e] who is all ablaze and burning he is now himself catching fire. It's evident that if he doesn't come running to us,[f] he too will go soft. . . . But I ob-

[a] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 239 c.
[b] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 916, Adespoton 404.
[c] See 751 D *supra*. [d] See 749 B *supra*.
[e] Presumably Plutarch himself.
[f] That is, if he doesn't change sides in a hurry, he will lose whatever manhood he has left.

(752) "γινόμενον ὅπερ ἂν μάλιστα σπουδάσειεν Ἀνθε-
E μίων, προσκρούοντα τοῖς δικασταῖς καὶ ἐμαυτόν,
ὥστε παύομαι."

Καὶ ὁ Ἀνθεμίων, "ὤνησας," εἶπεν, "ὡς ἔδει γ' ἀπ' ἀρχῆς λέγειν τι πρὸς τὴν ὑπόθεσιν."

7. "Λέγω τοίνυν," ὁ Πεισίας ἔφη, "προκηρύξας ἐμοῦ γ' ἕνεκα πάσαις γυναιξὶν ἀνεραστίαν,[1] ὅτι τῆς γυναικὸς ὁ πλοῦτός ἐστι φυλακτέος τῷ νεανίσκῳ, μὴ συμμίξαντες αὐτὸν ὄγκῳ καὶ βάρει τοσούτῳ λάθοιμεν ὥσπερ ἐν χαλκῷ κασσίτερον ἀφανίσαντες. μέγα γὰρ ἂν ἐλαφρᾷ καὶ λιτῇ γυναικὶ μειρακίου συνελθόντος εἰς ταὐτὸν ἡ κρᾶσις οἴνου δίκην ἐπικρατήσῃ· ταύτην δ' ὁρῶμεν ἄρχειν καὶ κρατεῖν δοκοῦσαν[2]· οὐ γὰρ ἂν ἀπορρίψασα
F δόξας καὶ γένη τηλικαῦτα καὶ πλούτους ἐμνᾶτο μειράκιον ἐκ χλαμύδος, ἔτι παιδαγωγεῖσθαι δεόμενον. ὅθεν οἱ νοῦν ἔχοντες αὐτοὶ προΐενται καὶ περικόπτουσιν ὥσπερ ὠκύπτερα τῶν γυναικῶν τὰ περιττὰ[3] χρήματα, τρυφὰς ἐμποιοῦντα καὶ χαυνότητας ἀβεβαίους[4] καὶ κενάς,[5] ὑφ' ὧν ἐπαιρόμεναι πολλάκις ἀποπέτονται· κἂν μένωσι,[6] 'χρυσαῖς'
753 ὥσπερ ἐν Αἰθιοπίᾳ 'πέδαις δεδέσθαι' βέλτιον[7] ἢ πλούτῳ γυναικός."

8. "'Ἐκεῖνο[8] δ' οὐ λέγεις,[9]" ὁ[10] Πρωτογένης εἶπεν, "ὅτι κινδυνεύομεν ἀναστρέφειν ἀτόπως καὶ γελοίως

[1] ἀνεραστίαν Tucker : ἂν ἐραστήν.
[2] δοκοῦσαν] ποθοῦσαν Emperius.
[3] περιττὰ Salmasius : περὶ τὰ.
[4] ἀβεβαίους Xylander : ἐκβεβαίους.
[5] κενάς Jacobs : κελίους.
[6] μὲν ὦσι BE. [7] βελτίω BE.
[8] ἐκεῖνο Winckelmann : ἐκεῖνα.
[9] λέγεις Xylander : λέγει.
[10] ὁ added by Bernardakis.





serve," he added, "that the very thing that Anthemion would like best is happening: I myself am offending the judges, so no more."

Anthemion said, "Well and good, since you really ought to have spoken to the point in the first place."

7. "Well then," said Pisias, "after fair warning to all women that as far as I am concerned, love doesn't exist, I must say that the young man must beware of the lady's wealth.[a] If we were to plunge him into such pomp and high estate, we might unwittingly make him disappear, as tin disappears when mixed with copper. It would be something to brag of if a boy of his age were to marry a simple, unassuming woman and yet keep his quality unchanged in the union, like wine mixed with water. But as for this woman, we can see her determination to command and to dominate. Otherwise, she would hardly have rejected so many eminent, noble, and wealthy suitors and be wooing a stripling who has not yet discarded his school uniform, who still needs a tutor.[b] So it comes about that men of sense throw away their wives' excessive fortunes[c] and clip their wings, as it were. For such wealth makes women frivolous, haughty, inconstant, and vain; often it elates them so much that they fly away. Even if they stay, it is better to be fettered 'with the golden chains of Ethiopia'[d] than by a wife's wealth."

8. "And this you don't mention," said Protogenes, "that we risk being silly and ridiculous to reverse the

[a] Ismenodora and Bacchon.
[b] The slave who accompanied a child to and from school; but in 754 F *infra* we see that Bacchon was not so accompanied.
[c] *Cf.* Euripides, frag. 502 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 522).
[d] See Herodotus, iii. 23. 4.

(753) τὸν Ἡσίοδον, ἂν ἐκείνου λέγοντος,[1]

μήτε τριηκόντων[2] ἐτέων μάλα πόλλ' ἀπολείπων
μήτ' ἐπιθεὶς μάλα πολλά· γάμος δέ τοι ὥριος οὗτος·
ἡ δὲ γυνὴ τέτορ' ἡβώοι, πέμπτῳ δὲ γαμοῖτο·

σχεδὸν ἡμεῖς ἔτεσι[3] τοσούτοις γυναικὶ πρεσβυτέρᾳ, καθάπερ οἱ φοίνικας ἢ συκᾶς ἐρινάζοντες, ὄμφακα[4] καὶ ἄωρον ἄνδρα περιάψωμεν.

" Ἐρᾶται γὰρ αὐτοῦ νὴ Δία καὶ κάεται· τίς οὖν
B ὁ κωλύων ἐστὶ κωμάζειν ἐπὶ θύρας, ᾄδειν τὸ παρακλαυσίθυρον, ἀναδεῖν τὰ εἰκόνια, παγκρατιάζειν πρὸς τοὺς ἀντεραστάς; ταῦτα γὰρ ἐρωτικά· καὶ καθείσθω τὰς[5] ὀφρῦς καὶ παυσάσθω τρυφῶσα, σχῆμα[6] λαβοῦσα τῶν τοῦ πάθους οἰκείων. εἰ δ' αἰσχύνεται καὶ σωφρονεῖ, κοσμίως οἴκοι καθήσθω[7] περιμένουσα τοὺς μνωμένους καὶ σπουδάζοντας. ἐρᾶν δὲ φάσκουσαν γυναῖκα φυγεῖν τις ἂν ἔχοι καὶ βδελυχθείη, μήτι γε λάβοι[8] γάμου ποιησάμενος ἀρχὴν τὴν τοιαύτην ἀκρασίαν."

9. Παυσαμένου δὲ τοῦ Πρωτογένους, " ὁρᾷς," εἶπεν ὁ πατήρ, " ὦ Ἀνθεμίων, ὅτι πάλιν κοινὴν
C ποιοῦσι τὴν ὑπόθεσιν καὶ τὸν λόγον ἀναγκαῖον ἡμῖν τοῖς οὐκ ἀρνουμένοις οὐδὲ φεύγουσι[9] τοῦ περὶ γάμον Ἔρωτος εἶναι χορευταῖς; "

[1] λέγοντος Madvig : λόγος.
[2] τριηκόντων Winckelmann : τριήκοντ' ὢν.
[3] ἔτεσι Reiske : οὗτοι.
[4] συκᾶς ἐρινάζοντες, ὄμφακα added by Hubert.
[5] καθείσθω τὰς G. Hermann : καθὸ αἴσθηται.
[6] σχῆμα Emperius : καὶ σχῆμα.
[7] κεκαθήσθω BE corrected by Stephanus.
[8] λάβοι] λάθοι Apelt. [9] φεύγουσι Reiske : φεύγειν.

[a] *Works and Days*, 696-698.





words of Hesiod [a] if, though he says,

No marriage much before the age of thirty,
Nor much after it : this time's the ripe one ;
Let a wife be matured four years, married the fifth—

if, I say, we are going to join a green, immature man to a woman as many years older than he as the bridegroom should be older than the bride [b]—and so follow the example of those who artificially pollinate dates and figs.[c]

" ' Yes,' you say, ' for she's in love with him, she's all on fire.' Who, then, prevents her from making revel-rout to his house, from singing the Complaint Before the Closed Door,[d] from putting nosegays on his portraits, from entering the ring with her rivals ? These are the actions of true lovers. Let her lower her brow, renounce her easy life, and put on the dress of those who are in the service of passion. But if she is really modest and orderly, let her sit decently at home awaiting suitors, men with serious designs. For if a woman makes a declaration of love, a man could only take to his heels in utter disgust, let alone accepting and founding a marriage on such intemperance."

9. Protogenes stopped and my father said, " Do you observe, Anthemion, that they are again making a public issue of the matter, forcing a rebuttal from us who neither deny that we are devotees of conjugal love, nor seek to escape from our position ? "

[b] See Einarson's explanation (*Class. Phil.* xlix, p. 278, n. 1) : marrying Bacchon to Ismenodora would be reversing Hesiod's 30 for the man and 17 for the woman. (*Cf.* 754 D-E *infra* where Megara is 33 and Iolaüs 16.)

[c] Hubert's supplement seems just right in view of *Mor.* 700 F *supra* and Theophrastus, *De Causis Plant.* ii. 9. 5.

[d] Songs like Horace, *Carm.* iii. 10 were not uncommon in ancient literature and life.

(753) "Ναὶ[1] μὰ Δί'," εἶπεν ὁ Ἀνθεμίων· "ἄμυν' οὖν[2] διὰ πλειόνων νῦν αὐτοὺς τῷ[3] ἐρᾶν· ἔτι[4] δὲ τῷ πλούτῳ βοήθησον,[5] ᾧ μάλιστα δεδίττεται Πεισίας ἡμᾶς."

"Τί δ'," εἶπεν ὁ πατήρ, "οὐκ ἂν ἔγκλημα γένοιτο γυναικός, εἰ δι' ἔρωτα καὶ πλοῦτον ἀπορρίψομεν Ἰσμηνοδώραν; βαρεῖα γὰρ καὶ[6] πλουσία· τί δ' εἰ καλὴ καὶ νέα; τί δ' εἰ[7] γένει σοβαρὰ καὶ ἔνδοξος; αἱ δὲ σώφρονες οὐ διὰ τὸ[8] αὐστηρὸν καὶ κατεγρυπωμένον ἐπαχθὲς ὄνομα[9] καὶ δυσκαρτέρητον ἔχουσι, καὶ Ποινὰς[10] καλοῦσιν αὐτὰς ἀεὶ[11] τοῖς
D ἀνδράσιν ὀργιζομένας; ἆρ'[12] οὖν κράτιστον ἐξ ἀγορᾶς γαμεῖν Ἀβρότονόν[13] τινα Θρῇσσαν ἢ Βακχίδα Μιλησίαν ἀνέγγυον[14] ἐπαγομένην δι' ὠνῆς καὶ καταχυσμάτων;[15]

"Ἀλλὰ καὶ ταύταις ἴσμεν οὐκ ὀλίγους αἴσχιστα δουλεύσαντας. αὐλητρίδες δὲ Σάμιαι καὶ ὀρχηστρίδες, Ἀριστονίκα καὶ τύμπανον ἔχουσ' Οἰνάνθη καὶ Ἀγαθόκλεια διαδήμασι βασιλέων ἐπέβησαν. ἡ δὲ Σύρα Σεμίραμις οἰκότριβος μὲν ἦν βασιλικοῦ θεράπαινα παλλακευομένη· Νίνου δὲ τοῦ μεγάλου

[1] ναὶ Wilamowitz : καὶ ναί.
[2] ἄμυν' οὖν Bernardakis : ἀμύνει.
[3] τῷ added by Hubert. [4] ἔτι Wyttenbach : εἰ.
[5] βοήθησον Wyttenbach : βοηθήσων.
[6] καὶ] εἰ Emperius. [7] εἰ . . . εἰ Leonicus : ἡ . . . ἡ.
[8] οὐ διὰ τὸ Wilamowitz : οὐδὲ.
[9] ὄνομα added by Post to fill a lacuna.
[10] Ποινὰς Basel edition : πείνας. [11] ἀεὶ Emperius : καὶ.
[12] ἆρ' Post : ὅτι σωφρονοῦσιν; ἆρ'.
[13] Ἀβρότονον *Life of Themistocles* : Ἀβρότονον.
[14] ἀνέγγυον Winckelmann : ἔγγυον.
[15] καταχυσμάτων Winckelmann : κατεσυμμάτων.

[a] There is probably a lacuna at this point.
[b] The name and nationality of Themistocles' mother : *Life of Themistocles*, i (111 F).





"Good Lord, yes," said Anthemion. "So now undertake against them a somewhat fuller defence of Love—and put in a word for Wealth, too, of which Pisias is making such use to frighten us."

"What charge," asked my father, "will they not bring against a woman if we are to reject Ismenodora because of her love and her wealth? She does, in fact, live in grandeur and opulence. And what of that if she is beautiful and young? What of her proud and eminent birth? . . .[a] Isn't it true that decent women have a name for being disagreeable and intolerable because of their severity and eagle-beak noses? Aren't they nicknamed Furies because they're always angry with their husbands? So the best plan is to marry a Thracian Habrotonon[b] or a Milesian Bacchis[c] from the market-place without benefit of ceremony and bring her home for a price and a shower of nuts.[d]

"Yet we know a good many men who have been abject slaves of women like this. Samian flute-girls, ballet dancers, women like Aristonica[e] and Oenanthê with her tambourine and Agathoclea[f] have trampled on the crowns of kings. The Syrian Semiramis[g] was the servant and concubine of a house-born slave of the king, Ninus the Great, who one day caught sight of

[c] Of Samos according to Athenaeus, 594 b, where the pleasant story of her friendship with Plangon is related.
[d] Brides and new slaves were showered with nuts when first brought home.
[e] Unknown; perhaps a mistake for Stratonicê (Athenaeus, 576 f or Plutarch, *Life of Pompey*, xxxvi, 638 D).
[f] Agathoclea was the mistress of Ptolemy IV (*Life of Agis and Cleomenes*, liv, 820 D); Oenanthê was her mother. The former had immense power (Polybius, xiv. 11. 5).
[g] An account of this queen of Assyria will be found in Diodorus, ii. 20. 3 ff.

(753) βασιλέως ἐντυχόντος αὐτῇ καὶ στέρξαντος οὕτως ἐκράτησε καὶ κατεφρόνησεν ὥστ' ἀξιῶσαι καὶ μίαν
E ἡμέραν αὐτὴν περιιδεῖν ἐν τῷ θρόνῳ καθεζομένην ἔχουσαν τὸ διάδημα καὶ χρηματίζουσαν. δόντος δ' ἐκείνου καὶ κελεύσαντος πάντας ὑπηρετεῖν ὥσπερ αὐτῷ καὶ πείθεσθαι, μετρίως ἐχρῆτο τοῖς πρώτοις ἐπιτάγμασι, πειρωμένη τῶν δορυφόρων· ἐπεὶ δ' ἑώρα μηδὲν ἀντιλέγοντας μηδ' ὀκνοῦντας, ἐκέλευσε συλλαβεῖν τὸν Νῖνον εἶτα δῆσαι, τέλος δ' ἀποκτεῖναι· πραχθέντων δὲ πάντων, ἐβασίλευσε τῆς Ἀσίας ἐπιφανῶς πολὺν χρόνον.

"Ἡ δὲ Βελεστίχη,[1] πρὸς Διός, οὐ βάρβαρον ἐξ ἀγορᾶς γύναιον, ἧς ἱερὰ καὶ ναοὺς Ἀλεξανδρεῖς ἔχουσιν, ἐπιγράψαντος δι' ἔρωτα τοῦ βασιλέως
F 'Ἀφροδίτης Βελεστίχης'[2]; ἡ δὲ σύνναος μὲν ἐνταυθοῖ καὶ συνίερος τοῦ Ἔρωτος, ἐν δὲ[3] Δελφοῖς κατάχρυσος ἑστῶσα[4] μετὰ τῶν βασιλέων καὶ βασιλειῶν, ποίᾳ προικὶ τῶν ἐραστῶν ἐκράτησεν;

"Ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἐκεῖνοι δι' ἀσθένειαν ἑαυτῶν καὶ μαλακίαν ἔλαθον φαύλων[5] γενόμενοι λεία γυναικῶν,
754 οὕτω πάλιν ἄδοξοι καὶ πένητες ἕτεροι πλουσίαις γυναιξὶ καὶ λαμπραῖς συνελθόντες οὐ διεφθάρησαν οὐδ' ὑφῆκάν τι τοῦ φρονήματος, ἀλλὰ τιμώμενοι καὶ κρατοῦντες μετ' εὐνοίας συγκατεβίωσαν. ὁ δὲ συστέλλων τὴν γυναῖκα καὶ συνάγων εἰς μικρόν, ὥσπερ δακτύλιον ἰσχνὸς ὢν[6] μὴ περιρρυῇ δεδιώς,

[1] Βελεστίχη Winckelmann : βελεστίη.
[2] Βελεστίχης Winckelmann : βελεστικῆς.
[3] δὲ added by Bernardakis.
[4] ἑστῶσα Wyttenbach : δ' ἑστῶσα.
[5] φαύλων added by Bolkestein to fill a lacuna.
[6] δακτύλιον ἰσχνὸς ὢν Basel edition and Coraes : δακτύλων ἴχνος ὤν.





her and fell in love. She grew to have such power and such contempt for him that she asked to be allowed to direct the affairs of state, crowned and seated on his throne, for one day. He granted this and issued orders for everyone to serve and obey her just as they would himself. At first her commands were moderate while she was making trial of the guards; then, when she saw that there was no opposition or hesitation on their part, she ordered Ninus to be seized, put in chains, and finally put to death. When all this was done, she ruled gloriously over Asia for many years.

"Good heavens! Wasn't Belestichê [a] a barbarian female bought in the market place, she to whom now the Alexandrians maintain shrines and temples dedicated through the king's love to Aphroditê Belestichê? And that woman down there [b] who shares a temple and worship with Eros, whose gilded statue stands at Delphi with those of kings and queens, what dowry had she to subjugate her lovers? [c]

"The men these worthless females exploited became their prey unwittingly through their own weakness and softness; yet other men, though poor and obscure, have married rich and noble women and have not been destroyed or lost one particle of dignity; they have enjoyed honour and exercised benevolent authority to the end of their life together. But the man who cramps and diminishes his wife (as a thin man does his ring for fear it may fall off) is like those who shear

[a] One of the mistresses of Ptolemy II.
[b] He points down to Thespiae.
[c] Phrynê of Thespiae shared Eros' temple there and dedicated a golden statue of herself by her lover Praxiteles in the precinct of Apollo at Delphi (*Mor.* 336 c-D; 401 D; Pausanias, x. 15. 1).

(754) ὅμοιός ἐστι τοῖς ἀποκείρουσι τὰς ἵππους εἶτα πρὸς ποταμὸν ἢ λίμνην ἄγουσι· καθορῶσαν γὰρ ἑκάστην τὴν εἰκόνα τῆς ὄψεως ἀκαλλῆ καὶ ἄμορφον, ἀφιέναι τὰ φρυάγματα[1] λέγεται καὶ προσδέχεσθαι τὰς τῶν ὄνων ἐπιβάσεις.

" Πλοῦτον δὲ γυναικὸς αἱρεῖσθαι μὲν πρὸ ἀρετῆς ἢ γένους ἀφιλότιμον καὶ ἀνελεύθερον, ἀρετῇ δὲ καὶ
B γένει προσόντα φεύγειν ἀβέλτερον. ὁ μὲν γὰρ Ἀντίγονος ὠχυρωμένῳ τὴν Μουνιχίαν τῷ φρουροῦντι γράφων ἐκέλευε ποιεῖν μὴ μόνον τὸν κλοιὸν ἰσχυρὸν ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸν κύνα λεπτόν, ὅπως ὑφαιρῇ τὰς εὐπορίας τῶν Ἀθηναίων· ἀνδρὶ δὲ πλουσίας ἢ καλῆς οὐ προσήκει μηδὲ τὴν γυναῖκα ποιεῖν ἄμορφον ἢ πενιχράν, ἀλλ' ἑαυτὸν ἐγκρατείᾳ καὶ φρονήσει καὶ τῷ μηθὲν ἐκπεπλῆχθαι τῶν περὶ ἐκείνην ἴσον παρέχειν καὶ ἀδούλωτον, ὥσπερ ἐπὶ ζυγοῦ ῥοπὴν τῷ ἤθει προστιθέντα καὶ βάρος, ὑφ' οὗ κρατεῖται καὶ ἄγεται δικαίως ἅμα καὶ[2] συμφερόντως.

" Καὶ μὴν ἡλικία γε πρὸς γάμον καὶ ὥρα τὸ
C τίκτειν ἔχουσα καὶ τὸ γεννᾶν εὐάρμοστός ἐστιν· ἀκμάζειν δὲ τὴν γυναῖκα πυνθάνομαι "· καὶ ἅμα τῷ Πεισίᾳ προσμειδιάσας, " οὐδενὸς γάρ," ἔφη, " τῶν ἀντεραστῶν πρεσβυτέρα, οὐδ' ἔχει πολιάς, ὥσπερ ἔνιοι τῶν Βάκχωνι[3] προσαναχρωννυμένων. εἰ δ' οὗτοι καθ' ὥραν ὁμιλοῦσι, τί κωλύει κἀκείνην ἐπιμεληθῆναι τοῦ νεανίσκου βέλτιον ἡστινοσοῦν

[1] φρυάγματα Basel edition : φριμάγματα.
[2] δικαίως ἅμα καὶ Bernardakis : καὶ ὡς ἅμα.





their mares [a] and then lead them to a river or a pool : when the poor beast sees how she looks in the reflection, ugly and unsightly, they say that she abandons her haughty airs and allows asses to mount her.

" To choose a woman for her wealth rather than for her character or birth would be ignoble and base ; but if character and good breeding are added, it would be ridiculous to shun her. Antigonus,[b] to be sure, wrote to the commander of the garrison which had fortified Munychia that it wasn't enough to make the collar strong : the dog must also be made lean. This was in order to drain off the resources of the Athenians. The husband, however, of a rich or beautiful woman must not make her unsightly or poor ; rather by his own self-possession and prudence, as well as by his refusal to be overawed by any of her advantages, he must hold his own without servility. The extra weight of his character must turn the scales ; thus his wife is controlled and guided with as much profit as justice.

" Moreover, the right age and proper time for marriage are suitably matched as long as both parties are able to procreate. I understand that the lady is in the prime of life, for " (he added with a smile at Pisias) " she is no older than any of her rivals ; nor is her hair grey as is that of some of the gentlemen who try to give their own colour to Bacchon. If they are young enough to frequent his company, what is to hinder her looking after the young man better than

[a] Aristotle, *Hist. Animal.* vi. 18 (572 b 7) ; contrast Columella, vi. 35.
[b] For the date and occasion see Tarn, *Antigonus Gonatas*, p. 126 and note 35.

[3] ἔνιοι τῶν Βάκχωνι Basel edition : ἔνιαι τῶν βάκχων.

(754) νέας; δύσμικτα γὰρ τὰ νέα καὶ δυσκέραστα καὶ μόλις ἐν χρόνῳ πολλῷ τὸ φρύαγμα καὶ τὴν ὕβριν ἀφίησιν, ἐν ἀρχῇ δὲ κυμαίνει καὶ ζυγομαχεῖ καὶ μᾶλλον ἂν Ἔρως ἐγγένηται καθάπερ[1] πνεῦμα κυβερ-
D νήτου μὴ παρόντος ἐτάραξε καὶ συνέχεε τὸν γάμον οὔτ' ἄρχειν δυναμένων οὔτ' ἄρχεσθαι βουλομένων.

" Εἰ δ' ἄρχει βρέφους μὲν ἡ τίτθη καὶ παιδὸς ὁ διδάσκαλος, ἐφήβου δὲ γυμνασίαρχος, ἐραστὴς δὲ μειρακίου, γενομένου δ' ἐν ἡλικίᾳ νόμος καὶ στρατηγός, οὐδεὶς δ' ἄναρκτος οὐδ' αὐτοτελής, τί δεινὸν εἰ γυνὴ νοῦν ἔχουσα πρεσβυτέρα κυβερνήσει νέου βίον ἀνδρός, ὠφέλιμος μὲν οὖσα τῷ φρονεῖν μᾶλλον ἡδεῖα δὲ τῷ φιλεῖν καὶ προσηνής;

" Τὸ δ' ὅλον," ἔφη, " καὶ τὸν Ἡρακλέα Βοιωτοὺς ὄντας ἔδει σέβεσθαι καὶ μὴ δυσχεραίνειν τῷ παρ' ἡλικίαν τοῦ γάμου, γινώσκοντας ὅτι κἀκεῖνος
E τὴν ἑαυτοῦ γυναῖκα Μεγάραν Ἰολάῳ συνῴκισεν ἑκκαιδεκαέτει τότ' ὄντι τρία καὶ τριάκοντ' ἔτη γεγενημένην."

10. Τοιούτων λόγων, ὁ πατὴρ ἔφη, παρόντων αὐτοῖς, ἐλθεῖν τῷ[2] Πεισίᾳ ἑταῖρον ἐκ πόλεως ἵππῳ θέοντα, πρᾶγμα θαυμαστὸν ἀπαγγέλλοντα τετολμημένον.

Ἡ γὰρ Ἰσμηνοδώρα, ὡς ἔοικεν, αὐτὸν μὲν οὐκ ἀηδῶς ἔχειν οἰομένη τὸν Βάκχωνα πρὸς τὸν γάμον, αἰσχύνεσθαι δὲ τοὺς ἀποτρέποντας, ἔγνω μὴ προέσθαι τὸ μειράκιον. τῶν οὖν φίλων τοὺς μάλιστα τοῖς βίοις νεαροὺς καὶ συνερῶντας[3] αὐτῇ καὶ τῶν

[1] καθάπερ Xylander : καὶ καθάπερ.
[2] τῷ Reiske : τοῦ. [3] συνεργοῦντας Naber.

[a] *Cf.* Diodorus, iv. 31. 1





any young wife in the world? It is true that young people find it difficult to fuse and blend well with each other. Only after a long time do they abandon their stiffness and self-assertion. At the beginning they have stormy weather and struggle with their partners—and still more so if Love is involved. Just as a high wind upsets a boat without a pilot, so Love makes stormy and chaotic a marriage of two people who cannot both command and will not either of them obey.

" The nurse rules the infant, the teacher the boy, the gymnasiarch the youth, his admirer the young man who, when he comes of age, is ruled by law and his commanding general. No one is his own master, no one is unrestricted. Since this is so, what is there dreadful about a sensible older woman piloting the life of a young man? She will be useful because of her superior intelligence; she will be sweet and affectionate because she loves him.

" To sum up," my father said, " we are Boeotians and so should reverence Heracles and not be squeamish about a marriage of disproportionate ages. We know that he married his own wife, Megara,[a] aged thirty-three, to Iolaüs, who was then only sixteen."

10. It was at this point in the conversation, said my father, that a friend rode up from the city with his horse at a gallop bringing a report to Pisias of a surprisingly audacious occurrence.

It seems that Ismenodora was convinced that, though Bacchon had no personal antipathy to the marriage, he was embarrassed by its detractors; accordingly, she resolved not to let the young man escape. She summoned those male friends who were the most vigorous and most sympathetic to her pas-

(754) γυναικῶν τὰς συνήθεις μεταπεμψαμένη καὶ συγκροτήσασα[1] παρεφύλαττε τὴν ὥραν, ἣν ὁ Βάκχων
F ἔθος εἶχεν ἀπιὼν ἐκ[2] παλαίστρας παρὰ τὴν οἰκίαν αὐτῆς παρεξιέναι κοσμίως. ὡς οὖν τότε προσῄει μετὰ δυοῖν ἢ τριῶν ἑταίρων ἀληλιμμένος, αὐτὴ μὲν ἐπὶ τὰς θύρας ἀπήντησεν ἡ Ἰσμηνοδώρα καὶ τῆς χλαμύδος ἔθιγε μόνον, οἱ δὲ φίλοι καλὸν καλῶς ἐν τῇ χλαμύδι καὶ τῇ διβολίᾳ συναρπάσαντες εἰς τὴν οἰκίαν παρήνεγκαν ἀθρόοι καὶ τὰς θύρας εὐθὺς ἀπέκλεισαν.

755 Ἅμα δ' αἱ μὲν γυναῖκες ἔνδον αὐτοῦ τὸ χλαμύδιον ἀφαρπάσασαι περιέβαλον ἱμάτιον νυμφικόν· οἰκέται δὲ περὶ κύκλῳ δραμόντες ἀνέστεφον ἐλαίᾳ καὶ δάφνῃ τὰς θύρας οὐ μόνον τὰς τῆς Ἰσμηνοδώρας ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰς τοῦ Βάκχωνος· ἡ δ' αὐλητρὶς αὐλοῦσα διεξῆλθε τὸν στενωπόν.

Τῶν δὲ Θεσπιέων καὶ τῶν ξένων οἱ μὲν ἐγέλων, οἱ δ' ἠγανάκτουν καὶ τοὺς γυμνασιάρχους παρώξυνον· ἄρχουσι γὰρ ἰσχυρῶς τῶν ἐφήβων καὶ προσέχουσι τὸν νοῦν σφόδρα τοῖς ὑπ' αὐτῶν πραττομένοις. ἦν δὲ λόγος οὐθεὶς τῶν ἀγωνι-
B ζομένων, ἀλλ' ἀφέντες τὸ θέατρον ἐπὶ τῶν θυρῶν τῆς Ἰσμηνοδώρας ἐν λόγοις ἦσαν καὶ φιλονεικίαις πρὸς ἀλλήλους.

11. Ὡς οὖν ὁ τοῦ Πεισίου φίλος ὥσπερ ἐν πολέμῳ προσελάσας τὸν ἵππον αὐτὸ τοῦτο τεταραγμένος εἶπεν ὅτι Βάκχων' ἥρπακεν Ἰσμηνοδώρα, τὸν μὲν Ζεύξιππον ὁ πατὴρ ἔφη γελάσαι καὶ εἰπεῖν,

[1] συγκρατήσασα BE, corrected by Stephanus.
[2] ἐκ Mittelhaus, Kronenberg : εἰς.

[a] Rabinowitz would delete this last clause as a gloss. Why





sion, together with the most intimate of her women friends, organized them in a disciplined group, and waited intently for the hour when Bacchon habitually left the palaestra and walked decorously by her house. On this occasion, freshly anointed, he approached with two or three companions. Ismenodora met him at the door and had only to touch his garment when her friends handsomely snatched up the handsome youth in his cloak and mantle, carried him in a body into the house, and immediately locked the doors.

At the same time the women inside snatched off his cloak and put a wedding garment on him. The servants scurried about and wreathed the doors with olive and laurel, not only Ismenodora's doors, but Bacchon's also ; and a flute-girl went out and piped her way down the lane.

Now of the Thespians and their guests, some merely laughed, while others were furious and tried to stir up the gymnasiarchs, for these maintain a strict control over the young men and pay close attention to their activities.[a] No one paid any more attention to the contests [b] ; everybody deserted the theatre and gathered about Ismenodora's door, where they engaged in fierce debate.

11. So when (continued my father) Pisias' friend had come galloping up as fast as though he were bringing a military dispatch and, in great excitement, had said no more than that Ismenodora had kidnapped Bacchon, Zeuxippus [c] began to laugh and, being a

should Plutarch explain what a gymnasiarch is ? But he may have had personal knowledge that these officials were not everywhere so strict as at Thespiae.

[b] Of harpists : see 749 c *supra*.

[c] The friend from Sparta : see 749 B *supra*.

(755) ἅτε δὴ καὶ φιλευριπίδην ὄντα,

πλούτῳ χλιδῶσα θνητὰ δ', ὦ γύναι, φρόνει[1]·

τὸν δὲ Πεισίαν ἀναπηδήσαντα βοᾶν, " ὦ θεοί, τί πέρας ἔσται τῆς ἀνατρεπούσης τὴν πόλιν ἡμῶν ἐλευθερίας; ἤδη γὰρ εἰς ἀνομίαν τὰ πράγματα διὰ τῆς αὐτονομίας βαδίζει.[2] καίτοι γελοῖον ἴσως ἀγ-
C ανακτεῖν περὶ νόμων καὶ δικαίων, ἡ γὰρ φύσις παρανομεῖται γυναικοκρατουμένη. τί τοιοῦτον ἡ Λῆμνος; ἴωμεν ἡμεῖς, ἴωμεν," εἶπεν, "ὅπως καὶ τὸ γυμνάσιον ταῖς γυναιξὶ παραδῶμεν καὶ τὸ βουλευτήριον, εἰ παντάπασιν ἡ πόλις ἐκνενεύρισται." προάγοντος οὖν τοῦ Πεισίου, ὁ μὲν Πρωτογένης οὐκ ἀπελείπετο τὰ μὲν συναγανακτῶν τὰ δὲ πραΰνων ἐκεῖνον.

Ὁ δ' Ἀνθεμίων, " νεανικὸν μέν," ἔφη, " τὸ τόλμημα καὶ Λήμνιον ὡς ἀληθῶς, αὐτοὶ γάρ ἐσμεν,[3] σφόδρ' ἐρώσης γυναικός."

Καὶ ὁ Σώκλαρος ὑπομειδιῶν, " οἴει γὰρ ἁρπαγήν," ἔφη, " γεγονέναι καὶ βιασμόν, οὐκ ἀπολό-
D γημα καὶ στρατήγημα νεανίσκου[4] νοῦν ἔχοντος, ὅτι τὰς τῶν ἐραστῶν ἀγκάλας διαφυγὼν ἐξηυτομόλησεν εἰς χεῖρας καλῆς καὶ πλουσίας γυναικός;"

" Μὴ λέγε ταῦτ'," εἶπεν, " ὦ Σώκλαρε, μηδ' ὑπονόει ἐπὶ Βάκχωνος," ὁ Ἀνθεμίων· " καὶ γὰρ

[1] φρόνει Nauck : φρονεῖς.
[2] βαδίζειν BE, corrected by Xylander.
[3] ἐσμεν Meziriacus : ἴσμεν.
[4] νεανίσκου Hartman : τοῦ νεανίσκου.

[a] Frag. 986 Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 678.
[b] Where the women, by a concerted and synchronized effort, slew all the men : Apollodorus, i. 9. 17.





great admirer of Euripides,[a] recited :

You revel in your wealth, madame :
Keep thoughts upon a mortal plane.

But Pisias jumped up and shouted, " Good heavens ! What end will there be to the licence that is subverting our town ? Now already self-government is on the way to anarchy ! Yet it may be absurd to be protesting in defence of laws and statutes when it is the very Laws of Nature that are transgressed when women take over the state. Did even Lemnos see the like ?[b] Let's be off ! " he cried. " Let's be off and hand over the gymnasium and the Council Chamber to the women since our city is by now completely emasculated ! " So Pisias rushed off and Protogenes trailed after him, partly because he shared his anger, partly to calm him.

Anthemion remarked, " Such a bold stroke is certainly a strong action, really Lemnian [c]—we can admit it since we're by ourselves.[d] It shows the hand of a woman very much in love."

Soclarus asked with a little smile, " Do you really think that it's a case of kidnapping and rape ? Isn't it rather the plausible counter-stratagem of a sensible young man who has slipped from the clutches of his lovers and deserted to the arms of a rich and beautiful woman ? "

" Don't say such things, Soclarus," answered Anthemion. " And don't be putting suspicion on Bacchon. Even if his character were not naturally

[c] This time the reference has a sly twist and refers to the dalliance of the widowed Lemnian ladies with the Argonauts, the first gentry to visit their island since their bereavement.
[d] That is, the paederasts having departed, we can be frank and admit the worst : women in love may be dangerous.

(755) εἰ μὴ φύσει τὸν τρόπον ἁπλοῦς ἦν καὶ ἀφελής, ἐμέ γ' οὐκ ἂν[1] ἀπεκρύψατο, τῶν τ' ἄλλων[2] μεταδιδοὺς ἁπάντων, ἔν τε τούτοις ὁρῶν προθυμότατον ὄντα τῆς Ἰσμηνοδώρας βοηθόν. Ἔρωτι δὲ ' μάχεσθαι χαλεπόν,' οὐ ' θυμῷ ' καθ' Ἡράκλειτον· ' ὅ τι γὰρ ἂν θελήσῃ, καὶ ψυχῆς ὠνεῖται ' καὶ χρημάτων καὶ δόξης. ἐπεὶ τί κοσμιώτερον Ἰσμηνοδώρας ἐν τῇ πόλει; πότε δ' εἰσῆλθεν ἢ λόγος αἰσχρὸς ἢ πράξεως
E ὑπόνοια φαύλης ἔθιγε τῆς οἰκίας; ἀλλ' ἔοικε θεία τις ὄντως εἰληφέναι τὴν ἄνθρωπον ἐπίπνοια καὶ κρείττων ἀνθρωπίνου λογισμοῦ."

12. Καὶ ὁ Πεμπτίδης ἐπιγελάσας, " ἀμέλει καὶ σώματός τις," ἔφη, " νόσος ἔστιν, ἣν ἱερὰν καλοῦσιν· οὐδὲν οὖν ἄτοπον, εἰ καὶ ψυχῆς τὸ μανικώτατον πάθος καὶ μέγιστον ἱερὸν καὶ θεῖον ἔνιοι προσαγορεύουσιν.

" Εἶθ' ὥσπερ ἐν Αἰγύπτῳ ποτὲ γείτονας ἑώρων δύο διαμφισβητοῦντας, ὄφεως προσερπύσαντος εἰς τὴν ὁδόν, ἀμφοτέρων μὲν ἀγαθὸν δαίμονα καλούντων, ἑκατέρου δ' ἔχειν ἀξιοῦντος ὡς ἴδιον· οὕτως
F ὁρῶν ὑμῶν ἄρτι τοὺς μὲν εἰς τὴν ἀνδρωνῖτιν ἕλκοντας τὸν Ἔρωτα, τοὺς δ' εἰς τὴν γυναικωνῖτιν, ὡς[3] ὑπερφυὲς καὶ θεῖον ἀγαθόν, οὐκ ἐθαύμαζον εἰ τηλικαύτην δύναμιν ἔσχε καὶ τιμὴν τὸ πάθος, οἷς ἦν προσῆκον ἐξελαύνειν αὐτὸ πανταχόθεν καὶ κολούειν, ὑπὸ τούτων αὐξανόμενον καὶ σεμνυνόμενον. ἄρτι

[1] γ' οὐκ ἄν Meziriacus : γοῦν BE ; γοῦν οὐκ ἄν Reiske.
[2] τ' ἄλλων Xylander : τελῶν.
[3] ὡς added by Meziriacus.





simple and frank, he certainly wouldn't have concealed it from *me*, with whom he shares every confidence. He sees quite well that in these matters it is I who am Ismenodora's warmest ally. It's Love that it's ' hard to combat,' not ' anger,' as Heraclitus [a] has it : ' whatever it wants, it buys even at the cost of one's life '—and money and reputation, too. Where do you find better behaviour in the city than was Ismenodora's ? When did any ugly story ever enter her house or any hint of evil-doing ever leave a stain on it ? Yes, it's only too plain that some divine impulse, overpowering her common sense, has really taken possession of the poor mortal creature."

12. And Pemptides [b] laughed and said, " There is, of course, a physical disease which they call the sacred [c] one ; so that there's nothing strange about it if some people call the greatest and most frenetic mental affliction sacred and divine.

" Once upon a time in Egypt I saw two neighbours disputing about a snake that had slithered on to the road. They both hailed it as a bringer of good luck, but each wanted to keep it as his own. Similarly, just now, when I observed both parties dragging off Love, some to the men's quarters, others to the women's, while both claimed him as a tremendous and divine blessing, I was not surprised that this passion had acquired all the power and respect that it has, since the very persons who should have been expelling it from every nook and cranny and restricting it were themselves magnifying and exalting it.

[a] Frag. 85 : Diels, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[7] i, p. 170 ; *cf. Mor.* 457 D ; *Life of Coriolanus*, xxii (224 C).
[b] Since Pemptides has not been introduced before, there may well be an undetected lacuna in 749 B *supra*.
[c] Epilepsy ; see *Mor.* 981 D and the note.

(755) μὲν οὖν ἡσυχίαν ἦγον· ἐν γὰρ ἰδίοις μᾶλλον ἢ
756 κοινοῖς ἑώρων τὴν ἀμφισβήτησιν οὖσαν· νυνὶ δ' ἀπηλλαγμένος Πεισίου, ἡδέως ἂν ὑμῶν ἀκούσαιμι πρὸς τί βλέψαντες ἀπεφήναντο τὸν Ἔρωτα θεὸν οἱ πρῶτοι τοῦτο λέξαντες."

13. Παυσαμένου δὲ τοῦ Πεμπτίδου καὶ τοῦ πατρὸς ἀρξαμένου τι περὶ τούτων λέγειν, ἕτερος ἦκεν ἐκ πόλεως, τὸν Ἀνθεμίωνα μεταπεμπομένης τῆς Ἰσμηνοδώρας· ἐπέτεινε γὰρ ἡ ταραχή, καὶ τῶν γυμνασιάρχων ἦν διαφορά, τοῦ μὲν οἰομένου δεῖν τὸν Βάκχωνα ἀπαιτεῖν, τοῦ δὲ πολυπραγμονεῖν οὐκ ἐῶντος. ὁ μὲν οὖν Ἀνθεμίων ἀναστὰς ἐβάδιζεν.

Ὁ δὲ πατὴρ τὸν Πεμπτίδην ὀνομαστὶ προσαγορεύσας, " μεγάλου μοι δοκεῖς ἅπτεσθαι," εἶπεν,
B " καὶ παραβόλου πράγματος, ὦ Πεμπτίδη, μᾶλλον δ' ὅλως τὰ ἀκίνητα κινεῖν τῆς περὶ θεῶν δόξης ἣν ἔχομεν, περὶ ἑκάστου λόγον ἀπαιτῶν καὶ ἀπόδειξιν· ἀρκεῖ γὰρ ἡ πάτριος καὶ παλαιὰ πίστις, ἧς οὐκ ἔστιν εἰπεῖν οὐδ' ἀνευρεῖν τεκμήριον ἐναργέστερον

οὐδ' εἰ δι' ἄκρας τὸ σοφὸν εὕρηται φρενός,[1]

ἀλλ' ἕδρα τις αὕτη καὶ βάσις ὑφεστῶσα κοινὴ πρὸς εὐσέβειαν, ἐὰν ἐφ' ἑνὸς ταράττηται καὶ σαλεύηται τὸ βέβαιον αὐτῆς καὶ νενομισμένον, ἐπισφαλὴς γίνεται πᾶσα[2] καὶ ὕποπτος.

" Ἀκούεις δὲ δήπου τὸν Εὐριπίδην, ὡς ἐθορυβήθη ποιησάμενος ἀρχὴν τῆς Μελανίππης ἐκείνην,[3]

Ζεύς, ὅστις ὁ Ζεύς,[4] οὐ γὰρ οἶδα πλὴν λόγῳ,

[1] δι' ἄκρων . . . φρενῶν MSS. of Euripides.
[2] πᾶσα Volkmann : πᾶσι. [3] ἐκείνην Sauppe : ἐκείνης.
[4] ὅστις ὁ Ζεὺς added from Lucian (*Iov. Trag.* 41).

[a] Euripides, *Bacchae*, 203.





So I held my peace a while ago, observing that the dispute was more a matter of private than of public concern. But now that Pisias has left us, I should be delighted to hear from you what criterion those who first declared Eros to be a god had in mind when they made the statement."

13. Pemptides had finished and my father had begun to answer when another messenger arrived from town with a summons from Ismenodora for Anthemion. The tumult, in fact, was growing worse as the gymnasiarchs disagreed, one holding that they should reclaim Bacchon, the other that they should not meddle. So Anthemion got up and set out.

My father addressed Pemptides by name. " Pemptides," he said, " it is, I believe, a grave and dangerous matter that you are broaching ; or rather, you are altogether violating our inviolable belief in the gods when you demand an account and proof of each of them. Our ancient traditional faith is good enough. It is impossible to assert or discover evidence more palpable than this faith,

Whatever subtle twist's invented by keen wit.[a]

This faith is a basis, as it were, a common foundation, of religion ; if confidence and settled usage are disturbed or shaken at a single point, the whole edifice is enfeebled and discredited.

" You have no doubt heard what an uproar burst upon Euripides [b] when he began his *Melanippê* with this verse :

Zeus, whoever he is, for I know him only by report.

[b] Frag. 480 ; Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 510 : from *Melanippê the Wise*. A good part of the prologue of this play has been recorded on a papyrus, including the amended line below.

(756)
C μεταλαβὼν δὲ χορὸν[1] ἄλλον (ἐθάρρει δ'[2] ὡς ἔοικε τῷ δράματι γεγραμμένῳ πανηγυρικῶς καὶ περιττῶς) ἤλλαξε τὸν στίχον ὡς νῦν γέγραπται

Ζεύς, ὡς λέλεκται τῆς ἀληθείας ὕπο.

" Τί οὖν διαφέρει τὴν περὶ τοῦ Διὸς δόξαν ἢ τῆς Ἀθηνᾶς ἢ τοῦ Ἔρωτος εἰς ἀμφίβολον τῷ λόγῳ θέσθαι ἢ καὶ ἄδηλον; οὐ γὰρ νῦν αἰτεῖ πρῶτον βωμὸν ὁ Ἔρως καὶ θυσίαν οὐδ' ἔπηλυς ἔκ τινος βαρβαρικῆς δεισιδαιμονίας, ὥσπερ Ἄτται τινὲς καὶ Ἀδώνιοι[3] λεγόμενοι, δι' ἀνδρογύνων καὶ γυναικῶν παραδύεται κρύφα[4] τιμὰς οὐ προσηκούσας καρπούμενος, ὥστε παρεισγραφῆς δίκην φεύγειν καὶ
D νοθείας τῆς ἐν θεοῖς. ἀλλ' ὅταν Ἐμπεδοκλέους ἀκούσῃς λέγοντος, ὦ ἑταῖρε,

καὶ φιλότης ἐν τοῖσιν ἴση μῆκός τε πλάτος τε,
τὴν σὺ[5] νόῳ δέρκευ,[6] μηδ' ὄμμασιν ἧσο τεθηπώς·

ταῦτ' οἴεσθαι χρὴ λέγεσθαι περὶ Ἔρωτος· οὐ γάρ ἐστιν ὁρατὸς ἀλλὰ δοξαστὸς ἡμῖν ὁ θεὸς οὗτος ἐν τοῖς πάνυ παλαιοῖς· ὧν ἂν περὶ ἑκάστου τεκμήριον ἀπαιτῇς, παντὸς ἁπτόμενος ἱεροῦ καὶ παντὶ βωμῷ σοφιστικὴν ἐπάγων πεῖραν, οὐδέν'[7] ἀσυκοφάντητον οὐδ' ἀβασάνιστον ἀπολείψεις.

" Πόρρω γὰρ οὐκ ἄπειμι

τὴν δ' Ἀφροδίτην οὐχ ὁρᾷς ὅση θεός;—

[1] δὲ χορὸν Sauppe : δι' ἐχθρὸν.
[2] δ' added by Bernardakis.
[3] Ἀδώνιοι Bergk : ἀδωναῖοι.
[4] κρύφα Basel edition : καὶ κρύφα.
[5] σὺ Xylander : σὺν.
[6] δέρκευ Clement of Alexandria (p. 653 Pott.) : δέρκου.
[7] οὐδέν' Hubert : οὐδὲν.





Well, he got another chorus (for he had confidence in the play, it seems, since it was composed in an elevated and elaborate style) and changed the verse to the present text :

Zeus, as the voice of truth declares.

" So what is to be gained by the use of argument to make our belief in Zeus or Athena or Eros debatable or uncertain ? Love is not now requesting his first altar and sacrifice. He is no alien intruder from some barbaric superstition like certain Attises and Adonises, as they are called. He does not, assisted by hermaphrodites and women, smuggle himself in to reap a harvest of honours to which he has no right, which would make him liable to indictment for illegal registration as a god, and bastardy. On the contrary, my friend, when you hear Empedocles [a] declaring,

Among them Love is equal, far and wide ;
Use the mind's eye ; sit not with staring gaze—

you must suppose that his verses apply also to Eros ; for though he is not visibly among the most ancient divinities, he is there conceptually. If you are going to demand a proof of each one of them, probing every temple and attacking each altar with sophistic assault, not a god will you exempt from malicious prosecution and inquisition.

" Not to go farther,

Do you not see how mighty is the goddess

[a] Frag. 17. 20 f. " Plutarch is guilty here of gross misrepresentation (or extreme irony) ; for the pronoun (' among them ') refers to the four roots, not the Olympians, while the verse itself is a statement of the pervasion of the roots by the force of Love and does not attribute to Love equality of rank with the Olympians " (Rabinowitz).

(756) ' ἥδ' ἐστὶν ἡ σπείρουσα καὶ διδοῦσ' ἔρον,
οὗ πάντες ἐσμὲν οἱ κατὰ χθόν' ἔκγονοι.'

E ' ζείδωρον ' γὰρ αὐτὴν Ἐμπεδοκλῆς ' εὔκαρπον ' δὲ Σοφοκλῆς ἐμμελῶς πάνυ καὶ πρεπόντως ὠνόμασαν. ἀλλ' ὅμως τὸ μέγα τοῦτο καὶ θαυμαστὸν Ἀφροδίτης μὲν ἔργον Ἔρωτος δὲ πάρεργόν ἐστιν Ἀφροδίτῃ συμπαρόντος· μὴ συμπαρόντος δὲ κομιδῇ τὸ γινόμενον ἄζηλον ἀπολείπεται καὶ

ἄτιμον κἄφιλον.

ἀνέραστος γὰρ ὁμιλία καθάπερ πεῖνα καὶ δίψα πλησμονὴν ἔχουσα πέρας εἰς οὐδὲν ἐξικνεῖται καλόν· ἀλλ' ἡ θεὸς Ἔρωτι τὸν κόρον ἀφαιροῦσα τῆς ἡδονῆς φιλότητα ποιεῖ καὶ σύγκρασιν. διὸ Παρμενίδης μὲν ἀποφαίνει τὸν Ἔρωτα τῶν Ἀφροδίτης ἔργων πρεσβύτατον, ἐν τῇ κοσμογονίᾳ γράφων

F πρώτιστον μὲν Ἔρωτα θεῶν μητίσατο πάντων.

Ἡσίοδος δὲ φυσικώτερον ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ ποιεῖν Ἔρωτα πάντων προγενέστατον, ἵνα πάντα δι' ἐκεῖνον μετάσχῃ γενέσεως.

" Ἂν οὖν τὸν Ἔρωτα τῶν νενομισμένων τιμῶν
757 ἐκβάλλωμεν, οὐδ' αἱ[1] τῆς Ἀφροδίτης κατὰ χώραν μενοῦσιν. οὐδὲ γὰρ τοῦτ' ἔστιν εἰπεῖν, ὅτι τῷ μὲν Ἔρωτι λοιδοροῦνταί τινες ἀπέχονται δ'[2] ἐκείνης,

[1] οὐδ' αἱ Cobet : οὐδὲ or οὐδὲ τὰ.
[2] ἀπέχονται δ' Schellens : ἀλλὰ ἀπέχονται.

[a] Euripides, frag. 898. 1 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 648) together with *Hippolytus*, 449-450.
[b] Frag. 151 Diels (*Frag. der Vorsok.*[7] i, p. 370).





Aphrodite? She sows and gives that love
From which all we upon this earth are born.[a]

Empedocles[b] has called her 'giver of life' and Sophocles[c] 'fruitful'; both epithets being perfectly just and apt. And yet this great and wonderful primary function of Aphroditê becomes only a secondary task of Eros when he accompanies the goddess. If he is not present, what occurs is precisely a dreary residue and becomes

Unhonoured and without a friend.[d]

For intercourse without Eros is like hunger and thirst, which can be sated, but never achieve a noble end. It is by means of Eros that the goddess removes the cloying effect of pleasure and creates affection and fusion. This is the reason why Parmenides[e] declares that Eros is the most ancient work of Aphroditê; his words in the *Cosmogony* are

And first of all the gods she framed was Love.

But Hesiod,[f] in my opinion, was more scientific when he depicted Eros as the first-born of them all, in order to make him indispensable for the generation of all things.

" If, then, we strip from Love any of his customary honours, even those given to Aphroditê will not remain undisturbed. Nor is it in fact possible to affirm that there are some who rail at Eros without dis-

[c] Frag. 763 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 310); *cf.* *Mor.* 144 B.
[d] Aeschylus, *Choephoroe*, 295.
[e] Frag. 13 Diels (*op. cit.* i, p. 243).
[f] *Theogony*, 120; *cf.* Plato, *Symposium*, 178 B; Sextus Empiricus, *Adv. Phys.* ii. 11, 18.

(757) ἀλλ' ἀπὸ μιᾶς σκηνῆς ἀκούομεν

Ἔρως γὰρ ἀργὸν κἀπὶ[1] τοιούτοις ἔφυ·

καὶ πάλιν

ὦ παῖδες, ἥ τοι Κύπρις[2] οὐ Κύπρις μόνον,
ἀλλ' ἔστι πολλῶν ὀνομάτων ἐπώνυμος.[3]
ἔστιν μὲν Ἅιδης, ἔστι δ' ἄφθιτος βίος[4]
ἔστιν δὲ λύσσα μανιάς[5]·

ὥσπερ οὐδὲ τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν σχεδὸν ἀλοιδόρητος οὐδεὶς ἐκπέφευγε τὴν εὐλοιδόρητον[6] ἀμαθίαν. σκόπει δὲ τὸν Ἄρην καθάπερ ἐν πίνακι χαλκῷ τὴν ἀντικειμένην ἐκ διαμέτρου τῷ Ἔρωτι χώραν ἔχοντα[7] πηλίκας εἴληχε τιμὰς ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων καὶ πάλιν ὅσα κακῶς ἀκούει,

B τυφλὸς γάρ, ὦ γυναῖκες, οὐδ' ὁρῶν Ἄρης
συὸς προσώπῳ πάντα τυρβάζει κακά,

καὶ ' μιαιφόνον ' Ὅμηρος αὐτὸν καλεῖ καὶ ' ἀλλοπρόσαλλον.' ὁ δὲ Χρύσιππος ἐξηγούμενος τοὔνομα τοῦ θεοῦ κατηγορίαν ποιεῖ καὶ διαβολήν· Ἀναίρην[8] γὰρ εἶναι τὸν Ἄρην φησίν, ἀρχὰς διδοὺς τοῖς τὸ μαχητικὸν ἐν ἡμῖν καὶ διάφορον καὶ θυμοειδὲς Ἄρην κεκλῆσθαι νομίζουσιν. ἕτεροι δ' αὖ φήσουσι τὴν Ἀφροδίτην ἐπιθυμίαν εἶναι καὶ τὸν Ἑρμῆν λόγον καὶ τέχνας τὰς Μούσας καὶ φρόνησιν τὴν

[1] κἀπὶ Xylander : καὶ ἐπὶ.
[2] ἥ τοι Κύπρις] added by Xylander from Stobaeus.
[3] ἐπώνυμος Xylander : αἰτιώνυμος.
[4] βίος Bothe : βία.
[5] μανιάς Porson : μανίας.
[6] εὐλοιδόρητον Meziriacus : ἀλοιδόρητον.





paraging Aphroditê. Rather on the selfsame stage we hear

Love is idle and born god for idle men [a];

and again

My children, Cypris is not Cypris alone,
But she is called by very many names :
Hades she is and everlasting life,
And she can be a raging Fury.[b]

In the same way practically none of the other gods has escaped unscathed the stupidity of those ready to slander. Look at the case of Ares who occupies a position diametrically opposite to that of Eros, as it were, on a design etched in bronze. Observe how great are the honours men give him and again how numerous are the invectives hurled against him :

Ladies, Ares is blind and cannot see ;
With swinish snout he churns up every evil.[c]

Homer [d] calls him ' bloodstained ' and ' turn-coat.' Chrysippus' [e] explanation of the name is an accusation and an indictment of the god. He declares that Ares means *Anaires* (assassin), which gives an opening to those who believe that the contentious, argumentative, and spirited quality inside us is called 'Ares.' Others [f] in their turn will state that Aphroditê is merely desire and Hermes eloquence and the Muses

[a] From the *Danaë* of Euripides, frag. 332. 1 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 455) ; *cf.* 760 D *infra.*
[b] Sophocles, frag. 855. 1-4 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 329).
[c] Sophocles, frag. 754 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 308) ; *cf. Mor.* 23 c.
[d] Homer, *Iliad*, v. 31, 831.
[e] Von Arnim, *S.V.F.* ii, p. 1094.
[f] Especially the Stoics.

[7] ἔχοντα Reiske : ἔχοντι.
[8] Ἀναίρην Wilamowitz : ἀναιρεῖν.

(757) Ἀθηνᾶν. ὁρᾷς δήπου τὸν ὑπολαμβάνοντα βυθὸν
C ἡμᾶς ἀθεότητος, ἂν εἰς πάθη καὶ δυνάμεις καὶ ἀρετὰς διαγράφωμεν ἕκαστον τῶν θεῶν;"

14. "Ὁρῶ," εἶπεν ὁ Πεμπτίδης, "ἀλλ' οὔτε πάθη τοὺς θεοὺς ποιεῖν ὅσιον οὔτ' αὖ πάλιν τὰ πάθη θεοὺς νομίζειν."

Καὶ ὁ πατήρ, "τί οὖν," ἔφη, "τὸν Ἄρην, θεὸν εἶναι νομίζεις ἢ πάθος ἡμέτερον;"

Ἀποκριναμένου δὲ τοῦ Πεμπτίδου θεὸν ἡγεῖσθαι τὸν Ἄρην κοσμοῦντα τὸ θυμοειδὲς ἡμῶν καὶ ἀνδρώδες, ἀνακραγὼν ὁ πατήρ, "εἶτ'," ἔφη, "τὸ μὲν μαχητικόν,[1] ὦ Πεμπτίδη, καὶ πολεμικὸν καὶ ἀντίπαλον θεὸν ἔχει, τὸ δὲ φιλητικὸν καὶ κοινωνικὸν καὶ συνελευστικὸν ἄθεόν ἐστι; καὶ κτείνοντας μὲν ἄρα καὶ κτεινομένους ἀνθρώπους ὅπλα τε καὶ
D βέλη καὶ τειχομαχίας καὶ λεηλασίας ἔστι τις ἐφορῶν καὶ βραβεύων θεὸς Ἐνυάλιος καὶ Στράτιος, ποθοῦσι[2] δὲ γάμου καὶ φιλότητος εἰς ὁμοφροσύνην καὶ κοινωνίαν τελευτώσης οὐδεὶς θεῶν μάρτυς οὐδ' ἐπίσκοπος οὐδ' ἡγεμὼν ἢ συνεργὸς ἡμῖν γέγονεν;

"Ἀλλὰ δορκάδας μὲν θηρεύουσι καὶ λαγωοὺς καὶ ἐλάφους Ἀγροτέρα[3] τις συνεπιθωΰσσει καὶ συνεξορμᾷ θεός, εὔχονται δ' Ἀρισταίῳ δολοῦντες ὀρύγμασι καὶ βρόχοις λύκους καὶ ἄρκτους,

ὃς πρῶτος θήρεσσιν ἔπηξε ποδάγρας;

ὁ δ' Ἡρακλῆς ἕτερον θεὸν παρακαλεῖ μέλλων ἐπὶ

[1] μαχητικόν Reiske: παθητικόν.
[2] ποθοῦσι W. C. H.: πάθους.
[3] Ἀγροτέρα Winckelmann: ἀγρότερος.





the arts and Athena wisdom. You surely perceive the abyss of atheism that engulfs us if we list each several god on a roster of emotions, functions, and virtues."[a]

14. "Yes, I do perceive it," said Pemptides. "But if it is impious to identify the gods with our passions, it is equally so, on the other hand, to consider our passions as gods."

"Well now," my father asked, "do you believe Ares to be a god or an emotion of ours?"

Pemptides replied that he believed Ares to be a god who ordered the spirited and courageous element within us. "What is this, Pemptides?" cried my father. "So the warlike, inimical, and antagonistic element has a divinity, while the affectionate, sociable, coupling impulse is to be left without a god? When men slay and are slain, is there a god, Enyalios or Stratios, overseeing and presiding over their arms and arrows, their storming of towns and their driving off of booty, but when they desire marriage and an affection that will lead to concord and co-operation, is there no god to witness and direct, to lead and help us?

"When men hunt roebucks and hare and deer, have they a goddess, Artemis Agrotera, to urge and halloo them on? Do those who trap wolves and bears with pits and nets pray to Aristaeus,

Who first set snares for beasts?[b]

When Heracles makes ready his bow to shoot at the

[a] *Cf. Mor.* 360 A, 377 D.
[b] A verse of unknown origin. It used to be referred to Callimachus by Schneider (frag. anon. 379) and others, but has not been accepted by Pfeiffer.

(757) τὸν ὄρνιν αἴρεσθαι τὸ τόξον, ὡς Αἰσχύλος φησίν,

ἀγρευὺς δ' Ἀπόλλων ὀρθὸν ἰθύνοι[1] βέλος;

E ἀνδρὶ δὲ τὸ κάλλιστον ἐπιχειροῦντι θήραμα φιλίαν ἑλεῖν οὔτε θεὸς οὔτε δαίμων ἀπευθύνει καὶ συνεφάπτεται τῆς ὁρμῆς;

" Ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ οὐδὲ δρυὸς οὐδὲ μορίας οὐδ' ἣν Ὅμηρος ' ἡμερίδα ' σεμνύνων προσεῖπεν ἀκαλλέστερον ἔρνος οὐδὲ φαυλότερον ἡγοῦμαι φυτὸν ἄνθρωπον, ὦ φίλε Δαφναῖε, βλαστήσεως ὁρμὴν ἔχοντα διαφαίνουσαν ὥραν[2] καὶ κάλλος ἅμα σώματος καὶ ψυχῆς."

15. Καὶ ὁ Δαφναῖος, " τίς δ' ἄλλως,"[3] εἶπεν, " ὦ πρὸς τῶν θεῶν ; "

" Οὗτοι νὴ Δί'," ἔφη, " πάντες," ὁ πατήρ, " οἱ νομίζοντες ἀρότου[4] καὶ σπόρου καὶ φυτείας ἐπιμέλειαν θεοῖς προσήκειν. ἢ γὰρ οὐ νύμφαι τινὲς αὐτοῖς δρυάδες εἰσὶν

ἰσοδένδρου[5] τέκμαρ αἰῶνος λαχοῖσαι[6]·

F δενδρέων δὲ νομὸν[7] Διόνυσος πολυγαθὴς[8] αὐξάνει, φέγγος ἁγνὸν ὀπώρας

κατὰ Πίνδαρον; μειρακίων δ' ἅρα καὶ παίδων ἐν ὥρᾳ καὶ ἄνθει πλαττομένων καὶ ῥυθμιζομένων τρο-

[1] εὐθύνοι Nauck. [2] ὥραν Reiske : ὥρα.
[3] ἄλλως Leonicus : ἄλλος.
[4] ἀρότου Xylander : ἀρότρου.
[5] ἰσοδένδρου Reiske : ἴσον δένδρου.
[6] λαχοῖσαι Heyne : λαχοῦσαι.
[7] νομὸν Boeckh : τρόπον.
[8] πολυγαθὴς Wyttenbach : πολύ τε φέγγος.





bird, does he invoke another god to help him, as Aeschylus [a] says,

May Hunter Apollo guide my shaft aright ?

But when a man sets out to catch the fairest prey,[b] namely affection, does no god or spirit lead him straight and second his efforts ?

" As for me, no oak nor sacred olive nor that vine which Homer [c] exalts with the epithet ' cultivated ' seems to me a growth superior in beauty and value to the human plant,[d] dear Daphnaeus, since its vital force of growth reveals a youthful beauty that belongs to soul and body alike."

15. " In heaven's name," said Daphnaeus, " who could think otherwise ? "

" Why, in heaven's name," said my father, " just these very men, all of them believe that agriculture —ploughing, sowing, planting—merits the gods' attention. Don't they have certain tree nymphs, to whom is

Allotted a term of life as long as the years of a tree—
Dionysus exultant gives increase to the orchard,
Holy light of the fruit-time,

as Pindar [e] says ? But the case is otherwise, of course, with boys and striplings : when they are at the ripening and flowering season and are being shaped and educated, it is the office of not a single

[a] From the *Prometheus Lyomenos*, frag. 200 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 67) ; so " the bird " is Prometheus' vulture.
[b] *Cf.* Plato, *Laws*, 823 B.
[c] Homer, *Odyssey*, v. 69.
[d] *Cf. Mor.* 400 B, which quotes Plato, *Timaeus*, 90 A.
[e] Frags. 184, 171 ed. Turyn (168, 140 Bowra ; 165, 153 Schroeder ; frag. 153 Sandys, L.C.L., who prints only the second and third lines) ; *cf. Mor.* 365 A, 415 D, 745 A *supra.*

(757) φαὶ καὶ αὐξήσεις οὐδενὶ θεῶν ἢ δαιμόνων προσ-
ήκουσιν, οὐδ' ἔστιν ᾧ μέλει[1] φυόμενον ἄνθρωπον
758 εἰς ἀρετὴν ὀρθὸν ἐλθεῖν καὶ μὴ παρατραπῆναι μηδὲ
κλασθῆναι τὸ γενναῖον ἐρημίᾳ κηδεμόνος ἢ κακίᾳ
τῶν προστυγχανόντων;

" Ἢ καὶ τὸ λέγειν ταῦτα δεινόν ἐστι καὶ ἀχάρι-
στον, ἀπολαύοντάς γε[2] τοῦ θείου τοῦ φιλανθρώπου
πανταχόσε νενεμημένου καὶ μηδαμοῦ προλείποντος
ἐν χρείαις, ὧν ἀναγκαιότερον ἔνιαι τὸ τέλος ἢ κάλ-
λιον ἔχουσιν; ὥσπερ εὐθὺς ἡ περὶ τὴν γένεσιν ἡμῶν,
οὐκ εὐπρεπὴς οὖσα δι' αἵματος καὶ ὠδίνων, ὅμως
ἔχει θεῖον ἐπίσκοπον Εἰλείθυιαν καὶ Λοχείαν· ἦν δέ
που μὴ γενέσθαι[3] κρεῖττον ἢ γενέσθαι κακόν, ἁμαρ-
τάνοντα κηδεμόνος ἀγαθοῦ καὶ φύλακος. οὐ μὴν
B οὐδὲ νοσοῦντος ἀνθρώπου θεὸς ἀποστατεῖ τὴν περὶ
τοῦτο χρείαν καὶ δύναμιν εἰληχώς, ἀλλ' οὐδ' ἀπο-
θανόντος· ἔστι δέ τις ἐκείνου[4] κομιστὴρ ἐνθένδε καὶ
ἀγωγὸς[5] τῶν[6] ἐν τέλει γενομένων κατευναστὴς καὶ
ψυχοπομπὸς εἰς Πλούτωνος,[7]

οὐ γάρ με Νὺξ ἔτικτε δεσπότην λύρας,
οὐ μάντιν οὐδ' ἰατρόν, ἀλλ' ἡγήτορα[8]
ψυχαῖς.

καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα πολλὰς ἔχει δυσχερείας.

" Ἐκείνου δ' οὐκ ἔστιν εἰπεῖν ἔργον ἱερώτερον

[1] μέλει Xylander : μέλλει. [2] γε Reiske : τε.
[3] γενέσθαι Bernardakis : γίνεσθαι.
[4] ἐκείνου Post : ἐκεῖ. [5] ἀγωγὸς Xylander : ἀρωγὸς.
[6] τῶν added by Post.
[7] εἰς Πλούτωνος Post : ὥσπερ οὗτος.
[8] ἀλλ' ἡγήτορα Valckenaer : ἀλλὰ θνητὸν ἅμα.

[a] *Cf. Life of Numa*, iv (62 A-B).
[b] *Cf. Mor.* 496 B.





god or divinity to sustain and promote their progress[a]; nor is there a god whose care it is that a man grows straight in the direction of virtue with no deviation or crushing of the main stem of excellence through lack of a protector or by the viciousness of those he encounters.

" Is it not, moreover, shocking and ungrateful of them to say such things, especially as they continue to profit by divinity's love for man, which is everywhere dispensed and at no point fails him in his needs, even though some services are necessary rather than decorous? For example, there is the service connected with parturition which, with its accompaniment of blood[b] and travail is no lovely thing, yet enjoys the divine supervision of Eileithyia and Locheia. It might, in fact, be better not to be born at all than to be born defective for lack of a good guardian and protector. Deity does not abandon man even when he is sick: there is a special god[c] whose mission it is to bring help and strength at such a time. Not even when a man dies is he forsaken: there is a god who cares for him and leads him to the other world, who is for the dead a lord of repose, an escort of souls to Pluto's realm[d]:

Night did not bear me lord of the lyre
Nor yet seer or physician, but to be a guide
Of souls.

These matters, too, involve many disagreeable features.[e]

" Love, on the other hand, has a function as holy

[c] Asclepius.
[d] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 916, Adespoton 405. The god is Hermes.
[e] The crude ugliness of birth and death.

(758) οὐδ' ἄμιλλαν ἑτέραν οὐδ' ἀγῶνα θεῷ πρέπειν μᾶλλον ἐφορᾶν καὶ βραβεύειν ἢ τὴν περὶ τοὺς καλοὺς καὶ ὡραίους ἐπιμέλειαν τῶν ἐρώντων καὶ δίωξιν· οὐδὲν γάρ ἐστιν αἰσχρὸν οὐδ' ἀναγκαῖον, ἀλλὰ πειθὼ καὶ χάρις ἐνδιδοῦσα ' πόνον ἡδὺν ' ὡς ἀληθῶς ' κάματόν τ' εὐκάματον '[1] ὑφηγεῖται πρὸς ἀρετὴν καὶ C φιλίαν, οὔτ' ' ἄνευ θεοῦ ' τὸ προσῆκον τέλος λαμβάνουσαν, οὔτ' ἄλλον ἔχουσαν ἡγεμόνα καὶ δεσπότην θεὸν ἀλλὰ τὸν Μουσῶν καὶ Χαρίτων καὶ Ἀφροδίτης ἑταῖρον Ἔρωτα.

γλυκὺ γὰρ θέρος ἀνδρὸς ὑποσπείρων πραπίδων
πόθῳ

κατὰ τὸν Μελανιππίδην, τὰ ἥδιστα μίγνυσι τοῖς καλλίστοις· ἢ πῶς," ἔφη, " λέγωμεν,[2] ὦ Ζεύξιππε;"

16. Κἀκεῖνος, " οὕτως," ἔφη, " νὴ Δία παντὸς μᾶλλον· ἄτοπον γὰρ ἀμέλει τοὐναντίον."

" Ἐκεῖνο δ'," ὁ πατήρ, " οὐκ ἄτοπον," εἶπεν, " εἰ τέσσαρα γένη τῆς φιλίας ἐχούσης, ὥσπερ οἱ D παλαιοὶ διώρισαν, τὸ φυσικὸν πρῶτον εἶτα τὸ ξενικὸν[3] ἐπὶ τούτῳ καὶ τρίτον τὸ ἑταιρικὸν καὶ τελευταῖον τὸ ἐρωτικόν, ἔχει τούτων ἕκαστον ἐπιστάτην θεὸν ἢ φίλιον ἢ ξένιον ἢ ὁμόγνιον καὶ πατρῷον· μόνον δὲ τὸ ἐρωτικὸν ὥσπερ δυσιεροῦν ἀνόσιον[4]

[1] τ' εὐκάματον added by Porson (*cf.* 467 D ; 794 B).
[2] λέγωμεν Hatzidakis : λέγομεν.
[3] ξενικὸν Madvig : συγγενικόν.
[4] ἀνόσιον Reiske : ἄνοσον.

[a] Euripides, *Bacchae*, 66 ; *cf. Mor.* 794 B ; *Commentarii in Hesiodum*, 48 (Bernardakis, vol. vii, p. 75).





as any you could mention, nor is there any contest or competition more fitting for a god to preside over and umpire than the pursuit and tendance by lovers of handsome young men. Here there is no ignoble compulsion ; instead persuasion and favour, prompting truly

A labour sweet, a toil that is no toil,[a]

leads the way to virtuous friendship. Not

Without a god [b]

does such friendship attain its proper goal, nor is the guide to it, to whose dominion it belongs, any other god than Eros, companion of the Muses, the Graces and Aphroditê. For it is he who, in the words of Melanippides,[c]

Sows secretly a delightful harvest
In the desire of man's heart,

mingling what is most pleasant with what is best. Well, Zeuxippus," he said, " is this what we mean ? "

16. " Heavens, yes," said the other. " Exactly right. The contrary would be quite absurd."

" And would not this also be absurd," asked my father, " if in the four classes of friendship that the ancients distinguished : blood kinship, hospitality, comradeship, and love, the first three of these should have as their patron a god, of comrades or guests or clan or family, and that only love should be ignored as though it were profane [d] and unsuitable for a god's

[b] Homer, *Odyssey*, ii. 372.
[c] Frag. 7 (ii, p. 154 Diehl ; Edmonds, *Lyra Graeca*, iii, p. 238).
[d] On the corruption of his passage see Bolkestein, *Mnemosynê*, iv (1953), p. 304.

(758) καὶ ἀδέσποτον ἀφεῖται, καὶ ταῦτα πλείστης ἐπιμελείας καὶ κυβερνήσεως δεόμενον;"

"Ἔχει καὶ ταῦτα," ὁ Ζεύξιππος εἶπεν, "οὐ μικρὰν ἀλογίαν."[1]

"Ἀλλὰ μήν," ὁ πατὴρ ἔφη, "τά γε[2] τοῦ Πλάτωνος ἐπιλάβοιτ' ἂν τοῦ λόγου καὶ παρεξιόντος.[3] μανία γὰρ ἡ μὲν ἀπὸ σώματος ἐπὶ ψυχὴν ἀνεσταλμένη δυσκρασίαις τισὶν ἢ συμμίξεσιν πνεύματος[4] βλαβεροῦ περιφερομένου τραχεῖα καὶ χαλεπὴ
E καὶ νοσώδης· ἑτέρα δ' ἐστὶν οὐκ ἀθείαστος οὐδ' οἰκογενής, ἀλλ' ἔπηλυς ἐπίπνοια καὶ παρατροπὴ τοῦ λογιζομένου καὶ φρονοῦντος ἐκ[5] κρείττονος δυνάμεως ἀρχὴν ἔχουσα καὶ κίνησιν, ἧς τὸ μὲν κοινὸν ἐνθουσιαστικὸν καλεῖται πάθος· ὡς γὰρ ἔμπνουν τὸ πνεύματος πληρωθὲν ἔμφρον δὲ τὸ φρονήσεως, οὕτως ὁ τοιοῦτος σάλος[6] ψυχῆς ἐνθουσιασμὸς ὠνόμασται μετοχῇ καὶ κοινωνίᾳ θειοτέρας δυνάμεως.

"Ἐνθουσιασμοῦ δὲ τὸ μαντικὸν ἐξ Ἀπόλλωνος ἐπιπνοίας καὶ κατοχῆς, τὸ δὲ βακχεῖον ἐκ Διονύσου,

κἀπὶ Κυρβάντεσι χορεύσατε,

φησὶ Σοφοκλῆς· τὰ γὰρ μητρῷα καὶ πανικὰ κοινω-
F νεῖ τοῖς βακχικοῖς ὀργιασμοῖς.

"'Τρίτη δ' ἀπὸ Μουσῶν λαβοῦσ' ἀπαλὴν καὶ

[1] οὐ μικρὰν ἀλογίαν G. Hermann: οὐ μὴν ἀλλοτρίαν.
[2] γε Wyttenbach: τε.
[3] παρεξιόντος Winckelmann: παρεξιόντα.
[4] πνεύματος Reiske: ἢ πνεύματος.
[5] ἐκ Sandbach: ἀρχὴν.
[6] σάλος Basel edition: λάλος.

[a] *Phaedrus*, 244 A ff.; 265 A.
[b] Quoting Plato, *Republic*, 503 A.
[c] This passage is a synopsis of Plato, *Timaeus*, 86 E—87 A.





protection—and this when above all others it needs surveillance and guidance?"

"Yes," said Zeuxippus, "that would be very illogical."

"But," my father said, "Plato's[a] doctrine might help in the discussion at this point, though it is a digression.[b] There is one form of madness that rises from the body to the soul: when a noxious exhalation is put into circulation as a result of distempers or commixtures of a certain sort, a madness ensues that is savage, harsh, and diseased.[c] There is a second kind, however, which does not exist without divine inspiration. It is not intrinsically generated but is, rather, an extrinsic afflatus that displaces the faculty of rational inference; it is created and set in motion by a higher power. This sort of madness bears the general name of 'enthusiasm.' For just as what possesses breath within it is called 'breathing' and what has sense is called 'sensible,' just so this kind of agitation in the soul has been named 'enthusiasm' because it shares in and participates in a power that is divine.[d]

"There are several kinds of enthusiasm: the prophetic comes from the inspiration and possession of Apollo; the Bacchic from Dionysus—

Dance after the Corybantes,

says Sophocles,[e] for the festivals of Cybelê and Pan have much in common with the Bacchic revels.[f]

"'The third kind comes from the Muses. It takes

[d] *En-thus*iasm is derived from *entheos*, "having a god within."
[e] Frag. 778 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 313).
[f] See now Dodds, *The Greeks and the Irrational*, pp. 78 and 96, note 92.

(758) ἄβατον ψυχὴν ' τὸ ποιητικὸν καὶ μουσικὸν ἐξώρμησε καὶ ἀνερρίπισεν. ἡ δ' ἀρειμάνιος[1] αὕτη λεγομένη καὶ πολεμικὴ παντὶ δῆλον ὅτῳ[2] θεῶν[3] ἀνίεται καὶ βακχεύεται

ἄχορον[4] ἀκίθαριν δακρυογόνον Ἄρη
βοάν τ' ἔνδημον ἐξοπλίζουσα.[5]

759 " Λείπεται δὲ τῆς ἐξαλλαγῆς ἐν ἀνθρώπῳ καὶ παρατροπῆς οὐκ ἀμαυρὸν οὐδ' ἡσυχαῖον, ὦ Δαφναῖε, μόριον, ὑπὲρ οὗ βούλομαι τουτονὶ Πεμπτίδην ἐρέσθαι . . .

τίς καλλίκαρπον[6] θύρσον ἀνασείει θεῶν,

τὸν φιλητικὸν τοῦτον περὶ παῖδας ἀγαθοὺς καὶ σώφρονας γυναῖκας ἐνθουσιασμὸν πολὺ δριμύτατον ὄντα καὶ θερμότατον;

" Ἢ γὰρ οὐχ ὁρᾷς, ὡς ὁ μὲν στρατιώτης τὰ ὅπλα θεὶς πέπαυται τῆς πολεμικῆς μανίας,

τοῦ μὲν ἔπειτα
γηθόσυνοι θεράποντες ἀπ' ὤμων τεύχε' ἕλοντο,

καὶ κάθηται τῶν ἄλλων ἀπόλεμος θεατής, ταυτὶ δὲ τὰ βακχικὰ καὶ κορυβαντικὰ σκιρτήματα τὸν ῥυθ-
B μὸν μεταβάλλοντες ἐκ τροχαίου καὶ τὸ μέλος ἐκ Φρυγίου πραΰνουσι καὶ καταπαύουσιν, ὡς δ' αὕτως ἡ Πυθία τοῦ τρίποδος ἐκβᾶσα καὶ τοῦ πνεύματος

[1] ἀρειμάνιος Xylander : ἀριμάνιος.
[2] ὅτῳ Wyttenbach : ὅτι τῶ.
[3] θεῶν Bernardakis : θεῶ.
[4] ἄχορον Winckelmann from Aesch. *Suppl.* 681 : ἄχαριν.
[5] ἀκιθαριν . . . ἐξοπλιζουσα Porson : ἀκίθαριν ἀκ 3—4 BE γονον ἀρ 4 E 6 B τατε (τᾶτε B) δῆμον ἐξοπλίζουσαν.
[6] τίς καλλίκαρπον Winckelmann : τί . . . καρπον.





a pure and virgin soul,' [a] strikes a spark in it and fans it into a blaze of poetic and musical creation. As for that kind which is called ' mad with Ares ' [b] and is concerned with war, everyone knows which of the gods it honours in its frenzied inspiration :

It calls Ares to arms, the stranger to dance and lyre,
The sower of tears ; it rouses cries of civil war. [c]

" There remains within the class of mutations and aberrations that man is subject to yet another kind, Daphnaeus, that is neither inconspicuous nor quiescent. I have a question about it to put to Pemptides here . . . [d]

Which god shakes the thyrsus of fair fruits [e]—

this enthusiasm which arouses affection for virtuous boys and chaste women, which is much the fiercest and warmest of all our enthusiasms ?

" You have observed, have you not, that as soon as the soldier lays down his arms he is relieved from the madness of war—

And then his joyful servants
Stripped the armour from his shoulders [f]——

he sits still, an unwarlike spectator of everything else. Likewise in Bacchic orgies and Corybantic revels the dance grows milder and comes to rest when the musicians switch from the trochaic rhythm and the Phrygian mode. In the same way the Pythia regains calm and tranquillity once she has left her

[a] Plato, *Phaedrus*, 245 A.
[b] Perhaps there is also a reference to Ahriman, the spirit of evil in Zoroastrianism ; *cf. Mor.* 369 E, 1026 B.
[c] Aeschylus, *Supplices*, 681 f.
[d] There is a short lacuna in the MSS. at this point.
[e] Nauck, *op. cit.* p. 917, Adespoton 406.
[f] Homer, *Iliad*, vii. 121 f.

(759) ἐν γαλήνῃ καὶ ἡσυχίᾳ διατελεῖ; τὴν δ' ἐρωτικὴν μανίαν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καθαψαμένην ἀληθῶς καὶ διακαύσασαν οὐ μοῦσά τις οὐκ ἐπῳδὴ θελκτήριος οὐ τόπου μεταβολὴ καθίστησιν· ἀλλὰ καὶ παρόντες ἐρῶσι καὶ ἀπόντες ποθοῦσι καὶ μεθ' ἡμέραν διώκουσι καὶ νύκτωρ θυραυλοῦσι, καὶ νήφοντες καλοῦσι τοὺς καλοὺς καὶ πίνοντες ᾄδουσι.

C "Καὶ οὐχ ὥς τις εἶπεν αἱ ποιητικαὶ φαντασίαι διὰ τὴν ἐνάργειαν[1] ἐγρηγορότων ἐνύπνιά εἰσιν, ἀλλὰ μᾶλλον αἱ τῶν ἐρώντων, διαλεγομένων ὡς πρὸς παρόντας, ἀσπαζομένων, ἐγκαλούντων. ἡ γὰρ ὄψις ἔοικε τὰς μὲν ἄλλας φαντασίας ἐφ' ὑγροῖς ζωγραφεῖν, ταχὺ μαραινομένας καὶ ἀπολειπούσας τὴν διάνοιαν· αἱ δὲ τῶν ἐρωμένων εἰκόνες ὑπ' αὐτῆς οἷον ἐν ἐγκαύμασι γραφόμεναι διὰ πυρὸς εἴδωλα ταῖς μνήμαις ἐναπολείπουσι κινούμενα καὶ ζῶντα καὶ φθεγγόμενα καὶ παραμένοντα τὸν ἄλλον χρόνον.

"Ὁ μὲν γὰρ Ῥωμαῖος Κάτων ἔλεγε τὴν ψυχὴν τοῦ ἐρῶντος ἐνδιαιτᾶσθαι τῇ τοῦ ἐρωμένου· . . .

[1] ἐνάργειαν Victorius : ἐνέργειαν.

[a] Euripides, *Hippolytus*, 478.

[b] Something of the sort (though "hopes," not "poetic fancies") is attributed to Pindar by Stobaeus, iv. 47. 12; to Plato by Aelian, *Varia Hist.* xiii. 29; and to Aristotle by Diogenes Laertius, v. 18. See also Plato, *Epistle* viii (357 D).

[c] Plutarch is presumably thinking of fresco painting which, if not reinforced, seems to have faded quickly; doubtless he had seen many ruined frescoes in his day. Others translate "on water," recalling such passages as Sophocles, frag. 741; Plato, *Phaedrus*, 276 C; Catullus, lxx. 4.

[d] *Cf. Life of Cato Maior*, ix (341 C).





tripod and its exhalations. In erotic madness, however, when once it has really seized upon a man and set him on fire, there is no reading of literature, no 'magic incantation,'[a] no change of environment, that restores him to calm. He loves when present and longs when absent, pursues by day and haunts the door by night, summons his lad when sober and sings his praises while he drinks.

"Someone[b] has said that the images entertained by the poetic imagination, because they impose themselves so vividly, are dreams of those wide awake; but this is much more true of the images entertained by the imagination of lovers who speak to the beloved and embrace him or chide him as though he were present. For our sight seems to paint its other pictures on wet plaster[c]: they fade away quickly and slip from mind; the images of the beloved, however, burned into the mind by sight, as if using encaustic technique, leave behind in the memory shapes that move and live and speak and remain forever and ever.

"Roman Cato[d] declared that the soul of the lover is ever present in that of the beloved . . .[e] form,

[e] There is a lacuna at this point, though it is not indicated in the MSS.

Rabinowitz thinks that this corrupt passage has conceptual affinities with Plato, *Phaedrus*, 252 E—253 B, and has somewhat the following meaning:

"That is to say, the form (τὸ εἶδος) or character of the beloved—his way of life, his actions—affect (note τοῦ πάθους below) the soul of the lover and lead him to achieve a lengthy journey in swift compass. As the Cynics say, he comes to discover that the passage to virtue is 'strenuous and short at the same time.' For the soul of the lover proceeds first to friendship and then to virtue, moving swiftly, as it were, on the wave of affection with the god's help."

(759)
D καὶ τὸ εἶδος καὶ τὸ ἦθος καὶ ὁ βίος καὶ αἱ πράξεις, ὑφ' ὧν ἀγόμενος ταχὺ συναιρεῖ πολλὴν ὁδόν, ὥσπερ οἱ Κυνικοὶ λέγουσι ' σύντονον ὁμοῦ καὶ σύντομον εὗρηκε τὴν[1] πορείαν ἐπ' ἀρετήν '· καὶ γὰρ ἐπὶ τὴν φιλίαν . . . καθάπερ ἐπὶ κύματος τοῦ πάθους ἅμα θεῷ φερομένη.

" Λέγω δὴ κεφάλαιον, ὡς οὔτ' ἀθείαστον ὁ τῶν ἐρώντων ἐνθουσιασμός ἐστιν οὔτ' ἄλλον ἔχει θεὸν ἐπιστάτην καὶ ἡνίοχον ἢ τοῦτον, ᾧ νῦν ἑορτάζομεν καὶ θύομεν.

" Ὅμως δ' ἐπεὶ[2] δυνάμει καὶ ὠφελείᾳ μάλιστα θεοὺς διακρίνομεν[3] καθότι καὶ τῶν ἀνθρωπίνων ἀγαθῶν δύο ταῦτα, βασιλείαν καὶ ἀρετήν, θειότατα
E καὶ νομίζομεν καὶ ὀνομάζομεν, ὥρα σκοπεῖν πρότερον, εἴ τινι θεῶν ὁ Ἔρως ὑφίεται δυνάμεως. καίτοι

μέγα μὲν σθένος ἁ Κύπρις ἐκφέρεται νίκας,

ὥς φησι καὶ Σοφοκλῆς, μεγάλη δ' ἡ τοῦ Ἄρεος ἰσχύς· καὶ τρόπον τινὰ τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν νενεμημένην[4] δίχα τὴν δύναμιν ἐν τούτοις ὁρῶμεν· ἡ μὲν γὰρ οἰκειωτικὴ πρὸς τὸ καλὸν ἡ δ' ἀντιτακτικὴ πρὸς τὸ αἰσχρὸν ἀρχῆθεν ἐγγέγονε ταῖς ψυχαῖς, ὥς που καὶ Πλάτων[5] . . . τὰ εἴδη. σκοπῶμεν οὖν εὐθύς, ὅτι τῆς Ἀφροδίτης τοὔργον ἔρωτος μὴ παρόντος[6] ὠνιόν ἐστι δραχμῆς, καὶ οὔτε πόνον οὐδεὶς

[1] εὗρηκε τὴν Rabinowitz : εὑρηκέναι.
[2] ἐπεὶ Meziriacus : ἐπὶ.
[3] θεοὺς διακρίνομεν supplied by Bernardakis to fill a lacuna : θεοῦ.
[4] νενεμημένην Meziriacus : νενεμημένων.
[5] A lacuna in which Wyttenbach would supply διεῖλε τῆς ψυχῆς.
[6] μὴ παρόντος added by Bernardakis.





character, way of life, and every act. By these he is led to make a long journey with great swiftness ; he has found, as the Cynics [a] say, the passage to virtue ' strenuous and short at the same time.' And in fact to friendship [b] . . . as it were borne along on the wave of affection with the help of a god.

" To sum up : it is clear that neither is the lover's enthusiasm without divine assistance, nor does it have as director and charioteer any god other than him whose festival and sacrifice we are now engaged in celebrating.

" It is, however, principally in respect to power and benefits that we distinguish between the gods, just as there are two human goods, kingship and virtue, that are held and said to be the most divine. Let us first, then, see whether Love yields to any other god in power. Though

Mighty the victory which the Cyprian bears away,

as Sophocles [c] says ; yet the strength of Ares is also mighty. Indeed we see the two-way distribution of the power of all the other gods illustrated in the case of these two. For the one power, which makes us receptive to beauty, and the other, which leads us to combat evil and ugliness, are fundamentally and from the beginning present in our souls as, I dare say, Plato [d] also . . . the kinds. For example, then, let us recognize that the work of Aphroditê, if Love is not present, can be bought for a drachma and that no

[a] *Cf.* Diogenes Laertius, vii. 121 ; Julian, *Oration*, vii. 225 c.
[b] Here the MSS. indicate the lacuna.
[c] *Trachiniae*, 497.
[d] A lacuna in the text does not permit us to know from what passage(s) of Plato Plutarch wishes to make an inference ; perhaps *Republic*, 440 A or *Symposium*, 190 D.

(759) οὔτε κίνδυνον ἀφροδισίων ἕνεκα μὴ ἐρῶν ὑπέμεινε. καὶ ὅπως ἐνταῦθα μὴ Φρύνην ὀνομάζωμεν, ὦ ἑταῖρε, Λαΐς[1] τις ἢ Γναθαίνιον

F ἐφέσπερον δαίουσα[2] λαμπτῆρος σέλας

ἐκδεχομένη καὶ καλοῦσα παροδεύεται πολλάκις·

ἐλθὼν δ' ἐξαπίνης ἄνεμος

σὺν ἔρωτι πολλῷ καὶ πόθῳ ταὐτὸ τοῦτο τῶν Ταντάλου λεγομένων ταλάντων καὶ τῆς Γύγου[3] ἀρχῆς ἀντάξιον ἐποίησεν. οὕτως ἀσθενὴς καὶ ἀψίκορός ἐστιν ἡ τῆς Ἀφροδίτης χάρις, Ἔρωτος μὴ ἐπιπνεύσαντος.[4]

"Ἔτι δὲ μᾶλλον κἀκεῖθεν ἂν συνίδοις· πολλοὶ γὰρ ἀφροδισίων ἑτέροις ἐκοινώνησαν, οὐ μόνον ἑταίρας ἀλλὰ καὶ γαμετὰς προαγωγεύοντες· ὥσπερ καὶ ὁ Ῥωμαῖος ἐκεῖνος, ὦ ἑταῖρε, Γάββας[5] εἰστία
091 Μαικήναν ὡς ἔοικεν, εἶθ' ὁρῶν διαπληκτιζόμενον ἀπὸ νευμάτων πρὸς τὸ γύναιον, ἀπέκλινεν ἡσυχῇ τὴν κεφαλὴν ὡς δὴ καθεύδων· ἐν τούτῳ δὴ τῶν οἰκετῶν τινος προσρυέντος ἔξωθεν τῇ τραπέζῃ καὶ τὸν οἶνον ὑφαιρουμένου, διαβλέψας, 'κακόδαιμον,' εἶπεν, 'οὐκ οἶσθ' ὅτι μόνῳ Μαικήνᾳ καθεύδω;' τοῦτο μὲν οὖν ἴσως οὐ[6] δεινόν ἐστιν· ἦν γὰρ ὁ Γάββας[7] γελωτοποιός. ἐν δ' Ἄργει Νικόστρατος

[1] Λαΐς Madvig : λάιε. [2] δαίουσα Stephanus : δέουσα.
[3] Γύγου Wilamowitz : αὐτοῦ (τῆς αὐταρχίας Post).
[4] ἐπιπνεύσαντος Aldine edition : ἐπινεύσαντος BE.
[5] Γάββας Buecheler : κάββας.
[6] οὐ added by Stephanus.
[7] Γάββας Buecheler : κάββας.

[a] See the note on 753 F *supra* : it would be untactful to dwell on Phrynê's exploits in Thespiae, of all places.





one not in love ever endured pain or danger merely for the sake of Aphroditê's pleasures. This is not the place to mention Phrynê,[a] my friend, while some girl like Laïs or Gnathaenion

Kindles at evening the gleam of her lamp [b] ;

though they welcome and solicit, their doors are often passed by.

But suddenly the wind will rise [c]

and bring with it love and desire in all its force : at once to this same activity it gives a worth equal to the fabulous wealth of Tantalus and the kingdom of Gyges. So weak and quickly sated are the favours of Aphroditê if Love has not inspired them.

" You will find this even more clearly indicated by the fact that many have shared their pleasure with others, playing the pander not merely to their mistresses, but even to their wives. An example, my friend, is that notorious Roman, Gabba. He was, they say, giving a dinner to Maecenas and observed the latter toying amorously with his wife when given the signal to do so ; so he let his head nod gently as if he were sound asleep. But meanwhile one of his slaves glided into the dining room and started to steal wine. ' Damn you ! ' cried Gabba, glaring. ' Don't you know that it's only for Maecenas that I'm asleep ? ' This, perhaps, is not so shocking, for Gabba was a buffoon.[d] But at Argos

[b] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 917, Adespoton 407.
[c] Homer, *Iliad*, xvii. 57.
[d] That is, a court jester of Augustus. But Gabba is really quoting a famous literary joke of Lucilius (frag. 251 Warmington) : " non omnibus dormio," echoed in Juvenal, i. 57 : " vigilanti stertere naso."

(760) ἀντεπολιτεύσατο πρὸς Φάυλλον[1]· ἐπιδημήσαντος οὖν Φιλίππου τοῦ βασιλέως, ἐπίδοξος ἦν διὰ τῆς γυναικὸς ὁ Φάυλλος ἐκπρεποῦς οὔσης, εἰ συγ-
B γένοιτο τῷ Φιλίππῳ, διαπράξεσθαί[2] τινα δυναστείαν αὐτῷ καὶ ἀρχήν. αἰσθομένων δὲ τῶν περὶ Νικόστρατον τοῦτο καὶ παρὰ τὰς θύρας τῆς οἰκίας περιπατούντων, ὁ Φάυλλος[1] ὑποδήσας τὴν γυναῖκα κρηπῖσι καὶ χλαμύδα περιθεὶς καὶ καυσίαν Μακεδονικήν, ὡς ἕνα τῶν βασιλικῶν νεανίσκων παρεισέπεμψε λαθοῦσαν.

"Ἆρ' οὖν, ἐραστῶν τοσούτων γεγονότων καὶ ὄντων, οἶσθ' ἐπὶ ταῖς τοῦ Διὸς τιμαῖς προαγωγὸν ἐρωμένου γενόμενον; ἐγὼ μὲν οὐκ οἶμαι· πόθεν γάρ, ὅπου καὶ τοῖς τυράννοις ἀντιλέγων μὲν οὐδεὶς οὔτ' ἀντιπολιτευόμενός ἐστιν, ἀντερῶντες δὲ πολλοὶ καὶ φιλοτιμούμενοι περὶ τῶν καλῶν καὶ ὡραίων;
C ἀκούετε[3] γὰρ ὅτι καὶ Ἀριστογείτων ὁ Ἀθηναῖος καὶ Ἀντιλέων ὁ[4] Μεταποντῖνος καὶ Μελάνιππος ὁ Ἀκραγαντῖνος οὐ διεφέροντο τοῖς τυράννοις, πάντα τὰ πράγματα λυμαινομένους καὶ παροινοῦντας ὁρῶντες· ἐπεὶ δὲ τοὺς ἐρωμένους αὐτῶν ἐπείρων, ὥσπερ ἱεροῖς ἀσύλοις καὶ ἀθίκτοις ἀμύνοντες ἠφείδησαν ἑαυτῶν.

"Λέγεται καὶ Ἀλέξανδρος ἐπιστεῖλαι Θεοδώρῳ Πρωτέου ἀδελφῷ, 'πέμψον μοι τὴν μουσουργὸν δέκα τάλαντα λαβών, εἰ μὴ ἐρᾷς αὐτῆς'· ἑτέρου δὲ τῶν ἑταίρων Ἀντιπατρίδου μετὰ ψαλτρίας ἐπι-

[1] Φάυλλον Reiske here and below: *φάϋλον* (-os).
[2] διαπράξεσθαι Xylander: *διαπράξασθαι*.
[3] ἀκούετε Reiske: *ἀκούεται*.
[4] Ἀντιλέων ὁ Bernardakis: *ὁ ἀντιλέων*.

[a] Philip V of Macedonia.





Nicostratus was the political opponent of Phaÿllus. When King Philip [a] came to town, everyone thought that Phaÿllus, who had a wife of great beauty, would obtain a dominant position for himself if his wife should become intimate with Philip. Nicostratus' party got wind of this and patrolled the street before Phaÿllus' door. The latter, however, put soldiers' boots on his wife and a cape and a Macedonian hat and got her undetected to Philip, since she passed for one of the royal pages.

"On the other hand, of all the throngs of lovers past and present, do you know of a single one who sold the favours of his beloved even to gain the honours of Zeus himself? I think not. How could this happen, when even tyrants, whom no one dares to contradict, whose policies no one dares to oppose have had many rivals in love, many competitors for the friendship of handsome young lads? You know the tales of Aristogeiton of Athens [b] and Antileon of Metapontum and Melanippus of Agrigentum: they had at first no quarrel with their tyrants, though they saw that these were acting like drunkards and disfiguring the state; but when the tyrants tried to seduce their beloveds, they spared not even their own lives in defending their loves, holy, as it were, and inviolable shrines.

"The tale is told that Alexander wrote to Theodorus, the brother of Proteas, 'If you're not in love with your music-girl, please send her to me for ten talents.' Another of Alexander's Companions, Antipatrides, came to a drinking party with his lyre-

[b] *Cf.* 770 B *infra*; Thucydides, vi. 54 ff.; Plato, *Symposium*, 182 C.

(760) κωμάσαντος, ἡδέως διατεθεὶς πρὸς τὴν ἄνθρωπον ἐρέσθαι τὸν Ἀντιπατρίδην, ' οὐ δήπου σὺ τυγχάνεις
D ἐρῶν ταύτης; ' τοῦ δέ, ' καὶ πάνυ,' φήσαντος, εἰπών, ' ἀπόλοιο τοίνυν κακὸς κακῶς,' ἀποσχέσθαι καὶ μὴ θιγεῖν τῆς γυναικός.

17. " Σκόπει τοίνυν αὖθις," ἔφη, " τοῖς ἀρηίοις ἔργοις ὅσον Ἔρως περίεστιν, οὐκ ἀργὸς ὤν, ὡς Εὐριπίδης ἔλεγεν, οὐδ' ἀστράτευτος οὐδ'

ἐν μαλακαῖσιν ἐννυχεύων[1] παρειαῖς νεανίδων.

ἀνὴρ γὰρ ὑποπλησθεὶς Ἔρωτος οὐδὲν Ἄρεος δεῖται μαχόμενος πολεμίοις, ἀλλὰ τὸν αὑτοῦ θεὸν ἔχων συνόντα

πῦρ καὶ θάλασσαν καὶ πνοὰς τὰς αἰθέρος
περᾶν ἕτοιμος

ὑπὲρ τοῦ φίλου οὗπερ[2] ἂν κελεύῃ. τῶν μὲν γὰρ τοῦ Σοφοκλέους Νιοβιδῶν βαλλομένων καὶ θνη-
E σκόντων ἀνακαλεῖταί τις οὐθένα βοηθὸν ἄλλον οὐδὲ σύμμαχον ἢ τὸν ἐραστήν,

ὦ . . . ἀμφ' ἐμοῦ στεῖλαι.

" Κλεόμαχον δὲ τὸν Φαρσάλιον ἴστε δήπουθεν ἐξ ἧς αἰτίας ἐτελεύτησεν ἀγωνιζόμενος."

" Οὐχ ἡμεῖς γοῦν," οἱ περὶ Πεμπτίδην ἔφασαν, " ἀλλ' ἡδέως ἂν πυθοίμεθα."

" Καὶ γὰρ ἄξιον," ἔφη ὁ πατήρ· " ἦκεν ἐπί-

[1] ἐννυχεύων added by Canter from Soph. : ων, following a lacuna.

[2] οἷπερ Hubert ; but see *Mnemosynê*, vi (1953), p. 304.

[a] *Cf. Mor.* 180 F. [b] *Cf.* Aelian, *Varia Hist.* iii. 9.





player. The wench pleased Alexander and he asked Antipatrides, ' Of course, you aren't in love with her, are you ? ' ' Very much so,' said the other. ' Well, damn you to hell the worst way ! ' cried Alexander. But he restrained himself and did not touch the woman.[a]

17. " And now consider," he said, " the extent of Eros' superiority in the sphere of battle, in Ares' sphere.[b] He is not idle, as Euripides [c] said ; he has seen service in the field ; he does not

Spend his nights on the soft cheeks of girls.[d]

A man filled with Love has no need of Ares to fight his enemies ; if he has his own god with him, he is

Ready to cross fire and sea, the air itself,[e]

on behalf of his friend, wherever the friend may bid him. When the sons of Niobê in Sophocles' [f] play are being shot at and about to die, one of them calls for help—and for no other helper or ally than his lover :

O . . . place about me . . .

" You know, of course, the story of Cleomachus of Pharsalia and the reason for his death in battle."

" No, we don't," said Pemptides and his party. " But we should be glad to hear it told."

" It's worth hearing," said my father. " Cleoma-

[c] Quoted in 757 A *supra*. With this whole chapter *cf.* Plato, *Symposium*, 179 A ff.

[d] Sophocles, *Antigonê*, 783.

[e] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 917, Adespoton 408.

[f] Frag. 410 (Nauck, *op. cit.* p. 229). The text is too mutilated to admit restoration, but Athenaeus, 601 a-b, gives us the tone of the tragedy, similar to Aeschylus' *Myrmidons* (cited in 751 c *supra*).

(760) κουρος Χαλκιδεῦσι τοῦ Ληλαντικοῦ[1] πολέμου πρὸς
Ἐρετριεῖς ἀκμάζοντος· καὶ τὸ μὲν πεζὸν ἐδόκει τοῖς
Χαλκιδεῦσιν ἐρρῶσθαι, τοὺς δ' ἱππέας μέγ' ἔργον
ἦν ὥσασθαι τῶν πολεμίων· παρεκάλουν δὴ τὸν
Κλεόμαχον ἄνδρα λαμπρὸν ὄντα τὴν ψυχὴν οἱ σύμ-
μαχοι πρῶτον ἐμβάλλειν εἰς τοὺς ἱππέας. ὁ δ'
F ἠρώτησε παρόντα τὸν ἐρώμενον, εἰ μέλλοι θεᾶσθαι
τὸν ἀγῶνα· φήσαντος δὲ τοῦ νεανίσκου καὶ φιλο-
φρόνως αὐτὸν ἀσπασαμένου καὶ τὸ κράνος ἐπιθέν-
τος, ἐπιγαυρωθεὶς ὁ Κλεόμαχος καὶ τοὺς ἀρίστους
τῶν Θεσσαλῶν συναγαγὼν περὶ αὑτὸν ἐξήλασε
λαμπρῶς καὶ προσέπεσε τοῖς πολεμίοις, ὥστε συν-
ταράξαι καὶ τρέψασθαι τὸ ἱππικόν· ἐκ δὲ τούτου
761 καὶ τῶν ὁπλιτῶν φυγόντων, ἐνίκησαν κατὰ κράτος
οἱ Χαλκιδεῖς. τὸν μέντοι Κλεόμαχον ἀποθανεῖν
συνέτυχε· τάφον δ' αὐτοῦ δεικνύουσιν ἐν ἀγορᾷ
Χαλκιδεῖς, ἐφ' οὗ μέχρι νῦν ὁ μέγας ἐφέστηκε
κίων· καὶ τὸ παιδεραστεῖν πρότερον ἐν ψόγῳ τιθέ-
μενοι τότε μᾶλλον ἑτέρων ἠγάπησαν καὶ ἐτίμησαν.
Ἀριστοτέλης δὲ τὸν μὲν Κλεόμαχον ἄλλως ἀπο-
θανεῖν φησι, κρατήσαντα τῶν Ἐρετριέων τῇ μάχῃ·
τὸν δ' ὑπὸ τοῦ ἐρωμένου φιληθέντα τῶν ἀπὸ
Θράκης Χαλκιδέων γενέσθαι, πεμφθέντα τοῖς ἐν
Εὐβοίᾳ Χαλκιδεῦσιν ἐπίκουρον· ὅθεν ᾄδεσθαι παρὰ
τοῖς Χαλκιδεῦσιν

ὦ παῖδες, οἵ[2] χαρίτων τε καὶ πατέρων λάχετ'[3]
ἐσθλῶν,
B μὴ φθονεῖθ' ὥρας ἀγαθοῖσιν ὁμιλίαν·

[1] Ληλαντικοῦ Wilamowitz : *θεσσαλικοῦ*.
[2] οἵ] ὅσοι Bergk. [3] λάχετ' Meineke : ἐλάχετε.





chus came to help the Chalcidians when the Lelantine War against the Eretrians was at its height. The Chalcidian infantry was thought to have considerable strength, but they found it difficult to resist the enemy cavalry. Accordingly his allies requested Cleomachus, a man of splendid courage, to be the first to charge the horse. His beloved was there and Cleomachus asked him if he was going to witness the battle. The youth said that he was, embraced Cleomachus tenderly, and put on his helmet for him. Filled with ardour, Cleomachus assembled the bravest of the Thessalians about himself, made a fine charge, and fell upon the enemy with such vigour that their cavalry was thrown into confusion and was thoroughly routed. When subsequently their hoplites also fled, the Chalcidians had a decisive victory. It was, however, Cleomachus' bad fortune to be killed in the battle. The Chalcidians point out his tomb in the market-place with the great pillar standing on it to this day. Formerly they had frowned on paederasty, but now they accepted it and honoured it more than others did. Now Aristotle [a] says that the circumstances of Cleomachus' death in victorious battle with the Eretrians were different and that the lover embraced by his friend was one of the Chalcidians from Thrace sent as an ally to the Chalcidians of Euboea. And this, he says, is the reason for the Chalcidian [b] popular song :

Ye lads of grace and sprung from worthy stock,
Grudge not to brave men converse with your beauty :

[a] Probably not the philosopher (though Rose, frag. 98, accepts the reference), but the historian of Chalcis (Müller, *Frag. Hist. Graec.* ii, p. 141).
[b] Diehl, ii, p. 205 ; Edmonds, *Lyra Graeca*, iii, p. 546.

(761) σὺν γὰρ ἀνδρείᾳ[1] καὶ ὁ λυσιμελὴς Ἔρως
ἐνὶ[2] Χαλκιδέων θάλλει πόλεσιν.

Ἄντων ἦν ὄνομα τῷ ἐραστῇ τῷ δ' ἐρωμένῳ Φίλιστος, ὡς ἐν τοῖς Αἰτίοις[3] Διονύσιος ὁ ποιητὴς ἱστόρησε.

" Παρ' ὑμῖν δ', ὦ Πεμπτίδη, τοῖς Θηβαίοις οὐ πανοπλίᾳ ὁ ἐραστὴς ἐδωρεῖτο τὸν ἐρώμενον εἰς ἄνδρας[4] ἐγγραφόμενον; ἤλλαξε δὲ καὶ μετέθηκε τάξιν τῶν ὁπλιτῶν ἐρωτικὸς ἀνὴρ Παμμένης, Ὅμηρον ἐπιμεμψάμενος ὡς ἀνέραστον, ὅτι κατὰ φῦλα καὶ φρήτρας συνελόχιζε τοὺς Ἀχαιούς, οὐκ ἐρώμενον ἔταττε παρ' ἐραστήν, ἵν' οὕτω γένηται τὸ

ἀσπὶς δ' ἀσπίδ' ἔρειδε κόρυς δὲ κόρυν,

ὡς μόνον ἀήττητον ὄντα τὸν Ἔρωτα[5] τῶν στρατη-
C γῶν. καὶ γὰρ φυλέτας καὶ οἰκείους καὶ νὴ Δία γονεῖς καὶ παῖδας ἐγκαταλείπουσιν· ἐραστοῦ δ' ἐνθέου[6] καὶ ἐρωμένου μέσος οὐδεὶς πώποτε διεξῆλθε πολέμιος οὐδὲ διεξήλασεν· ὅπου καὶ μηδὲν δεομένοις ἔπεισιν[7] ἐπιδεικνύναι τὸ φιλοκίνδυνον καὶ φιλόψυχον[8]· ὡς Θήρων ὁ Θεσσαλὸς προσβαλὼν τὴν χεῖρα τῷ τοίχῳ τὴν εὐώνυμον καὶ σπασάμενος τὴν μάχαιραν ἀπέκοψε τὸν ἀντίχειρα προκαλούμενος τὸν ἀντεραστήν. ἕτερος δέ τις ἐν μάχῃ πεσὼν ἐπὶ πρόσω-

[1] ἀνδρία BE.
[2] ἐνὶ Bernardakis : ἐπὶ.
[3] Αἰτίοις Xylander : ἀντίοις.
[4] εἰς ἄνδρας Winckelmann : ἀνδέτας.
[5] ὡς μόνον . . . ὄντα τὸν ἔρωτα Bernardakis : μόνον . . . ὄντα.
[6] δ' ἐνθέου Winckelmann : δὲ θω δὲ.





In cities of Chalcis, Love, looser of limbs,
Thrives side by side with courage.

Anton was the name of the lover and Philistus was his beloved, as the poet Dionysius relates in his *Origins*.

" In your city, Thebes, Pemptides, isn't it true that the lover made his beloved a present of a complete suit of armour when the boy was registered as a man? Pammenes,[a] a man versed in love, changed the order of battle-line for the hoplites, censuring Homer [b] as knowing nothing about love, because he arranged the companies of Achaeans by tribes and clans and did not station lover beside beloved, in order to bring it about that

Shield supported shield and helmet helmet,[c]

for he considered that Love is the only invincible general. It is a fact that men desert their fellow tribesmen and relatives and even (God knows) their parents and children ; but lover and beloved, when their god is present, no enemy has ever encountered and forced his way through. In some cases, even when there is no need for it, they are moved to exhibit their love of danger, their disregard for mere life. This was what prompted Theron of Thessaly to place his left hand on the wall, draw his sword, and cut off the thumb, challenging his rival to do the same. When another man had fallen in battle on his

[a] *Cf. Mor.* 618 D ; *Life of Pelopidas*, xviii (287 C ff.). Pammenes was a close political adherent of Epaminondas according to *Mor.* 805 E.
[b] Homer, *Iliad*, ii. 362.
[c] Homer, *Iliad*, xiii. 131 ; xvi. 215.

[7] ἔπεισιν added by Xylander.
[8] καὶ φιλόψυχον Xylander : καὶ φιλόψυχον.

(761) πον, ὡς ἔμελλε παίσειν αὐτὸν ὁ πολέμιος, ἐδεήθη περιμεῖναι μικρόν, ὅπως μὴ[1] ὁ ἐρώμενος ἴδῃ[2] κατὰ νώτου τετρωμένον.

D "Οὐ μόνον τοίνυν τὰ μαχιμώτατα τῶν ἐθνῶν ἐρωτικώτατα, Βοιωτοὶ καὶ Λακεδαιμόνιοι καὶ Κρῆτες, ἀλλὰ καὶ τῶν παλαιῶν ὁ Μελέαγρος ὁ Ἀχιλλεὺς ὁ Ἀριστομένης ὁ Κίμων ὁ Ἐπαμεινώνδας· καὶ γὰρ οὗτος ἐρωμένους ἔσχεν Ἀσώπιχον[3] καὶ Καφισόδωρον, ὃς αὐτῷ συναπέθανεν ἐν Μαντινείᾳ καὶ τέθαπται πλησίον· τὸν δ' Ἀσώπιχον[4] φοβερώτατον[5] γενόμενον τοῖς πολεμίοις καὶ δεινότατον ὁ πρῶτος ὑποστὰς καὶ πατάξας Εὔκναμος Ἀμφισσεὺς ἡρωικὰς ἔσχε τιμὰς παρὰ Φωκεῦσιν.

"Ἡρακλέους δὲ τοὺς μὲν ἄλλους ἔρωτας ἔργον ἐστὶν εἰπεῖν διὰ πλῆθος· Ἰόλαον δὲ νομίζοντες ἐρώμενον αὐτοῦ γεγονέναι μέχρι νῦν σέβονται καὶ E τιμῶσιν οἱ ἐρῶντες[6] ὅρκους τε καὶ πίστεις ἐπὶ τοῦ τάφου παρὰ τῶν ἐρωμένων λαμβάνοντες. λέγεται δὲ καὶ τὴν Ἄλκηστιν ἰατρικὸς ὢν ἀπεγνωσμένην σῶσαι τῷ Ἀδμήτῳ χαριζόμενος, ἐρῶντι μὲν αὐτῷ τῆς γυναικός, ἐρωμένου δ' αὐτοῦ γενομένου· καὶ

[1] ὅπως μὴ added by Bernardakis.
[2] ἴδῃ Xylander: ἥδῃ.
[3] Ἀσώπιχον Reiske: ἀσωπικὸν.
[4] δ' Ἀσώπιχον Bernardakis: δὲ μω with lacuna MSS.
[5] φοβερώτατον Reiske: φοβερώτερον.
[6] οἱ ἐρῶντες Wachendorf: ἔρωτος.





face and an enemy was about to kill him, he begged the latter to wait for a moment in order that his beloved might not see him wounded from behind.[a]

"It is not only the most warlike peoples, Boeotians, Spartans, Cretans, who are the most susceptible to love, but also the great heroes of old, Meleager, Achilles,[b] Aristomenes, Cimon,[c] Epaminondas. Epaminondas, in fact, loved two young men, Asopichus and Caphisodorus. The latter died with him at Mantineia and is buried close to him; while Asopichos showed himself a most formidable warrior and so redoubtable to his foes that the first man who stood up to him and struck back, Eucnamus of Amphissa, received heroic honours among the Phocians.

"As for Heracles, it would be difficult to list all his loves, they are so numerous. For example, believing Iolaüs to have been beloved by him, to this very day lovers worship and honour Iolaüs, exchanging vows and pledges with their beloved at his tomb.[d] It is also related that Heracles exhibited his talent for healing by rescuing Alcestis from a mortal disease to please Admetus, who was not only in love with his wife, but had also been Heracles' beloved. In

[a] *Life of Pelopidas*, xviii (287 D). [b] See 751 C *supra*.
[c] *Life of Cimon*, iv (481 B f.). Meleager and Cimon, so far as we know, were inspired by the love of women. In literature Achilles is sometimes bisexual, Epaminondas is not. Nothing is known of Aristomenes' proclivities, though Plutarch, since he wrote a life of him, as well as one of Epaminondas, was doubtless well informed.
[d] The shrine was still standing in Pausanias' day (ix. 23. 1), shortly after Plutarch's. See also *Life of Pelopidas*, xviii (287 D). For another and more miraculous shrine of Iolaüs see Diodorus, iv. 24. 4; and for the connexions of Iolaüs and Thespiae Diodorus, iv. 29. 4.

(761) γὰρ τὸν Ἀπόλλωνα μυθολογοῦσιν ἐραστὴν γενόμενον

Ἀδμήτῳ πάρα θητεῦσαι[1] μέγαν εἰς ἐνιαυτόν.

" Εὖ δέ πως ἐπὶ μνήμην ἦλθεν ἡμῖν Ἄλκηστις· Ἄρεος γὰρ οὐ πάνυ μέτεστι γυναικί, ἡ δ' ἐξ Ἔρωτος κατοχὴ προάγεταί τι τολμᾶν παρὰ φύσιν καὶ[2] ἀποθνήσκειν. εἰ δέ πού[3] τι καὶ μύθων πρὸς πίστιν ὄφελός ἐστι, δηλοῖ τὰ περὶ Ἄλκηστιν καὶ
F Πρωτεσίλεων καὶ Εὐρυδίκην τὴν Ὀρφέως, ὅτι μόνῳ θεῶν ὁ Ἅιδης Ἔρωτι ποιεῖ τὸ προσταττόμενον· καίτοι πρός γε τοὺς ἄλλους, ὥς φησι Σοφοκλῆς, ἅπαντας

οὔτε τοὐπιεικὲς οὔτε τὴν χάριν
οἶδεν, μόνην δ' ἔστερξε[4] τὴν ἁπλῶς δίκην·

αἰδεῖται δὲ τοὺς ἐρῶντας καὶ μόνοις τούτοις οὐκ ἔστιν ἀδάμαστος οὐδ' ἀμείλιχος. ὅθεν ἀγαθὸν μέν, ὦ ἑταῖρε, τῆς ἐν Ἐλευσῖνι τελετῆς μετασχεῖν· ἐγὼ
762 δ' ὁρῶ τοῖς Ἔρωτος ὀργιασταῖς καὶ μύσταις ἐν Ἅιδου βελτίονα μοῖραν οὖσαν, οὔτι τοῖς μύθοις πειθόμενος οὐ μὴν οὐδ' ἀπιστῶν παντάπασιν· εἰ γὰρ δὴ λέγουσι, καὶ θείᾳ τινὶ τύχῃ ψαύουσι τἀληθοῦς οἱ[5] λέγοντες κἀξ Ἅιδου[6] τοῖς ἐρωτικοῖς ἄνοδον εἰς φῶς ὑπάρχειν, ὅπη δὲ καὶ ὅπως ἀγνοοῦσιν

[1] πάρα θητεῦσαι Stephanus : παραθητεῦσαι.
[2] καὶ] καὶ δὴ καὶ ?
[3] δέ που Reiske : δήπου.
[4] δ' ἔστερξε Ritschl : δὲ στέρξαι.
[5] ἀληθοῦς οἱ added by Reiske.
[6] κἀξ Ἅιδου W. C. H. after Xylander : ἐξ ἄλλου.





fact, Apollo also was Admetus' lover according to the tale :

He served Admetus for a mighty year.[a]

" It is fortunate that I mentioned the name of Alcestis. Women have no part at all in Ares ; but if Love possesses them, it leads them to acts of courage beyond the bounds of nature, even to die.[b] If it is ever any use to cite the evidence of mythology, we may learn from the tales about Alcestis and Protesilaüs and Orpheus' Eurydicê that Love is the only one of the gods whose commands are obeyed by Hades. As for all the others, as Sophocles[c] says,

He knows no kindness and no favour,
But is content with justice unadorned.

To lovers, however, he shows respect ; for them alone he ceases to be ' inflexible, implacable.'[d] So though it is true, my friend, that it is a good thing to be initiated into the mysteries[e] at Eleusis, I observe that celebrants of Love's mysteries have a higher place in Hades. It isn't that I'm completely persuaded by old tales, yet I cannot withhold from them some credence. They do well to say—and indeed by some divine chance they touch the truth when they say—that lovers are able to return to the light even from Hades. It is true that they do not know where

[a] Another line of unknown origin, which was formerly attributed to Callimachus (Schneider, frag. anon. 380), but is now rejected by Pfeiffer. For this Alexandrian version of the famous tale of Admetus see K. F. Smith on Tibullus, ii. 3. 11. See also *Life of Numa*, iv (62 c) ; *Mor.* 417 E-F.
[b] *Cf.* 769 B *infra*.
[c] Frag. 703 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 298).
[d] Homer, *Iliad*, ix. 158.
[e] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedo*, 69 c.

(762) ὥσπερ ἀτραποῦ διαμαρτόντες ἦν πρῶτος ἀνθρώπων διὰ φιλοσοφίας Πλάτων κατεῖδε. καίτοι λεπταί τινες ἀπορροαὶ καὶ ἀμυδραὶ τῆς ἀληθείας ἔνεισι ταῖς Αἰγυπτίων ἐνδιεσπαρμέναι μυθολογίαις, ἀλλ' ἰχνηλάτου δεινοῦ δέονται καὶ μεγάλα μικροῖς ἐλεῖν δυναμένου.

B "Διὸ ταῦτα μὲν ἐῶμεν, μετὰ δὲ τὴν ἰσχὺν τοῦ Ἔρωτος οὖσαν τοσαύτην ἤδη τὴν πρὸς ἀνθρώπους εὐμένειαν καὶ χάριν ἐπισκοπῶμεν,[1] οὐκ εἰ πολλὰ τοῖς ἐρωμένοις[2] ἀγαθὰ περιποιεῖ (δῆλα γάρ ἐστι ταῦτά γε πᾶσιν) ἀλλ' εἰ πλείονα καὶ μείζονα τοὺς ἐρῶντας αὐτοὺς[3] ὀνίνησιν· ἐπεί, καίπερ ὢν ἐρωτικὸς ὁ Εὐριπίδης, τὸ σμικρότατον ἀπεθαύμασεν εἰπών,[4]

ποιητὴν ἄρα
Ἔρως διδάσκει, κἂν ἄμουσος ᾖ τὸ πρίν.

συνετόν τε γὰρ ποιεῖ, κἂν ῥάθυμος ᾖ τὸ πρίν[5]· καὶ ἀνδρεῖον, ἢ λέλεκται, τὸν ἄτολμον, ὥσπερ οἱ τὰ ξύλα πυρακτοῦντες ἐκ μαλακῶν ἰσχυρὰ ποιοῦσι. δωρητικὸς δὲ καὶ ἁπλοῦς καὶ μεγαλόφρων γίνεται
C πᾶς ἐραστής, κἂν γλίσχρος ᾖ πρότερον, τῆς μικρολογίας καὶ φιλαργυρίας δίκην σιδήρου διὰ πυρὸς ἀνιεμένης· ὥστε χαίρειν τοῖς ἐρωμένοις διδόντας, ὡς παρ' ἑτέρων οὐ χαίρουσιν αὐτοὶ λαμβάνοντες.

"Ἴστε γὰρ δήπου, ὡς Ἀνύτῳ τῷ[6] Ἀνθεμίωνος, ἐρῶντι μὲν Ἀλκιβιάδου ξένους δ' ἑστιῶντι φιλο-

[1] ἐπισκοπῶμεν Xylander : ἐπισκοπῶ.
[2] ἐρωμένοις Meziriacus : χρωμένοις.
[3] αὐτοὺς Amyot : αὐτοῦ.
[4] εἰπὼν Valckenaer : ἐπεὶ.
[5] πρὶν Aldine edition : πρᾶγμα.
[6] τῷ added by Wyttenbach.





and how this was accomplished; they missed the path, as it were, that Plato through his philosophy was the first of all human beings to discern. There are, however, dim, faint effluvia of the truth scattered about in Egyptian mythology, but a man needs a keen wit to track them down, one which can draw important conclusions from tiny scraps of evidence.[a]

" Let us, then, leave this subject. Now that we have seen how great is the power of Love, let us next examine his kindness and his favours to mankind. I am not speaking about the many benefits which he procures for those who are loved (these are perfectly obvious to everybody); I mean the even greater and more numerous benefits that he bestows on lovers themselves. Euripides,[b] though experienced in love, marvels only at the least of them when he says

Love will be the poet's teacher,
Though he knew nothing of the Muse before.

For love makes a man clever, even if he was slow-witted before; and, as we noted, the coward brave, just as men make soft wood tough by hardening it in the fire. Every lover becomes generous, single-hearted, highminded, even though he was miserly before. His meanness and avarice are melted away like iron in the fire, so that he is made happier giving to those he loves than he is made by receiving gifts from others himself.

" Of course, you know the tale of Anthemion's son Anytus, a lover of Alcibiades.[c] He was lavishly and

[a] We return to this subject in 764 A *infra*.
[b] Frag. 663, from the notorious *Stheneboea* (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 569); *cf. Mor.* 405 E-F; 622 C; Plato, *Symposium*, 196 E.
[c] See the *Life of Alcibiades*, iv (193 D-E).

(762) τίμως καὶ λαμπρῶς, ἐπεκώμασεν ὁ Ἀλκιβιάδης καὶ λαβὼν ἀπὸ τῆς τραπέζης εἰς ἥμισυ τῶν ἐκπωμάτων ἀπῆλθεν. ἀχθομένων δὲ τῶν ξένων καὶ λεγόντων, 'ὑβριστικῶς σοι κέχρηται καὶ ὑπερηφάνως τὸ μειράκιον,' 'φιλανθρώπως μὲν οὖν,' ὁ Ἄνυτος εἶπε· 'πάντα γὰρ ἐνῆν αὐτῷ λαβεῖν, ὁ δὲ κἀμοὶ τοσαῦτα καταλέλοιπεν.'"

D 18. Ἡσθεὶς οὖν ὁ Ζεύξιππος, "ὦ Ἡράκλεις," εἶπεν, "ὡς ὀλίγου διελύσατο πρὸς Ἄνυτον τὴν ἀπὸ Σωκράτους καὶ φιλοσοφίας πατρικὴν ἔχθραν, εἰ πρᾶος ἦν οὕτω περὶ ἔρωτα καὶ γενναῖος."

"Εἶεν," εἶπεν ὁ πατήρ· "ἐκ δὲ δυσκόλων καὶ σκυθρωπῶν τοῖς συνοῦσιν οὐ[1] ποιεῖ φιλανθρωποτέρους καὶ ἡδίους; 'αἰθομένου' γὰρ 'πυρὸς γεραρώτερον οἶκον ἰδέσθαι' καὶ ἄνθρωπον ὡς ἔοικε φαιδρότερον ὑπὸ τῆς ἐρωτικῆς θερμότητος. ἀλλ' οἱ πολλοὶ παράλογόν τι πεπόνθασιν· ἂν μὲν ἐν οἰκίᾳ νύκτωρ σέλας ἴδωσι, θεῖον ἡγοῦνται καὶ θαυμά-

E ζουσι· ψυχὴν δὲ μικρὰν καὶ ταπεινὴν καὶ ἀγεννῆ ὁρῶντες ἐξαίφνης ὑποπιμπλαμένην φρονήματος, ἐλευθερίας, φιλοτιμίας, χάριτος, ἀφειδίας, οὐκ ἀναγκάζονται λέγειν ὡς ὁ Τηλέμαχος

ἦ μάλα τις θεὸς ἔνδον.

ἐκεῖνο δ'," εἶπεν, "ὦ Δαφναῖε,[2] πρὸς Χαρίτων οὐ δαιμόνιον; ὅτι τῶν ἄλλων ὁ ἐρωτικὸς ὀλίγου

[1] οὐ Winckelmann : εὖ.
[2] ὦ Δαφναῖε Wyttenbach : ὁ Δαφναῖος.

[a] Anytus was the chief prosecutor of Socrates.
[b] See *Mor.* 100 D. The verse is attributed to Homer in the *Contest of Homer and Hesiod*, 274.





sumptuously entertaining strangers at a banquet when Alcibiades stormed drunkenly in, took about half the goblets from the table, and went away. The strangers were annoyed and said, 'How insolently, how contemptuously, that boy treats you!' 'Not at all,' said Anytus. 'It was very kind of him when he might have taken all the cups to leave me as many as he did.'"

18. Zeuxippus was delighted and remarked, "Good heavens, how near it comes to making me renounce my ancestral feud with Anytus, deriving as it does from his treatment of Socrates[a] and philosophy, if in a love affair Anytus could behave so like a well-bred gentleman!"

"Very well then," said my father. "Doesn't Love change the ill-tempered and sullen and make them more sociable and agreeable?

When hearth's ablaze, a house appears more cheerful[b];

likewise a man seems to become more radiant through the heat of love. But people react irrationally: if they see a light blazing in the house at night, they consider it supernatural and marvel at it; but when they observe a mean, base, ignoble soul suddenly invaded by high thoughts, liberality, aspiration, kindness, generosity, they are not compelled to cry out with Telemachus,

Surely some god is within![c]

By all the Graces, Daphnaeus," he asked, "is not this wonderful? I mean the fact that a man in love

[c] Homer, *Odyssey*, xix. 40: Telemachus perceives the light, a sign of Athena's presence. *Cf.* a fragment of Plutarch, 34. 1 (Bernardakis, vol. vii, p. 150).

(762) δεῖν ἁπάντων περιφρονῶν, οὐ μόνον ἑταίρων καὶ οἰκείων,[1] ἀλλὰ καὶ νόμων καὶ ἀρχόντων καὶ βασιλέων, φοβούμενος δὲ μηδὲν μηδὲ θαυμάζων μηδὲ θεραπεύων, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸν ' αἰχματὰν κεραυνὸν ' οἷος ὢν ὑπομένειν, ἅμα τῷ τὸν καλὸν ἰδεῖν

ἔπτηξ' ἀλέκτωρ δοῦλον ὡς κλίνας πτερόν,

καὶ τὸ θράσος ἐκκέκλασται[2] καὶ κατακέκοπταί οἱ
F τὸ τῆς ψυχῆς γαῦρον.

" "Αξιον δὲ Σαπφοῦς[3] παρὰ ταῖς Μούσαις μνημονεῦσαι· τὸν μὲν γὰρ Ἡφαίστου παῖδα Ῥωμαῖοι Κᾶκον[4] ἱστοροῦσι πῦρ καὶ φλόγας ἀφιέναι διὰ τοῦ στόματος ἔξω ῥεούσας· αὕτη δ' ἀληθῶς μεμιγμένα πυρὶ φθέγγεται καὶ διὰ τῶν μελῶν ἀναφέρει τὴν ἀπὸ τῆς καρδίας θερμότητα

Μούσαις εὐφώνοις ἰωμένη τὸν ἔρωτα

763 κατὰ Φιλόξενον. ἀλλ' εἴ τι μὴ διὰ Λυσάνδραν,[5] ὦ Δαφναῖε, τῶν παλαιῶν ἐκλέλησαι παιδικῶν,[6] ἀνάμνησον ἡμᾶς, ἐν οἷς ἡ καλὴ Σαπφὼ λέγει τῆς ἐρωμένης ἐπιφανείσης τήν τε φωνὴν ἴσχεσθαι καὶ φλέγεσθαι[7] τὸ σῶμα καὶ καταλαμβάνειν ὠχρότητα καὶ πλάνον αὐτὴν[8] καὶ ἴλιγγον."

[1] οἰκείων Bernardakis : οἰκετῶν. [2] κατακέκλασται Post.
[3] Σαπφοῦς Basel edition : σαφῶς.
[4] Κᾶκον Goettling : κακὸν.
[5] διὰ Λυσάνδραν Xylander : λύσανδρον.
[6] παιδικῶν Xylander : παιδίων.
[7] φλέγεσθαι Xylander φθέγγεσθαι.
[8] αὐτὴν Basel edition : αὐτὴ.

[a] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 252 A. [b] Pindar, *Pyth.* i. 5.
[c] Phrynichus, frag. 17 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 724); *cf. Life of Alcibiades*, iv (193 c); *Life of Pelopidas*, xxix (293 F).





thinks little of practically everything else, not merely companions and relatives, but even laws and magistrates and kings.[a] He fears nothing, he admires nothing, he pays service to nothing. He's capable of braving ' even the Thunderbolt, the spear-wielder '[b]; but once he catches sight of the handsome boy,

He flinches like a cock that droops his vanquished wing.[c]

His confidence is broken to bits and the pride of his soul is overthrown.

" Being, as we are, at the Muses' shrine, it is only right and proper to mention Sappho. Roman writers[d] relate that Cacus, the son of Hephaestus, emitted torrents of fire and flame that poured from his mouth. In the same way Sappho speaks words mingled truly with fire; through her song she communicates the heat of her heart,

With sweet-voiced Muses healing her love,

as Philoxenus[e] says. Now, Daphnaeus, if through the influence of Lysandra you have not completely forgotten your old loves,[f] recite for us the ode in which the fair Sappho[g] describes how her voice is lost and her body burns; how she turns pale, reels, and grows giddy when her beloved appears."

[d] *e.g.* Virgil, *Aeneid*, viii. 199.
[e] Frag. 7 Diehl; 6 Edmonds (*Lyra Graeca*, iii, p. 388). Curiously enough in Philoxenus it is the Cyclops who is healing his love: *Mor.* 622 c; *Scholia ad Theocr.* xi. 1.
[f] See 752 D *supra*. It appears also from 765 E *infra* that Daphnaeus has given considerable attention to the interpretation of Lesbian love poetry.
[g] Sappho 2, the most famous of her extant works, though we have only three stanzas, as had apparently Catullus (51) also. *Cf. Mor.* 81 D; *Life of Demetrius*, xxxviii, 907 B.

(763) Λεχθέντων οὖν ὑπὸ τοῦ Δαφναίου τῶν μελῶν ἐκείνων, " ὡς . . . " ὑπολαβὼν ὁ πατήρ, " ταῦτ,' " εἶπεν, " ὦ πρὸς τοῦ Διός, οὐ[1] θεοληψία καταφανής; οὗτος οὐ δαιμόνιος σάλος τῆς ψυχῆς; τί τοσοῦτον ἡ Πυθία πέπονθεν ἁψαμένη τοῦ τρίποδος; τίνα τῶν ἐνθεαζομένων οὕτως ὁ αὐλὸς καὶ τὰ μητρῷα
B καὶ τὸ τύμπανον ἐξίστησιν;

" Καὶ μὴν[2] ταὐτὸ σῶμα πολλοὶ καὶ ταὐτὸ κάλλος ὁρῶσιν, εἵληπται δ' εἷς ὁ ἐρωτικός· διὰ τίν'[3] αἰτίαν; οὐ γὰρ μανθάνομέν γέ που τοῦ Μενάνδρου λέγοντος οὐδὲ συνίεμεν,[4]

καιρός ἐστιν ἢ[5] νόσος
ψυχῆς, ὁ πληγεὶς δ' οὖν ἑκὼν[6] τιτρώσκεται·

ἀλλ' ὁ θεὸς αἴτιος τοῦ μὲν καθαψάμενος τὸν δ' ἐάσας.

" Ὁ τοίνυν ἐν ἀρχῇ καιρὸν εἶχε ῥηθῆναι μᾶλλον, οὐδὲ νῦν ' ὅτι[7] νῦν[8] ἦλθεν ἐπὶ στόμα ' κατ' Αἰσχύλον, ἄρρητον[9] ἐάσειν μοι δοκῶ· καὶ γάρ ἐστι παμμέγε-
θες. ἴσως μὲν γάρ, ὦ ἑταῖρε, καὶ τῶν ἄλλων
C ἁπάντων, ὅσα μὴ δι' αἰσθήσεως ἡμῖν εἰς ἔννοιαν ἥκει,[10] τὰ μὲν μύθῳ τὰ δὲ νόμῳ τὰ δὲ λόγῳ πίστιν ἐξ ἀρχῆς ἔσχηκε· τῆς δ' οὖν περὶ θεῶν δόξης[11] παντάπασιν ἡγεμόνες καὶ διδάσκαλοι γεγόνασιν ἡμῖν οἵ τε ποιηταὶ καὶ οἱ νομοθέται καὶ τρίτον οἱ

[1] οὐ added by Meziriacus.
[2] καὶ μὴν Wyttenbach : ἡμῖν.
[3] τίνα Wyttenbach : τὴν.
[4] συνίεμεν Wyttenbach : σύνιμεν.
[5] ἢ Post : ἡ.
[6] οὖν ἑκὼν added by Post (*Amer. Jour. Phil.* lxxvii, 1956, p. 217) to fill a lacuna : εἶσω δὴ Stobaeus.
[7] ὅτι Nauck : ἐπὶ. [8] νῦν Winckelmann : νοῦν.





When Daphnaeus had recited these verses,[a] my father resumed. " In heaven's name," he asked, " is not this a plain case of divine possession ? Is it not a supernatural agitation of the soul ? Is the disturbance of the Pythia grasping her tripod so great ? Do the flute, the tambourine, the hymns to Cybelê, cause so much ecstasy in any of the devotees ?

" Moreover, while many behold the same body and the identical beauty, only one, the lover, is seized by it. Why ? For surely we are not instructed by Menander [b] nor do we understand when he says,

It's malady of mind that turns the scale ;
Right gladly is the wounded pricked by love ;

rather, it is the god that makes the difference by pouncing on one and letting another go free.

" There is something that might better have been stated at the beginning, but even now—

Since only now has it come to my lips,

as Aeschylus [c] says—since it is very important, I do not believe that I shall leave it unspoken. Perhaps, my friend, our belief in all our notions, except those derived from the senses, comes from three sources : myth, law, and rational explanation ; so it is undoubtedly the poets, the legislators, and thirdly the philosophers who have been our guides and teachers

[a] There is a long lacuna in the MSS., as though for the verses to be inserted.
[b] Frag. 541. 7-8 (Kock, *Com. Att. Frag.* iii, p. 163 ; frag 568 Körte) ; *cf.* Plutarch, frag. 25 (Bernardakis, vol. vii, pp. 130 f.).
[c] Frag. 351 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 105).

[9] ἄρρητον Meziriacus : ἄριστον.
[10] ἥκει Xylander : στήκει. [11] δόξης Reiske: δόξης καὶ.

(763) φιλόσοφοι, τὸ μὲν[1] εἶναι θεοὺς ὁμοίως τιθέμενοι, πλήθους δὲ πέρι καὶ τάξεως αὐτῶν οὐσίας τε καὶ δυνάμεως μεγάλα διαφερόμενοι πρὸς ἀλλήλους. ἐκεῖνοι μὲν γὰρ οἱ τῶν φιλοσόφων

ἄνοσοι καὶ ἀγήραοι
πόνων τ' ἄπειροι, βαρυβόαν
πορθμὸν πεφευγότες Ἀχέροντος·

ὅθεν οὐ[2] προσίενται ποιητικὰς Ἔριδας οὐ Λιτάς, οὐ Δεῖμον οὐδὲ Φόβον ἐθέλουσι θεοὺς εἶναι καὶ[3] παῖδας Ἄρεος ὁμολογεῖν· μάχονται δὲ περὶ πολλῶν καὶ τοῖς νομοθέταις, ὥσπερ Ξενοφάνης Αἰγυπτίους
D ἐκέλευσε τὸν Ὄσιριν, εἰ θνητὸν νομίζουσι, μὴ τιμᾶν ὡς θεόν, εἰ δὲ θεὸν ἡγοῦνται μὴ θρηνεῖν. αὖθις δὲ ποιηταὶ καὶ νομοθέται, φιλοσόφων ἰδέας τινὰς καὶ ἀριθμοὺς μονάδας τε καὶ πνεύματα θεοὺς ποιουμένων, οὔτ' ἀκούειν ὑπομένουσιν οὔτε συνιέναι δύνανται.

" Πολλὴν δ' ὅλως ἀνωμαλίαν ἔχουσιν αἱ δόξαι καὶ διαφοράν. ὥσπερ οὖν ἦσάν ποτε τρεῖς στάσεις Ἀθήνησι, Παράλων Ἐπακρίων[4] Πεδιέων, χαλεπῶς ἔχουσαι καὶ διαφερόμεναι πρὸς ἀλλήλας· ἔπειτα[5] δὲ πάντες ἐν ταὐτῷ γενόμενοι καὶ τὰς ψήφους λαβόντες ἤνεγκαν πάσας Σόλωνι, καὶ τοῦτον εἵ-
E λοντο κοινῇ διαλλακτὴν καὶ ἄρχοντα καὶ νομοθέτην,

[1] μὲν Reiske : μὲν οὖν. [2] ὅθεν οὐ Basel edition : ὅθεν.
[3] καὶ added by Bernardakis.
[4] Ἐπακρίων Xylander : ἐπάκρων.
[5] ἔπειτα Madvig : ἐπεί.

[a] Pindar, frag. 147 Turyn ; 143 Schroeder and Sandys ; 131 Bowra. *Cf. Mor.* 167 E, 1075 A.
[b] Hesiod, *Works and Days*, 11-26 ; Homer, *Iliad*, ix. 502-512.





in what we think about the gods. They are alike in stating that gods exist ; but they hold widely varying views about their number and rank, as well as their nature and function. Now the philosophers believe that the gods are

Untroubled by illness or age,
Free from toil, spared the hoarse passage of Acheron.[a]

For this reason they do not admit the Strifes and the Prayers[b] of the poets, nor do they allow Fear and Panic to be gods or acknowledged as the children of Ares.[c] They are at variance on many points with the legislators, as when Xenophanes[d] told the Egyptians not to honour Osiris as a god if they thought he was mortal, or not to weep for him if they believed him a god. On the other hand, when the philosophers[e] put forth as gods certain patterns and numbers, monads and spirits, the poets and legislators haven't the patience to listen to them, nor are they able to understand what is meant.

" In short, their opinions have considerable variety and much divergence. Once upon a time there were three factions in Athens,[f] of the Coast, the Hills, and the Plain. They had much enmity and many differences with each other ; but they subsequently compromised to give all their votes to Solon. They jointly elected him mediator, chief magistrate, and

[c] Homer, *Iliad*, xiii. 299 ; xv. 119. *Cf.* Plato's diatribe (*Republic*, 377 ff.) against the licence of the poets and the evil effects on the young caused by their irresponsible lore : see especially 379 E, 387 B-C, 388 B.
[d] Frag. A 13 (Diels, *Frag. der Vorsok.*[7], i, p. 115 ; *cf.* Heraclitus, frag. B 127, Diels i, p. 180). See also *Mor.* 171 D-E ; 228 E ; 379 B.
[e] Such as Xenocrates, the Pythagoreans and Stoics.
[f] *Mor.* 805 D-E ; *Life of Solon*, xiii ff. (85 A ff.).

(763) ὃς ἔδοξε τῆς ἀρετῆς ἔχειν ἀδηρίτως τὸ πρωτεῖον· οὕτως αἱ τρεῖς στάσεις αἱ περὶ θεῶν διχοφρονοῦσαι καὶ ψῆφον ἄλλην ἄλλη φέρουσαι καὶ μὴ δεχόμεναι ῥᾳδίως τὸν ἐξ ἑτέρας περὶ ἑνὸς βεβαίως ὁμογνωμονοῦσι καὶ κοινῇ τὸν Ἔρωτα συνεγγράφουσιν εἰς θεοὺς ποιητῶν οἱ κράτιστοι καὶ νομοθετῶν καὶ φιλοσόφων ' ἀθρόᾳ φωνᾷ[1] μέγ' ἐπαίνεντες,'[2] ὥσπερ ἔφη, ' τὸν Πιττακὸν ' ὁ Ἀλκαῖος αἱρεῖσθαι τοὺς Μυτιληναίους ' τύραννον.' ἡμῖν δὲ βασιλεὺς καὶ ἄρχων καὶ ἁρμοστὴς ὁ Ἔρως ὑφ' Ἡσιόδου καὶ Πλάτωνος καὶ Σόλωνος ἀπὸ τοῦ Ἑλικῶνος εἰς τὴν
F Ἀκαδήμειαν ἐστεφανωμένος κατάγεται καὶ κεκοσμημένος εἰσελαύνει πολλαῖς συνωρίσι φιλίας καὶ κοινωνίας, οὐχ οἵαν Εὐριπίδης φησὶν

ἀχαλκεύτοισιν ἐζεῦχθαι πέδαις,

ψυχρὰν οὗτός γε καὶ βαρεῖαν ἐν χρείᾳ περιβαλὼν ὑπ' αἰσχύνης ἀνάγκην, ἀλλ' ὑποπτέρου φερομένης ἐπὶ τὰ κάλλιστα τῶν ὄντων καὶ θειότατα,[3] περὶ ὧν ἑτέροις εἴρηται βέλτιον."

764 19. Εἰπόντος δὲ ταῦτα τοῦ πατρός, ὁ Σώκλαρος, " ὁρᾷς," εἶπεν, " ὅτι δεύτερον ἤδη τοῖς αὐτοῖς περιπεσών, οὐκ οἶδ' ὅπως βίᾳ σαυτὸν[4] ἀπάγεις καὶ ἀποστρέφεις,[5] οὐ δικαίως χρεωκοπῶν, εἴ γε δεῖ τὸ

[1] ἀθρόᾳ φωνᾷ Reiske : ἀθρόαι φωναί.
[2] ἐπαίνεντες Ahrens : ἐπαινέοντες.
[3] θειότατα Reiske : θειότερα.
[4] βίᾳ σαυτὸν Winckelmann : βίαις αὐτὸν E ; βίαις B.
[5] ἀπάγεις καὶ ἀποστρέφεις Reiske : ἀπάγει καὶ ἀποστραφείς.

[a] Frag. 37 a Diehl (i, p. 427); 160 Edmonds (*Lyra Graeca* i, p. 418).
[b] As the most eminent of poets, philosophers, legislators.





legislator, since he seemed indisputably to hold the palm of virtue. In just the same way the three factions who theorize about the gods are at variance : they differ in their votes and find it difficult to accept each other's candidates. Yet there is one god about whom all firmly agree. The most eminent of poets, legislators, philosophers, join together in enrolling Love among the gods

With one voice of great approval,

as Alcaeus [a] says the people of Mitylenê elected Pittacus tyrant. So we see Love chosen as king, chief magistrate, and harmonizer by Hesiod, Plato, Solon.[b] He is brought down with a crown on his head from Helicon to the Academy. Richly adorned, he is given a triumphal procession in which there are many two-horse chariots bound in a communion of love—not such as Euripides [c] describes,

Yoked in bonds not forged by metal,

for he is imposing a cold constraint that is oppressive in practice because of shame. No, this is a winged communion that soars to the region of the fairest and most divine realities. But of these, others [d] have spoken better than I."

19. When my father had concluded his remarks, Soclarus asked, " Don't you see that this is now the second time that, when you encounter the same subject, you make a detour and somehow break off violently and turn your back on it ? If I may speak my mind, it's not giving due justice to the argument,

[c] Frag. 595 (Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 549); *cf. Mor.* 96 c, 482 A, 533 A.
[d] Plato, no doubt, in the *Phaedrus* and the *Symposium.*

(764) φαινόμενον εἰπεῖν, ἱερὸν ὄντα τὸν λόγον; καὶ γὰρ
ἄρτι τοῦ Πλάτωνος ἅμα καὶ τῶν Αἰγυπτίων ὥσπερ
ἄκων ἁψάμενος παρῆλθες καὶ νῦν ταὐτὰ ποιεῖς.
τὰ μὲν οὖν ' ἀριζήλως εἰρημένα ' Πλάτωνι, μᾶλλον
δὲ ταῖς θεαῖς ταύταις διὰ Πλάτωνος, ὦγαθέ, ' μηδ'
ἂν κελεύωμεν εἴπῃς '· ᾗ δ' ὑπῃνίξω τὸν Αἰγυπτίων
μῦθον εἰς ταὐτὰ τοῖς Πλατωνικοῖς συμφέρεσθαι
περὶ Ἔρωτος, οὐκέτ' ἔστι[1] σοι μὴ διακαλύψαι μηδὲ
B διαφῆναι πρὸς ἡμᾶς· ἀγαπήσομεν δέ, κἂν μικρὰ
περὶ μεγάλων ἀκούσωμεν."

Δεομένων δὲ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἔφη ὁ πατὴρ ὡς
Αἰγύπτιοι δύο μὲν Ἕλλησι παραπλησίως Ἔρωτας,
τόν τε πάνδημον καὶ τὸν οὐράνιον, ἴσασι, τρίτον δὲ
νομίζουσιν Ἔρωτα τὸν ἥλιον, Ἀφροδίτην . . .
ἔχουσι μάλα σεβάσμιον.

" Ἡμεῖς δὲ πολλὴν μὲν Ἔρωτος ὁμοιότητα πρὸς
τὸν ἥλιον[2] ὁρῶμεν οὖσαν· πῦρ μὲν γὰρ οὐδέτερός[3]
ἐστιν ὥσπερ οἴονταί τινες, αὐγὴ[4] δὲ καὶ θερμότης
γλυκεῖα καὶ γόνιμος, καὶ[5] ἡ μὲν ἀπ' ἐκείνου φερο-
μένη σώματι παρέχει τροφὴν καὶ φῶς καὶ αὔξησιν,
ἡ δ' ἀπὸ τούτου ψυχαῖς. ὡς δ' ἥλιος ἐκ νεφῶν καὶ
C μεθ' ὁμίχλην θερμότερος, οὕτως Ἔρως μετ' ὀργὰς[6]
καὶ ζηλοτυπίας ἐρωμένου διαλλαγέντος ἡδίων καὶ
δριμύτερος· ἔτι[7] δ' ὥσπερ ἥλιον ἅπτεσθαι καὶ σβέν-

[1] ἔστι added by Winckelmann.
[2] τὸν ἥλιον Xylander and Stephanus: τὴν γῆν.
[3] οὐδέτερος Hubert: οὐδέτερον.
[4] αὐγὴ Wyttenbach: αὐ. [5] καὶ added by Wyttenbach.
[6] ὀργὰς Xylander: ὀργῆς. [7] ἔτι Stephanus: ὅτι.

[a] 762 A *supra.*
[b] Homer, *Odyssey*, xii. 453; quoted more fully in *Mor.* 504 D.
[c] The Muses.
[d] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 235 D.





which is a holy thing. In fact, just a moment ago[a] you touched, as though unwillingly, upon Plato and the Egyptians, then turned aside; and now you are doing the same thing. To be sure, as far as Plato's ' well-known utterances '[b] are concerned—or rather, my friend, those utterances of the goddesses[c] through the mouth of Plato—don't rehearse them ' even if we beg you to do so.'[d] But as for your hint that the Egyptian tales bear a resemblance to the Platonic doctrine of Love, you can no longer avoid revealing and expounding to us your meaning; and we shall be perfectly content if we hear only ' tiny scraps of evidence ' about ' important conclusions.' "[e]

The others added their entreaties, whereupon my father said that the Egyptians recognize two Loves, just as the Greeks do, Uranios and Pandemos,[f] but they believe that the sun is a third Love; Aphroditê[g] . . . they reverence greatly.

" We also observe that there is considerable similarity between Eros and the sun. Neither of them is really fire, as some think, but a radiance[h] of sweet and fertile warmth. The radiance that proceeds from the sun gives nourishment, light, and the power of growth to the body, while the gleaming ray from Love does the same for the souls. The sun is warmer after a fog or upon emerging from clouds; so after rages and jealousies a reconciliation with the beloved makes love sweeter and more pungent. Then too, just as some believe that the sun is both illumined

[e] Quoting Plutarch's remarks in 762 A *supra.*
[f] Heavenly and Vulgar, or Earthly.
[g] Here there is probably a lacuna, though none is indicated in the MSS. Hubert supplies " and they call Aphroditê the moon and the earth and her . . . "
[h] *Cf.* Plato, *Republic*, 509 B.

(764) νυσθαι δοκοῦσιν ἔνιοι, ταὐτὰ καὶ περὶ Ἔρωτος ὡς θνητοῦ καὶ ἀβεβαίου διανοοῦνται. καὶ μὴν οὔτε σώματος ἀγύμναστος ἕξις ἥλιον, οὔτ' Ἔρωτα δύναται φέρειν ἀλύπως τρόπος ἀπαιδεύτου ψυχῆς· ἐξίσταται δ' ὁμοίως ἑκάτερον καὶ νοσεῖ, τὴν τοῦ θεοῦ δύναμιν οὐ τὴν αὑτοῦ μεμφόμενον ἀσθένειαν.

" Πλὴν ἐκείνῃ γε δόξειεν ἂν διαφέρειν, ᾗ δείκνυσιν ἥλιος μὲν ἐπίσης[1] τὰ καλὰ καὶ τὰ αἰσχρὰ τοῖς ὁρῶσιν· Ἔρως δὲ μόνων τῶν καλῶν φέγγος ἐστὶ
D καὶ πρὸς ταῦτα μόνα τοὺς ἐρῶντας ἀναπείθει βλέπειν καὶ στρέφεσθαι, τῶν δ' ἄλλων πάντων ὑπερορᾶν.[2]

" Γῆν δὲ κατ' οὐδὲν Ἀφροδίτην καλοῦντες ἅπτονταί τινος ὁμοιότητος· καὶ γὰρ χθονία[3] καὶ οὐρανία καὶ μίξεως χώρα τοῦ ἀθανάτου πρὸς τὸ θνητόν, ἀδρανὴς δὲ καθ' ἑαυτὴν καὶ σκοτώδης ἡλίου μὴ προσλάμποντος, ὥσπερ Ἀφροδίτη μὴ παρόντος Ἔρωτος.

" Ἐοικέναι μὲν οὖν Ἀφροδίτῃ σελήνην ἥλιον δὲ Ἔρωτι τῶν ἄλλων θεῶν μᾶλλον εἰκός ἐστιν, οὐ μὴν εἶναί γε παντάπασι τοὺς αὐτούς· οὐ γὰρ ψυχῇ σῶμα ταὐτὸν ἀλλ' ἕτερον, ὥσπερ ἥλιον μὲν ὁρατὸν Ἔρωτα δὲ νοητόν. εἰ δὲ μὴ δόξει πικρότερον
E λέγεσθαι, καὶ τἀναντία φαίη τις ἂν ἥλιον Ἔρωτι

[1] ἐπίσης Kronenberg : ἐπὶ γῆς.
[2] ὑπερορᾶν van Herwerden : περιορᾶν.
[3] χθονία Keil : οἷα.

[a] A probable lacuna, though none is indicated in the MSS.





and extinguished, so they hold the same view about love, that it is a mortal and unstable thing. Finally, just as a body not conditioned by exercise cannot endure the sun without damage, neither can the guiding principle of an uncultivated soul sustain love without hurt : each degenerates alike and becomes afflicted, blaming the power of the god and not its own weakness.

" Yet there is, it seems, a difference to be pointed out : the sun with equal candour exhibits both the beautiful and the ugly to men's eyes, while Love illumines only what is beautiful. Only this does he persuade lovers to contemplate and turn to ; everything else they must overlook.

" Now if they call Aphroditê earth, in no respect do they attain any verisimilitude [a] . . . The moon, in fact, is both earthly and heavenly, a place where the immortal is blended with the mortal,[b] ineffective by herself and without illumination when the sun is not shining on her, just as Aphroditê is nothing without the presence of Eros.

" It is, then, likely that the resemblances of the moon to Aphroditê and of the sun to Eros are much stronger than those which these stars have to the other gods [c] ; yet they are by no means identical, for body is not the same as soul, but different, just as the sun is visible while Eros is merely intelligible. One might even say, if the statement is not too unpalatable, that the sun's activities are directly opposed

Wilamowitz supplies " Aphroditê has nothing in common with the earth, but those who call her the moon have hit upon a certain resemblance."

[b] *Cf. Mor.* 416 E ; 935 C ; 766 B *infra.*

[c] This ignores the Artemis-Apollo relationship to sun and moon : see *Mor.* 393 C-D ; 433 D ff. ; 434 F ff. ; 1130 A, *al.*

(764) ποιεῖν· ἀποστρέφει γὰρ ἀπὸ τῶν νοητῶν ἐπὶ τὰ αἰσθητὰ τὴν διάνοιαν, χάριτι καὶ λαμπρότητι τῆς ὄψεως γοητεύων καὶ ἀναπείθων ἐν ἑαυτῷ καὶ περὶ αὐτὸν κεῖσθαι[1] τά τ' ἄλλα καὶ τὴν ἀλήθειαν, ἑτέρωθι δὲ μηδέν·

δυσέρωτες δὴ φαινόμεθ' ὄντες[2]
τοῦδ', ὅ τι τοῦτο στίλβει[3] κατὰ γῆν,

ὡς Εὐριπίδης φησί,

δι' ἀπειροσύνην ἄλλου βιότου,

μᾶλλον δὲ λήθην ὧν ὁ Ἔρως ἀνάμνησίς ἐστιν.

"Ὥσπερ γὰρ εἰς φῶς πολὺ καὶ λαμπρὸν ἀνεγρομένων ἐξοίχεται πάντα τῆς ψυχῆς τὰ καθ' ὕπνους φανέντα καὶ διαπέφευγεν, οὕτω τῶν γενομένων ἐνταῦθα καὶ μεταβαλόντων[4] ἐκπλήττειν ἔοικε τὴν
F μνήμην καὶ φαρμάττειν τὴν διάνοιαν ὁ ἥλιος, ὑφ' ἡδονῆς καὶ θαύματος ἐκλανθανομένων ἐκείνων. καίτοι τό γ' ὕπαρ ὡς ἀληθῶς ἐκεῖ καὶ περὶ ἐκεῖνα τῆς ψυχῆς ἐστι, δευρὶ δ' ἐλθοῦσα διὰ[5] τῶν ἐνυπνίων ἀσπάζεται καὶ τέθηπε τὸ κάλλιστον καὶ θειότατον.

ἀμφὶ δέ οἱ δολόεντα φιλόφρονα χεῦεν ὄνειρα,

πᾶν ἐνταῦθα πειθομένη τὸ καλὸν εἶναι καὶ τίμιον,

[1] κεῖσθαι Wyttenbach : αἰτεῖσθαι.
[2] ὄντες Stephanus : ἰόντες.
[3] τοῦδ' ὅ τι τοῦτο στίλβει added by Stephanus from Euripides to fill a lacuna.
[4] μεταβαλόντων Stephanus : μεταβαλλόντων.
[5] ἐλθοῦσα διὰ added by Post to fill a lacuna in the MSS.

[a] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedo*, 81 D.
[b] *Hippolytus*, 193-195.





to those of Love.[a] For it is the sun that turns our attention from intelligibles to sensibles, bewitching us by the charm and brilliance of vision, and convincing us that truth and everything else is to be found in the sun, or in the realm of sun, and not in any other place.

It's clear that we unwisely love
The dazzling gleam we see on earth,

as Euripides [b] says,

Because we have not known another life—

or rather because of our forgetfulness of the realities of which Love is a recollection.[c]

" If we awaken in the face of a great brilliant light, everything that has been seen in our dreams leaves our souls and vanishes ; just so, when we pass from one life to another and are born on this earth, the sun seems to dazzle our memory and drug our minds, through the pleasure and wonder it rouses, into forgetting what went before. And yet the soul's true period of wakefulness [d] is there in that other life and in that realm ; since its arrival in this world, it is by means of dreams that it joyfully greets and gazes upon that which is most beautiful and most divine.[e]

About it are shed sweet but treacherous dreams,[f]

for the soul is persuaded that beauty and value exist

[c] See Plato, *Phaedrus*, 249 C-E.
[d] *Cf. Mor.* 393 D.
[e] Much of this sentence is conjecturally supplied to fill a gap in the MSS. ; *cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 249 C.
[f] A line of unknown origin ; it was formerly attributed to Callimachus (frag. anon. 381 Schneider), but is rejected by Pfeiffer.

(764) ἂν μὴ τύχῃ θείου καὶ σώφρονος Ἔρωτος ἰατροῦ καὶ σωτῆρος καὶ ἡγεμόνος ὃς[1] διὰ σωμάτων ἀφικόμενος ἀγωγὸς ἐπὶ τὴν ἀλήθειαν ἐξ Ἅιδου κεῖς[2] 765 'τὸ ἀληθείας πεδίον,' οὗ τὸ πολὺ καὶ καθαρὸν καὶ ἀψευδὲς ἵδρυται κάλλος, ἀσπάσασθαι καὶ συγγενέσθαι διὰ χρόνου ποθοῦντας ἐξαναφέρων καὶ ἀναπέμπων εὐμενὴς οἷον ἐν τελετῇ παρέστη μυσταγωγός.

"'Ενταῦθα δὲ[3] πάλιν πεμπομένων αὐτῇ μὲν οὐ πλησιάζει ψυχῇ[4] καθ' ἑαυτήν, ἀλλὰ διὰ σώματος. ὡς δὲ γεωμέτραι παισὶν οὔπω δυναμένοις ἐφ' ἑαυτῶν τὰ νοητὰ μυηθῆναι τῆς ἀσωμάτου καὶ ἀπαθοῦς οὐσίας εἴδη πλάττοντες ἁπτὰ καὶ ὁρατὰ μιμήματα σφαιρῶν καὶ κύβων καὶ δωδεκαέδρων προτείνουσιν· B οὕτως ἡμῖν ὁ οὐράνιος Ἔρως ἔσοπτρα καλῶν καλά, θνητὰ μέντοι θείων[5] καὶ ἀπαθῶν[6] παθητὰ καὶ νοητῶν αἰσθητὰ μηχανώμενος ἔν τε σχήμασι καὶ χρώμασι καὶ εἴδεσι νέων ὥρᾳ στίλβοντα δείκνυσι καὶ κινεῖ τὴν μνήμην ἀτρέμα διὰ τούτων ἀναφλεγομένην τὸ πρῶτον. ὅθεν διὰ σκαιότητος ἔνιοι φίλων καὶ οἰκείων, σβεννύναι πειρωμένων βίᾳ καὶ ἀλόγως τὸ πάθος, οὐδὲν ἀπέλαυσαν αὐτοῦ χρηστὸν ἀλλ' ἢ

[1] καὶ ἡγεμόνος ὃς added by Amyot.
[2] κεῖς W. C. H. after Hubert: καὶ.
[3] δὲ added by Winckelmann.
[4] αὐτῇ . . . ψυχῇ Meziriacus: αὐτὴ . . . ψυχὴ.
[5] θείων Wyttenbach: θεῶν.
[6] καὶ ἀπαθῶν added by Bernardakis.

[a] *Cf.* Osiris in *Mor.* 382 F—383 A.
[b] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 248 B, 254 B.





nowhere but here, unless it secures divine, chaste Love[a] to be its physician, its saviour, its guide. Love, who has come to it through the medium of bodily forms, is its divine conductor to the truth from the realm of Hades here; Love conducts it to the Plain of Truth[b] where Beauty, concentrated and pure and genuine, has her home. When we long to embrace and have intercourse with her after our separation, it is Love who graciously appears to lift us out of the depths and escort us upward, like a mystic guide beside us at our initiation.[c]

"But while we are being brought safely to that higher ground, Love does not approach our souls in isolation by themselves, but through the body. Teachers of geometry, when their pupils are not yet capable of initiation into purely intellectual conceptions of incorporeal and unchanging substance, offer them tangible and visible copies of spheres and cubes and dodecahedrons; in the same way heavenly Love contrives for us, as in a glass, beautiful reflections of beautiful realities. These are, however, merely mortal reflections of the divine, corruptible of the incorruptible, sensible of the intelligible. By showing us these in the form and hue and aspect of young men radiant in the prime of their beauty, Love gently excites our memory, which is first kindled by this means.[d] Hence some, because of maladroit friends or relatives who tried by violence and unreasonably to extinguish the flame of love, have derived no benefit from it; instead they either fill

[c] As in the Eleusinian Mysteries.
[d] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 250 c ff. This whole passage reshapes in a condensed and continuous form a number of separate *motifs* of the *Phaedrus*: see 241 A, 253 E—254 A, and, in general, 250 A—256 E.

(765) καπνοῦ καὶ ταραχῆς ἐνέπλησαν ἑαυτοὺς ἢ πρὸς ἡδονὰς σκοτίους[1] καὶ παρανόμους ῥυέντες ἀκλεῶς[2] ἐμαράνθησαν. ὅσοι δὲ σώφρονι λογισμῷ μετ' αἰδοῦς οἷον ἀτεχνῶς πυρὸς ἀφεῖλον τὸ μανικόν, αὐγὴν C δὲ καὶ φῶς ἀπέλιπον τῇ ψυχῇ μετὰ θερμότητος, οὐ σεισμὸν μέν,[3] ὥς τις εἶπε, κινούσης ἐπὶ σπέρμα κατ'[4] ὄλισθον ἀτόμων ὑπὸ λειότητος καὶ γαργαλισμοῦ θλιβομένων, διάχυσιν[5] δὲ θαυμαστὴν καὶ γόνιμον ὥσπερ ἐν φυτῷ βλαστάνοντι καὶ τρεφομένῳ καὶ πόρους ἀνοίγουσαν εὐπειθείας καὶ φιλοφροσύνης, οὐκ ἂν εἴη[6] πολὺς χρόνος, ἐν ᾧ τό τε σῶμα τὸ τῶν ἐρωμένων παρελθόντες ἔσω φέρονται καὶ ἅπτονται τοῦ ἤθους, ἐκκεκαλυμμένοι[7] τὰς ὄψεις καθορῶσι καὶ συγγίνονται διὰ λόγων τὰ[8] πολλὰ καὶ πράξεων ἀλλήλοις, ἂν περίκομμα τοῦ καλοῦ καὶ D εἴδωλον ἐν ταῖς διανοίαις ἔχωσιν· εἰ δὲ μή, χαίρειν ἐῶσι καὶ τρέπονται πρὸς ἑτέρους ὥσπερ αἱ μέλιτται πολλὰ τῶν χλωρῶν καὶ ἀνθηρῶν μέλι δ' οὐκ ἐχόντων ἀπολιπόντες· ὅπου δ' ἂν ἔχωσιν ἴχνος τι τοῦ θείου καὶ ἀπορροὴν καὶ ὁμοιότητα σαίνουσαν, ὑφ' ἡδονῆς καὶ θαύματος ἐνθουσιῶντες καὶ περιέποντες,[9] εὐπαθοῦσι τῇ μνήμῃ καὶ ἀναλάμπουσι πρὸς ἐκεῖνο τὸ ἐράσμιον ἀληθῶς καὶ μακάριον καὶ φίλιον ἅπασι καὶ ἀγαπητόν.

[1] σκοτίους Basel edition : σκότους.
[2] ἀκλεῶς Meziriacus : ἀκλινῶς.
[3] μέν added by W. C. H.
[4] κατ' Madvig : καὶ.
[5] διάχυσιν Xylander : διάλυσιν.
[6] εἴη Bernardakis : ᾖ.
[7] ἐκκεκαλυμμένοι Wyttenbach : ἐκκαλούμενος.
[8] τὰ added by Bernardakis.





themselves with the smoke of humbug and passion or slip away to dark and illicit pleasures and fall into a shameful decay. But all those who by sober reason and modesty have excluded the raging element, as if it were literally fire, have kept in their souls only its light and radiance and warmth. This warmth does not, as someone [a] has affirmed, set up a churning that leads to the formation of seed through the gliding of atoms that are rubbed off in the smooth, tickling contact; rather, it produces a marvellous and fruitful circulation of sap, as in a plant that sprouts and grows, a circulation that opens the way to acquiescence and affection. Nor is it long before lovers learn to disregard the body of the beloved; they move inward instead and attach themselves to his character. The veil is stripped from their eyes and they see clearly and have intercourse—now through reasoned discourse, for the most part, but through moral behaviour as well—to discover whether the beloved may have in his thoughts an image that is cut to the pattern of ideal beauty. If he does not, they have no more to do with him and turn to others, like bees that abandon many fresh and charming flowers because these have no honey. But wherever they catch a trace of the divine, some emanation or beguiling resemblance, they are intoxicated with joy and wonder and pay court to it, basking in the memory of ideal beauty and renewing their radiance in the presence of that genuine object of love, blessed as it is and beloved of all and worthy of all affection.

[a] Epicurus, frag. 311 (Usener); *cf.* 766 E *infra*; Lucretius, iv. 1041.

[9] περιέποντες Reiske : περισπῶντες.

(765) 20. " Τὰ μὲν οὖν πολλὰ ποιηταὶ προσπαίζοντες ἐοίκασι τῷ θεῷ γράφειν περὶ αὐτοῦ καὶ ᾄδειν ἐπικωμάζοντες, ὀλίγα δὲ εἴρηται μετὰ σπουδῆς αὐτοῖς, εἴτε κατὰ νοῦν καὶ λογισμὸν εἴτε σὺν θεῷ τῆς ἀλη-
E θείας ἁψαμένοις· ὧν ἕν ἐστι καὶ τὸ περὶ τῆς γενέσεως·

δεινότατον θέων[1]
τὸν γέννατ'[2] εὐπέδιλλος[3] Ἶρις
χρυσοκόμᾳ Ζεφύρῳ μίγεισα[4]·

εἰ μή τι καὶ ὑμᾶς ἀναπεπείκασιν οἱ γραμματικοί, λέγοντες πρὸς τὸ ποικίλον τοῦ πάθους καὶ τὸ ἀνθηρὸν γεγονέναι τὴν εἰκασίαν."

Καὶ ὁ Δαφναῖος, " πρὸς τί γάρ," ἔφη, " ἕτερον;"

" Ἀκούετ'," εἶπεν ὁ πατήρ· " οὕτω γὰρ βιάζεται τὸ φαινόμενον λέγειν. ἀνάκλασις δή που τὸ περὶ τὴν ἶριν ἐστὶ τῆς ὄψεως πάθος, ὅταν ἡσυχῇ νοτερῷ λείῳ δὲ καὶ μέτριον πάχος[5] ἔχοντι προσπεσοῦσα νέφει τοῦ ἡλίου ψαύσῃ κατ' ἀνάκλασιν, καὶ τὴν
F περὶ ἐκεῖνον αὐγὴν ὁρῶσα καὶ τὸ φῶς δόξαν ἡμῖν ἐνεργάσηται τοῦ φαντάσματος ὡς ἐν τῷ νέφει ὄντος. ταὐτὸ[6] δὴ τὸ ἐρωτικὸν μηχάνημα καὶ σόφισμα περὶ τὰς εὐφυεῖς καὶ φιλοκάλους ψυχάς· ἀνάκλασιν ποιεῖ τῆς μνήμης ἀπὸ τῶν ἐνταῦθα φαινομένων καὶ προσαγορευομένων καλῶν εἰς τὸ θεῖον

[1] θέων Bergk : θειῶν.
[2] τὸν γέννατ' Bergk : γείνατο.
[3] εὐπέδιλλος Ahrens : εὐπέδιλος.
[4] μιγεισα Porson : μιχθεῖσα.
[5] πάχος Stephanus : πάθος. [6] ταὐτὸ Pohlenz : τοῦτο.

[a] Alcaeus, frag. 13 b Diehl (i, p. 393) ; 13 Edmonds (*Lyra Graeca*, i, p. 328). Edmonds cites the *Etymologicum Gudi-*





20. " Now generally poets who write or sing of the god seem to be making fun of him or carousing in a drunken revel ; but they have some serious productions to their credit, either because they have taken careful thought, or else by the god's help they have really grasped the truth. One such concerns his birth [a] :

Most fearful of the gods
Whom fair-sandalled Iris bore
To Zephyr of the golden hair—

unless you have let yourselves be persuaded by literary critics who affirm that the imagery symbolizes the variegated brilliance [b] of the emotion."

Daphnaeus asked, " Why, what other interpretation can one give to the words ? "

" Listen," said my father, " for this account is forced upon us by the phenomenon. What happens to our vision when we see a rainbow [c] is, of course, refraction, which occurs whenever the sight encounters a slightly moist, but smooth and moderately thick cloud and has contact with the sun by refraction. Seeing the radiance in this way produces in us the illusion that the thing we see is in the cloud. Now the devices and ruses of Love's operations on noble souls who love beauty are of the very same kind : he refracts their memories from the phenomena of this world, which are called beautiful, to the marvellous

*anum* : " Flowers are said to be tender because they grow in the spring, the particular season of love. That is why Alcaeus calls Love the child of the West Wind and the Rainbow."

[b] The Rainbow ; but the word here rendered " brilliance " may mean " flowery," for which see the quotation in the preceding note.

[c] *Cf. Mor.* 358 F f. ; 894 B-F ; 921 A.

(765) καὶ ἐράσμιον καὶ μακάριον ὡς ἀληθῶς ἐκεῖνο καὶ θαυμάσιον καλόν.

"'Αλλ' οἱ πολλοὶ μὲν ἐν παισὶ καὶ γυναιξὶν ὥσπερ ἐν κατόπτροις εἴδωλον αὐτοῦ φανταζόμενον
766 διώκοντες καὶ ψηλαφῶντες οὐδὲν ἡδονῆς μεμιγμένης λύπῃ δύνανται λαβεῖν βεβαιότερον· ἀλλ' οὗτος ἔοικεν ὁ τοῦ Ἰξίονος[1] ἴλιγγος εἶναι καὶ πλάνος, ἐν νέφεσι κενὸν ὥσπερ σκιαῖς θηρωμένου[2] τὸ ποθούμενον· ὥσπερ οἱ παῖδες προθυμούμενοι τὴν ἶριν ἑλεῖν τοῖν[3] χεροῖν, ἑλκόμενοι πρὸς τὸ φαινόμενον.

"Εὐφυοῦς δ' ἐραστοῦ καὶ σώφρονος ἄλλος τρόπος· ἐκεῖ γὰρ ἀνακλᾶται πρὸς τὸ θεῖον καὶ νοητὸν καλόν· ὁρατοῦ δὲ σώματος ἐντυχὼν κάλλει καὶ χρώμενος οἷον ὀργάνῳ τινὶ τῆς μνήμης ἀσπάζεται καὶ ἀγαπᾷ, καὶ συνὼν καὶ γεγηθὼς ἔτι μᾶλλον ἐκφλέγεται τὴν διάνοιαν· καὶ οὔτε μετὰ σωμάτων
B ὄντες ἐνταῦθα τουτὶ τὸ φῶς ἐπιποθοῦντες κάθηνται καὶ θαυμάζοντες· οὔτ' ἐκεῖ γινόμενοι μετὰ τὴν τελευτήν, δεῦρο πάλιν στρεφόμενοι καὶ δραπετεύοντες ἐν θύραις νεογάμων καὶ δωματίοις κυλινδοῦνται, δυσόνειρα φαντασμάτια φιληδόνων καὶ φιλοσωμάτων ἀνδρῶν καὶ γυναικῶν οὐ δικαίως ἐρωτικῶν προσαγορευομένων.

"Ὁ γὰρ ὡς ἀληθῶς ἐρωτικὸς ἐκεῖ γενόμενος καὶ τοῖς καλοῖς ὁμιλήσας ᾗ θέμις, ἐπτέρωται καὶ

[1] Ἰξίονος Winckelmann : πλείονος.
[2] θηρωμένου Reiske : θηρωμένους.
[3] τοῖν Doehner : ταῖν.

[a] *Cf.* 766 E *infra*; 944 E; Plato, *Symposium*, 210 D ff.





Beauty of that other world,[a] that divine and blessed entity which is the real object of love.

"Yet most men, since they pursue in boys and women merely the mirrored image of Beauty, can attain by their groping nothing more solid than a pleasure mixed with pain.[b] Probably this is the meaning of Ixion's [c] constant whirling and irregular course, for the object of his desire and pursuit was an illusion in the clouds, as it were an empty shadow. It is like the eagerness of children to catch the rainbow in their hands, attracted by its mere appearance.

"But the noble and self-controlled lover has a different bent. His regard is refracted to the other world, to Beauty divine and intelligible. When he encounters beauty in a visible body, he treats it as an instrument to memory. He welcomes and delights in it, yet the pleasure of its company only serves the more to inflame his spirit. While he is in this world and involved with bodies, he is not content to confine his activity to a wonder-struck yearning for the illumination of visible beauty; nor when he comes to the other world after death does he attempt to wrench himself away and run back for an erotic wallow at the chamber doors of the newly wed—those ill-omened dreams of men and women in love with the pleasures of the body: it is very wrong to call them lovers.[d]

"The true lover, when he has reached the other world and has consorted with true beauty in the holy

[b] The "bittersweet" of Love from Sappho to Goethe has been collected by the commentators on Catullus, 68. 18.

[c] *Cf. Mor.* 777 E. Ixion's pursuit of the cloudy Hera is most entertainingly set forth in Lucian's *Dialogues of the Gods*, 6: "Here's a rascal who has tippled nectar to some purpose!"

[d] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedo*, 81 D.

(766) κατωργίασται καὶ διατελεῖ περὶ τὸν αὐτοῦ[1] θεὸν ἄνω χορεύων καὶ συμπεριπολῶν, ἄχρι οὗ πάλιν εἰς τοὺς Σελήνης καὶ Ἀφροδίτης λειμῶνας ἐλθὼν καὶ καταδαρθὼν ἑτέρας ἄρχηται γενέσεως.

C "Ἀλλὰ ταῦτα μέν," ἔφη, "μείζονας ἔχει τῶν παρόντων λόγων ὑποθέσεις. τῷ δ' Ἔρωτι καὶ τοῦτο καθάπερ τοῖς ἄλλοις θεοῖς 'ἔνεστιν,' ὡς Εὐριπίδης φησί, 'τιμωμένῳ χαίρειν ἀνθρώπων ὕπο' καὶ τοὐναντίον· εὐμενέστατος γάρ ἐστι τοῖς δεχομένοις ἐμμελῶς αὐτὸν βαρὺς δὲ τοῖς ἀπαυθαδισαμένοις.[2] οὔτε γὰρ ξένων καὶ ἱκετῶν ἀδικίας ὁ Ξένιος οὔτε γονέων ἀρὰς ὁ Γενέθλιος οὕτω διώκει καὶ μέτεισι ταχέως ὡς[3] ἐρασταῖς ἀγνωμονηθεῖσιν ὁ Ἔρως ὀξὺς ὑπακούει, τῶν ἀπαιδεύτων καὶ ὑπερηφάνων κολαστής.

"Τί γὰρ ἂν λέγοι τις Εὐξύνθετον[4] καὶ Λευκοκόμαν; τί δὲ[5] τὴν ἐν Κύπρῳ Παρακύπτουσαν ἔτι νῦν προσαγορευομένην; ἀλλὰ τὴν Γοργοῦς ἴσως D ποινὴν οὐκ ἀκηκόατε τῆς Κρήσσης, παραπλήσια τῇ Παρακυπτούσῃ παθούσης· πλὴν ἐκείνη μὲν ἀπελιθώθη παρακύψασα τὸν ἐραστὴν ἰδεῖν ἐκκομιζόμενον.

"Τῆς δὲ Γοργοῦς Ἄσανδρός τις ἠράσθη, νέος ἐπιεικὴς καὶ γένει λαμπρός, ἐκ δὲ λαμπρῶν εἰς

[1] αὐτοῦ Wyttenbach: αὐτὸν.
[2] ἀπαυθαδισαμένοις Winckelmann: ἀπαυθισαμένοις E. ἀπαυθαδιαζομένοις B.
[3] ὡς Basel edition: καὶ.
[4] Εὐξύνετον Reiske.
[5] Λευκοκόμαν; τί δὲ Rohde: Λευκομάντιδα.





way, grows wings and joins in the continual celebration of his god's mysteries,[a] escorting[b] him in the celestial dance until it is time for him to go again to the meadows of the Moon and Aphroditê[c] and fall asleep before he begins another existence in this world.

"But these topics," said my father, "take us beyond the purposes of the present discussion. Love, like the other gods, as Euripides[d] says,

Can be pleased by honours given him by men;

but he can also be displeased: he is most gracious to those who receive him as they should and severe with those who have stubbornly rejected him. Neither does the god of Hospitality so quickly pursue and avenge wrongs done to strangers and suppliants, nor the god of the Family a father's curse, as is Eros swift to respond to the complaints of outraged lovers and quick to punish the ill-mannered and disdainful.

"Why tell the tale of Euxynthetus and Leucocoma?[e] Or repeat the story of the girl who is still called Paracyptousa[f] in Cyprus? But perhaps you haven't heard the punishment of the Cretan Gorgo, who was treated very much like Paracyptousa, except that the latter was turned to stone at the moment when she peeped out of the window to watch the funeral procession of her lover.

"Well, a certain Asander, an upright youth from a distinguished family, fell in love with Gorgo.

[a] See Plato, *Phaedrus*, 249 A, 250 B ff.
[b] *Cf.* 745 E *supra*.
[c] *Cf.* 764 D *supra*.
[d] *Hippolytus*, 7.
[e] See Strabo, x. 4. 12.
[f] *Cf.* Antoninus Liberalis, *Metamorphoses*, 39. The name means "The Peeper."

(766) ταπεινὰ πράγματα καὶ ἀδοξίαν[1] ἀφιγμένος, ὅμως αὐτὸν οὐδενὸς ἀπηξίου[2] ἀλλὰ τὴν Γοργώ, διὰ πλοῦτον ὡς ἔοικε περιμάχητον οὖσαν καὶ πολυμνήστευτον, ἥτει γυναῖκα συγγενὴς ὤν, πολλοὺς ἔχων καὶ ἀγαθοὺς συνερῶντας αὐτῷ, πάντας δὲ τοὺς περὶ τὴν κόρην ἐπιτρόπους καὶ οἰκείους πεπεικώς . . .

21. "Ἔτι τοίνυν ἃς λέγουσιν αἰτίας καὶ γενέσεις Ἔρωτος, ἴδιαι μὲν οὐδετέρου γένους εἰσὶ κοιναὶ δ' ἀμφοτέρων. καὶ γὰρ εἴδωλα δήπουθεν ἐνδυόμενα τοῖς ἐρωτικοῖς καὶ διατρέχοντα κινεῖν καὶ γαργαλίζειν τὸν ὄγκον[3] εἰς σπέρμα συνολισθαίνοντα τοῖς ἄλλοις σχηματισμοῖς οὐ δυνατὸν μὲν ἀπὸ παίδων, ἀδύνατον δ' ἀπὸ γυναικῶν; καὶ τὰς καλὰς ταύτας καὶ ἱερὰς ἃς[4] ἀναμνήσεις καλοῦμεν ἡμεῖς ἐπὶ τὸ θεῖον καὶ ἀληθινὸν καὶ ὀλύμπιον ἐκεῖνο κάλλος, αἷς ψυχὴ πτεροῦται, τί ἂν κωλύοι[5] γίνεσθαι μὲν ἀπὸ παίδων καὶ ἀπὸ νεανίσκων, γίνεσθαι δ' ἀπὸ παρθένων καὶ γυναικῶν, ὅταν ἦθος ἁγνὸν καὶ κόσμιον ἐν ὥρᾳ καὶ χάριτι μορφῆς διαφανὲς γένηται, καθάπερ ὄρθιον ὑπόδημα δείκνυσι ποδὸς εὐφυΐαν, ὡς Ἀρίστων ἔλεγεν· ἢ[6] ὅταν ἐν εἴδεσι καλοῖς καὶ

[1] ἀδοξίαν Bolkestein (*cf.* 53 B, 69 C): εὐτελῆ B; lacuna in E.
[2] ἀπηξίου Bernardakis: ἀπηξιοῦτο.
[3] ὄγκον] γόνον Rabinowitz.
[4] ἃς added by Rabinowitz after Bernardakis.
[5] ἂν κωλύοι Bernardakis: κωλύει E; οὖν κωλύει B.
[6] ἢ added by Bernardakis.

[a] Here unfortunately the story ends, though the MSS. indicate no lacuna. The gap must be a long one; for when the dialogue is resumed, we have left the Shrine of the Muses and are on the way back to Thespiae. Zeuxippus has spoken





Though he had fallen on evil, disreputable days after his distinguished beginnings, nevertheless he did not think that anything was too good for him. He even asked Gorgo to be his wife, since he was her kinsman. The lady was, it seems, much sought after for her wealth, so that Asander had plenty of worthy rivals. He, however, was able to win over all the girl's guardians and relatives . . .[a]

21. "Furthermore, the causes that they[b] give for the generation of love are peculiar to neither sex and common to both. For is it really the case that visual shapes emanating from boys can, but the same from women cannot, enter into the body of the lover where, coursing through him, they stimulate and tickle the whole mass and, by gliding along with the other configurations of atoms, produce seed?[c] And those beautiful and sacred passions which we[d] call recollections of the divine, the true, the Olympian beauty of the other world, by which the soul is made winged—why should they not spring from maidens and women, as well as from boys and striplings, whenever a pure and disciplined character shines through from within a beautiful and charming outward shape (just as a well-made shoe, as Ariston[e] remarked, reveals a shapely foot)—or whenever the

against conjugal love and Plutarch is in the act of replying to him.

[b] Probably the Epicureans.

[c] See the Epicurean doctrine mentioned in the note on 765 C *supra*.

[d] As Platonists, opposed to Epicurean dogma. The unexpressed antecedent of the relative is "passions" (some word like μανίας may have fallen out, or be understood): see Plato, *Phaedrus*, 249 D-E.

[e] Von Arnim, *S.V.F.* i, p. 390; but Wehrli (*Die Schule des Aristoteles*, vol. vi) assigns the fragment to Ariston of Ceos (frag. 21).

(766) καθαροῖς σώμασιν ἴχνη λαμπρὰ κείμενα[1] ψυχῆς ὀρθὰ καὶ ἄθρυπτα[2] κατίδωσιν οἱ δεινοὶ τῶν τοιούτων αἰσθάνεσθαι;

" Οὐ γὰρ ὁ μὲν φιλήδονος ἐρωτηθεὶς εἰ

πρὸς θῆλυ νεύει μᾶλλον ἢ ἐπὶ τἄρρενα

767 καὶ ἀποκρινάμενος,

ὅπου προσῇ τὸ κάλλος, ἀμφιδέξιος,

ἔδοξεν οἰκείως ἀποκρίνασθαι τῆς ἐπιθυμίας· ὁ δὲ φιλόκαλος καὶ γενναῖος οὐ πρὸς τὸ καλὸν οὐδὲ τὴν εὐφυΐαν ἀλλὰ μορίων διαφορὰς ποιεῖται τοὺς ἔρωτας.

" Καὶ φίλιππος μὲν ἀνὴρ οὐδὲν ἧττον ἀσπάζεται τοῦ Ποδάργου τὴν εὐφυΐαν ' Αἴθης τῆς 'Αγαμεμνονέης '[3]· καὶ θηρατικὸς οὐ τοῖς ἄρρεσι χαίρει μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ Κρήσσας τρέφει καὶ Λακαίνας σκύλακας· ὁ δὲ φιλόκαλος καὶ φιλάνθρωπος οὐχ ὁμαλός ἐστιν οὐδ' ὅμοιος ἀμφοτέροις τοῖς γένεσιν, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἱματίων οἰόμενος εἶναι διαφορὰς ἐρώ-
B των[4] γυναικῶν καὶ ἀνδρῶν;

" Καίτοι τήν γ' ὥραν ' ἄνθος ἀρετῆς ' εἶναι λέγουσι, μὴ φάναι δ' ἀνθεῖν τὸ θῆλυ μηδὲ ποιεῖν ἔμφασιν εὐφυΐας πρὸς ἀρετὴν ἄτοπόν ἐστι· καὶ γὰρ

[1] κείμενα Meziriacus : καὶ κείμενα.
[2] ἄθρυπτα Stephanus : θρυπτὰ (Rabinowitz suspects that ὀρθὰ καὶ ἄθρυπτα are an interpolated gloss).
[3] Αἴθης τῆς 'Αγαμεμνονέης Hubert, deleting ἧ, the preceding word : Αἴθην τὴν 'Αγαμεμνονέην.
[4] ἐρώτων Reiske : ἐρώντων.

[a] Nauck, *op. cit.* p. 906, Adespoton 355 ; Kock, *Com. Att. Frag.* iii, p. 476, Adespoton 360. See also *Mor.* 34 A.





clearcut traces of a shining soul stored up in beautiful forms and pure bodies are perceived undistorted, without a flaw, by those capable of such perceptions.

" In the play, the pleasure-lover is asked whether

To women more than men is he inclined ?

And he answers

Where there is beauty, he is ambidexterous.[a]

If he is to be given credit for an answer well suited to lust, it is no less true that the noble lover of beauty engages in love wherever he sees excellence and splendid natural endowment without regard for any difference in physiological detail.

" A lover of horses takes pleasure in the excellent qualities of ' Aethê, Agamemnon's mare '[b] no less than in those of the horse Podargus. The hunter has no special preference for male dogs, but also keeps Cretan and Laconian bitches. So too will not the lover of human beauty be fairly and equably disposed toward both sexes, instead of supposing that males and females are as different in the matter of love as they are in their clothes ? . . .

" To be sure they say[c] that beauty is the ' flower of virtue ' ; yet it would be absurd to deny that the female produces that flower or gives a ' presentation ' of a ' natural bent for virtue.' Aeschylus[d] is surely

[b] Homer, *Iliad*, xxiii. 295 ; *cf. Mor.* 32 E ; 209 C ; 988 A ; *Life of Agesilaüs*, ix (600 E).
[c] The Stoics and specifically Chrysippus : von Arnim, *S.V.F.* iii, p. 718. Rabinowitz thinks that there is another lacuna before these words. In it the Stoic position on women was stated, " a position which Plutarch believes to be incompatible with their further general view that beauty is the flower of virtue." Plutarch enjoys parodying Stoic jargon.
[d] Frag. 243 (Nauck, p. 78) ; *cf. Mor.* 81 D.

(767) Αἰσχύλος ὀρθῶς ἐποίησε

νέας γυναικὸς οὔ με μὴ λάθῃ φλέγων
ὀφθαλμός, ἥτις ἀνδρὸς ᾗ γεγευμένη.

πότερον οὖν ἰταμοῦ μὲν ἤθους καὶ ἀκολάστου καὶ διεφθορότος σημεῖα τοῖς εἴδεσι τῶν γυναικῶν ἐπιτρέχει, κοσμίου δὲ καὶ σώφρονος οὐδὲν ἔπεστι τῇ μορφῇ φέγγος; ἢ[1] πολλὰ μὲν ἔπεστι καὶ συνεπιφαίνεται, κινεῖ δ' οὐθὲν οὐδὲ προσκαλεῖται τὸν ἔρωτα; οὐδέτερον γὰρ εὔλογον οὐδ' ἀληθές.

C "'Αλλὰ κοινῶς ὥσπερ δέδεικται τοῖς γένεσι πάντων ὑπαρχόντων, ὥσπερ κοινοῦ[2] συστάντος τοῦ ἀγῶνος,[3] ὦ Δαφναῖε, πρὸς ἐκείνους μαχώμεθα[4] τοὺς λόγους, οὓς ὁ Ζεύξιππος ἀρτίως διῆλθεν, ἐπιθυμίᾳ τὸν Ἔρωτα ταὐτὸ ποιῶν ἀκαταστάτῳ καὶ πρὸς τὸ ἀκόλαστον ἐκφερούσῃ τὴν ψυχήν, οὐκ αὐτὸς οὕτω πεπεισμένος, ἀκηκοὼς δὲ πολλάκις ἀνδρῶν δυσκόλων καὶ ἀνεράστων· ὧν[5] οἱ μὲν ἄθλια γύναια προικιδίοις ἐφελκόμενοι,[6] εἶτα[7] χρημάτων εἰς οἰκονομίαν καὶ λογισμοὺς ἐμβάλλοντες ἀνελευθέρους,
D ζυγομαχοῦντες ὁσημέραι διὰ χειρὸς ἔχουσιν· οἱ δὲ παίδων δεόμενοι μᾶλλον ἢ γυναικῶν, ὥσπερ οἱ τέττιγες εἰς σκίλλαν ἤ τι τοιοῦτο τὴν γονὴν ἀφιᾶσιν, οὕτω διὰ τάχους οἷς ἔτυχε[8] σώμασιν ἐναπογεννήσαντες καὶ καρπὸν ἀράμενοι χαίρειν ἐῶσιν ἤδη τὸν

[1] ἢ added by Meziriacus.
[2] κοινοῦ Reiske: κ νοῦ E. κνοῦ B.
[3] τοῦ ἀγῶνος added by Bernardakis after Madvig: there is a lacuna of 10 letters in E; of 8 in B; *cf.* 753 B.
[4] μαχώμεθα Amyot: μαχόμεθα.





right in saying,

An ardent eye betrays the tender girl
Who once has tasted of the joys of love.

Do the 'signs' betokening a flighty, unchaste, and corrupt character overrun women's faces, while no lustre is added to a female's beauty by a chaste and modest character? Or are there many 'signs' of the latter which 'present themselves in combination,' yet nevertheless do not move or evoke our love? Neither position is well taken or true.

"But now, Daphnaeus, since we have shown that all these characteristics belong to both sexes alike, let us too join in the struggle and make common cause against those arguments which Zeuxippus recently developed. He identified Love with an uncontrolled desire which forced the soul into debauchery, not that he was himself convinced of this, but because he had often heard it from ill-tempered fellows,[a] who had never fallen in love. Some of these creatures attach to themselves a wretched female for her bit of dowry, then thrust her into the keeping of strict and slavish accounts, quarrel with her day after day, and keep her under their thumbs. Others want children more than a wife: like cicadas[b] who eject their seed into a squill or something of the sort, they are quick to fecundate the first body they come upon. When they have reaped the fruit, they are

[a] Probably the Cyrenaics and Epicureans.
[b] *Cf.* Plato, *Symposium*, 191 B.

[5] ὧν added by Meziriacus.
[6] ἐφελκόμενοι Reiske: ἐφελκόμενα.
[7] εἶτα W. C. H.: μετὰ.
[8] ἔτυχον Bollaan.

(767) γάμον, ἢ μένοντος οὐ φροντίζουσιν οὐδ' ἀξιοῦσιν ἐρᾶν οὐδ' ἐρᾶσθαι.

" Στέργεσθαι δὲ καὶ στέργειν ἐνί μοι δοκεῖ γράμματι τοῦ στέγειν παραλλάττον εὐθὺς ἐμφαίνειν τὴν ὑπὸ χρόνου καὶ συνηθείας ἀνάγκῃ μεμιγμένην εὔνοιαν. ᾧ δ' ἂν Ἔρως ἐπισκήψῃ τε[1] καὶ ἐπιπνεύσῃ, πρῶτον μὲν ἐκ τῆς Πλατωνικῆς πόλεως 'τὸ ἐμὸν' ἕξει καὶ 'τὸ οὐκ ἐμόν'· οὐ γὰρ ἁπλῶς
E 'κοινὰ τὰ φίλων' καὶ ἐρώντων[2] ἀλλ' οἷ[3] τοῖς σώμασιν ὁριζόμενοι τὰς ψυχὰς βίᾳ συνάγουσι καὶ συντήκουσι, μήτε βουλόμενοι δύ' εἶναι μήτε νομίζοντες.

" Ἔπειτα σωφροσύνη πρὸς ἀλλήλους, ἧς μάλιστα δεῖται γάμος, ἡ μὲν ἔξωθεν καὶ νόμων ἕνεκα[4] πλέον ἔχουσα τοῦ ἑκουσίου τὸ βεβιασμένον ὑπ' αἰσχύνης καὶ φόβων,

πολλῶν χαλινῶν ἔργον[5] οἰάκων θ' ἅμα,

διὰ χειρός ἐστιν ἀεὶ τοῖς συνοῦσιν· Ἔρωτι δ' ἐγκρατείας τοσοῦτον καὶ κόσμου καὶ πίστεως μέτεστιν, ὥστε, κἂν ἀκολάστου ποτὲ θίγῃ ψυχῆς, ἀπέστρεψε τῶν ἄλλων ἐραστῶν, ἐκκόψας δὲ τὸ θράσος καὶ κατακλάσας τὸ σοβαρὸν καὶ ἀνάγωγον, ἐμβα-

[1] τε added by Bernardakis in a lacuna.
[2] καὶ ἐρώντων Pohlenz to fill a lacuna (οὐδὲ πάντων Winckelmann). [3] οἷ Amyot: ἢ.
[4] ἕνεκα added by Hubert to fill a lacuna.
[5] ἔργον Stephanus: ἔργων.

[a] The Greek words that differ by a letter are *stergein*, " cherish," and *stegein*, " not to leak " (of a roof, for instance). So affection is like a tight roof that keeps the home cosy. [b] *Cf. Mor.* 448 E.
[c] *Republic*, 462 C; *cf. Mor.* 140 D: 484 D. The citizens





ready for divorce; or, if the marriage stands, they pay no attention to it, so little do they care for giving or receiving love.

" But between ' attachment to wife ' and ' attachment to life '[a] the difference is only that of a single letter, and this immediately gives us a hint of the mutual loyalty that time and companionship are bound to create.[b] The man whom Love strikes and inspires will first of all come to understand ' mine ' and ' not mine ' as these terms are used in Plato's city.[c] The phrase, ' all is held in common among friends '[d] and lovers is not one of absolute validity: it applies only to those who, though separated in body, forcibly join their souls and fuse them together,[e] no longer wishing to be separate entities, or believing that they are so.

" In the next place, there is temperance, a mutual self-restraint which is a principal requirement of marriage. The temperance that comes from without and in deference to usage is imposed by shame or fear, rather than voluntary;

The task of many a bit and many a rudder,[f]

it is always in the power of those who live together. Love, however, has in himself enough self-control, decorum, and mutual trust, so that if he ever but touches the heart even of a profligate, he turns him from his other lovers, drives out insolence, humbles pride and intractability, and brings in modesty,

of Plato's State used the terms " mine," " not mine " in concert about the same things, not individually or selfishly.
[d] *Cf. Mor.* 644 C; 743 E.
[e] *Cf. Mor.* 156 C; 769 A; Plato, *Symposium*, 192 E.
[f] Sophocles, frag. 785 (Nauck, p. 315); *cf. Life of Alexander*, vii (667 F).

(767) λὼν[1] αἰδῶ καὶ σιωπὴν καὶ ἡσυχίαν καὶ σχῆμα
F περιθεὶς κόσμιον, ἑνὸς ἐπήκοον ἐποίησεν.

" Ἴστε δήπουθεν ἀκοῇ Λαΐδα τὴν ἀοίδιμον ἐκείνην καὶ πολυήρατον, ὡς ἐπέφλεγε πόθῳ τὴν Ἑλλάδα, μᾶλλον δὲ ταῖς δυσὶν ἦν περιμάχητος θαλάσσαις· ἐπεὶ δ' ἔρως ἔθιγεν αὐτῆς Ἱπποκόχου τοῦ Θεσσαλοῦ, τὸν

ὕδατι χλωρῷ κατακλυζόμενον προλιποῦσ'
Ἀκροκόρινθον

καὶ ἀποδρᾶσα τῶν ἄλλων ἐραστῶν κρύφα πολὺν ὅμι-
768 λον καὶ τῶν ἑταιρῶν[2] μέγαν στρατὸν ᾤχετο κοσμίως· ἐκεῖ δ' αὐτὴν αἱ γυναῖκες ὑπὸ φθόνου καὶ ζήλου διὰ τὸ κάλλος εἰς ἱερὸν Ἀφροδίτης προαγαγοῦσαι κατέλευσαν καὶ διέφθειραν· ὅθεν ὡς ἔοικεν ἔτι νῦν τὸ ἱερὸν ' Ἀφροδίτης ἀνδροφόνου ' καλοῦσιν.

" Ἴσμεν δὴ καὶ θεραπαινίδια δεσποτῶν φεύγοντα συνουσίας καὶ βασιλίδων ὑπερορῶντας ἰδιώτας, ὅταν Ἔρωτα δεσπότην ἐν ψυχῇ κτήσωνται. καθάπερ γὰρ ἐν Ῥώμῃ φασὶ τοῦ καλουμένου[3] δικτάτωρος ἀναγορευθέντος ἀποτίθεσθαι τὰς ἄλλας ἀρχὰς τοὺς ἔχοντας, οὕτως, οἷς ἂν Ἔρως κύριος ἐγγένηται, τῶν ἄλλων δεσποτῶν καὶ ἀρχόντων ἐλεύθεροι
B καὶ ἄφετοι καθάπερ ἱερόδουλοι διατελοῦσιν. ἡ δὲ γενναία γυνὴ πρὸς ἄνδρα νόμιμον συγκραθεῖσα δι' Ἔρωτος ἄρκτων ἂν ὑπομείνειε καὶ δρακόντων περιβολὰς μᾶλλον ἢ ψαῦσιν ἀνδρὸς ἀλλοτρίου καὶ συγκατάκλισιν.

22. " Ἀφθονίας δὲ παραδειγμάτων οὔσης πρός

[1] ἐμβαλὼν Aldine edition : ἐμβάλλων.





silence, calm. He clothes him with the robes of decorum and makes him deaf to all appeals but one.

" You have, of course, heard of Laïs, the theme of song, the essence of loveliness—how she threw all Greece into a fever of longing or was, rather, the object of contention from sea to sea.[a] But when she fell in love with Hippolochus the Thessalian,

Forsaking Acrocorinth bathed in grey-green water,[b]

and escaping secretly from the vast throngs of her other lovers and from the great army of harlots, she beat an orderly retreat. But when she came to Thessaly, the women there were envious and jealous of her beauty, decoyed her into a temple of Aphroditê, and stoned her to death ; and this seems to be why to this very day they call it the temple of Murderous Aphroditê.

" We also know quite well that slave girls will fly from the embrace of their masters, and subjects reject their own queen, when Love becomes the lord of their souls. At Rome, they say, when the so-called dictator is proclaimed, all the other magistrates resign their offices ; just so when Love enters as sovereign, men are ever after free and released from all other lords and masters and continue throughout their days to be, as it were, slaves of the god. A noble woman united by love to her lawful husband could endure the embrace of bears and snakes more readily than the touch and couch of another man.

22. " Although there is an abundance of examples

[a] That is, the two seas of Corinth, the Saronic Gulf and the Gulf of Corinth. [b] Euripides, frag. 1084 (Nauck, p. 703).

[2] πολὺν ὅμιλον καὶ τῶν ἑταιρῶν τὸν added by Bernardakis to fill a lacuna. [3] καλουμένου Xylander : καλοῦ.

(768) γ' ὑμᾶς τοὺς ὁμοχώρους τοῦ θεοῦ καὶ θιασώτας, ὅμως τὸ περὶ Κάμμαν[1] οὐκ ἄξιόν ἐστι τὴν Γαλατικὴν παρελθεῖν. ταύτης γὰρ ἐκπρεπεστάτης τὴν ὄψιν γενομένης, Σινάτῳ δὲ τῷ τετράρχῃ γαμηθείσης, Σινόριξ ἐρασθεὶς δυνατώτατος Γαλατῶν ἀπέκτεινε τὸν Σινᾶτον, ὡς οὔτε βιάσασθαι δυνάμενος οὔτε πεῖσαι τὴν ἄνθρωπον ἐκείνου ζῶντος. ἦν δὲ C τῇ Κάμμῃ καταφυγὴ καὶ παραμυθία τοῦ πάθους ἱερωσύνη πατρῴος Ἀρτέμιδος· καὶ τὰ πολλὰ παρὰ τῇ θεῷ διέτριβεν, οὐδένα προσιεμένη, μνωμένων πολλῶν βασιλέων καὶ δυναστῶν αὐτήν. τοῦ μέντοι Σινόριγος τολμήσαντος ἐντυχεῖν περὶ γάμου, τὴν πεῖραν οὐκ ἔφυγεν οὐδ' ἐμέμψατο περὶ τῶν γεγονότων, ὡς δι' εὔνοιαν αὐτῆς καὶ πόθον οὐκ ἄλλῃ τινὶ μοχθηρίᾳ προαχθέντος τοῦ Σινόριγος. ἦκεν οὖν πιστεύσας ἐκεῖνος καὶ ᾔτει τὸν γάμον· ἡ δ' ἀπήντησε καὶ δεξιωσαμένη καὶ προσαγαγοῦσα τῷ βωμῷ τῆς θεᾶς ἔσπεισεν ἐκ φιάλης μελίκρατον, ὡς ἔοικε, πεφαρμακωμένον· εἶθ' ὅσον ἥμισυ μέρος D αὐτὴ προεκπιοῦσα παρέδωκε τῷ Γαλάτῃ τὸ λοιπόν· ὡς δ' εἶδεν ἐκπεπωκότα, λαμπρὸν ἀνωλόλυξε καὶ φθεγξαμένη τοὔνομα τοῦ τεθνεῶτος, 'ταύτην,' εἶπεν, 'ἐγὼ τὴν ἡμέραν, ὦ φίλτατ' ἄνερ, προσμένουσα σοῦ χωρὶς ἔζων ἀνιαρῶς· νῦν δὲ κόμισαί με χαίρων· ἠμυνάμην γὰρ ὑπὲρ σοῦ τὸν κάκιστον ἀνθρώπων, σοὶ μὲν βίου τούτῳ δὲ θανάτου κοινωνὸς ἡδέως γενομένη.'' ὁ μὲν οὖν Σινόριξ ἐν φορείῳ

[1] Κάμμαν Xylander : *κάμιμαν*.

[a] See *Mor.* 257 E ff. where the story is told at greater length ; Polyaenus, viii. 39.

[b] To solemnize the betrothal.

[c] *Mor.* 258 C is rather more colourful about the gentleman's





of this—at least to you who are fellow countrymen and initiates of the god—yet I hardly think it right to pass over the story of Camma of Galatia.[a] She was a very beautiful woman married to Sinatus the tetrarch. Sinorix, the most powerful of the Galatians, fell in love with her and killed Sinatus, since he was unable to obtain the lady's consent either by force or persuasion while her husband was alive. Now Camma had a refuge and a consolation for her tragedy in serving as hereditary priestess of Artemis. She spent the greater part of her time in the goddess' temple and received no one, though many kings and potentates came to woo her. Yet when Sinorix dared to propose marriage, she did not shun his overtures or reproach him for past deeds, as if an act inspired by his kind regards and love for her could have nothing wicked about it. So he trusted in this and came to the temple and asked her to marry him. She met him, gave him her hand, led him to the altar of the goddess, and poured as a libation [b] a phial of hydromel which was, it seems, mixed with poison. Thereupon she drank off half of it herself as though it were a toast and gave the rest to the Galatian. When she saw that he had swallowed it, she shouted loud and clear in triumph and uttered the dead man's name. 'It was,' she cried, 'dearest husband, because I was awaiting this day that I have endured my tortured life without you. Now rejoice and take me. I have avenged you on the vilest of creatures, sharing death with him as gladly as I did my life with you.' So Sinorix [c] was carried out in a litter

death : "he mounted a chariot as if to try shaking and jolting as a relief, but almost immediately he had to climb down, was changed over to a litter, and expired when night fell."

(768) κομιζόμενος μετὰ μικρὸν ἐτελεύτησεν, ἡ δὲ Κάμμα τὴν ἡμέραν ἐπιβιώσασα καὶ τὴν νύκτα λέγεται μάλ' εὐθαρσῶς καὶ ἱλαρῶς ἀποθανεῖν.

23. " Πολλῶν δὲ τοιούτων γεγονότων καὶ παρ' E ἡμῖν καὶ παρὰ τοῖς βαρβάροις, τίς ἂν[1] ἀνάσχοιτο τῶν τὴν Ἀφροδίτην λοιδορούντων, ὡς Ἔρωτι προσθεμένη καὶ παροῦσα κωλύει φιλίαν γενέσθαι; τὴν μέντοι[2] πρὸς ἄρρεν' ἄρρενος ὁμιλίαν, μᾶλλον δ' ἀκρασίαν καὶ ἐπιπήδησιν, εἴποι τις ἂν ἐννοήσας

ὕβρις τάδ' οὐχὶ[3] Κύπρις ἐξεργάζεται.

διὸ τοὺς μὲν ἡδομένους τῷ πάσχειν εἰς τὸ χείριστον τιθέμενοι γένος κακίας οὔτε πίστεως μοῖραν οὔτ' αἰδοῦς οὔτε φιλίας νέμομεν, ἀλλ' ὡς ἀληθῶς κατὰ[4] τὸν Σοφοκλέα

φίλων τοιούτων οἱ μὲν ἐστερημένοι
χαίρουσιν,[5] οἱ δ' ἔχοντες εὔχονται φυγεῖν.

ὅσοι δὲ μὴ κακοὶ πεφυκότες ἐξηπατήθησαν ἢ κατε- F βιάσθησαν ἐνδοῦναι καὶ παρασχεῖν ἑαυτούς, οὐδένα μᾶλλον ἀνθρώπων ἢ τοὺς διαθέντας ὑφορώμενοι καὶ μισοῦντες διατελοῦσι καὶ πικρῶς ἀμύνονται καιροῦ παραδόντος· Ἀρχέλαόν τε γὰρ ἀπέκτεινε Κρατέας ἐρώμενος γεγονώς, καὶ τὸν Φεραῖον Ἀλέξανδρον Πυθόλαος· Περίανδρος δ' ὁ Ἀμβρακι-

[1] ἄν added by Madvig.
[2] μέντοι Emperius : μὲν (μὲν οὖν Wyttenbach).
[3] οὐχὶ Hermann : οὐχ ἡ.
[4] κατὰ Basel edition : καὶ.
[5] χαίρουσιν Xylander : καὶ χαίρουσιν.

[a] Nauck, *Trag. Graec. Frag.* p. 917, Adespoton 409. Assonance points up the antithesis of Hybris (insolence) and Cypris (love).





and died shortly after. Camma lived through that day and the following night and is said to have expired with the greatest courage and good cheer.

23. " Since many such things have happened both here in Greece and in foreign parts, who could be patient when men revile Aphroditê, claiming that when she joins and accompanies Eros, it is impossible for friendship to exist? Now of the union of male with male (it is, rather, not a union, but a lascivious assault), one would be right to say,

This is the work of Hybris, not of Cypris.[a]

That is why we class those who enjoy the passive part [b] as belonging to the lowest depth of vice and allow them not the least degree of confidence or respect or friendship. Of such creatures the words of Sophocles [c] are true :

Of friends like them it's joy to be bereft,
And those who have them pray for some escape.

Young men not naturally vicious, who have been lured or forced into yielding and letting themselves be abused, forever after mistrust and hate no one on earth more than the men who so served them and, if opportunity offers, they take a terrible vengeance. Crateas [d] slew Archelaüs who had been his lover and Pytholaüs killed Alexander of Pherae.[e] Periander,[f]

[b] Compare Flacelière's interpretation and Robbins on Ptolemy, *Tetrabiblos*, ii. 3. 62 (L.C.L. ed. p. 135) ; iii. 14. 172 ; iv. 5. 187 (p. 402).
[c] Frag. 779 (Nauck, p. 313) ; *cf. Mor.* 94 D.
[d] *Cf.* Plato, *Alcibiades II*, 141 D ; Aristotle, *Politics*, 1311 b 8 ff.
[e] *Cf. Life of Pelopidas*, xxxv (297 E ff.).
[f] *Cf.* Aristotle, *Politics*, 1311 a 39 ff.

(768) ωτῶν τύραννος ἠρώτα τὸν ἐρώμενον εἰ μήπω κύει, κἀκεῖνος παροξυνθεὶς ἀπέκτεινεν αὐτόν.

769 "'Αλλὰ[1] γυναιξί γε[2] γαμεταῖς ἀρχαὶ ταῦτα φιλίας, ὥσπερ ἱερῶν μεγάλων κοινωνήματα. καὶ τὸ τῆς ἡδονῆς μικρόν, ἡ δ' ἀπὸ ταύτης ἀναβλαστάνουσα καθ' ἡμέραν τιμὴ καὶ χάρις καὶ ἀγάπησις ἀλλήλων καὶ πίστις οὔτε Δελφοὺς ἐλέγχει ληροῦντας, ὅτι τὴν 'Αφροδίτην '"Αρμα' καλοῦσιν, οὔθ' "Ομηρον 'φιλότητα' τὴν τοιαύτην προσαγορεύοντα συνουσίαν· τόν τε Σόλωνα μαρτυρεῖ γεγονέναι τῶν γαμικῶν ἐμπειρότατον νομοθέτην, κελεύσαντα μὴ ἔλαττον ἢ τρὶς κατὰ μῆνα τῇ γαμετῇ πλησιάζειν, οὐχ ἡδονῆς ἕνεκα δήπουθεν,[3] ἀλλ' ὥσπερ αἱ πόλεις
B διὰ χρόνου σπονδὰς ἀνανεοῦνται πρὸς ἀλλήλας, οὕτως ἄρα βουλόμενον[4] ἀνανεοῦσθαι τὸν γάμον ἐκ τῶν ἑκάστοτε συλλεγομένων ἐγκλημάτων[5] ἐν τῇ τοιαύτῃ φιλοφροσύνῃ.

"'Αλλὰ πολλὰ φαῦλα καὶ μανικὰ τῶν γυναικείων[6] ἐρώτων. τί δ'; οὐχὶ πλείονα τῶν παιδικῶν;

οἰκεῖον εἶδος[7] ἐμβλέπων ὠλίσθανον·
ἀγένειος ἁπαλὸς καὶ νεανίας καλός,
ἐμφύντ'[8] ἀποθανεῖν κἀπιγράμματος τυχεῖν.

ἀλλ' ὥσπερ τοῦτο παιδομανία, οὕτως ἐκεῖνο γυναικομανία[9] τὸ πάθος, οὐδέτερον δ' ἔρως ἐστίν.

[1] ἀλλὰ Stephanus: ἅμα. [2] γε Reiske: τε.
[3] δήπουθεν Leonardus: ποθεν.
[4] βουλόμενον Reiske: βουλόμενοι.
[5] ἐγκλημάτων Emperius: σχημάτων.
[6] γυναικείων Meziriacus: γυναικῶν.
[7] οἰκεῖον εἶδος Post: οἰκειότητος.
[8] ἐμφύντ' Stephanus: ἐνφύντα.
[9] οὕτως ἐκεῖνο γυναικομανία added by Bernardakis.





tyrant of Ambracia, asked his minion whether he was not yet pregnant; the boy fell into a rage and slew him.

"On the other hand, in the case of lawful wives, physical union is the beginning of friendship, a sharing, as it were, in great mysteries. Pleasure is short; but the respect and kindness and mutual affection and loyalty that daily spring from it convicts neither the Delphians of raving when they call Aphroditê 'Harmony' [a] nor Homer [b] when he designates such a union as 'friendship.' It also proves that Solon [c] was a very experienced legislator of marriage laws. He prescribed that a man should consort with his wife not less than three times a month—not for pleasure surely, but as cities renew their mutual agreements from time to time,[d] just so he must have wished this to be a renewal of marriage and with such an act of tenderness to wipe out the complaints that accumulate from everyday living.

"'But,' you may say, 'there is much that is bad and mad in the love of women.' And doesn't that of boys have even more?

Seeing a kindred shape I swooned away.[e]
Beardless, soft, a lovely boy.
Clasped in his arms I'd die and find my epitaph.[f]

But just as this is boy-madness, so that other affliction is to be woman-crazy: neither is love.

[a] *Cf. Mor.* 156 c-D.
[b] Homer, *Iliad*, xiv. 209 and often.
[c] *Life of Solon*, xx (89 c).
[d] *Cf. Mor.* 143 D.
[e] Like Narcissus, falling in love with himself.
[f] All by unknown comic poets: Kock, iii, p. 451, Adespota 222-224.

(769) "Ἄτοπον οὖν τὸ γυναιξὶν ἀρετῆς φάναι μηδαμῇ[1] μετεῖναι· τί δὲ δεῖ λέγειν περὶ[2] σωφροσύνης καὶ συνέσεως αὐτῶν, ἔτι δὲ πίστεως καὶ δικαιοσύνης, ὅπου καὶ τὸ ἀνδρεῖον καὶ τὸ θαρραλέον καὶ τὸ μεγαλόψυχον ἐν πολλαῖς ἐπιφανὲς[3] γέγονε; τὸ δὲ πρὸς τἄλλα καλὴν[4] τὴν φύσιν αὐτῶν, ἀλλὰ[5] ψέγοντας εἰς μόνην φιλίαν ἀνάρμοστον ἀποφαίνειν, παντάπασι δεινόν. καὶ γὰρ φιλότεκνοι καὶ φίλανδροι καὶ τὸ στερκτικὸν ὅλως ἐν αὐταῖς, ὥσπερ εὐφυὴς χώρα καὶ δεκτικὴ φιλίας, οὔτε πειθοῦς οὔτε χαρίτων ἄμοιρον ὑπόκειται. καθάπερ δὲ λόγῳ ποίησις ἡδύσματα μέλη καὶ μέτρα καὶ ῥυθμοὺς ἐφαρμόσασα καὶ τὸ παιδεῦον αὐτοῦ κινητικώτερον ἐποίησε καὶ τὸ βλάπτον ἀφυλακτότερον, οὕτως ἡ φύσις γυναικὶ περιθεῖσα χάριν ὄψεως καὶ φωνῆς πιθανότητα καὶ μορφῆς ἐπαγωγὸν εἶδος, τῇ μὲν ἀκολάστῳ πρὸς ἡδονὴν καὶ ἀπάτην τῇ δὲ σώφρονι πρὸς εὔνοιαν ἀνδρὸς καὶ φιλίαν μεγάλα συνήργησεν.

"Ὁ μὲν οὖν Πλάτων τὸν Ξενοκράτη, τἄλλα γενναῖον ὄντα καὶ μέγαν, αὐστηρότατον δὲ τῷ ἤθει, παρεκάλει θύειν ταῖς Χάρισι. χρηστῇ δ' ἄν τις γυναικὶ καὶ σώφρονι παραινέσειε τῷ Ἔρωτι θύειν, ὅπως εὐμενὴς συνοικουρῇ τῷ γάμῳ καὶ ἡδύσμασιν αὐτὴν ἐπικοσμήσῃ πᾶσι τοῖς[6] γυναικείοις, καὶ μὴ

[1] μηδαμῇ Bernardakis: μηδ' ἄλλης.
[2] τί δὲ δεῖ λέγειν περὶ Winckelmann: τί δεῖ λέγειν; περὶ δὲ BE.
[3] ἐπιφανὲς Basel edition: ἐπιφανείαις.
[4] τὸ δὲ πρὸς τἄλλα καλὴν Bernardakis: δὲ πρὸς τὰ ἄλλα κατὰ.





"So it is ridiculous to maintain that women have no participation in virtue.[a] What need is there to discuss their prudence and intelligence, or their loyalty and justice, when many women have exhibited a daring and great-hearted courage which is truly masculine? And to declare that their nature is noble in all other relationships and then to censure it as being unsuitable for friendship alone—that is surely a strange procedure. They are, in fact, fond of their children and their husbands; their affections are like a rich soil ready to receive the germ of friendship; and beneath it all is a layer of seductive grace. Just as poetry adds to the prose meaning the delights of song and metre and rhythm, making its educational power more forceful and its capacity for doing harm more irresistible; just so nature has endowed women with a charming face, a persuasive voice, a seductive physical beauty and has thus given the dissolute woman great advantages for the beguilement of pleasure, but to the chaste, great resources also to gain the goodwill and friendship of her husband.

"Now Plato[b] urged Xenocrates, a noble and great-hearted youth, but of a very morose character, to sacrifice to the Graces. Just so one would advise a virtuous, chaste woman to sacrifice to Love that he may smile on her marriage and be guardian of her home, adorning her with such allurements as become a woman, and that her husband may not be diverted

[a] *Cf.* 767 B *supra.*
[b] *Cf. Mor.* 141 F; *Life of Marius*, ii (407 A).

[5] ἀλλὰ Bernardakis: ἀλλ' ἤ.
[6] ἡδύσμασιν αὐτὴν ἐπικοσμήσῃ πᾶσι τοῖς added by Hubert to fill a lacuna in the MSS.

(769) πρὸς ἑτέραν[1] ἀπορρυεὶς ὁ ἀνὴρ ἀναγκάζηται τὰς ἐκ τῆς κωμῳδίας λέγειν φωνὰς

οἵαν ἀδικῶ γυναῖχ' ὁ δυσδαίμων ἐγώ.

τὸ γὰρ ἐρᾶν ἐν γάμῳ τοῦ ἐρᾶσθαι μεῖζον ἀγαθόν
E ἐστι· πολλῶν γὰρ ἁμαρτημάτων ἀπαλλάττει, μᾶλλον δὲ πάντων ὅσα διαφθείρει καὶ λυμαίνεται τὸν γάμον.

24. " Τὸ δ' ἐμπαθὲς ἐν ἀρχῇ καὶ δάκνον, ὦ μακάριε Ζεύξιππε, μὴ φοβηθῇς ὡς ἕλκος ἢ ὀδαξησμόν· καίτοι καὶ μεθ' ἕλκους ἴσως οὐδὲν[2] δεινὸν ὥσπερ τὰ δένδρα συμφυῆ γενέσθαι πρὸς γυναῖκα χρηστήν. ἕλκωσις δὲ καὶ κυήσεως ἀρχή· μῖξις γὰρ οὐκ ἔστι τῶν μὴ πρὸς ἄλληλα πεπονθότων.

" Ταράττει δὲ καὶ μαθήματα παῖδας ἀρχομένους καὶ φιλοσοφία νέους· ἀλλ' οὔτε τούτοις ἀεὶ παραμένει τὸ δηκτικὸν οὔτε τοῖς ἐρῶσιν,[3] ἀλλ' ὥσπερ
F ὑγρῶν πρὸς ἄλληλα συμπεσόντων ποιεῖν τινα δοκεῖ ζέσιν ἐν ἀρχῇ καὶ τάραξιν ὁ Ἔρως, εἶτα χρόνῳ καταστὰς[4] καὶ καθαιρεθεὶς τὴν βεβαιοτάτην διάθεσιν παρέσχεν. αὕτη[5] γάρ ἐστιν ὡς ἀληθῶς ἡ δι' ὅλων λεγομένη κρᾶσις, ἡ τῶν ἐρώντων· ἡ δὲ τῶν ἄλλως[6] συμβιούντων ταῖς κατ' Ἐπίκουρον ἁφαῖς καὶ περιπλοκαῖς ἔοικε, συγκρούσεις λαμβάνουσα

[1] ἑταίραν W. C. H. [2] οὐδὲν Winckelmann: οὐδὲν ἧ.
[3] ἐρῶσιν Basel edition: ὁρῶσιν.
[4] καταστὰς Xylander: καταστήσας.
[5] αὕτη Stephanus: αὐτὴ.
[6] ἐρώντων· ἡ δὲ τῶν ἄλλως Reiske: ἐρώτων ἄλλων.





to a rival and be forced to repeat the cry of the man in the comedy:

Wretch that I am to injure such a wife! [a]

For in marriage, to love is a greater boon than to be loved: it rescues us from many errors—or rather from all errors that wreck or impair wedlock.

24. " Do not, my dear Zeuxippus, be afraid of that sharp pain which comes at the beginning of marriage —don't fear it as though it were a wound or a bite. And even if there were a wound, there is nothing very alarming in that when the union is with a good woman: it is like grafting a tree. Another wounding is a preliminary to pregnancy, for there is no impregnation without reciprocal hurt.

" Studies are disturbing to boys at the very beginning and philosophy upsets young men [b]; yet this stinging smart does not remain the same for them forever. The same is true of lovers; just as with the mixing of two liquids, love seems at first to cause some effervescence and agitation, but as time goes on it settles down and is reduced and produces the best sort of stability. For this truly is what is called 'integral amalgamation,' [c] that of a married couple who love each other; but the union of those who merely live together is like the contacts and interlacing of Epicurus' [d] atoms, which collide and rebound,

[a] Kock, p. 450, Adespoton 221.
[b] *Cf.* Plato, *Republic*, 539 B.
[c] See *Mor.* 142 F f. (trans. Babbitt): " As the mixing of liquids, according to what men of science say, extends through their entire content, so also in the case of married people there ought to be a mutual amalgamation of their bodies, property, friends, and relations." See also Antipater, frag. 63 (von Arnim, *S.V.F.* i, p. 255).
[d] *Cf. Mor.* 1112 C (Epicurus, frag. 286 Usener).

(769) καὶ ἀποπηδήσεις, ἑνότητα δ' οὐ ποιοῦσα τοιαύτην,
770 οἵαν Ἔρως ποιεῖ γαμικῆς κοινωνίας ἐπιλαβόμενος.
" Οὔτε γὰρ ἡδοναὶ μείζονες ἀπ' ἄλλων οὔτε χρεῖαι συνεχέστεραι πρὸς ἄλλους οὔτε φιλίας τὸ καλὸν ἑτέρας ἔνδοξον οὕτω καὶ ζηλωτόν, ὡς

ὅθ' ὁμοφρονέοντε νοήμασιν οἶκον ἔχητον
ἀνὴρ ἠδὲ γυνή·

καὶ γὰρ ὁ νόμος βοηθεῖ καὶ γεννήσεως κοινῆς ἕνεκα[1] καὶ τοὺς θεοὺς Ἔρωτος ἡ φύσις ἀποδείκνυσι δεομένους. οὕτω γὰρ

ἐρᾶν μὲν ὄμβρου γαῖαν

οἱ ποιηταὶ λέγουσι καὶ γῆς οὐρανόν, ἐρᾶν δ' ἥλιον σελήνης οἱ φυσικοὶ καὶ συγγίνεσθαι καὶ κυεῖσθαι· καὶ γῆν δ' ἀνθρώπων μητέρα καὶ ζῴων καὶ φυτῶν ἁπάντων γένεσιν οὐκ ἀναγκαῖον ἀπολέσθαι ποτὲ
B καὶ σβεσθῆναι παντάπασιν, ὅταν ὁ δεινὸς Ἔρως ἢ ἵμερος[2] τοῦ θεοῦ τὴν ὕλην ἀπολίπῃ καὶ παύσηται ποθοῦσα καὶ διώκουσα τὴν ἐκεῖθεν ἀρχὴν καὶ κίνησιν;
" Ἀλλ' ἵνα μὴ μακρὰν ἀποπλανᾶσθαι δοκῶμεν ἢ κομιδῇ φλυαρεῖν, οἶσθα τοὺς παιδικοὺς ἔρωτας ὡς εἰς ἀβεβαιότητα[3] πολλὰ ψέγουσι[4] καὶ σκώπτουσι λέγοντες ὥσπερ ᾠὸν αὐτῶν τριχὶ διαιρεῖσθαι[5] τὴν φιλίαν, αὐτοὺς δὲ νομάδων δίκην ἐνεαρίζοντας τοῖς

[1] ἕνεκα added by Hubert. [2] ἵμερος Stephanus : μέρος.
[3] εἰς ἀβεβαιότητα Wyttenbach : ἀβεβαιότατα.
[4] ψέγουσι Wyttenbach : λέγουσι.
[5] τριχὶ διαιρεῖσθαι Meziriacus : τριχῇ αἱρεῖσθαι.

[a] Homer, *Odyssey*, vi. 183-184.
[b] Euripides, frag. 898. 7 (Nauck, p. 648). Verses 1 and 2 were quoted in 756 D *supra*.





but never achieve the unity that Love creates when he takes in hand a partnership in marriage.

" There can be no greater pleasures derived from others nor more continuous services conferred on others than those found in marriage, nor can the beauty of another friendship be so highly esteemed or so enviable as

When a man and wife keep house in perfect harmony.[a]

The law, in fact, assists Eros in bringing about procreation in all societies ; and nature brings it about that even the gods have need of him. It is in this sense, then, that the poets say that

The earth loves rain,[b]

and that Heaven loves Earth ; and in this sense, too, natural philosophers assert that the sun loves the moon and that they unite and propagate. And since earth is the mother of all men and a source of generation for all beasts and plants, will she not be destined to perish at some time or other and be completely extinguished if ever the mighty love and desire of the god abandons her matter [c] and if ever she stops longing for and pursuing the principle of her motion which derives from that source ?

" But I don't want you to think that I am wandering far from my subject and merely raving on. You are well aware, I take it, how often men condemn and make jests about the inconstancy of boy-lovers. They say that such friendships are parted by a hair as eggs are [d] ; that these lovers are like nomads who pass the spring of the year in regions that are lush

[c] That is, Earth as ὕλη (matter).
[d] *Cf.* Plato, *Symposium*, 190 D-E.

(770) τεθηλόσι καὶ ἀνθηροῖς εἶθ' ὡς[1] ἐκ γῆς[2] πολεμίας ἀναστρατοπεδεύειν· ἔτι[3] δὲ φορτικώτερον ὁ σοφιστὴς Βίων τὰς τῶν καλῶν τρίχας Ἁρμοδίους ἐκάλει
C καὶ Ἀριστογείτονας, ὡς ἅμα καλῆς[4] τυραννίδος ἀπαλλαττομένους ὑπ' αὐτῶν τοὺς ἐραστάς. ταῦτα μὲν οὐ δικαίως κατηγορεῖται τῶν γνησίων ἐραστῶν· τὰ δ' ὑπ'[5] Εὐριπίδου ῥηθέντ' ἐστὶ κομψά· ἔφη γὰρ Ἀγάθωνα τὸν καλὸν ἤδη γενειῶντα περιβάλλων καὶ κατασπαζόμενος, ὅτι τῶν καλῶν καλὸν[6] καὶ τὸ μετόπωρον . . . ἐκδέχεται μόνον . . . οὐδ' ἐν πολιαῖς[7] ἀπακμάζων[8] καὶ ῥυτίσιν, ἀλλ' ἄχρι τάφων καὶ μνημάτων παραμένει. καὶ συζυγίας ὀλίγας ἔστι παιδικῶν, μυρίας δὲ γυναικείων ἐρώτων καταριθμήσασθαι, πάσης πίστεως κοινωνίαν πιστῶς ἅμα καὶ προθύμως συνδιαφερούσας· βούλομαι δ' ἕν τι τῶν καθ' ἡμᾶς ἐπὶ Καίσαρος Οὐεσπασιανοῦ γεγονότων διελθεῖν.

25. "Κιουίλιος[9] γάρ, ὁ τὴν ἐν Γαλατίᾳ κινήσας
D ἀπόστασιν, ἄλλους τε πολλοὺς ὡς εἰκὸς ἔσχε κοινωνοὺς καὶ Σαβῖνον ἄνδρα νέον οὐκ ἀγεννῆ, πλούτῳ δὲ καὶ δόξῃ Γαλατῶν[10] πάντων ἐπιφανέστατον. ἁψάμενοι δὲ πραγμάτων μεγάλων ἐσφάλησαν καὶ δίκην δώσειν προσδοκῶντες οἱ μὲν αὐτοὺς ἀνῄρουν, οἱ δὲ φεύγοντες ἡλίσκοντο. τῷ δὲ Σαβίνῳ τὰ μὲν ἄλλα πράγματα ῥᾳδίως παρεῖχεν ἐκποδὼν γενέσθαι

[1] εἶθ' ὡς Bernardakis : εὐθὺς.
[2] γῆς Reiske : τῆς.
[3] ἔτι Stephanus : ἐπεὶ.
[4] ἅμα καλῆς] ἂν ἀπαλῆς Bernardakis ; ἀλλοκότου Post.
[5] ὑπ' Stephanus : ὑπὲρ.
[6] καλὸν added by the Basel edition (later on in the sentence).
[7] οὐδ' ἐν πολιαῖς Salmasius : οὐδὲν πολιῶσα.
[8] ἀπακμάζων Warmington : ἀκμάζων.





and blooming and then decamp as though from a hostile country. Even more vulgarly the sophist Bion used to call the beards of beautiful boys Harmodius and Aristogeiton [a] because, as the hair grows, it frees their lovers from a beautiful [b] tyranny ! It is, however, unjust to bring these charges against true and genuine lovers. Euripides' [c] remark is clever : he observed upon embracing and kissing Agathon, though the latter's beard had already grown, that even the autumn of the fair is fair.[d] . . . and even among wrinkles remains flourishing, indeed right up to the tomb. There are very few examples of a durable relationship among boy lovers, but countless numbers of successful unions with women may be enumerated, distinguished from beginning to end by every sort of fidelity and zealous loyalty. I should like to tell you of one such event that occurred in our time during the reign of Vespasian.

25. "Civilis,[e] who stirred up the revolt in Gaul, had naturally many associates. Among them was Sabinus, a young man of good family, whose wealth and reputation were second to none of the Gauls. When their great enterprise collapsed, in the expectation of reprisal some killed themselves and some tried to escape, but were caught. Sabinus' affairs were not such as to prevent him from getting away and making

[a] See 760 B *supra*.
[b] Or, adopting Post's correction, " a monstrous tyranny."
[c] *Cf. Mor.* 177 A-B ; *Life of Alcibiades*, i (192 A).
[d] Here follow several lacunae, partially indicated in one MS. The sense to be supplied is doubtless : " At any rate the love of chaste women admits no autumn, but even amid grey hairs . . . "
[e] Tacitus, *Histories*, iv. 67.

[9] Κιουίλιος Madvig : Κιούλιος.
[10] Γαλατῶν Wyttenbach : ἀνθρώπων.

(770) καὶ καταφυγεῖν εἰς τοὺς βαρβάρους· ἦν δὲ γυναῖκα πασῶν ἀρίστην ἠγμένος, ἣν ἐκεῖ μὲν Ἐμπονὴν[1] ἐκάλουν, Ἑλληνιστὶ δ' ἄν τις Ἡρωίδα προσαγο-
E ρεύσειεν, οὔτ' ἀπολιπεῖν δυνατὸς ἦν οὔτε μεθ' ἑαυτοῦ κομίζειν. ἔχων οὖν κατ' ἀγρὸν ἀποθήκας χρημάτων ὀρυκτὰς ὑπογείους, ἃς δύο μόνοι τῶν ἀπελευθέρων συνήδεισαν, τοὺς μὲν ἄλλους ἀπήλλαξεν οἰκέτας, ὡς μέλλων φαρμάκοις ἀναιρεῖν ἑαυτόν, δύο δὲ πιστοὺς παραλαβὼν εἰς τὰ ὑπόγεια κατέβη· πρὸς δὲ τὴν γυναῖκα Μαρτιάλιον ἔπεμψεν ἀπελεύθερον ἀπαγγελοῦντα τεθνάναι μὲν ὑπὸ φαρμάκων, συμπεφλέχθαι δὲ μετὰ τοῦ σώματος τὴν ἔπαυλιν· ἐβούλετο γὰρ τῷ πένθει χρῆσθαι[2] τῆς γυναικὸς ἀληθινῷ[3] πρὸς πίστιν τῆς λεγομένης τελευτῆς.

"Ὃ καὶ συνέβη· ῥίψασα γάρ, ὅπως ἔτυχε, τὸ
F σῶμα μετ' οἰκτων[4] καὶ ὀλοφυρμῶν ἡμέρας τρεῖς καὶ νύκτας ἄσιτος διεκαρτέρησε. ταῦτα δ' ὁ Σαβῖνος πυνθανόμενος καὶ φοβηθείς, μὴ διαφθείρῃ παντάπασιν ἑαυτήν, ἐκέλευσε φράσαι κρύφα τὸν Μαρτιάλιον πρὸς αὐτήν, ὅτι ζῇ καὶ κρύπτεται,
771 δεῖται δ' αὐτῆς ὀλίγον ἐμμεῖναι τῷ πένθει, καὶ μηδὲν παραλείπειν ὥστε[5] πιθανὴν ἐν τῇ προσποιήσει γενέσθαι. τὰ μὲν οὖν ἄλλα παρὰ τῆς γυναικὸς ἐναγωνίως συνετραγῳδεῖτο τῇ δόξῃ τοῦ πάθους· ἐκεῖνον δ' ἰδεῖν ποθοῦσα νυκτὸς ᾤχετο, καὶ πάλιν ἐπανῆλθεν. ἐκ δὲ τούτου λανθάνουσα τοὺς ἄλλους ὀλίγον ἀπέδει συζῆν ἐν Ἅιδου τἀνδρὶ πλέον[6] ἑξῆς ἑπτὰ μηνῶν.

[1] Ἐμπονὴν] *Epponinam* Tacitus ; Ἐμπονίναν Amyot ; Σεμόνην Salmasius.
[2] *πένθει χρῆσθαι* added by Meziriacus to fill a lacuna.





good his escape to a foreign country, except that he had married a most remarkable wife. Her Gaulish name was Empona, which may be translated into Greek as 'Heroine.' He could not abandon her nor take her with him. Now he had in the country underground caves for the storing of his treasures and these caves were known only to two of his freedmen. He dismissed all the other slaves, saying that he was going to poison himself, and took his two trusted servants down into the caves with him. To his wife he sent one of the freedmen, Martial, to tell her that he had poisoned himself and that his body had been consumed in the burning of his country house, for he wished to make use of his wife's genuine grief to gain credit for the report of his death.

"And so it turned out. Empona threw herself, just as she was, on the ground and remained there without any nourishment for three days and three nights, in lamentation and tears. When Sabinus heard this, being afraid that she would make away with herself completely, he ordered Martial to report to her secretly that he was alive and in hiding, and begged her to continue in her mourning a little while longer and to neglect nothing that would make her simulation convincing. She, then, played the role of grief to tragic perfection in outward show ; but she so longed to see him that she visited him at night and returned again by night. Hereafter for more than seven continuous months, unknown to anyone, she all but lived in the underworld with her husband.

[3] *ἀληθινῷ* Meziriacus : *ἀληθινῶς*.
[4] *οἰκτων* added by Winckelmann.
[5] *μηδὲν παραλιπεῖν ὥστε* added by Reiske to fill a lacuna.
[6] *πλέον* Winckelmann : *πλὴν*.

(771) "Ἐν οἷς κατασκευάσασα τὸν Σαβῖνον ἐσθῆτι καὶ κουρᾷ καὶ καταδέσει τῆς κεφαλῆς ἄγνωστον εἰς Ῥώμην ἐκόμισε μεθ' ἑαυτῆς ἐλπίδων[1] τινῶν ἐνδεδομένων. πράξασα δ' οὐδὲν αὖθις ἐπανῆλθε, καὶ τὰ μὲν πολλὰ ἐκείνῳ συνῆν ὑπὸ γῆς, διὰ χρόνου δ' εἰς πόλιν ἐφοίτα ταῖς φίλαις ὁρωμένη καὶ
B οἰκείαις γυναιξί. τὸ δὲ πάντων ἀπιστότατον,[2] ἔλαθε κύουσα λουομένη μετὰ τῶν γυναικῶν· τὸ γὰρ φάρμακον, ᾧ τὴν κόμην αἱ γυναῖκες ἐναλειφόμεναι[3] ποιοῦσι χρυσοειδῆ καὶ πυρράν,[4] ἔχει λίπασμα σαρκοποιὸν ἢ χαυνωτικὸν σαρκός, ὥσθ' οἷον διάχυσίν τιν' ἢ διόγκωσιν ἐμποιεῖν· ἀφθόνῳ δὴ χρωμένη τούτῳ πρὸς τὰ λοιπὰ μέρη τοῦ σώματος, αἰρόμενον καὶ ἀναπιμπλάμενον ἀπέκρυπτε τὸν τῆς
C γαστρὸς ὄγκον. τὰς δ' ὠδῖνας αὐτὴ καθ' ἑαυτὴν διήνεγκεν, ὥσπερ ἐν φωλεῷ λέαινα καταδῦσα πρὸς τὸν ἄνδρα, καὶ τοὺς γενομένους ὑπεθρέψατο σκύμνους ἄρρενας· δύο γὰρ ἔτεκε. τῶν δ' υἱῶν ὁ μὲν ἐν Αἰγύπτῳ πεσὼν ἐτελεύτησεν, ὁ δ' ἕτερος ἄρτι καὶ πρώην γέγονεν ἐν Δελφοῖς παρ' ἡμῖν ὄνομα Σαβῖνος.

"Ἀποκτείνει μὲν οὖν αὐτὴν ὁ Καῖσαρ· ἀποκτείνας δὲ δίδωσι δίκην, ἐν ὀλίγῳ χρόνῳ τοῦ γένους παντὸς ἄρδην ἀναιρεθέντος. οὐδὲν γὰρ ἤνεγκεν ἡ

[1] ἐλπίδων added by Reiske.
[2] ἀπιστότατον Basel edition: ἄπιστον τούτων.
[3] ἐναλειφόμεναι Stephanus: ἀναλειφόμεναι.
[4] πυρρὰν Basel edition: πυρὰν.

[a] This may mean that the dialogue was written after A.D. 116–117, during which year the only war in Egypt between the death of Domitian and that of Plutarch was briefly fought (Cichorius, *Römische Studien*, pp. 406 ff.).





"Meanwhile she disguised Sabinus completely by refashioning his clothes, by clipping and binding up his hair and took him with her to Rome, since there was some hope of a pardon. But she accomplished nothing and returned home again, now spending the greater part of her life with him underground, yet from time to time going to town to show herself to her friends and relatives. And what is most incredible of all, she succeeded in keeping the knowledge of her pregnancy from these ladies, even though she bathed with them. There is an ointment which women rub on their hair to make it gold or red; it contains grease which fills or puffs out the flesh and produces a sort of dilation or swelling. She spread this ointment in profusion on all other parts fo her body except the abdomen and thus concealed its size as it swelled and filled out. She endured her birth pangs completely alone, like a lioness in a den, descending into the earth to rejoin her husband; she brought up secretly the male cubs that were born. There were two of them: one son was killed in Egypt,[a] but the other visited us recently in Delphi. His name was Sabinus . . .[b]

"Though Caesar put her to death, yet he paid the penalty for this murder when his family was totally extinguished in a short time.[c] No act of his princi-

[b] There is probably a lacuna here, stating the circumstances of Sabinus' eventual discovery. According to Tacitus he eluded his pursuers for nine years. Dio Cassius (lxv. 16) says that the whole family was brought to Rome and implies that they were executed by Vespasian. But Plutarch's personal evidence about the survival of the sons casts doubt on this. The wife, at any rate, must have been taken to Rome.

[c] Actually Vespasian died (peacefully: "vae, puto deus fio") in A.D. 79 and Domitian was not murdered until 96.

(771) τόθ' ἡγεμονία σκυθρωπότερον[1] οὐδὲ μᾶλλον ἑτέραν εἰκὸς ἦν καὶ θεοὺς καὶ δαίμονας ὄψιν ἀποστραφῆναι· καίτοι τὸν οἶκτον ἐξῆρει τῶν θεωμένων τὸ θαρραλέον αὐτῆς καὶ μεγαλήγορον, ᾧ καὶ μάλιστα παρώξυνε τὸν Οὐεσπασιανόν, ὡς ἀπέγνω τῆς σωτηρίας πρὸς αὐτὸν ἀλλαγὴν κελεύουσα τοῦ βίου[2]· βεβιωκέναι γὰρ ὑπὸ σκότῳ καὶ κατὰ γῆς ἥδιον ἢ βασιλεύειν ἐκεῖνον."[3]

D 26. Ἐνταῦθα μὲν ὁ πατὴρ ἔφη τὸν περὶ Ἔρωτος αὐτοῖς τελευτῆσαι λόγον, τῶν Θεσπιῶν[4] ἐγγὺς οὖσιν· ὀφθῆναι δὲ προσιόντα θᾶττον ἢ βάδην πρὸς αὐτοὺς ἕνα τῶν Πεισίου ἑταίρων Διογένη· τοῦ δὲ Σωκλάρου πρὸς αὐτὸν ἔτι πόρρωθεν εἰπόντος, "οὐ πόλεμόν γ', ὦ Διόγενες, ἀπαγγέλλων," ἐκεῖνον, "οὐκ εὐφημήσετε," φάναι, "γάμων ὄντων καὶ προάξετε θᾶσσον, ὡς ὑμᾶς τῆς θυσίας περιμενούσης;"

Πάντας μὲν οὖν ἡσθῆναι, τὸν δὲ Ζεύξιππον ἐρέσθαι εἰ ἔτι[5] χαλεπός ἐστι.

"Πρῶτος μὲν οὖν," φάναι,[6] "συνεχώρησε τῇ Ἰσμηνοδώρᾳ· καὶ νῦν ἑκὼν στέφανον καὶ λευκὸν ἱμάτιον λαβὼν οἷός ἐστιν ἡγεῖσθαι δι' ἀγορᾶς πρὸς τὸν θεόν."

E "Ἀλλ' ἴωμεν, ναὶ μὰ Δία," τὸν πατέρα εἰπεῖν, "ἴωμεν, ὅπως ἐπεγγελάσωμεν τἀνδρὶ καὶ τὸν θεὸν προσκυνήσωμεν· δῆλος γάρ ἐστι χαίρων καὶ παρὼν εὐμενὴς τοῖς πραττομένοις."

[1] ἡ τόθ' ἡγεμονία σκυθρωπότερον Basel edition: τότε ἡγεμονίαν σκυθρωποτέραν. [2] τοῦ βίου added by Bolkestein.
[3] βασιλεύειν ἐκεῖνον W. C. H. after Bernardakis: βασιλεύων ἐκείνως. [4] Θεσπιῶν Stephanus: θεσπιέων.





pate was more grim and no other gave the gods and the spirits such good reason to avert their faces. Yet the audacity and pride of her words abolished pity in the spectators and roused Vespasian to a high pitch of fury: she renounced all hope of survival and challenged him to exchange his life with hers, declaring that she had lived more happily in the underground darkness than he had on his throne."

26. And it was at this point, my father said, that the conversation about love came to an end, for they were now near Thespiae and one of Pisias' friends, Diogenes, was observed to be approaching them on the run. While he was still at some distance, Soclarus called to him, "It's not a war [a] you're going to tell us of, Diogenes?" "Hush!" cried the latter. "A marriage is on foot. Please hurry up, for the sacrifice only awaits your presence."

They were all pleased and Zeuxippus inquired whether Diogenes' friend was still angry.

"On the contrary," said Diogenes, "he was the first to agree to Ismenodora's proposal. And now he has eagerly put on a chaplet and a white cloak to lead the procession through the market-place to the temple of the god."

"Forward then, by all means forward," said my father, "so that we may have a laugh at the man and salute the god. For it's plain to see that he approves and is graciously present at this affair."

[a] *Cf.* Plato, *Phaedrus*, 242 B; Leutsch & Schneidewin, *Paroemiographi Graeci*, ii, p. 84: "said of those who bring glad tidings."

[5] ἐρέσθαι εἰ ἔτι Wyttenbach: ἐρᾶσθαι ἔτι or ὁρᾶσθαι ὅτι.
[6] φάναι Hubert, adding τὸν Διογένη: ἐν ᾗ or ὡς ἐνῆν.

# INDEX

## OF PROPER NAMES AND OF SELECTED SUBJECTS

COMPILED BY W. C. HELMBOLD

[The subject index makes no claim to completeness; it includes only what the compiler believed might be useful.]


A: see alpha
Abdera, 49: town of Thrace
Academics, 253
Academy, 115: the school of philosophy founded by Plato at Athens
Achaeans, 243, 257, 379: the Greeks at Troy
Acheron, 203, 393: river of the lower world
Achilles, 11, 41, 151, 221, 243, 259, 291, 321 note *b*, 381: Greek hero in the Trojan War
Acrocorinth, 421: the citadel of Corinth
Admetus, 381, 383: king of Pherae in Thessaly
Adonis(es), 349: beloved of Aphrodítê
Aegina, 249: island in the Saronic gulf
Aeneas, 239: Trojan hero
Aeolus, 293: son of Hellen
Aeschylus, 101, 321, 415; quoted, 321, 351, 357, 365, 391, 417: Athenian tragic poet, *circa* 525–456 B.C.
Aethê, 415: Agamemnon's racing mare
Agamemnon, 57, 93, 225, 257, 261, 263, 415: the Greek general at Troy
Agatharchidas, 197: Greek historian
Agathoclea, 333 and note *f*: mistress of Ptolemy IV
Agathon, 57, 73, 435: Athenian tragic poet, *circa* 447–400 B.C.
agnus castus, 307
Agrigentum, 373: city of Sicily
Agrionia, 111: Boeotian festival of Dionysus
Agrotera, 355: epithet of Artemis
Ahriman, 365 note *b*: Persian divinity
Ajax, 41, 229, 241-249: one of the Greek heroes at Troy
*akrasia, akratisma, akratos*, 161
Alcaeus, 7, 161; quoted, 7, 161, 395, 407: lyric poet of Lesbos; born *circa* 620 B.C.
Alcestis, 381, 383: wife of Admetus
Alcibiades, 73, 385, 387: Athenian politician and general, *circa* 450–404 B.C.
Alexander, 113, 117, 203, 223, 373, 375: the Great, 356–323 B.C.
Alexander, 255, 257, 263, 265 Paris, prince of Troy; see also Paris
Alexander, 425: of Pherae; master of Thessaly 369–358 B.C.

Alexandrians, 335
Alexicrates, 175 : a Pythagorean contemporary with Plutarch
Alexio, 27, 29 (and *cf.* 309) : Plutarch's father-in-law
alpha, 227-233 : the first letter of the Greek alphabet
Alpheüs, 291 : the largest river of the Peloponnesus
Ambracia, 427 : a Greek city north of Actium
Ammonius, 131, 137-141, 215, 219, 221, 227, 229, 241, 243, 265, 269, 271, 279, 283, 289, 299 : Plutarch's instructor in philosophy
Amphictyon, 149: reputed founder of the Amphictyons
Amphictyons, 43 : a religious league of cities near Delphi and Thermopylae
Amphissa, 381 : a town in Locris
Amyclean, 295 : from Amyclae, a town near Sparta
Anacreon, 79 ; quoted, 319 : lyric poet of the sixth century B.C.
*Anaires*, 353 : Ares the slayer
Ananke : see Necessity
Anaxagoras, 139, 141 : Ionian philosopher, *circa* 500–428 B.C.
Anaxarchus, 49, 223 and note *e* : philosopher of Abdera
Anaximander, 185 : Ionian philosopher of the sixth century B.C.
*andreia*, 93
Antalcidas, 91 : a Spartan, responsible for the notorious "peace" of 387 B.C.
Anthemion, 385 : Athenian, father of Anytus
Anthemion, 311, 313, 329-333, 343, 347 : native of Thespiae
Anthesterion, 209 and note *c* : Athenian month
Antigonus, 337 : Gonatas, king of Macedonia 283–239 B.C.
Antileon, 373 : of Metapontum
Antimachus, 209 : of Colophon, poet of the fourth century B.C.
Antipater, 304 note *a*, 431 note *c* : Stoic philosopher of the second century B.C.
Antipatrides, 373, 375 : friend of Alexander the Great
Antisthenes, 73 : Socratic philosopher
Anton, 379 : of Chalcis
Anytus, 385, 387 : Athenian, lover of Alcibiades and accuser of Socrates
Aphroditê, 51, 237-241, 293, 323, 325, 335, 351, 353, 361, 369, 371, 397, 399, 411, 421, 425, 427 : the goddess ; see also Cypris
Apis, 117, 118 note *a* : the sacred bull of Egypt
Apollo, 73, 115, 151, 235, 249, 265, 275, 291, 357, 363, 383, 399 note *c* : the god
Aratus, quoted, 141 : Cilician poet, *circa* 315–249 B.C.
Arcesilaüs, 51 : Academic philosopher, *circa* 315–241 B.C.
Archelaüs, 425 : king of Macedonia 413–399 B.C.
Archidamus, 309 : Thespian, father of Daphnaeus
Archilochus, quoted, 313 : iambic and elegiac poet of the eighth or seventh century B.C.
Archytas, 121 : Pythagorean philosopher of the fourth century B.C.
Ares, 101, 353, 355, 365, 369, 375, 383, 393 : the god
Argive, 327
Argos, 249, 371 : city of the Peloponnesus
Aristaeus, 355 : hero, son of Apollo
Aristion, 309 : father of Soclarus
Aristippus, 317 : Cyrenaic philosopher
Aristodemus, 57 : friend of Socrates
Aristodemus, 131, 143 : of Cyprus
Aristogeiton, 373, 435 : Athenian tyrannicide, killed in 514 B.C.
Aristomenes, 381 : hero of the Second Messenian War. Plutarch wrote his life
Ariston, 413 and note *e* : philosopher
Ariston, 115 : Plato's father
*ariston* : 161, 163
Aristonica, 333 and note *e* : not identified

Aristophanes, 73, 85 : Athenian comic poet, *circa* 445–388 B.C.
Aristotle, 377 and note *a* : historian of Chalcis
Aristotle, 31, 45, 131, 169. 199, 203, 205, 209, 366 note *b*, 377 note *a* : the philosopher, 384–322 B.C.
Aristoxenus, 45, 79 : the learned Peripatetic
Arsinoë II, 222 note *a* : wife and sister of Ptolemy II Philadelphus
Artemis(es), 269, 271, 355, 399 note *c*, 423 : the goddess
Asander, 411, 413 : Cretan, lover of Gorgo
Asclepiades, 187 and note *c* : Bithynian physician of the first century B.C.
Asclepius, 115, 275, 359 note *c* : the god of healing
Asia, 335
Asopichus, 381 : Theban, beloved of Epaminondas
*aspharagos*, 11, 13
ass(es), 243, 337
*ateramon*, 21
Athena(s), 109, 239, 249, 269, 271, 349, 355, 387 : the goddess
Athenian(s), 33, 37, 91, 99, 149, 151, 159, 209, 249, 337
Athenodorus, 187 : medical writer
Athens, 77, 115, 131, 149, 159, 197, 199, 315, 319, 349, 373, 393
Atropos, 277 : one of the Fates
Attalus, 113 : II Philadelphus, 220–138 B.C.
Attis(es), 349 : the youthful consort of the goddess Cybelê
Autobulus, 119, 125, 203, 207, 209, 307 : Plutarch's son

BABYLONIANS, 153
Bacchant, 291
Bacchic, 363, 365
Bacchis, 333 : courtesan of Miletus
Bacchon, 311, 313, 329, 331 note *b*, 337-347 : youth of Thespiae
Bacchylides, 297 note *b* : choral poet of the fifth century B.C.
barbarism, 191
bass, 183
Bathyllic, 80 note *b*, 81 : a type of dance
bears, 355, 421
bees, 405
Belestichê, 335 : mistress of Ptolemy II
Bion, 435 : Borysthenite philosopher, *circa* 325–255 B.C.
bird(s), 17, 167, 169, 197, 319, 357
boars, 25
Boëdromion, 249, 251 : Attic month
Boeotia, 41
Boeotian(s), 39, 229, 309, 339, 381
Boëthus, 131-137 : Epicurean friend of Plutarch

CACUS, 389 : monstrous son of Hephaestus
Cadmus, 228 note *c*, 229, 235 : founder of Thebes
Caesar (Augustus), 159 ; (Vespasian), 439
Caesernius, 33, 35, 55, 59 : son-in-law of Florus
Calliopê, 265, 285 : Muse
Callistratus, 43 and note *c*, 45, 47 : rich Delphian
calves, 315
Camma, 423, 425 : Galatian heroine
Caphisias, 143, 151 : son of Theon
Caphisodorus, 381 : Theban, beloved of Epaminondas
Carneades, 115 : Academic philosopher, *circa* 218–129 B.C.
Carneia, 115 : festival at Cyrenê
Carthaginian, 165
Cassius Longinus, 225 and note *f*, 227 : of uncertain identity
Cato, 367 : M. Porcius Cato the Censor, *circa* 234-149 B.C.
cattle, 87
*cena*, 163
Ceÿx, 185 : husband of Halcyonê
Chaeronea, 73, 99 : town in Boeotia, Plutarch's birthplace
Chalcidian(s), 377 ; of Thrace, 377
Chalcis, 379 : city of Euboea
Charites : see Charm, Graces
Charm : 269, 278 note *a*, 279 ; see also Graces
Cheiron, 115 : the Centaur
chickens, 181 ; see also fowls, hen(s)

Chios, 267 : large island off the coast of Asia Minor
cholera, 193
Chrysippus, 195, 267, 353, 415 note *c* : the pillar of Stoic philosophy, *circa* 280–207 B.C.
cicadas, 169, 417
Cilicia, 199, 315
Cimon, 381 : Athenian statesman and general, *circa* 512–449 B.C.
Cinesias, 83 : character in a play of Plato Comicus
Civilis, 435 : Gaius Julius, noble Batavian who led the great rebellion in Gaul, A.D. 69–70
Cleitomachus, 75 : great athlete
Cleomachus, 375, 377 : Pharsalian general
Clio, 267, 285 : Muse
Clotho, 277 : one of the Fates
Comedy : see New Comedy, Old Comedy
*comissatum*, 165
Corinth, 223, 421 ; see also Acrocorinth
Corinthian, 149, 223
*corona*, 165
Corybantes, 363 : ecstatic devotees of Cybelê or Attis
Corybantic, 365
*Cosmogony*, 351 : poem of Parmenides
Crateas, 425 : slayer of Archelaüs
Cratinus, 83 : Athenian comic poet of the fifth century B.C.
Cretan(s), 93, 151, 297, 381, 411, 415
crocodiles, 35
Cronus, 261 : father of Zeus
cuttlefish, 205
Cybelê, 363, 391 : the goddess
Cyclopean, 179
Cyclops, 13, 389 note *e* : the one-eyed giant
Cynic(s), 113, 369 : philosophical sect
Cynosarges, 318 note *a*, 319 : gymnasium at Athens
Cyprian, 369
Cypris, 239, 353, 425 ; see also Aphroditê
Cyprus, 143, 411
Cyprus-born, 323
Cypselus, 149 : tyrant of Corinth *circa* 655–625 B.C.
Cyrenaeans, 115
Cyrenaics, 47, 417 note *a* : philosophical sect

DAPHNAEUS, 309, 313, 315, 321-327, 357, 365, 387, 389 and note *f*, 391, 407, 417 : Thespian
Daulis, 169 : city in Phocis
Death : see Hades
deer, 25, 355 ; see also stags
*deipnon*, 161, 163
Delos, 149 : sacred Aegean island
Delphi, 23, 67, 149, 181, 249, 335, 493 ; see also Pytho
Delphians, 151, 273, 277, 427
Demeter(s), 271, 275 : goddess
Demetrius II, 222 note *c*, 223 : king of Macedon 239–229 B.C.
Democriteans, 199
Democritus, 139, 205-209 ; quoted, 141 : the laughing atomic philosopher of Abdera, *circa* 460–370 B.C.
Demosthenes, 239, 255 : great Attic orator, 384–322 B.C.
*dentes*, 165
Dexippus : see Dioxippus and 15 note *d*
Dicaearchus, 123 : Peripatetic of fourth century B.C.
dictator, 421 : at Rome
Diogenes, 441 : native of Thespiae
Diogenes, 113 : of Sinopê, Cynic philosopher, *circa* 400–325 B.C.
Diogenes, 220 note *a*, 221 : school at Athens
Diogenianus, 73, 77, 81, 85, 111, 113, 119, 129, 187, 191, 193, 199, 203 : of Pergamum, friend of Plutarch
Diomedes, 237, 239 : Greek hero in the Trojan War
Dionê, 293 : mother of Aphroditê
Dionysius, 265, 275 : friend of Plutarch
Dionysius, 379 : poet
Dionysius I, 113 : tyrant of Syracuse 406–367 B.C.
Dionysus, 47, 75, 95, 101, 111, 209, 231. 249, 275, 323, 357, 363 : the god
Dioxippus, 15 and note *d*, 17 : Hippocratean medical authority

dog(s), 35, 39, 191, 203, 337, 415
dog-fish, 185
dog-star, 7 : Sirius
Domitian, 439 note *c* : emperor of Rome A.D. 81–96
donkey, 243
Dorus, 293 : son of Hellen
Dotion, 297 : plain in Thessaly

EAGLE, 319
Echo, 81
*edere*, 165
Egypt, 113, 145, 177, 235, 345, 438 note *a*, 439
Egyptian(s), 35, 117, 177, 179, 185, 235, 385, 393, 397
Eileithyia, 359 : goddess protector of childbirth
elephantiasis, 187, 191
Eleusinian, 403 note *c* : Mysteries
Eleusis, 383 : town in Attica
Eleuthereus, 103 : Dionysus
*ellops*, 175
Elpenor, 247 : companion of Odysseus
Empedocles, quoted, 133, 147, 175, 279, 349, 351 : Sicilian philosopher of the fifth century B.C.
Empedocles, 173, 175 : friend of Plutarch
Empona, 437-441 : wife of Sabinus
Enyalios, 355 : Ares
Epaminondas, 381 : Theban statesman and general, *circa* 420–362 B.C.
Ephebus, 199 : Athenian, friend of Plutarch
Ephesian letters, 55 and note *c*
Epicurean(s), 413 notes *b-d*, 417 note *a*
Epicurus, 207, 405 note *a*, 431 ; quoted, 133 : Athenian philosopher, 342–271 B.C.
*Epidemics*, 187 : work of Athenodorus
epilepsy, 345 note *c*
Er, 245 : in Plato, *Republic*
Erasistratus, 9 and note *d*, 11, 15 : medical writer of the third century B.C.
Erato, 287 : Muse
Erato, 215, 219, 221, 265 : young musical friend of Plutarch
Eratosthenes, quoted, 15 : great all-round Alexandrian scholar and poet, *circa* 275–194 B.C.
Eretrians, 377 : of Euboea
*erispharagoi*, 11
Eros, 81, 307, 309, 313-319, 323, 325, 333, 335, 339, 343-353, 359, 361, 369, 371, 375, 379, 383-387, 395-407, 411-421, 425, 429-433, 441 : god of Love
Erotidia, 307 : festival of Eros at Thespiae
Ethiopia, 329
Etruria, 167
Etruscan(s), 167, 177
Eubuleus, 95 : ancient epithet of Dionysus
Eucnamus, 381 : warrior of Amphissa
Eudoxus, 121 : of Cnidus, mathematician and astronomer, *circa* 408–355 B.C.
Eumaeus, 41, 161 : heroic swineherd of Odysseus
*euphronê*, 94 note *a*, 95
Eupolis, 83 ; quoted, 13 : Athenian comic poet of the fifth century B.C.
Euripides, 55, 75, 113, 329 note *c*, 347, 435 ; quoted, 15, 89, 103, 117, 223, 291, 313, 343, 347, 351, 353, 361, 367, 375, 385, 395, 401, 411, 433 : Athenian tragic poet, *circa* 484–406 B.C.
Eurydicê, 383 : beloved of Orpheus
Eustrophus, 33, 39 : Athenian friend of Plutarch
Euterpê, 267, 287 : Muse
Euthydemus, 21, 23 and note *e*, 25 : a contemporary of Plutarch
Euxynthetus, 411 : Cretan lover of Leucocoma
Evenus, quoted, 5 : lyric poet of the fifth century B.C.

FATES, 277
Favorinus, 203, 205 and note *c*, 207 : famous Gallic rhetorician, *circa* A.D. 80–150
fish, 39, 173-185, 317, 319
*Flatterers*, 13 : play of Eupolis
Flavian, 307 : friend of Plutarch's son Autobulus
Florus, 7, 13 and note *b*, 21, 25,

33, 35, 55, 59, 61, 111, 115, 119, 123, 125, 203 : L. Mestrius Florus, influential Roman friend of Plutarch
fly (flies), 171, 315
Forgetfulness : see Lethê
fowls, 315 ; see also chickens, hen(s)
Fury (Furies), 333, 353

GABBA, 159, 371 : a court-jester of Augustus Caesar
Galatia, 423 : Gaulish kingdom in Asia Minor
Galatian(s), 423
Gaul, 435
Gaulish, 437
Gauls, 203, 435
geometry, 119 ff., 403
Glaucias, 91, 95, 253, 255, 261 : Athenian rhetor and friend of Plutarch
Gnathaenion, 371 : courtesan
Gnatho, 61 and note *a* : parasite in New Comedy
goat, 23
Gorgias, 101, 169 : famous sophist of the fifth century B.C.
Gorgo, 411, 413 : of Crete
Gorgon, 291
Grace(s), 73, 91, 361, 387, 429 : the Charities ; see also Charm
Greece, 145, 293, 421, 425
Greek(s), 91-95, 113, 153, 163, 165, 183, 185, 225, 239, 241, 257, 397, 437
Gyges, 371 : king of Lydia *circa* 685–657 B.C.

HABROTONON, 332 note *b*, 333 : Themistocles' mother
Hades (Death), 245, 247, 281, 383, 403 ; see also Pluto
hare(s), 181, 355
Harmodius, 435 : Athenian tyrannicide, killed 514 B.C.
*harmonia*, 245
Harmonius, 244 note *b*, 245 : father of Er
Harmony, 427
Harpies, 67
Hecatê, 67 : ancient Chthonian goddess
Hector, 11, 255, 259-263 : the hero of Troy
Helen, 255-259 : wife of Menelaüs
Helicon, 55, 307, 309 : largest mountain of Boeotia
Helius, 183, 185, 251 and note *f*, 397-401, 433 : the Sun
Hellen, 185, 293 : eponymous ancestor of the Hellenes
Hellenes : see Greek(s)
Hellespont, 183 : the modern Dardanelles
hen(s), 21, 117, 169 ; see also chickens, fowls
Hephaestus, 269, 321, 389 : the god
Hera, 223, 249, 293, 321, 409 note *c* : goddess-queen
Heracles, 223, 293, 323, 339, 355, 381 : hero
Heraclitus, quoted, 345 : the weeping Ionian philosopher of the sixth and fifth centuries B.C.
Hermeias, 227, 229, 233-237 : geometer contemporary with Plutarch
Herodotus, quoted, 329 : of Halicarnassus, historian of the Persian Wars
Hesiod, 27, 37, 185, 231, 265, 273, 285, 351, 392 note *b*, 395 ; quoted, 25, 29, 39, 59, 157, 221, 227, 293, 321 note *c*, 331
Hipparchus, 197 : famous astronomer of the second century B.C.
Hippocrates, 15 : the most famous medical writer of antiquity, probably of the fifth and fourth centuries B.C.
Hippolochus, 421 : of Thessaly, lover of Laïs
*Hippothoros*, 45 : " The Stallion's Leap," a tune
Homer, 25, 55, 87, 93, 109 note *a*, 191, 221 note *b*, 235 note *c*, 237, 249, 255-265, 279, 393, 427 ; quoted, 5, 11, 13, 41, 57, 73, 93, 115, 145, 151, 157, 161-165, 183, 185, 191, 201, 203, 211, 223-227, 235, 239-243, 247, 255-265, 269, 277, 291, 293, 319, 353, 357, 361, 365, 371, 379, 387, 397, 415, 427, 433 ; see also *Iliad*, *Odyssey*
horses, 415 ; see also mare(s), stallion

Hybris, 424 note *a*, 425
hydrophobia, 187, 191
Hylas, 241, 243, 249, 251 : rhetor contemporary with Plutarch
Hypatê, 277 : name of a Muse
*hyporchemata*, 295 and note *b*, 297 note *b*, 298 note *b*
*hypotheseis*, 85

IBIS, 235
Ibycus, quoted, 141, 297 : lyric poet of the sixth century B.C.
*Iliad*, 237, 255 ; see also Homer
Ilissus, 307 : stream near Athens
Ilithyia : see Eileithyia
Iolaüs, 339, 381 : beloved of Heracles
Ion, 113 : of Chios, poet and dramatist of the fifth century B.C.
Iphiclus, 293 : brother of Heracles
Ismenodora, 311, 313, 329, 331 note *b*, 333, 337-347, 441 : rich widow of Thespiae
Isthmian games, 143 : held at Corinth
Ixion, 409 and note *c* : attempted Hera

JAYS, 169

*KERASBOLOS*, 21
*kordax*, 81
*kykeon*, 9

*LABRA*, 165
Lacedaemon, 123, 309
Lacedaemonian(s), 7, 115, 151, 175 ; see also Laconian, Spartan(s)
Lachesis, 277 : one of the Fates
Laconian, 415 ; see also Lacedaemonian(s), Spartan(s)
Laespodias, 83 : character in a comedy of Eupolis
Laïs, 317, 371, 421 : famous courtesan
Laïus, 313 and note *d* : father of Oedipus
Lampon, 83 : character in a comedy of Cratinus
Lamprias, 43, 44 note *a*, 45, 47, 53, 95, 97 note *b*, 99, 159, 163, 216, 241-251, 265, 271, 277, 289 : Plutarch's brother
Lamprias, 231 : Plutarch's grandfather
Latin, 163
Lelantine War, 377
Lemnian, 343 and note *c*
Lemnos, 343 : large island in the northern Aegean
Leon, 47 : father of Callistratus
Leptis, 185 : African port
Lethê, 47, 249 : the river of Forgetfulness in the world below
Leucocoma, 411 : Cretan maiden beloved of Euxynthetus
*leukaniê*, 11, 13
lion, 243
lioness, 439
Locheia, 359 : goddess of childbirth
Locri, 15 : city of Southern Italy
Longinus : see Cassius Longinus
Love : see Eros
Lucius, 166 note *b*, 167, 169, 173, 175 : a Pythagorean contemporary with Plutarch
Lucius, 33, 35, 41 : son of Florus
Lycurgus, 123 : traditional founder of the Spartan constitution
Lysander, 253 : Spartan general, killed 395 B.C.
Lysandra, 309, 327, 389 : beloved by Daphnaeus
*Lysios*, 103 : epithet of Dionysus

MACEDONIA, 27
Macedonian, 373
Maecenas, 371 : the adviser of Augustus and patron of poets
Mantineia, 381 : battle in which Epaminondas was killed, 362 B.C.
Marcus, 241, 247 : rhetor contemporary with Plutarch
mare(s), 45, 337, 415
*Marriage of Ceïx*, 185 : a work in antiquity attributed by some to Hesiod
Marsyas, 89 : satyr flayed by Apollo for presumptuous rivalry
marten, 183
Martial, 437 : servant of Sabinus
Maximus, 237, 239 : rhetor contemporary with Plutarch
Mede(s), 39, 113 ; see also Persian
Megara, 339 : wife of Heracles

Megarians, 185
*Melanippê*, 347, 349 : the tragedy of Euripides
Melanippides, quoted, 361 : lyric poet
Melanippus, 373 : tyrannicide of Agrigentum
Meleager, 381 : hero of the Calydonian boar hunt
Melitê, 275 : Attic deme
Melpomenê, 287 and note *c* : Muse
Menaechmus, 121 : mathematician
Menander, 55, 83, 85 ; quoted, 53, 243, 391 : Athenian comic poet, *circa* 342–290 B.C.
Menelaüs, 55, 57, 255-259, 263 : Spartan hero at Troy
Menephylus, 249, 265, 277 : Peripatetic philosopher contemporary with Plutarch
Meniscus, 289 : dancing teacher
Meno, 199 : medical writer
*mensa*, 165
Mesê, 277 : name of a Muse
metaphor, 291
Metapontum, 373 : city in Southern Italy
*metoporon*, 209
Milesian, 333
Mitylenê, 395 : chief city of Lesbos
Mneiai, 267 : name of the Muses
Mnemosynê, 308 note *a* : Memory, mother of the Muses (*cf.* 267)
Moderatus, 167 : Pythagorean
mole, 23
Moon, 251 and note *f*, 399 and notes, 411, 433
mouse (mice), 183, 199
mullet, grey, 183
Mummius, 223, 225 : Lucius Achaicus, sacked Corinth 146 B.C.
Munychia, 337 : citadel of the Piraeus
Muse(s), 51, 55, 91, 111, 218 note *a*, 219, 227, 235, 265-285, 287 and note *c*, 299, 307, 309, 323, 353, 361, 363, 385, 389, 396 note *c*, 412 note *a* ; see also Pierides
*Myrmidons*, 321 note *b* : a tragedy of Aeschylus
NATURE, 15, 65, 133, 287, 343, 433, *al.*
nausea, 193
Nausicaa, 144 note *b* : princess of Phaeacia
Naxos, 249 : island of the central Aegean
Neatê, 277 : name of a Muse
Necessity, 277, 279
Nestor, 173, 185 : contemporary of Plutarch
Nestor, 93 : king of Pylos, hero of the Trojan War
New Comedy, 83
Nicias, 149 : Athenian politician, *circa* 470–413 B.C.
Nicias, 7, 11 : physician contemporary with Plutarch
Nicolaüs(es), 143, 147 and note *b* : of Damascus, court historian of Herod the Great, *floruit* 20-4 B.C.
Nicopolis, 7 : probably the city of Pontus is meant
Nicostratus, 373 : Argive contemporary of Philip V of Macedon
Nicostratus, 91, 95, 97 : Athenian host of Plutarch
nightingale, 169
*nikê*, 145
Nile, 153-157, 177 : the river of Egypt
Ninus, 333, 335 : king of Assyria
Niobê, 375 : daughter of Tantalus and wife of Amphion

ODYSSEUS, 41, 178 note *c*, 183, 249, 281, 291 : the Homeric hero
*Odyssey*, 237 ; see also Homer
Oenanthê, 333 and note *f* : mother of Agathoclea
*oinos*, 97
Old Comedy, 81
Olympian, 413
Olympias, 293 : mother of Alexander the Great
onomatopoeia, 291
*opson*, 161
*Origins*, 379 : a work of Dionysius
Orpheus, 383
Orphic, 147
Osiris, 177, 393 : Egyptian divinity

# INDEX


owls, 47
ox, 230 note *a*, 231
oysters, 201

*PAIGNIA*, 85
Palamedes, 237 : the proverbially clever hero
Pammenes, 379 and note *a* : Theban adherent of Epaminondas
Pamphylian, 245
Pan, 81, 291, 363
Pandemos, 397 : Eros
*panis*, 165
Pantheia, 55 : romantic heroine of Xenophon's *Cyropaedeia*
parabasis, 81 : the poet's address to the audience, through chorus and coryphaeus, in Old Comedy
Paracyptousa, 411 and note *f*
Paris, 257, 259, 265 : prince of Troy ; see also Alexander
Parmenides, 351 : philosopher of fifth century B.C.
parrot-wrasse, 183
partridges, 169
Patrocleas, 21, 23 : Plutarch's son-in-law
Patroclus, 321 note *b* : Achilles' friend
Pausanias, 175 : friend of Empedocles
Peitho : see Persuasion
Pelasgian, 295
Peleus, 243 : father of Achilles
Pemptides, 345, 347, 355, 365, 375, 379 : a speaker in the *Dialogue on Love*
Penelopê, 55 : wife of Odysseus
pentathlon, 229, 338 note *b*
Pergamum, 73, 113 : city of Mysia
Periander, 425 : tyrant of Ambracia
Peripatetic(s), 65, 147, 151, 205, 249, 277 : the school of Aristotle
Persephonê, 247 : queen of the lower world
Perseus, 291 : Gorgon-slaying hero
Persia, 39
Persian, 89-95 : see also Mede(s)
Persuasion, 269, 277, 283
*pettoi*, 65
Phaeacian(s), 145, 183
Pharsalia, 375 : city of Thessaly
*pharynx*, 13
Phaÿllus, 373 : Argive contemporary of Philip of Macedon
Pherae, 425 : city of Thessaly
*phiditia*, 93 : the common messes of the Spartans
Philinus, 165, 167 and note *c*, 171 : friend of Plutarch
Philip, 71, 73 : buffoon in Xenophon's *Symposium*
Philip, 73-79, 85 : of Prusa, Stoic contemporary of Plutarch
Philip II, 57, 99, 239 : king of Macedon 359–336 B.C.
Philip V, 222 note *c*, 223, 373 : king of Macedon 221–179 B.C.
Philippi, 27 : town in Macedonia founded by Philip II
Philippides, 317 : Athenian poet of New Comedy
Philistion, 15 : of Locri, medical writer of fourth century B.C.
Philistus, 379 : beloved of Anton
Philo, 186 note *a*, 187, 191 : physician, contemporary with Plutarch
Philolaüs, 121 : of Croton, Pythagorean contemporary with Socrates
Philomela, 168 note *a*, 169 : daughter of Pandion, metamorphosed into a swallow
Philoxenus, 389 : of Cythera, dithyrambic poet, 436/5–380/79 B.C.
Phocians, 381
Phocis, 41 : country of Central Greece
Phoenician, 231, 235
Phorcus (Phorcys), 281 and note *d* : father of the Sirens
Phrygian, 365
Phrynê, 335 note *c*, 371 : famous courtesan of Thespiae
Phrynichus, quoted, 195, 389 : Athenian tragic poet, late sixth and early fifth centuries B.C.
Pierides, 283 : the Muses, *q.v.*
Pindar, 45, 113, 297 notes *b*, *c*, 366 note *b* ; quoted, 47, 51, 55, 195, 275, 283, 291, 297 notes *b*, *c*, 321, 357, 389, 393 : Theban lyric poet, 518–438 B.C.

# INDEX


Pisias, 311, 313, 325-329, 333, 337-343, 347, 441 : Thespian, lover of Bacchon
Pithoigia, 209 and note *c* : first day of the festival Anthesteria
Pittacus, 161, 395 : statesman of Mitylenê, *circa* 650–570 B.C.
Plato, 7, 9, 13-17, 57 note *c*, 73, 75, 79, 93, 111, 115-123, 128 note *b*, 234 note *b*, 241-249, 277-285, 298 note *a*, 307, 312 note *a*, 313 note *c*, 363, 366 note *b*, 367 note *e*, 369, 385, 395, 397, 403 note *d*, 429, 431 note *b*, 433 note *d*, 441 note *a*; quoted, 21, 55, 81, 97, 101, 119-123, 141, 245, 247, 281-285, 313, 323, 363, 365, 397, 403, 419 : Athenian philosopher, *circa* 427–347 B.C.
Plato, 83 : Athenian poet of the Old Comedy
Platonic, 279, 397
Platonists, 413 note *d*
Plutarch, 2, 7, 21-27, 33, 39, 43, 53, 55, 63, 65, 73, 77, 85, 91, 111, 119, 127-131, 137, 143, 153, 159, 165-173, 179, 187, 191-195, 203, 205, 215, 227-233, 253, 255, 265, 289, 307, 309, 313, 327 and note *e*, 331-341, 347-441 : philosopher and biographer of Chaeronea, *circa* A.D. 46-127
Pluto, 359 : lord of the underworld ; see also Hades
Podargus, 415 : Menelaüs' horse
Podes, 259 : Trojan, friend of Hector
Polycharmus, 33, 159 : Athenian
Polycrates, 253 : tyrant of Samos *circa* 540–522 B.C.
Polymathia, 287 : Sicyonian name for the Muses
Polymnia, 267, 285 : Muse
Pompey, 113, 225 : the Great, 106–48 B.C.
Porson's law, 293 note *d*
Poseidon, 185, 249, 251 : the god
*prandium*, 163
Praxiteles, 143, 149, 151 : geographer contemporary with Plutarch
Prayers, 393 : the ninth book of the *Iliad*
Priam 41, 261 : king of Troy
*Problems, Scientific*, 203 : work of Aristotle
Procnê, 168 note *a*, 169 : daughter of Pandion, metamorphosed into a nightingale
Protagoras, 13 : of Abdera, one of the earliest of the sophists
Proteas, 373 : Macedonian, brother of Theodorus
Protesilaüs, 383 : husband of Laodamia
Protogenes, 7, 10 note *b*, 11, 143, 149, 215, 227, 229, 253, 255, 309, 313-331, 343 : friend of Plutarch from Tarsus
Providence, 131, 132 note *a*
Prusa, 73 : city of Bithynia
Prytaneum, 93 : at Athens
Ptolemy II, 222 note *a*, 223 : king of Egypt 285–246 B.C.
Pyladic, 80 note *b*, 81 : dances
Pyriphlegethon, 203 : river of the lower world
pyrrhic dance, 289 and note *b*
Pythagoras, 39, 123, 129, 167, 171, 177, 179 : philosopher of the sixth century B.C.
Pythagorean(s), 165-175, 179, 183
Pythia, 365, 391 : the prophetic priestess at Delphi
Pythian, 43, 115, 149
Pytho, 151 : Delphi, *q.v.*
Pytholaüs, 425 : slew his lover, Alexander of Pherae

RED SEA, 197
Rhodes, 227 : island off the southern coast of Asia Minor
roebucks, 355
Roman(s), 5, 33, 35, 39, 163, 167, 367, 371, 389
Rome, 35, 79, 167, 421, 439

SABINUS, 435-439 : a noble Gaul ; his sons, 439
Salamis, 113 : the battle of 480 B.C.
Samian, 333
Sappho, 79, 389, 409 note *b* ; quoted, 321, 389 : the most celebrated of ancient poetesses, of Lesbos, born *circa* 612 B.C.
Satyr, 81
*Scientific Problems*, 203 : work of Aristotle

sea-urchins, 201
seal, 23
Semiramis, 333, 335 : queen of Assyria
Senecio : see Sossius Senecio
serpents, 95 ; see also snake(s)
*Seven against Thebes*, 101 : tragedy of Aeschylus
seventh-born, 114 note *a*, 115
" shadows," 57 ff. : parasites
sheep, 41
Sicilian, 113
Sicyonians, 287
Simon, 309 : father of Lysandra
Simonides, 237, 295, 297 note *b* ; quoted, 141, 269 : lyric and elegiac poet, *circa* 556–468 B.C.
Sinatus, 423 : tetrarch of Galatia
Sinorix, 423 : his murderer
Sirens, 53, 75, 277-281
Sirius : see Dog-star
snake(s), 171, 345, 421 ; see also serpents
Soclarus, 159, 160 note *a*, 161, 308 note *b*, 309, 343, 395, 397, 441 : an intimate friend of Plutarch
Socrates, 57, 73, 81, 89, 111, 115, 123, 387 : the Athenian philosopher, 469–399 B.C.
solecism, 191
Solon, 319-323, 393, 395, 427 : Athenian statesman and poet, *circa* 640–560 B.C.
Sophocles, quoted, 117, 189, 193, 225, 249, 281, 351, 353, 363, 369, 375, 383, 419, 425 : Athenian tragic poet, *circa* 496–406 B.C.
Sospis, 143, 147, 149, 153, 215, 241, 243, 253, 255, 257 : friend of Plutarch
Sossius Senecio, 4 note *a*, 5, 109, 219, 299 : Roman friend of Plutarch
sow, 201
*spadix*, 149
Sparta : see Lacedaemon
Spartan(s), 77, 91, 93, 381 ; see also Lacedaemonian(s), Laconian
stag(s), 23, 45 ; see also deer
stallion, 45 ; see also horses
Stoic(s), 73, 110 note *a*, 177, 353 note *f*, 415 note *c*
stork, 171
*strategos*, 219 and note *b*
Stratios, 355 : war-god
Stratocles, 317 : Athenian demagogue, *circa* 350–292 B.C.
Stratonicê, 333 note *e* : concubine of Mithridates
Strife(s), 221, 393 : in Hesiod
Sulla, 165 and note *d*, 169, 173, 179 : Sextius, Carthaginian friend of Plutarch
Sun : see Helius
swallow(s), 165-171
*symbola*, 167, 171 : of Pythagoras
*Symposiacs:* see *Table-Talk*
symposium (-ia), 83, 103
*Symposium*, 73, of Plato ; *-iums*, 75, of Plato and Xenophon
Syria, 145
Syrian(s), 185, 333

*TABLE-TALK*, 111, 219
Tantalus, 371 : son of Zeus, father of Pelops
Tarsus, 309 : city of Cilicia
Teiresias, 247 : blind seer of Thebes
Telamon, 241 : father of Ajax
Telamonian, 243
Telemachus, 41, 387 : son of Odysseus
Tereus, 168 note *a*. 169 : son of Ares and king of Thrace
Terpsichorê, 287 and note *c* : Muse
Thalia, 275, 285, 287 : Muse
Thargelia, 115 : festival at Athens
Thargelion, 111 : Attic month
Thebes, 101, 306 note *a*, 379 : city of Boeotia
Themis, 293 : goddess of Justice
Theodectes, 49 : identity unknown
Theodorus, 373 : Macedonian, brother of Proteas
Theodorus, 224 note *b*, 225 : tragic actor of the fourth century B.C.
Theon, 151, 158 note *a*, 159, 161, 173, 175 : friend of Plutarch
Theophrastus, 21, 24 note *a*, 25 notes *b-d*, 331 note *c* ; quoted, 103 : Peripatetic philosopher, *circa* 369–285 B.C.

# INDEX


Thermopylae, 203 : town near the famous pass, lying between Thessaly and Phocis
Theron, 379 : Thessalian
Theseus, 149 : Attic hero
Thesmotheteum, 93 : at Athens
Thespiae, 306 note *a*, 307-311, 412 note *a*, 441 : town in Boeotia
Thespians, 309 note *e*, 341
Thessalian(s), 377, 421
Thessaly, 379, 421
Thrace, 377
Thracian, 333
Thrasybulus, 250 note *b*, 251 : Athenian statesman and general ; died 388 B.C.
Thrasybulus, 289 : contemporary of Plutarch
Thrasyllus, 131, 141, 143 : son of Ammonius
Thucydides, 197 : the great historian of the Peloponnesian War, *circa* 460–400 B.C.
*Timaeus*, 128 note *b*, 129 : Plato's work
Timaeus, 113 : Sicilian historian, *circa* 356–260 B.C.
Timon, 199 : not to be identified with any certainty
Timon, quoted, 49 : sceptic philosopher and poet, *circa* 320–230 B.C.
Timoxena, 309 : Plutarch's wife
Tithora, 309 : town in Phocis
toads, 171
Trojan(s), 239, 257
Troy, 93
Trypho, 265, 275 : medical friend of Plutarch
Tydeus, 239 : father of Diomedes
Tyndares, 111, 115, 119-125, 175 : Spartan Platonist, contemporary with Plutarch

URANIA, 283 note *d* : Muse
Uranios, 397 : Eros

VESPASIAN, 435, 439 note *c*, 441 : emperor of Rome A.D. 69–79

WOLF (WOLVES), 35, 355
*Works and Days*, 221 : Hesiod's poem
wrasse : see parrot-wrasse

XENOCRATES, 53, 197, 429 : disciple of Plato and head of the Academy 339–314 B.C.
Xenophanes, 393 ; quoted, 283 : Greek philosopher, *circa* 570–498 B.C.
Xenophon, 71 note *a*, 73, 75 : Greek historian and general author, *circa* 430–354 B.C.
Xuthus, 293 : son of Hellen

ZEPHYR, 407 : the West Wind
Zeus, 37, 141, 223, 249, 259, 261, 265, 269, 283, 291, 347, 349, 373 : the god
Zeuxippus, 309, 341, 361, 363, 387, 412 note *a*, 417, 431, 441 : Spartan friend of Plutarch
Zopyrio, 233, 237, 239 : schoolmaster contemporary with Plutarch



*Printed in Great Britain by* R. & R. CLARK, LIMITED, *Edinburgh*

# THE LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

## VOLUMES ALREADY PUBLISHED

### LATIN AUTHORS

AMMIANUS MARCELLINUS. J. C. Rolfe. 3 Vols.
APULEIUS: THE GOLDEN ASS (METAMORPHOSES). W. Adlington (1566). Revised by S. Gaselee.
ST. AUGUSTINE: CITY OF GOD. 7 Vols. Vol. I. G. E. McCracken. Vol. II. W. M. Green. Vol. III. D. Wiesen. Vol. IV. P. Levine. Vol. V. E. M. Sanford and W. M. Green. Vol. VI. W. C. Greene.
ST. AUGUSTINE, CONFESSIONS OF. W. Watts (1631). 2 Vols.
ST. AUGUSTINE: SELECT LETTERS. J. H. Baxter.
AUSONIUS. H. G. Evelyn White. 2 Vols.
BEDE. J. E. King. 2 Vols.
BOETHIUS: TRACTS AND DE CONSOLATIONE PHILOSOPHIAE. Rev. H. F. Stewart and E. K. Rand.
CAESAR: ALEXANDRIAN, AFRICAN AND SPANISH WARS. A. G. Way.
CAESAR: CIVIL WARS. A. G. Peskett.
CAESAR: GALLIC WAR. H. J. Edwards.
CATO AND VARRO: DE RE RUSTICA. H. B. Ash and W. D. Hooper.
CATULLUS. F. W. Cornish; TIBULLUS. J. B. Postgate; and PERVIGILIUM VENERIS. J. W. Mackail.
CELSUS: DE MEDICINA. W. G. Spencer. 3 Vols.
CICERO: BRUTUS AND ORATOR. G. L. Hendrickson and H. M. Hubbell.
CICERO: DE FINIBUS. H. Rackham.
CICERO: DE INVENTIONE, etc. H. M. Hubbell.
CICERO: DE NATURA DEORUM AND ACADEMICA. H. Rackham.
CICERO: DE OFFICIIS. Walter Miller.
CICERO: DE ORATORE, etc. 2 Vols. Vol. I: DE ORATORE, Books I and II. E. W. Sutton and H. Rackham. Vol. II: DE ORATORE, Book III; DE FATO; PARADOXA STOICORUM; DE PARTITIONE ORATORIA. H. Rackham.
CICERO: DE REPUBLICA, DE LEGIBUS, SOMNIUM SCIPIONIS. Clinton W. Keyes.

CICERO: DE SENECTUTE, DE AMICITIA, DE DIVINATIONE. W. A. Falconer.
CICERO: IN CATILINAM, PRO MURENA, PRO SULLA, PRO FLACCO. Louis E. Lord.
CICERO: LETTERS TO ATTICUS. E. O. Winstedt. 3 Vols.
CICERO: LETTERS TO HIS FRIENDS. W. Glynn Williams. 3 Vols
CICERO: PHILIPPICS. W. C. A. Ker.
CICERO: PRO ARCHIA, POST REDITUM, DE DOMO, DE HARUSPICUM RESPONSIS, PRO PLANCIO. N. H. Watts.
CICERO: PRO CAECINA, PRO LEGE MANILIA, PRO CLUENTIO, PRO RABIRIO. H. Grose Hodge.
CICERO: PRO CAELIO, DE PROVINCIIS CONSULARIBUS, PRO BALBO. R. Gardner.
CICERO: PRO MILONE, IN PISONEM, PRO SCAURO, PRO FONTEIO, PRO RABIRIO POSTUMO, PRO MARCELLO, PRO LIGARIO, PRO REGE DEIOTARO. N. H. Watts.
CICERO: PRO QUINCTIO, PRO ROSCIO AMERINO, PRO ROSCIO COMOEDO, CONTRA RULLUM. J. H. Freese.
CICERO: PRO SESTIO, IN VATINIUM. R. Gardner.
[CICERO]: RHETORICA AD HERENNIUM. H. Caplan.
CICERO: TUSCULAN DISPUTATIONS. J. E. King.
CICERO: VERRINE ORATIONS. L. H. G. Greenwood. 2 Vols.
CLAUDIAN. M. Platnauer. 2 Vols.
COLUMELLA: DE RE RUSTICA, DE ARBORIBUS. H. B. Ash, E. S. Forster, E. Heffner. 3 Vols.
CURTIUS, Q.: HISTORY OF ALEXANDER. J. C. Rolfe. 2 Vols.
FLORUS. E. S. Forster; and CORNELIUS NEPOS. J. C. Rolfe.
FRONTINUS: STRATAGEMS AND AQUEDUCTS. C. E. Bennett and M. B. McElwain.
FRONTO: CORRESPONDENCE. C. R. Haines. 2 Vols.
GELLIUS. J. C. Rolfe. 3 Vols.
HORACE: ODES AND EPODES. C. E. Bennett.
HORACE: SATIRES, EPISTLES, ARS POETICA. H. R. Fairclough.
JEROME: SELECT LETTERS. F. A. Wright.
JUVENAL AND PERSIUS. G. G. Ramsay.
LIVY. B. O. Foster, F. G. Moore, Evan T. Sage, A. C. Schlesinger and R. M. Geer (General Index). 14 Vols.
LUCAN. J. D. Duff.
LUCRETIUS. W. H. D. Rouse.
MARTIAL. W. C. A. Ker. 2 Vols.
MINOR LATIN POETS: from PUBLILIUS SYRUS TO RUTILIUS NAMATIANUS, including GRATTIUS, CALPURNIUS SICULUS, NEMESIANUS, AVIANUS, with "Aetna," "Phoenix" and other poems. J. Wight Duff and Arnold M. Duff.

OVID: THE ART OF LOVE AND OTHER POEMS. J. H. Mozley.
OVID: FASTI. Sir James G. Frazer.
OVID: HEROIDES AND AMORES. Grant Showerman.
OVID: METAMORPHOSES. F. J. Miller. 2 Vols.
OVID: TRISTIA AND EX PONTO. A. L. Wheeler.
PETRONIUS. M. Heseltine; SENECA: APOCOLOCYNTOSIS. W. H. D. Rouse.
PHAEDRUS AND BABRIUS (Greek). B. E. Perry.
PLAUTUS. Paul Nixon. 5 Vols.
PLINY: LETTERS, PANEGYRICUS. B. Radice. 2 Vols.
PLINY: NATURAL HISTORY. 10 Vols. Vols. I-V and IX. H. Rackham. Vols. VI-VIII. W. H. S. Jones. Vol. X. D. E. Eichholz.
PROPERTIUS. H. E. Butler.
PRUDENTIUS. H. J. Thomson. 2 Vols.
QUINTILIAN. H. E. Butler. 4 Vols.
REMAINS OF OLD LATIN. E. H. Warmington. 4 Vols. Vol. I (Ennius and Caecilius). Vol. II (Livius, Naevius, Pacuvius, Accius). Vol. III (Lucilius, Laws of the XII Tables). Vol. IV (Archaic Inscriptions).
SALLUST. J. C. Rolfe.
SCRIPTORES HISTORIAE AUGUSTAE. D. Magie. 3 Vols.
SENECA: APOCOLOCYNTOSIS. *Cf.* PETRONIUS.
SENECA: EPISTULAE MORALES. R. M. Gummere. 3 Vols.
SENECA: MORAL ESSAYS. J. W. Basore. 3 Vols.
SENECA: TRAGEDIES. F. J. Miller. 2 Vols.
SIDONIUS: POEMS AND LETTERS. W. B. Anderson. 2 Vols.
SILIUS ITALICUS. J. D. Duff. 2 Vols.
STATIUS. J. H. Mozley. 2 Vols.
SUETONIUS. J. C. Rolfe. 2 Vols.
TACITUS: AGRICOLA AND GERMANIA. Maurice Hutton; DIALOGUS. Sir Wm. Peterson.
TACITUS: HISTORIES AND ANNALS. C. H. Moore and J. Jackson. 4 Vols.
TERENCE. John Sargeaunt. 2 Vols.
TERTULLIAN: APOLOGIA AND DE SPECTACULIS. T. R. Glover: MINUCIUS FELIX. G. H. Rendall.
VALERIUS FLACCUS. J. H. Mozley.
VARRO: DE LINGUA LATINA. R. G. Kent. 2 Vols.
VELLEIUS PATERCULUS AND RES GESTAE DIVI AUGUSTI. F. W. Shipley.
VIRGIL. H. R. Fairclough. 2 Vols.
VITRUVIUS: DE ARCHITECTURA. F. Granger. 2 Vols.

# THE LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

## GREEK AUTHORS

ACHILLES TATIUS. S. Gaselee.
AELIAN: ON THE NATURE OF ANIMALS. A. F. Scholfield. 3 Vols.
AENEAS TACTICUS, ASCLEPIODOTUS AND ONASANDER. The Illinois Greek Club.
AESCHINES. C. D. Adams.
AESCHYLUS. H. Weir Smyth. 2 Vols.
ALCIPHRON, AELIAN AND PHILOSTRATUS: LETTERS. A. R Benner and F. H. Fobes.
APOLLODORUS. Sir James G. Frazer. 2 Vols.
APOLLONIUS RHODIUS. R. C. Seaton.
THE APOSTOLIC FATHERS. Kirsopp Lake. 2 Vols.
APPIAN'S ROMAN HISTORY. Horace White. 4 Vols.
ARATUS. *Cf.* CALLIMACHUS.
ARISTOPHANES. Benjamin Bickley Rogers. 3 Vols. Verse trans.
ARISTOTLE: ART OF RHETORIC. J. H. Freese.
ARISTOTLE: ATHENIAN CONSTITUTION, EUDEMIAN ETHICS, VIRTUES AND VICES. H. Rackham.
ARISTOTLE: THE CATEGORIES. ON INTERPRETATION. H. P. Cooke; PRIOR ANALYTICS. H. Tredennick.
ARISTOTLE: GENERATION OF ANIMALS. A. L. Peck.
ARISTOTLE: HISTORIA ANIMALIUM. A. L. Peck. 3 Vols. Vols. I and II.
ARISTOTLE: METAPHYSICS. H. Tredennick. 2 Vols.
ARISTOTLE: METEOROLOGICA. H. D. P. Lee.
ARISTOTLE: MINOR WORKS. W. S. Hett. "On Colours," "On Things Heard," "Physiognomics," "On Plants," "On Marvellous Things Heard," "Mechanical Problems," "On Indivisible Lines," "Situations and Names of Winds," "On Melissus, Xenophanes, and Gorgias."
ARISTOTLE: NICOMACHEAN ETHICS. H. Rackham.
ARISTOTLE: OECONOMICA AND MAGNA MORALIA. G. C. Armstrong. (With METAPHYSICS, Vol. II.)
ARISTOTLE: ON THE HEAVENS. W. K. C. Guthrie.
ARISTOTLE: ON THE SOUL, PARVA NATURALIA. ON BREATH. W. S. Hett.
ARISTOTLE: PARTS OF ANIMALS. A. L. Peck; MOVEMENT AND PROGRESSION OF ANIMALS. E. S. Forster.
ARISTOTLE: PHYSICS. Rev. P. Wicksteed and F. M. Cornford. 2 Vols.

ARISTOTLE: POETICS; LONGINUS ON THE SUBLIME. W. Hamilton Fyfe; DEMETRIUS ON STYLE. W. Rhys Roberts.
ARISTOTLE: POLITICS. H. Rackham.
ARISTOTLE: POSTERIOR ANALYTICS. H. Tredennick; TOPICS. E. S. Forster.
ARISTOTLE: PROBLEMS. W. S. Hett. 2 Vols.
ARISTOTLE: RHETORICA AD ALEXANDRUM. H. Rackham. (With PROBLEMS, Vol. II.)
ARISTOTLE: SOPHISTICAL REFUTATIONS. COMING-TO-BE AND PASSING-AWAY. E. S. Forster; ON THE COSMOS. D. J. Furley.
ARRIAN: HISTORY OF ALEXANDER AND INDICA. Rev. E. Iliffe Robson. 2 Vols.
ATHENAEUS: DEIPNOSOPHISTAE. C. B. Gulick. 7 Vols.
BABRIUS AND PHAEDRUS (Latin). B. E. Perry.
ST. BASIL: LETTERS. R. J. Deferrari. 4 Vols.
CALLIMACHUS: FRAGMENTS. C. A. Trypanis.
CALLIMACHUS: HYMNS AND EPIGRAMS, AND LYCOPHRON. A. W. Mair; ARATUS. G. R. Mair.
CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA. Rev. G. W. Butterworth.
COLLUTHUS. *Cf.* OPPIAN.
DAPHNIS AND CHLOE. *Cf.* LONGUS.
DEMOSTHENES I: OLYNTHIACS, PHILIPPICS AND MINOR ORATIONS: I-XVII AND XX. J. H. Vince.
DEMOSTHENES II: DE CORONA AND DE FALSA LEGATIONE, C. A. Vince and J. H. Vince.
DEMOSTHENES III: MEIDIAS, ANDROTION, ARISTOCRATES, TIMOCRATES, ARISTOGEITON. J. H. Vince.
DEMOSTHENES IV-VI: PRIVATE ORATIONS AND IN NEAERAM. A. T. Murray.
DEMOSTHENES VII: FUNERAL SPEECH, EROTIC ESSAY, EXORDIA AND LETTERS. N. W. and N. J. DeWitt.
DIO CASSIUS: ROMAN HISTORY. E. Cary. 9 Vols.
DIO CHRYSOSTOM. 5 Vols. Vols. I and II. J. W. Cohoon. Vol. III. J. W. Cohoon and H. Lamar Crosby. Vols. IV and V. H. Lamar Crosby.
DIODORUS SICULUS. 12 Vols. Vols. I-VI. C. H. Oldfather. Vol. VII. C. L. Sherman. Vol. VIII. C. B. Welles. Vols. IX and X. Russel M. Geer. Vols. XI and XII. F. R. Walton. General Index. Russel M. Geer.
DIOGENES LAERTIUS. R. D. Hicks. 2 Vols.
DIONYSIUS OF HALICARNASSUS: ROMAN ANTIQUITIES. Spelman's translation revised by E. Cary. 7 Vols.
EPICTETUS. W. A. Oldfather. 2 Vols.

EURIPIDES. A. S. Way. 4 Vols. Verse trans.
EUSEBIUS: ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY. Kirsopp Lake and J. E. L. Oulton. 2 Vols.
GALEN: ON THE NATURAL FACULTIES. A. J. Brock.
THE GREEK ANTHOLOGY. W. R. Paton. 5 Vols.
THE GREEK BUCOLIC POETS (THEOCRITUS, BION, MOSCHUS). J. M. Edmonds.
GREEK ELEGY AND IAMBUS WITH THE ANACREONTEA. J. M. Edmonds. 2 Vols.
GREEK MATHEMATICAL WORKS. Ivor Thomas. 2 Vols.
HERODES. *Cf.* THEOPHRASTUS: CHARACTERS.
HERODIAN: C. R. Whittaker. 2 Vols. Vol. I.
HERODOTUS. A. D. Godley. 4 Vols.
HESIOD AND THE HOMERIC HYMNS. H. G. Evelyn White.
HIPPOCRATES AND THE FRAGMENTS OF HERACLEITUS. W. H. S. Jones and E. T. Withington. 4 Vols.
HOMER: ILIAD. A. T. Murray. 2 Vols.
HOMER: ODYSSEY. A. T. Murray. 2 Vols.
ISAEUS. E. S. Forster.
ISOCRATES. George Norlin and LaRue Van Hook. 3 Vols.
[ST. JOHN DAMASCENE]: BARLAAM AND IOASAPH. Rev. G. R. Woodward, Harold Mattingly and D. M. Lang.
JOSEPHUS. 9 Vols. Vols. I-IV. H. St. J. Thackeray. Vol. V. H. St. J. Thackeray and Ralph Marcus. Vols. VI and VII. Ralph Marcus. Vol. VIII. Ralph Marcus and Allen Wikgren. Vol. IX. L. H. Feldman.
JULIAN. Wilmer Cave Wright. 3 Vols.
LIBANIUS: SELECTED WORKS. A. F. Norman. 3 Vols. Vol. I.
LONGUS: DAPHNIS AND CHLOE. Thornley's translation revised by J. M. Edmonds; and PARTHENIUS. S. Gaselee.
LUCIAN. 8 Vols. Vols. I-V. A. M. Harmon. Vol. VI. K. Kilburn. Vols. VII and VIII. M. D. Macleod.
LYCOPHRON. *Cf.* CALLIMACHUS.
LYRA GRAECA. J. M. Edmonds. 3 Vols.
LYSIAS. W. R. M. Lamb.
MANETHO. W. G. Waddell; PTOLEMY: TETRABIBLOS. F. E. Robbins.
MARCUS AURELIUS. C. R. Haines.
MENANDER. F. G. Allinson.
MINOR ATTIC ORATORS. 2 Vols. K. J. Maidment and J. O. Burtt.
NONNOS: DIONYSIACA. W. H. D. Rouse. 3 Vols.
OPPIAN, COLLUTHUS, TRYPHIODORUS. A. W. Mair.
PAPYRI. NON-LITERARY SELECTIONS. A. S. Hunt and C. C.

Edgar. 2 Vols. LITERARY SELECTIONS (Poetry). D. L. Page.

PARTHENIUS. *Cf.* LONGUS.

PAUSANIAS: DESCRIPTION OF GREECE. W. H. S. Jones. 5 Vols. and Companion Vol. arranged by R. E. Wycherley.

PHILO. 10 Vols. Vols. I-V. F. H. Colson and Rev. G. H. Whitaker. Vols. VI-X. F. H. Colson. General Index. Rev. J. W. Earp.

Two Supplementary Vols. Translation only from an Armenian Text. Ralph Marcus.

PHILOSTRATUS: THE LIFE OF APOLLONIUS OF TYANA. F. C. Conybeare. 2 Vols.

PHILOSTRATUS: IMAGINES; CALLISTRATUS: DESCRIPTIONS. A. Fairbanks.

PHILOSTRATUS AND EUNAPIUS: LIVES OF THE SOPHISTS. Wilmer Cave Wright.

PINDAR. Sir J. E. Sandys.

PLATO: CHARMIDES, ALCIBIADES, HIPPARCHUS, THE LOVERS, THEAGES, MINOS AND EPINOMIS. W. R. M. Lamb.

PLATO: CRATYLUS, PARMENIDES, GREATER HIPPIAS, LESSER HIPPIAS. H. N. Fowler.

PLATO: EUTHYPHRO, APOLOGY, CRITO, PHAEDO, PHAEDRUS. H. N. Fowler.

PLATO: LACHES, PROTAGORAS, MENO, EUTHYDEMUS. W. R. M. Lamb.

PLATO: LAWS. Rev. R. G. Bury. 2 Vols.

PLATO: LYSIS, SYMPOSIUM, GORGIAS. W. R. M. Lamb.

PLATO: REPUBLIC. Paul Shorey. 2 Vols.

PLATO: STATESMAN, PHILEBUS. H. N. Fowler; ION. W. R. M. Lamb.

PLATO: THEAETETUS AND SOPHIST. H. N. Fowler.

PLATO: TIMAEUS, CRITIAS, CLITOPHO, MENEXENUS, EPISTULAE. Rev. R. G. Bury.

PLOTINUS. A. H. Armstrong. 6 Vols. Vols. I-III.

PLUTARCH: MORALIA. 16 Vols. Vols. I-V. F. C. Babbitt. Vol. VI. W. C. Helmbold. Vol. VII. P. H. De Lacy and B. Einarson. Vol. VIII. P. A. Clement, H. B. Hoffleit. Vol. IX. E. L. Minar, Jr., F. H. Sandbach, W. C. Helmbold. Vol. X. H. N. Fowler. Vol. XI. L. Pearson, F. H. Sandbach. Vol. XII. H. Cherniss, W. C. Helmbold. Vol. XIV. P. H. De Lacy and B. Einarson. Vol. XV. F. H. Sandbach.

PLUTARCH: THE PARALLEL LIVES. B. Perrin. 11 Vols.

POLYBIUS. W. R. Paton. 6 Vols.

# THE LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

PROCOPIUS: HISTORY OF THE WARS. H. B. Dewing. 7 Vols.
PTOLEMY: TETRABIBLOS. *Cf.* MANETHO.
QUINTUS SMYRNAEUS. A. S. Way. Verse trans.
SEXTUS EMPIRICUS. Rev. R. G. Bury. 4 Vols.
SOPHOCLES. F. Storr. 2 Vols. Verse trans.
STRABO: GEOGRAPHY. Horace L. Jones. 8 Vols.
THEOPHRASTUS: CHARACTERS. J. M. Edmonds; HERODES, etc. A. D. Knox.
THEOPHRASTUS: ENQUIRY INTO PLANTS. Sir Arthur Hort. 2 Vols.
THUCYDIDES. C. F. Smith. 4 Vols.
TRYPHIODORUS. *Cf.* OPPIAN.
XENOPHON: ANABASIS. C. L. Brownson.
XENOPHON: CYROPAEDIA. Walter Miller. 2 Vols.
XENOPHON: HELLENICA. C. L. Brownson.
XENOPHON: MEMORABILIA AND OECONOMICUS. E. C. Marchant. SYMPOSIUM AND APOLOGY. O. J. Todd.
XENOPHON: SCRIPTA MINORA. E. C. Marchant and G. W. Bowersock.

# VOLUMES IN PREPARATION

## GREEK AUTHORS

ARISTIDES: ORATIONS. C. A. Behr.
MUSAEUS: HERO AND LEANDER. T. Gelzer and C. H. Whitman.
THEOPHRASTUS: DE CAUSIS PLANTARUM. G. K. K. Link and B. Einarson.

## LATIN AUTHORS

ASCONIUS: COMMENTARIES ON CICERO'S ORATIONS. G. W. Bowersock.
BENEDICT: THE RULE. P. Meyvaert.
JUSTIN-TROGUS. R. Moss.
MANILIUS. G. P. Goold.

*DESCRIPTIVE PROSPECTUS ON APPLICATION*

LONDON
WILLIAM HEINEMANN LTD

CAMBRIDGE, MASS.
HARVARD UNIV. PRESS